

THE CHAPLAIN-RESEARCHER

The Perceived Impact of Participation
in a Dutch Research Project
on Chaplains' Professionalism

by

Niels den Toom



Eburon
Utrecht 2022

Colofon:

ISBN 978 94 6301 404-5

Academische Uitgeverij Eburon, Utrecht
info@eburon.nl / www.eburon.nl

Omslagontwerp: Textcetera , Den Haag

© 2022 Niels den Toom

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior permission in writing from the proprietor(s).

This publication is made possible by the support of:
Fonds Wetenschappelijk Onderzoek vgwz
Stichting Aanpakken
Stichting Zonneweelde
RDO Balije van Utrecht
Stichting Fonds Legaat Ad Pias Causas

J.E. Jurriaanse [Ⓟ]

Contents

SITUATING THE RESEARCH	13
Introduction	15
Why Professionalism?	18
Why Focus on Perceived Change?	19
What is Meant by Participation in Research?	21
Situating the Research in Practical Theology	21
Outline of the Dissertation	26
CHAPTER 1	
The Research Object. The Dutch Case Studies Project	29
1.1 The Call for Case Studies and the Dutch Response	29
1.2 The Aim and Rationale for the CSP	30
1.3 The Design of the Case Studies	31
1.4 The Process of Producing Case Studies	32
1.5 The Participation of the Chaplain as Researcher	33
1.6 Conclusion	35
THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES ON PROFESSIONALISM	37
CHAPTER 2	
Professionalism. A Conceptual Exploration	39
2.1 Professionalism: Being a <i>Profession</i>	40
2.1.1 The Functionalist Approach	41
2.1.2 The Trait Approach	41
2.1.3 The Power or Control Approach	42
2.1.4 The Third Logic	43
2.1.5 A Model of Professionalism	47

2.1.6	Conclusion	51
2.2	Professionalism: Being a <i>Professional</i>	52
2.2.1	Responsibility, Expertise, Positioning	53
2.2.2	A Heuristic Model of Professionalism	55
2.3	Conclusion	57
CHAPTER 3		
Exploring Chaplains' Professionalism		59
3.1	Pastoral Care and Professionalism	60
3.2	Ambivalence and polarization	61
3.3	Paradigms of Professionalism within Chaplaincy	61
3.3.1	A Theory of Presence	62
3.3.2	Normative Professionalization	63
3.3.3	Research-Informed Profession	64
3.4	Outlining Chaplains' Professionalism	65
3.4.1	Value Orientation	65
3.4.2	Expertise	68
3.4.3	Positioning	72
3.5	Conclusion	75
3.5.1	Summary	75
3.5.2	Implications for the Empirical Study	77
METHODS		79
CHAPTER 4		
Methodology		81
4.1	Mixed Methods: Different Goals, Different Methods	81
4.2	Stage I: Participant Observation in RC and RCG	83
4.2.1	Purpose	83
4.2.2	Research Setting	84
4.2.3	Role of the Researcher	84
4.2.4	Observation	84
4.2.5	Interpretation	85
4.3	Stage II: Interviews	85
4.3.1	Purpose	85
4.3.2	Sampling	85
4.3.3	Design and Implementation	88

4.3.4	Data Recording, Transcription and Storage	89
4.3.5	Member Checks	89
4.3.6	Additional Interviews	90
4.4	Qualitative Data Analysis	91
4.4.1	Initial Coding and Analysis	92
4.4.2	Focusing on Perceived Influences from a Theoretical Frame	92
4.4.3	Changing Strategies: Combining Inductive Coding and Theoretical Analysis	93
4.4.4	Use of Quotations	94
4.5	Stage III: Survey	94
4.5.1	Purposes	94
4.5.2	Design	95
4.5.3	Measures	96
4.5.4	Distribution and Sample	99
4.5.5	Data analysis	99
4.6	Stage IV: Focus Groups	99
4.6.1	Purpose	99
4.6.2	Design and Process	100
4.6.3	Data Analysis	101
4.7	Reliability and Validity	101
4.7.1	Reliability	101
4.7.2	Validity	102
4.8	The Role of Theology in the Study	103
4.9	Positionality of the Researcher	105
4.9.1	Relation to the Research Topic	105
4.9.2	Relationship to the Participants	106
4.9.3	Relationship to my Supervisors	107
4.10	Ethical Issues and Data Management	108

EMPIRICAL FINDINGS 109

CHAPTER 5

The Chaplain-Researcher in the Case Studies Project 111

5.1	The Emergence of the Practitioner-Researcher	112
5.1.1	The Scientist-Practitioner	112
5.1.2	The Practitioner-Researcher	113
5.1.3	The Chaplain as Practitioner-Researcher	114
5.2	Being a Chaplain-Researcher in the CSP	118
5.2.1	Identifying as a Co-Researcher	118

5.2.2	Working with a Format	120
5.2.3	Difficulty of Connecting Theory to Practice	121
5.2.4	Ethical Issues: Confidentiality, Informed Consent, and a Double Agenda	122
5.2.5	Describing Concretely and Precise	124
5.2.6	Judgement and the Normative Dimension of Research	125
5.3	Reflection	127
5.3.1	The Role of Methods and Methodology	128
5.3.2	Ethical Aspects	129
5.3.3	The Role of Normativity and the Neglect of Empiricism	130
5.3.4	Relating Theory to Practice	132
5.4	Conclusion: The Chaplain-Researcher	133

CHAPTER 6

Becoming Aware. Knowledge, Reflectivity and Goal Orientation 135

6.1	Expanding Knowledge	136
6.1.1	Ambivalence Towards Theory	136
6.1.2	Exploring the Toolbox	138
6.1.3	Employing Knowledge in Practice	139
6.1.4	(Re)reading Literature	140
6.1.5	New Interventions	141
6.1.6	Reflection: Implicit and Local Knowledge, a Body of Knowledge, and Literature	142
6.2	Increasing Reflectivity	146
6.2.1	Attuning	146
6.2.2	Assessing the Aesthetic	148
6.2.3	Increasing Discretion	149
6.2.4	Evaluative Reflection	150
6.2.5	Reflection: Reflectivity, the Aesthetic, Discretion, and Reflection	151
6.3	Acting Intentionally	154
6.3.1	Reflection on Chaplains' Goals	154
6.3.2	Focusing on Outcomes	156
6.3.4	Reflection	157
6.4	The Relation Between Knowledge, Reflectivity, and Goal Orientation.	158
6.5	Conclusion	160

CHAPTER 7	
Articulating Chaplaincy	163
7.1 Elucidating the Domain	164
7.1.1 Pertinacity, Worldview and Ideology	165
7.1.2 Common Words	167
7.1.3 Worldview and Meaning	167
7.1.4 Reflection	169
7.2 Collaboration with Other Professionals	172
7.2.1 Demarcating the Profession	172
7.2.2 Charting and Confidentiality	173
7.2.3 Reflection	174
7.3 Embedding Chaplaincy in the Organizational Context	177
7.3.1 Articulating the Added Value	178
7.3.2 Convincing the Manager	178
7.3.3 Language and Accountability	180
7.3.4 Endorsement and Positioning	181
7.3.5 Reflection	181
7.4 The Relationship Between Expertise and Positioning.	183
7.5 Conclusion	185
CHAPTER 8	
Professional Identity and Professionalism	187
8.1 Becoming Aware of ‘What Type of Chaplain I am’	187
8.2 Conceptualizing Professional Identity	188
8.3 Processes of Identification and Distinction	190
8.3.1 Relationship to the Client	191
8.3.2 Relationship to Chaplain-Colleagues	192
8.3.3 Relationship to Other Professionals	195
8.3.4 Relationship to Society and Culture	196
8.3.5 Relationship to the Chaplain as Person	197
8.4 Professional Identity and Agency	199
8.4.1 Confirmation and Recognition	199
8.4.2 Self-Confidence and Agency	201
8.5 Reflection	202
8.6 Relating Professional Identity to Professionalism	208
8.7 Conclusion	210

REFLECTIONS	213
CHAPTER 9	
Purpose, Wisdom, and Professionalization: Reflections on Professionalism in Chaplaincy	215
9.1 Intermezzo on Method. Philosophical and Theological Reflection in Dialogue	216
9.2 Labyrinthic Purposiveness. On the Purpose and Meaning of Chaplaincy	217
9.2.1 Chaplaincy and its Culture-Critical Potential	218
9.2.2 The Purpose of Meaning	219
9.2.3 Example: Religion, Ecclesiastes, and Purpose	222
9.2.4 Labyrinthic Purposiveness	223
9.2.5 The Relationship to the Institution's Goals	226
9.2.6 Conclusion	229
9.3 Professional Loving Wisdom: The Role of Knowledge in Chaplaincy	229
9.3.1 Relationship, Empathy and Hermeneutics	230
9.3.2 Why 'Theory' Is Considered Alien to Chaplains	232
9.3.3 Wisdom: <i>Phronesis</i> and <i>Sophia</i>	233
9.3.4 <i>Yādā'</i> : Knowing-in-relation	237
9.3.5 Conclusion	239
9.4 Chaplaincy as Postsecular Profession. Religious and Worldview-Related Professionalization	239
9.4.1 Secularization, Religion, and Worldview: The Internalized Taboo	240
9.4.2 Worldview in the Professional Association: Endorsement and Profession	241
9.4.3 Chaplaincy as a Postsecular Profession: Availability and Identity	242
9.4.4 On Roots and Leaves: Religious and Worldview-Related Professionalization	243
9.4.5 Conclusion	246
9.5 Spiritual Professionalism	246

Contents	11
CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION	249
Conclusion	251
Answering the Research Question	252
Synthesis	253
Theoretical Contributions of the Study	258
Methodological Considerations and Future Research	261
Implications for Practice. Profession, Policy and Education	263
Final Words	265
Acknowledgements	267
Summary in Dutch	269
Aanleiding en onderzoeksfocus	269
Theoretisch kader en methode	270
Resultaten	271
Reflecties	274
Aanbevelingen en vervolgonderzoek	275
Conclusie	276
Bibliography	279
APPENDICES	305
APPENDIX 1.1	
Format of the CSP	307
PHASE 1. DESCRIPTION	307
PHASE 2. EVALUATION	308
Chaplain/Submitter	
Case Studies Research Community	
APPENDIX 4.1	
Observation Form	310
APPENDIX 4.2	
Qualitative Data Documents	311
APPENDIX 4.3	
Interview Guides	313

APPENDIX 4.4 Additional Interview Scheme	316
APPENDIX 4.5 Initial Code Groups	317
APPENDIX 4.6 Reassigned Code Groups	318
APPENDIX 4.7 Codes to Variables	319
APPENDIX 4.8 Survey Questions and Measures	321
Curriculum Vitae	335