

Minority Rights, Freedom of Expression and of the Media:  
Dynamics and Dilemmas

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 44.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Minority Rights, Freedom of Expression and of the Media:  
Dynamics and Dilemmas

Tarlach McGonagle



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd  
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road  
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom  
mail@intersentia.co.uk

Tarlach McGonagle  
Minority Rights, Freedom of Expression and of the Media:  
Dynamics and Dilemmas

© Tarlach McGonagle and Intersentia, 2011

Intersentia  
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover image: © Anouschka Boswijk, 2011

ISBN 978-94-000-0215-9  
D/2011/7849/107  
NUR 828



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is a revised and updated version of my doctoral thesis, *Minority Rights and Freedom of Expression: A Dynamic Interface*, which I successfully defended at the University of Amsterdam on 7 October 2008. As such, many of these acknowledgements concern the original thesis and the process leading to its completion.

I would like, first of all, to thank Professor Egbert Dommering and Professor Nico van Eijk for their input into my thesis in their capacities as promoter and supervisor, respectively. Professor Geoff Gilbert accepted the invitation to come on board as co-promoter at the outset and I am extremely grateful for the keen interest he has taken in the thesis and book projects from start to finish, as well as for the very helpful comments and encouragement he has given me throughout.

Secondly, I would like to thank the Committee members, Dr. Yvonne Donders, Dr. Aernout Nieuwenhuis, Professor Patrick Thornberry and Professor Dirk Voorhoof, for their insightful remarks which have helped to enhance the quality of the thesis.

My colleagues at IViR have shown me support in many ways over the past years, for which I am also very grateful. The support has come from all quarters and in many shapes and forms – far too many to itemise here – so I hope no one will feel in any way slighted if I simply thank all my colleagues, past and present, collectively for their individual support.

Support, encouragement and – the lifeblood of any thesis – information and insights, have been forthcoming from many sources unconnected with my thesis or IViR. The late Professor Kevin Boyle, Dr. Yvonne Donders, Dr. Tom Moring and Donncha O’Connell deserve special mention for generously dispensing wisdom and humour and for always leading by example. David Goldberg, Dr. Susanne Nikoltchev, Dr. Wilfred Steenbruggen and Professor Dirk Voorhoof have also been invaluable sources of advice, encouragement and information.

I have been helped enormously by very obliging staff in a number of libraries, in particular, Rosanne van der Waal, Henja Korsten, William McKinney and Elvira Caneda Cabrera, but also more generally the staff in various libraries at the University of Amsterdam, in particular the Law Faculty and Communications Science libraries.

I am also indebted to a large number of colleagues for generously sharing their knowledge and passing on references and elusive documents: Wouter Gekiere, Karol Jakubowicz, Ilze Brands Kehris, Toby Mendel, Mario Oetheimer, Andrei Richter, Helena Sousa, the Secretariat of the Council of Europe's Media & Information Society Division, the Press Office of the European Court of Human Rights.

Since I started my thesis, many individuals and organisations have provided me with valuable fora in which to develop and present my ideas, orally and in writing, including: Vincent de Graaf, Michael Hertz, Sally Holt, Antti Korkeakivi, Heike Klempa, Eva Konecna, Danilo Leonardi, Stéphanie Marsal, Christian Möller, Peter Molnar, John Packer, Milica Pesic, Monroe Price, Mary Ruddy, Damian Tambini, Krzysztof Zyman and the organisations to which they are/were affiliated, as well as the European Audiovisual Observatory and KATTI, Faculty of Law, University of Helsinki. I would like to acknowledge my gratitude to all of them.

I am very grateful to Intersentia and Editorial Board of the School of Human Rights Research for their faith in this manuscript and their willingness to publish it. My thanks are due, in particular, to Tom Scheirs and Isabelle Van Dongen at Intersentia for their efficiency and for taking the stress out of the publication process. My thanks are equally due to Anouschka Boswijk for designing such a striking and symbolic image for the cover of this book.

I would like to thank my parents and Conall and Ríona and the rest of my family for being there for me throughout the thesis-period, as they always are. Thanks also to those friends who never let tedious thesis-talk spoil our relationships and maintained a healthy interest in the project right to the end: Wouter Gekiere, Clíona Hartigan, Karen Lim, Laurence O'Brien and Seána Ryan. I would like to thank my in-laws for their support, especially Ingeborg van der Waal who has perfected the art of the timely text message and Peter Boswijk who has perfected the art of the knowing nod.

I cannot even begin to express my gratitude to Rosanne, who has been with me every step of the way on the Ph.D. and book odysseys. She has believed in me even after that belief had deserted myself. The roles played by Ciara and Megan must also be fully acknowledged. Without ever realising it, they ensured that the sails were trimmed and that the port was reached.

Ar deireadh, ba mhaith liom an tráchtas seo a thíolacadh do mo thuismitheoirí, ceannródaithe beirt, a shíúil an bóthar romham, a chas timpeall agus a shíúil an bóthar liom.

# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i> . . . . .	v
<i>List of selected abbreviations</i> . . . . .	xv
Introduction. . . . .	1
<b>Part I</b>	
<b>Theoretical and normative approaches to minority rights</b> . . . . .	17
Chapter 1	
General theories and definitional entrapment . . . . .	19
Introduction. . . . .	19
1.1 Theoretical conundrums and definitional dilemmas. . . . .	19
1.2 Historical and conventional approaches to minority rights . . . . .	26
1.2.1 Numerical inferiority . . . . .	28
1.2.2 Non-dominance. . . . .	29
1.2.3 Nationality. . . . .	30
1.2.4 Range of distinctive, constitutive characteristics . . . . .	30
1.2.5 Sense of solidarity. . . . .	31
1.2.6 Combination of objective and subjective criteria for recognition. . . . .	32
1.3 Troublesome taxonomies and the notion of fixed features . . . . .	33
Conclusions. . . . .	40
Chapter 2	
The shaping of theories through international legal and political frameworks . . . . .	43
Introduction. . . . .	43
2.1 International instruments with focuses on minority rights. . . . .	43
2.1.1 Genocide Convention . . . . .	44
2.1.2 United Nations Charter . . . . .	46
2.1.3 Universal Declaration of Human Rights. . . . .	47
2.1.4 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. . . . .	49
2.1.5 UN Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities. . . . .	55
2.1.6 UN institutional approaches to minority rights . . . . .	56
2.2 European instruments with focuses on minority rights . . . . .	58
2.2.1 European Convention on Human Rights . . . . .	59
2.2.2 Standard-setting by the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe. . . . .	67

2.2.3	Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (FCNM).....	76
2.2.3(i)	Ceci n'est pas une minorité!.....	81
2.2.3(ii)	Water in the wine and holes in the cheese.....	85
2.2.3(iii)	Proof of the pudding.....	89
2.2.4	Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe standards.....	96
2.2.4(i)	OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities (HCNM).....	99
2.2.5	European Union.....	105
	Conclusions.....	109

## Part II

<b>Theoretical and normative approaches to freedom of expression and minority rights</b> .....	111
--	-----

### Chapter 3

Minorities, freedom of expression and of the media.....	113
---	-----

Introduction.....	113
-------------------	-----

3.1 Theories of freedom of expression and of the media.....	113
---	-----

3.1.1 Rationales for minorities' access to expressive opportunities....	120
---	-----

3.1.1(i) Democratic participation in public life.....	120
---	-----

3.1.1(ii) Creating alternative discursive spaces.....	122
---	-----

3.1.1(iii) Creating and sustaining (cultural) identities.....	123
---	-----

3.1.2 Enhanced liberty for the media/the Fourth Estate.....	127
---	-----

3.1.3 An enabling environment for media freedom.....	130
--	-----

3.2 Media functionality and media types.....	134
--	-----

3.2.1 Media functionality.....	134
--------------------------------	-----

3.2.2 Media types.....	138
------------------------	-----

3.2.2(i) Community media.....	141
-------------------------------	-----

3.2.2(ii) Public service media/content.....	144
---	-----

3.2.2(iii) Commercial media.....	152
----------------------------------	-----

3.2.2(iv) Transnational media.....	153
------------------------------------	-----

3.2.2(v) Other types of media.....	155
------------------------------------	-----

3.3 New media and new regulatory paradigms.....	156
---	-----

Conclusions.....	168
------------------	-----

### Chapter 4

The coupling of freedom of expression and minority rights.....	171
--	-----

Introduction.....	171
-------------------	-----

4.1 An underexplored nexus of international law.....	171
--	-----

4.1.1 Tentative tendencies and attempted couplings in international law	173
---	-----

4.1.1(i) Actual couplings.....	173
--------------------------------	-----



4.1.1(ii)	Attempted couplings: United Nations . . . . .	175
4.1.1(iii)	Attempted couplings: Council of Europe . . . . .	177
4.1.1(iv)	Attempted couplings: assessment . . . . .	179
4.1.2	Qualifying State obligations . . . . .	182
4.1.2(i)	International human rights treaty law . . . . .	185
4.1.2(ii)	Differentiated roles and duties of States regarding expression. . . . .	188
4.2	New trends in the development of the nexus under international treaty law . . . . .	191
4.2.1	Filling the interstices of international treaty law . . . . .	191
4.2.2	Modesty of scope and content of international treaty law . . . . .	194
4.2.3	Under-utilisation of international treaty law. . . . .	199
4.3	Emergence of differentiated protection for minorities' right to freedom of expression . . . . .	201
4.3.1	Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (FCNM). . . . .	202
4.3.2	European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (ECRML) . . . . .	211
4.3.3	Conceptual over-stretch and non-treaty-based standard-setting . . . . .	218
4.3.4	Guidelines on the use of Minority Languages in the Broadcast Media. . . . .	223
4.4	Interplay with other human rights . . . . .	226
4.4.1	Added value of minority dimension to human rights. . . . .	229
	Conclusions. . . . .	231

### Part III

## Regulation and Restriction of Expression to Protect Minority Rights. . . . . 235

### Chapter 5

#### The pluralism *problématique* . . . . . 237

#### Introduction. . . . . 237

#### 5.1 Selected theories of pluralism and tolerance. . . . . 237

##### 5.1.1 Pluralism . . . . . 237

##### 5.1.2 Tolerance. . . . . 238

###### 5.1.2(i) Notions of tolerance. . . . . 239

###### 5.1.2(ii) Normative articulations of tolerance . . . . . 241

#### 5.2 Towards a notion of comprehensive pluralistic tolerance . . . . . 244

##### 5.2.1 Minimum moral and ideological commonality . . . . . 246

##### 5.2.2 Pluralistic tolerance, democracy and freedom of expression . . . . . 249

#### 5.3 Comprehensive pluralistic tolerance in practice . . . . . 251

#### Conclusions. . . . . 254

Chapter 6	
Delineating the limits of permissible expression under International Human Rights Law . . . . .	257
Introduction. . . . .	257
6.1 Global instruments: asymmetries and conundrums . . . . .	257
6.1.1 Genocide Convention . . . . .	257
6.1.2 International Bill of Rights . . . . .	271
6.1.3 ICERD. . . . .	280
6.1.4 UNESCO standards . . . . .	290
6.1.5 Other UN standards and mechanisms . . . . .	291
6.1.5(i) World Conference against Racism and Review Conference . . . . .	291
6.1.5(ii) Work of Special Rapporteurs on Freedom of Expression . . . . .	293
6.2 Council of Europe instruments: contrived consistency? . . . . .	294
6.2.1 European Convention on Human Rights . . . . .	294
6.2.2 Other relevant Council of Europe treaties . . . . .	301
6.2.2(i) Cybercrime Convention and its Additional Protocol . . . . .	301
6.2.2(ii) European Convention on Transfrontier Television . . . . .	303
6.2.2(iii) Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities. . . . .	303
6.3 Other European standards: an ancillary normative dimension . . . . .	304
6.3.1 European Union standards . . . . .	304
6.3.1(i) General. . . . .	304
6.3.1(ii) The Audiovisual Media Services Directive. . . . .	309
6.3.2 OSCE standards . . . . .	314
Conclusions. . . . .	315
Chapter 7	
“Hate speech” and intolerance targeting minorities. . . . .	317
Introduction. . . . .	317
7.1 Irruption of “hate speech” into international human rights law and discourse . . . . .	317
7.1.1 The effectiveness of “hate speech” laws. . . . .	323
7.1.2 Critical race theory . . . . .	328
7.2 A square conceptual peg in a round normative hole? . . . . .	331
7.2.1 Rough coherence of principles . . . . .	336
7.2.2 Contextual variables . . . . .	338
7.2.2(i) Impact of publication . . . . .	341
7.2.2(ii) Specificity of genre . . . . .	344
7.2.2(iii) Proportionality of sanctions. . . . .	346
7.2.2(iv) New doctrinal directions? . . . . .	347

7.3	Specific current controversies as stress tests for the right to freedom of expression	351
7.3.1	Denial or trivialisation of genocide and other crimes against humanity	351
7.3.2	“Defamation” of religions	363
7.3.3	Protection of founders of religions	375
	Conclusions	379
Chapter 8		
	Integrated approaches to countering “hate speech”	381
	Introduction	381
8.1	Theoretical foundations for an integrated approach to countering “hate speech”	381
8.2	An integrated approach in practice: case study of the Council of Europe	385
8.2.1	Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities	385
8.2.1(i)	Studying the chemistry between Articles 6 and 9	386
8.2.1(ii)	Affirmation of the AC’s approach	394
8.2.1(iii)	Conclusions	394
8.2.2	Non-treaty-based approaches to hate speech	395
8.2.2(i)	Standard-setting by the Committee of Ministers	395
8.2.2(ii)	Standard-setting by the Parliamentary Assembly	403
8.2.2(iii)	European Ministerial Conferences on Mass Media Policy	405
8.2.2(iv)	The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI)	408
8.3	Evaluation of integrated approaches to countering “hate speech”	420
	Conclusions	424
<b>Part IV</b>		
<b>Regulation and facilitation of expression to promote minority rights</b>		
Chapter 9		
	Media-related pluralism	429
	Introduction	429
9.1	Connecting pluralistic tolerance to media-related pluralism	429
9.2	Media-related pluralism: structural and substantive considerations	431
9.2.1	Conceptual confusion	432
9.2.2	Structural considerations	433
9.2.2(i)	Source/Ownership	434
9.2.2(ii)	Outlet	438
9.2.3	Substantive considerations	440
9.2.4	Gauging media-related pluralism	441

9.2.4(i)	State obligations . . . . .	441
9.2.4(ii)	Media responsibilities . . . . .	447
9.3	Interrelationship of international legal standards . . . . .	449
9.3.1	United Nations standards . . . . .	450
9.3.2	Council of Europe standards . . . . .	452
9.3.2(i)	European Court of Human Rights . . . . .	452
9.3.2(ii)	European Convention on Transfrontier Television . . . . .	457
9.3.2(iii)	Non-treaty-based standard-setting . . . . .	459
9.3.2(iv)	Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities . . . . .	461
9.3.2(v)	European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages . . . . .	462
9.3.3	European Union standards . . . . .	463
9.3.3(i)	Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union . . . . .	463
9.3.3(ii)	European Court of Justice . . . . .	465
9.3.3(iii)	Other regulatory measures . . . . .	471
9.3.3(iv)	European Commission . . . . .	471
9.3.3(v)	European Parliament . . . . .	472
Conclusions . . . . .		474
Chapter 10		
Cultural and linguistic diversity . . . . .		477
Introduction . . . . .		477
10.1	Connecting pluralistic tolerance and media-related pluralism to cultural and linguistic diversity . . . . .	477
10.1.1	Defining culture and cultural rights . . . . .	478
10.1.2	Defining cultural diversity . . . . .	481
10.1.3	Rationales for the promotion of cultural diversity . . . . .	482
10.2	Universal standards: centrality of UNESCO instruments . . . . .	484
10.2.1	UNESCO Declaration on Cultural Diversity . . . . .	484
10.2.2	UNESCO Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions . . . . .	486
10.2.3	World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS) . . . . .	494
10.2.4	Joint IGO Special Mandates' Declaration on Diversity in Broadcasting . . . . .	495
10.3	European-level measures concerning cultural diversity . . . . .	495
10.3.1	Council of Europe standards . . . . .	496
10.3.1(i)	Treaty-based standards . . . . .	496
10.3.1(ii)	Non-treaty-based standards . . . . .	501
10.3.2	European Union standards . . . . .	506
10.3.2(i)	Audiovisual Media Services Directive . . . . .	507
10.3.2(ii)	Public service broadcasting/media . . . . .	514

10.3.2(iii) Community broadcasting . . . . .	515
10.3.2(iv) Must-carry regulation . . . . .	515
10.3.3 OSCE standards . . . . .	521
Conclusions . . . . .	521
Chapter 11	
Access rights . . . . .	523
Introduction . . . . .	523
11.1 Rights-based theories of access to the media . . . . .	523
11.1.1 Freedom of expression and access rights . . . . .	524
11.1.2 Interplay between rights . . . . .	528
11.1.3 Dynamism of rights . . . . .	532
11.1.4 Prognosis for the future development of access rights . . . . .	536
11.2 General “taxonomy” of access rights . . . . .	539
11.2.1 Right of reply as a form of access . . . . .	540
11.2.2 Public access channels . . . . .	545
11.3 Development of rights of access to the media for minorities under international law . . . . .	547
11.3.1 FCNM: factors affecting minorities’ access to the media . . . . .	547
11.3.1(i) Linguistic topography . . . . .	548
11.3.1(ii) Official recognition of minorities/languages . . . . .	548
11.3.1(iii) Market sustainability . . . . .	549
11.3.1(iv) Licensing of broadcasters . . . . .	550
11.3.1(v) Regulation of broadcasting output . . . . .	551
11.3.1(v)(a) Broadcasting in general . . . . .	551
11.3.1(v)(b) Public service broadcasting . . . . .	553
11.3.1(vi) Transfrontier dimension . . . . .	554
11.3.1(vii) Temporal and qualitative criteria . . . . .	555
11.3.1(viii) Facilitative measures . . . . .	555
11.3.2 ECRML: factors affecting minorities’ access to the media . . . . .	557
11.3.2(i) Official recognition of languages . . . . .	557
11.3.2 (ii) Active access to media . . . . .	559
11.3.2(iii) Market sustainability . . . . .	560
11.3.2(iv) Facilitative measures . . . . .	560
11.3.3 New technology-driven challenges for the FCNM and ECRML . . . . .	562
Conclusions . . . . .	564
Summary and conclusions . . . . .	567
<i>List of academic works consulted</i> . . . . .	585
<i>International instruments</i> . . . . .	635
<i>General and thematic comments and recommendations</i> . . . . .	645
<i>Table of cases</i> . . . . .	649
<i>Index</i> . . . . .	655



## LIST OF SELECTED ABBREVIATIONS

AC	Advisory Committee [on the FCNM]
ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
AMARC	<i>Association Mondiale des Radiodiffuseurs Communautaires</i> /World Association of Community Radio Broadcasters
CAHMIN	[CoE] <i>ad hoc</i> Committee of Experts for the Protection of National Minorities
CDDH	[CoE] Steering Committee on Human Rights
CDMC	[CoE] Steering Committee on the Media and New Communication Services
CDMM	[CoE] Steering Committee on the Mass Media
CERD	[UN] Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CESCR	[UN] Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CM	[CoE] Committee of Ministers
CoE	Council of Europe
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
DH-MIN	[CoE] Committee of Experts on Issues Relating to the Protection of National Minorities
EBU	European Broadcasting Union
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
ECRI	European Commission against Racism and Intolerance
ECRML	European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages
ECTT	European Convention on Transfrontier Television
EU	European Union
EUMC	European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia
FCNM	Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities
FRA	[EU] Fundamental Rights Agency
HCNM	[OSCE] High Commissioner on National Minorities
HRC	[UN] Human Rights Committee
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICT	Information and communication technologies
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IGO	Intergovernmental organisation
ILO	International Labour Organisation

List of selected abbreviations

NGO	Non-governmental organisation
NWICO	New World Information and Communication Order
OAS	Organization of American States
OHCHR	Office of the [UN] High Commissioner for Human Rights
OJEC	Official Journal of the European Communities
OSCE	Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
PACE	Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PSB	Public service broadcasting
PSM	Public service media
RFOM	[OSCE] Representative on Freedom of the Media
S&CR	Self- and Co-regulation
SAPG	[UN] Special Adviser on the Prevention of Genocide
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
WSIS	World Summit on the Information Society