

Maartje Verhoeven

The Costanzo Obligation

The obligations of national administrative authorities in the case of incompatibility between national law and European law

Maartje Verhoeven

The Costanzo Obligation

The obligations of national administrative authorities in the case of incompatibility between national law and European law

CRC prepared by C.J.Wiarda Institute for Legal Research, Utrecht University,
Janskerkhof 3, 3512 BK Utrecht, the Netherlands

Cover photograph © iStockphoto.com

ISBN 978-94-000-0194-7
D/2011/7849/40
NUR 823

© 2011 Intersentia
Cambridge - Antwerp - Portland
www.intersentia.com

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photo print, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

This book is the published version of the Ph.D thesis defended on May 20, 2011.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many people without whom I could not have written this thesis. It is impossible to mention everyone, but I would like to name a few. First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisors Professor Rob Widdershoven and Professor Sacha Prechal. My ‘doctoral parents’ made a good couple to supervise this thesis. Sacha stimulated me to get to the bottom of complicated concepts, and encouraged me to attend conferences in the Netherlands and abroad to present different stadia of my research. Rob was always available to discuss each and every obstacle I came across and provided me with other tasks which diverted me from the research when I needed it. They both encouraged me by showing their confidence in my work and provided me with different views in the countless discussions we had, often followed by an enjoyable dinner. Furthermore, I would like to thank the members of the reading committee: Professor Von Danwitz, Professor Dubos, Professor Hessel, Professor Jans, and particularly Professor Besselink for his valuable comments.

There are many other people to whom I owe thanks. My colleagues made the Institute for Administrative and Constitutional Law and the Chair of European Law great places to work. People such as Anna, Barbara, Brecht, Imelda, Loes, Maaïke, Paulien, Remco, Sybe and Ton made working on the PhD very pleasant. In that regard a special word of thanks to Hanneke and Rolf, not only for their uninvited offer to read important parts of the manuscript but also for their friendship. Ernst, many thanks for helping me by accurately improving the sloppy references in this thesis – all mistakes are of course my own. Klaartje, thank you very much for preparing the manuscript so accurately in a very short period of time.

Outside the context of work, I am very grateful that my family and friends have supported me in many ways. That applies particularly to my parents. The illness and death of my mother has unambiguously showed me what is really important in life, and that writing a thesis in the end is of limited significance. I regret that my mother did not live to see the completion of my PhD research. I am very happy that my father is here to witness the event.

Finally, the last words are for Stef – for simply everything.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	v
Abbreviations	xiii
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Research question	2
1.3 Theoretical backgrounds	4
1.3.1 Multilevel constitutionalism and the Composite Constitution	4
1.3.2 Dédoublement fonctionnel	5
1.4 Research methods	6
1.5 Key concepts	8
1.5.1 European law	8
1.5.2 Administrative authorities	8
1.5.3 Statutory law and secondary legislation	9
1.5.4 The Costanzo obligation	10
1.6 Plan	11
Chapter 2 European law in the national legal order	13
2.1 Introduction	13
2.2. The principles governing the effect of European law in the national legal order	14
2.2.1 Primacy	14
2.2.2 Direct effect	18
2.2.3 Consistent interpretation	31
2.2.4 Relation of primacy, direct effect and consistent interpretation	34
2.3 The relationship between the European Union and its Member States	40
2.3.1 The principle of sincere co-operation	40
2.3.2 National institutional and procedural autonomy: principles allowing large discretion for the Member States ..	43
2.3.3 ... but some specific remedies have to be available	52

2.4	European law in the national legal orders of Germany, France and The Netherlands	58
2.4.1	Introduction	58
2.4.2	The European Union in the constitution	59
2.4.3	The primacy of European law over domestic statutory law	60
2.4.4	The primacy of European law over constitutional law	65
2.4.5	Direct effect of European law	71
2.4.6	Consistent interpretation	74
2.5	Findings and summary	74
2.5.1	Principles	74
2.5.2	Effects of European law in the national legal orders	76
Chapter 3 The development of the <i>Costanzo</i> obligation in the case law of the Court of Justice		79
3.1	Introduction	79
3.2	Direct and indirect collisions	80
3.3	Direct collisions: the obligation to apply European law and set aside national law in cases of conflict	83
3.3.1	Introduction	83
3.3.2	The first indications for the existence of the ‘ <i>Costanzo</i> obligation’ in infringement procedures	83
3.3.3	The birth of the <i>Costanzo</i> obligation	86
3.4	Indirect collisions: the principle of national procedural autonomy and the accompanying principles of equivalence and effectiveness	96
3.4.1	Wells	97
3.4.2	Kühne & Heitz	98
3.4.3	i-21 and Arcor	102
3.5	The exceptional case of <i>Gervais Larsy</i>	103
3.6	European limits to the powers of administrative authorities	107
3.6.1	Absence of the preliminary procedure	108
3.6.2	Absence of the power to examine the validity of secondary EU law	111
3.7	Drawing the lines together	114
3.7.1	The ‘grey zone’ between direct and indirect collisions	114
3.7.2	Direct collisions: direct effect and primacy	116
3.7.3	The <i>Costanzo</i> obligation and different instruments of European law	119
3.7.4	Indirect collisions: national procedural autonomy	120
3.7.5	<i>Gervais Larsy</i> : the exception that proves the rule?	120
3.7.6	Drawing the threads together	121
Chapter 4 The principle of legality of the administration		123
4.1	Introduction	123
4.2	Background and historical development of the legality principle	124

4.3	The principle of legality in Germany, the Netherlands and France	126
4.4	Hierarchy of norms	130
4.5.	The precedence of statutory law	136
4.5.1	Germany	136
4.5.2	France	139
4.5.3	The Netherlands	141
4.6	The requirement of a statutory basis	141
4.6.1	Germany	141
4.6.2	The Netherlands	147
4.6.3	France	152
4.7	Legality on the European level	155
4.7.1	The principle of conferral	155
4.7.2	The requirement of a legal basis	156
4.7.3	Implied powers and Article 352 TFEU	158
4.7.4	Hierarchy of norms	159
4.7.5	Legality on the European level and legality in the Member States: parallels and differences	161
4.8	Interim conclusion	163
Chapter 5 The <i>Costanzo</i> obligation and precedence of statutory law		165
5.1	Introduction	165
5.2	Germany	166
5.2.1	The power of administrative authorities to set aside secondary legislation that is incompatible with higher sources of law	166
5.2.2	The power of administrative authorities to set aside statutory law that is incompatible with the German Constitution	167
5.2.3	The power of administrative authorities to set aside statutory law that is incompatible with European law	174
5.2.4	Interim conclusion	185
5.3	France	187
5.3.1	The power of administrative authorities to set aside secondary legislation that is incompatible with higher sources of law	187
5.3.2	The power of administrative authorities to set aside statutory law that is incompatible with the French Constitution	190
5.3.3	The power of administrative authorities to set aside statutory law that is incompatible with European law	193
5.3.4	Interim conclusion	200
5.4	The Netherlands	201
5.4.1	The power of administrative authorities to set aside secondary legislation that is incompatible with higher sources of law	201
5.4.2	The power of administrative authorities to set aside statutory law that is incompatible with the Dutch Constitution	202

5.4.3	The power of administrative authorities to set aside statutory law that is incompatible with European law	204
5.4.4	Interim conclusion	207
5.5	Intermezzo: Views on the <i>Costanzo</i> obligation from other Member States	208
5.6	Drawing the lines together	211
5.6.1	Secondary legislation that is incompatible with higher-ranking law	211
5.6.2	National statutory law that is incompatible with the domestic Constitution	211
5.6.3	National statutory law that is incompatible with EU law	212
5.6.4	Tensions between the <i>Costanzo</i> obligation and fundamental principles	214
5.6.5	Balance	215
Chapter 6 The <i>Costanzo</i> obligation and the requirement of a statutory basis		217
6.1	Introduction	217
6.2	The French distinction between <i>compétence</i> and <i>la base juridique</i>	219
6.3	Competence and the principle of national institutional autonomy	222
6.4	The different instruments of European law as legal basis	228
6.4.1	The Treaties	229
6.4.2	Regulations	233
6.4.3	Directives	238
6.4.4	Decisions	240
6.5	Interim conclusion	245
Chapter 7 Supervision of administrative authorities in the application of the <i>Costanzo</i> obligation		249
7.1	Introduction	249
7.2	German Federalism	251
7.2.1	Introduction	251
7.2.2	Distribution of competences between Bund and Länder	252
7.2.3	Supervision	257
7.3	Decentralised administrative authorities	261
7.3.1	Introduction	261
7.3.2	France	262
7.3.3	The Netherlands	267
7.3.4	Germany	270
7.4	Independent administrative authorities	272
7.4.1	Introduction	272
7.4.2	Supervision in general	275
7.4.3	The national competition authorities and telecommunications authorities as examples	275
7.5	Interim conclusion	280

Chapter 8 Synthesis and conclusions	285
8.1 General	285
8.2 The emergence of the <i>Costanzo</i> obligation	286
8.3 The obligations of national administrative authorities in case of direct collisions	286
8.4 The contents and scope of the principle of legality of the administration	288
8.5 The <i>Costanzo</i> obligation and the precedence of the law	289
8.5.1 General	289
8.5.2 Tension with the separation of powers	292
8.5.3 Tension with the principle of legal certainty and the requirement of uniform application of EU law	294
8.6 The <i>Costanzo</i> obligation and the requirement of a statutory basis: competence and legal basis	296
8.6.1 Competence	297
8.6.2 Legal basis	298
8.7 Supervision of national administrative authorities	299
8.8 Balance	302
8.8.1 Constitutional obstacles	302
8.8.2 Mitigation of the <i>Costanzo</i> obligation	303
Nederlandse samenvatting	311
1.1 Inleiding	311
1.2 Het ontstaan van de <i>Costanzo</i> -verplichting	312
1.3 De verplichtingen van nationale bestuursorganen bij directe botsingen	312
1.4 De inhoud en werkingssfeer van het legaliteitsbeginsel	314
1.5 De <i>Costanzo</i> -verplichting en het primaat van de wet	315
1.5.1 Algemeen	315
1.5.2 Spanningen met het beginsel van machtscheiding	317
1.5.3 Spanningen met het beginsel van rechtszekerheid en het vereiste van uniforme toepassing van EU-recht	317
1.6 De <i>Costanzo</i> -verplichting en het vereiste van een wettelijke bevoegdheidsgrondslag	318
1.6.1 Competentie	319
1.6.2 Rechtsbasis	320
1.7 Toezicht op nationale bestuursorganen	321
1.8 Balans	322
1.8.1 Constitutionele obstakels	322
1.8.2 Nuancering van de <i>Costanzo</i> -verplichting	323
Bibliography	327
Table of cases	353
Curriculum vitae	367

ABBREVIATIONS

AB	Administratiefrechtelijke beslissingen
ABRvS	Afdeling Bestuursrechtspraak Raad van State
AG	Advocate General
AJDA	Actualité Juridique – droit administratif
Awb	Algemene wet bestuursrecht
BNB	Beslissingen in belastingzaken / Nederlandse Belastingrechtspraak
BVerfG	Bundesverfassungsgericht
BVerfGE	Entscheidungen des Bundersverfassungsgericht
BVerfGG	Gesetz über das Bundesverfassungsgericht
BVerwG	Bundesverwaltungsgericht
BVerwGE	Entscheidungen des Bundesverwaltungsgericht
CC	Conseil Constitutionnel
CE	Conseil d'État
CMLR	Common Market Law Reporter
CMLRev	Common Market Law Review
DC	Décision portant declaration de conformité à la Constitution
DVBl	Deutsches Verwaltungsblatt
EC	(former) Treaty on the European Community
EEC	(former) Treaty on the European Economic Community
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECJ	European Court of Justice
ECR	European Court Reports
ELRev	European Law Review
EU	European Union
EuZW	Europäische Zeitschrift für Wirtschaftsrecht
GG	Grundgesetz
Gw	Grondwet
HR	Hoge Raad
JuS	Juristische Schulung
JZ	Juristenzeitung
L	Décision rendue sur examen de textes de forme législative

Abbreviations

LJN	Landelijk Jurisprudentie Nummer
M en R	Milieu en Recht
NJ	Nederlandse Jurisprudentie
NJB	Nederlands Juristenblad
NTB	Nederlands Tijdschrift voor Bestuursrecht
NTER	Nederlands Tijdschrift voor Europees Recht
NVwZ	Neue Zeitschrift für Verwaltungsrecht
RDP	Revue du Droit Public
Realaw	Review of European Administrative Law
Rec.	Recueil des decisions du Conseil d'État
Rfda	Revue Française de Droit administratif
RFDC	Revue Française de Droit consitutionnel
RTDE	Revue Trimestrielle de droit Européen
SEW	Sociaal-Economische Wetgeving
TEU	Treaty on the European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the functioning of the European Union
VwGO	Verwaltungsgerichtsordnung
VwVfG	Verwaltungsverfahrensgesetz