

EUROPEAN YEARBOOK OF DISABILITY LAW

European Yearbook of Disability Law

Editors:

Prof. Gerard Quinn
National University of Ireland, Galway (IRL)

Prof. Lisa Waddington
European Disability Forum Chair in European Disability Law
Maastricht University (NLs)

Editorial Board:

Prof. Theresia Degener
Evangelischen Fachhochschule Rheinland-Westfalen-Lippe (GER)

Prof. Aart Hendriks,
Chair in Health Law, University of Leiden (NLs)

Prof. Bjørn Hvinden
Head of Research & Deputy Director NOVA, (NO)

Dovile Juodkaite
Director, Global Initiative on Psychiatry – Vilnius (LI)

Anna Lawson
Senior Lecturer in Law and Member of the Centre for Disability Studies, Leeds
University (UK)

Oliver Lewis
Executive Director, Mental Disability Advocacy Center, Budapest (HU)

John Parry
Director, Commission on Mental & Physical Disability Law, American Bar
Association (US)

Shivaun Quinlivan
Law Lecturer, National University of Ireland, Galway (IRL)

Advisory Board:

Prof. Peter Blanck
Chairman, The Burton Blatt Institute, Syracuse University (US)

Prof. Christopher McCrudden
Lincoln College, Oxford University (GB)

Prof. Michael Stein
William & Mary School of Law and Executive Director, Harvard Project on
Disability Harvard Law School (US)

Yannis Vardakastanis
President of the European Disability Forum (EU)

EUROPEAN YEARBOOK OF DISABILITY LAW

Volume 2

Edited by

Lisa WADDINGTON

Gerard QUINN



Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

Distribution for the UK:

Hart Publishing
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX12JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 51 75 30
Fax: +44 1865 51 07 10

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Tel.: +1 503 287 3093
Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Vienna
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishers
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Fax: +32 3 658 71 21

European Yearbook of Disability Law. Volume 2

Lisa Waddington and Gerard Quinn (eds.)

© 2010 Intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
www.intersentia.com

ISBN 978-94-000-0128-2
D/2010/7849/124
NUR 825

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We are immensely grateful to the many people who have contributed, in various ways, to this volume of the Yearbook. First, we would like to thank Andrea Coomber (INTERIGHTS, International Centre for the Protection of Human Rights) who took the lead in authoring the review on the work of the Council of Europe. We are also very grateful to Colm O’Cinneide (University College London), who contributed to this section of the review, and to Dalindyebo Shabalala (Maastricht University), who contributed the section on the proposed Treaty on Copyright Exceptions and Limitations for Persons with Visual Impairments at the World Intellectual Property Organization, found in the review of the work of other European Intergovernmental Organizations and Civil Society Groups. We would also like to express other thanks to Anna Lawson (Leeds University) who assisted with the editing of the section on the review of the work of the Council of Europe, and Janina Arsenjeva (European Disability Forum), who provided us with useful feedback on the review of work of the European Union. We are grateful to Laura Visser (student assistant, Maastricht University) who ensured that all the papers were compliant with the Yearbook’s style sheet and, in particular, Karen Walsh (NUI Galway) who took the lead in drafting all remaining sections on the review and provided invaluable assistance and support throughout the production of this volume. Lastly, we express our thanks to the authors who contributed articles to this volume, the anonymous peer reviewers who help us to ensure the quality of the articles published, and members of our editorial and advisory boards.

Lisa Waddington and Gerard Quinn

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EDITORIAL TRACING AN EVENTFUL YEAR IN EUROPEAN DISABILITY LAW AND POLICY

GERARD QUINN and LISA WADDINGTON 1

PART I: ARTICLES AND PRACTITIONERS' NOTES 5

THE UN DISABILITY CONVENTION AND (MULTIPLE) DISCRIMINATION: SHOULD EU NON-DISCRIMINATION LAW BE MODELLED ACCORDINGLY?

AART HENDRIKS..... 7

1. Introduction 7
2. What is (Multiple) Discrimination?..... 10
 - 2.1. Discrimination..... 10
 - 2.2. Forms of Discrimination..... 12
 - 2.3. Multiple Discrimination..... 14
3. Disability and Multiple Discrimination 17
4. Disability, other Protected Grounds and the CRPD Approach Towards Combating Multiple Discrimination..... 22
5. Current Protection Offered by EU Law Against Multiple Discrimination..... 23
6. Discussion and Conclusions 26

THE LAW AND POLITICS OF US PARTICIPATION IN THE UN CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES

MICHAEL ASHLEY STEIN, JANET E. LORD, and PENELOPE J.S. STEIN 29

1. Introduction 29
2. Overview of American Disability Law..... 30
 - 2.1. Theoretical Underpinnings 31
 - 2.2. Practical Limitations 32
3. Consequences of United States Ratification 35
 - 3.1. Introspective Review 35
 - 3.2. Fostering Dialogue..... 38
 - 3.3. International Relations 40
 - 3.4. Transatlantic Dialogue 44
4. Conclusion 45

THE CONCLUSION OF THE UN CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES BY THE EC/EU: A CONSTITUTIONAL PERSPECTIVE	
DELIA FERRI	47
1. Introduction	47
2. The Text of the UN CRPD: A Brief Overview	51
3. The Conclusion of the UN CRPD by the EC/EU	56
4. The UN CRPD: Status and Effects Within the EU Legal System.....	62
5. Concluding Remarks.....	68
 INTRODUCTION TO THE SYMPOSIUM: DIGITAL FREEDOM AND DISABILITY – LESSONS FROM EUROPE AND THE UNITED STATES	
RUNE HALVORSEN	73
 DIGITAL FREEDOM FOR PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: ARE POLICIES TO ENHANCE E-ACCESSIBILITY AND E-INCLUSION BECOMING MORE SIMILAR IN THE NORDIC COUNTRIES AND THE US?	
RUNE HALVORSEN	77
1. Introduction	77
2. Comparing Institutional Differences in e-Accessibility and e-Inclusion Policy.....	78
3. E-Accessibility Regulations and Achievements in the Nordic Countries and the US.....	81
4. Social Redistribution and e-Inclusion in the Nordic Countries and the US	88
5. Explaining the Differing Profiles of Nordic and US e-Accessibility and e-Inclusion Policy.....	92
6. Will Supranational Organizations Further Convergence in e-Accessibility and e-Inclusion Policy Between the Nordic Countries and the US?	96
7. Conclusions	101
 LAW AND POLICY CHALLENGES FOR ACHIEVING AN ACCESSIBLE ESOCIETY: LESSONS FROM THE UNITED STATES	
WILLIAM N. MYHILL.....	103
1. Introduction	103
2. The Patchwork of Federal Law	106
2.1. Pre-ICT Proliferation Era.....	106
2.2. Public Internet Era.....	108
3. Progress and Shortcomings of Federal Law	112
4. Accessibility of the Internet and Higher Education ICTs	117
4.1. Internet Accessibility.....	118
4.2. Common Law and Litigation	120
5. Bringing About Uniformity of ICT Accessibility: Legislative and Alternate Mechanisms	123
5.1. Select Legislative Solutions.....	123

5.2.	Alternative Mechanisms.....	125
6.	Conclusion.....	129

**CHALLENGING DISABLING BARRIERS TO INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION
TECHNOLOGY IN THE INFORMATION SOCIETY: A UNITED KINGDOM PERSPECTIVE**

ANNA LAWSON.....	131
------------------	-----

1.	Introduction.....	131
2.	Equality Law Mechanisms.....	134
2.1.	Overview.....	134
2.2.	Types of Claim.....	135
2.2.1.	Disability-Related Discrimination.....	135
2.2.2.	Reasonable Adjustment Duties.....	136
2.2.2.1.	Scope.....	136
2.2.2.2.	Employment.....	136
2.2.2.3.	Goods and Services (Including Education, Transport and Public Functions).....	138
2.2.2.4.	Reasonable Adjustment and Access to Information.....	139
2.2.3.	The Disability Equality Duty.....	140
2.3.	Enforcement.....	142
3.	Market Regulation Mechanisms.....	144
4.	Social Protection Mechanisms.....	145
5.	Conclusion.....	147

**REMOVING ACCESSIBILITY BARRIERS TO TELECOMMUNICATIONS:
A PRE-REQUISITE FOR SOCIAL INCLUSION OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES
CONTRIBUTION FROM THE EUROPEAN DISABILITY FORUM**

RODOLFO CATTANI.....	149
----------------------	-----

**CONTRIBUTION FROM THE COMMISSIONER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS OF THE COUNCIL
OF EUROPE**

THOMAS HAMMARBERG.....	153
------------------------	-----

1.	Introduction.....	153
2.	The Commissioner's Approach and Working Methods.....	153
3.	Specific Issues of Concern to the Commissioner Regarding the Human Rights of Persons with Disabilities.....	155
3.1.	Implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.....	155
3.2.	Children with Disabilities.....	155
3.3.	Ageing Persons with Disabilities.....	156
3.4.	Persons with Mental Disabilities.....	156
3.4.1.	Legal Capacity.....	157
4.	Future Challenges - Conclusions.....	157
4.1.	Combating Discrimination.....	158
4.2.	National Action Plans.....	158

PART II: ANNUAL REVIEW OF EUROPEAN LAW AND POLICY	161
THE EUROPEAN UNION	163
1. Background to the European Union and Disability	163
1.1. Strategic Direction	165
1.1.1. Current Strategy: The European Disability Action Plan 2003-2010 ..	166
1.1.2. EU Disability Strategy 2010-2020	167
1.2. Legislative Measures	168
1.2.1. Entry into Force of the Lisbon Treaty	168
1.2.2. Council Directive 2000/78/EC of 27 November 2000 Establishing a General Framework for Equal Treatment in Employment and Occupation	170
1.2.3. Proposal for a Council Directive on Implementing the Principle of Equal Treatment Between Persons Irrespective of Religion or Belief, Disability, Age or Sexual Orientation (2008)	171
1.2.4. Proposal for a Regulation Concerning the Rights of Passengers when Traveling by Sea and Inland Waterway;	175
Proposal for a Regulation on the Rights of Passengers in Bus and Coach Transport	175
1.2.5. EU Telecoms Reform Package	178
1.3. The EU and International Legal Developments	180
1.3.1. Signature and Conclusion by the EC/EC of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities	180
1.4. Recent Developments in Miscellaneous Fields	182
2. Activities of the European Commission	182
2.1. Directorate General for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities	183
2.1.1. Unit for the Integration of People with Disabilities	183
2.1.2. Unit for Equality, Action against Discrimination: Legal Questions ..	185
2.1.3. Unit on Action against Discrimination, Civil Society	187
2.2. Directorate General for Health and Consumers	190
2.3. Directorate General for Mobility and Transport	192
2.4. Directorate General for Internal Market and Services	192
2.5. Directorate General for Competition	195
2.6. Directorate General for Enterprise and Industry	198
2.7. The Information Society and Media Directorate General	200
2.8. Eurostat	201
3. Activities of the Council of the European Union	202
3.1. Activities Under the Open Method of Coordination	202
3.1.1. Open Method of Coordination - Social Protection and Social Inclusion	202
3.1.2. Open Method of Coordination – European Employment Strategy ...	204
3.2. EU Presidency and Ministerial Conferences on Disability	206
4. Current Activities of the European Parliament	206
4.1. Activities of the Disability Intergroup of the European Parliament ..	206
5. Case Law of the Court of Justice of the European Union	209
5.1. The Powers of the Court of Justice of the European Union	209
5.2. Recently Decided Cases	210

5.2.1.	Gottwald v. Bezirkshauptmannschaft Bregenz.....	210
5.2.2.	Joined Cases Gerhard Schultz-Hoff v. Deutsche Rentenversicherung Bund and Stringer and Others v. Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs.....	212
5.2.3.	Francisco Vicente Pereda v. Madrid Movilidad SA.....	214
5.2.4.	Ketty Leyman v Institut national d'assurance maladie-invalidite (INAMI).....	215
5.2.5.	Evangelina Gomez-Limon Sanchez-Camacho v Instituto Nacional de la Seguridad Social (INSS), Tesoreria General de la Seguridad Social (TGSS) and Alcampo SA	217
5.2.6.	Petra von Chamier-Glisczynski v Deutsche Angestellten- Krankenkasse	220
5.3.	Cases Pending.....	222
5.3.1.	Lucy Stewart v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions	222
5.3.2.	Ralph James Bartlett, Natalio Gonzalez Ramos, Jason Michael Taylor v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions.....	222
6.	European Economic and Social Committee	223
6.1.	2009 Opinions with a Disability Dimension.....	224
7.	Activities of the European Union Fundamental Rights Agency	227
8.	Studies and Reports.....	230
8.1.	Study on the Situation of Women with Disabilities in Light of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities – A Final Report for the DG Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities of the European Commission.....	230
8.2.	Report of the <i>Ad Hoc</i> Expert Group on the Transition from Institutional to Community-Based Care.....	231
8.3.	International Perspectives on Positive Action Measures – A Comparative Analysis in the European Union, Canada, The United States and South Africa.....	232
8.4.	Various Reports Published By The Academic Network of European Disability Experts (ANED).....	234
8.4.1.	European Comparative Data on the Situation of Disabled People: An Annotated Review	234
8.4.2.	The Labour Market Situation of Disabled People in European Countries and Implementation of Employment Policies: A Summary of Evidence from Country Reports and Research Studies.	235
8.4.3.	Monitoring the Implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in Europe: Principles for the Identification and Use of Indicators	236
8.4.4.	The Implementation of EU Social Inclusion and Social Protection Strategies in European Countries with Reference to Equality for Disabled People	236
8.4.5.	Annotated Review of European Legislation which Makes a Reference to Disability	238
8.4.6.	Indicators of Disability Equality in Europe (IDEE) – A Preliminary List of Indicator Proposals for Discussion.....	238
8.4.7.	The Implementation of Policies Supporting Independent Living for Disabled People in Europe: Synthesis Report.....	239

8.5.	European Research Agendas for Disability Equality (EuRADE) – Policy Statement.....	240
9.	European Day of People with Disabilities.....	241
9.1.	European Day of People with Disabilities 2009 (3-4 December 2009).....	241
THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE		243
1.	Background to the Council of Europe and Disability.....	243
1.1.	The Role and Institutions of the Council of Europe.....	243
1.2.	The Strategic Direction of the Council of Europe on Disability.....	245
2.	The European Court of Human Rights and Recent Case Law on Disability.....	247
2.1.	The Convention and the Court.....	247
2.2.	Background, Proceedings and Jurisdiction of the Court.....	247
2.3.	Court Reform.....	249
2.4.	Disability and the Court.....	251
2.5.	Recent Disability Related Case Law.....	253
2.5.1.	General Disability Related Case Law.....	253
2.5.1.1.	Glor v. Switzerland.....	253
2.5.1.2.	G.N. and others v. Italy.....	256
2.5.1.3.	Savin and Savina v. Ukraine.....	258
2.5.1.4.	Salontaji-Drobnjak v. Serbia.....	260
2.5.1.5.	Codarcea v. Romania.....	262
2.5.2.	Case Law Concerning Conditions of Detention for Persons with Disabilities.....	263
2.5.2.1.	Paladi v Moldova.....	263
2.5.2.2.	Sławomir Musiał v. Poland.....	265
2.5.2.3.	Kats and Others v. Ukraine.....	266
2.5.2.4.	Kılavuz v. Turkey.....	268
2.3.	Pending Applications of Interest.....	269
2.3.1.	Câmpeanu v. Romania.....	269
2.3.2.	Farcas v. Romania.....	271
3.	European Social Charter.....	272
3.1.	Background of the European Social Charter and Committee.....	272
3.2.	Recent Conclusions of the European Committee of Social Rights on State Party Reports on Disability.....	274
3.3.	Recent Decisions of the European Committee of Social Rights on Collective Complaints and Disability.....	275
3.3.1.	European Roma Rights Centre (ERRC) v. Bulgaria (Revised Social Charter, Decision of June 2008).....	275
4.	European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhumane or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT).....	276
4.1.	Background of the CPT.....	276
4.2.	The CPT Standards and Disability.....	277
4.3.	The 2009 CPT General Report.....	278
4.4.	Country Visits of the CPT and Disability.....	278
4.4.1.	CPT Visit to Azerbaijan (2008).....	279
4.4.2.	CPT Visit to the United Kingdom (2008).....	280

4.4.3.	CPT Visit to Greece (2008).....	281
4.4.4.	CPT Visit to French Guyana (2008)	281
4.4.5.	CPT Visit to Slovakia (2009).....	282
4.4.6.	CPT Visit to Sweden (2009)	283
4.4.7.	CPT Visit to Latvia (2009).....	283
4.4.8.	CPT Visit to Abkhazia, Georgia (2009)	285
4.4.9.	CPT Visit to Moldova (2009)	286
5.	The Council of Europe Human Rights Commissioner and Disability	287
5.1.	Background and Role	287
5.2.	Recent Activity of the Commissioner on Disability	287
5.2.1.	Viewpoints	288
5.2.1.1.	Viewpoint on Intellectual Disability	288
5.2.1.2.	Viewpoint on Legal Capacity	289
5.2.1.3.	Viewpoint on De-Institutionalization of Orphans and Children with Disabilities	289
5.2.2.	Country Visits	290
5.2.2.1.	Report on Visit to the Netherlands.....	290
5.2.2.2.	Report on Visit to Serbia	291
5.2.2.3.	Report on Visit to Monaco.....	292
5.2.2.4.	Report on Visit to Kosovo	292
5.2.2.5.	Report on Visit to Turkey	293
5.2.2.6.	Report on Visit to Bulgaria	293
5.2.3.	Recommendations	295
6.	The Parliamentary Assembly and the Committee of Ministers and Disability	296
6.1.	Resolution 1642 (2009) and Recommendation 1854 (2009) - Access to Rights for People with Disabilities and Their Full and Active Participation in Society, and Committee of Ministers Response.....	296
6.2.	Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers to Member States on Ageing and Disability in the 21st Century: Sustainable Frameworks to Enable Greater Quality of Life in an Inclusive Society.....	297
6.3.	Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers to Member States on Monitoring the Protection of Human Rights and Dignity of Persons with Mental Disorder.....	297
6.4.	Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers to Member States on Achieving Full Participation Through Universal Design	298
6.5.	Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers to Member States to Encourage the Education and Social Inclusion of Children and Young People with Autism Spectrum Disorders	299
6.6.	Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers to Member States on Principles Concerning Continuing Powers of Attorney and Advance Directives for Incapacity.....	299
6.7.	Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers to Member States on Deinstitutionalization and Community Living of Children with Disabilities	300
6.8.	Council of Europe Conference on Women and Disabilities	300

OTHER EUROPEAN INTERGOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS AND CIVIL SOCIETY GROUPS	303
1. European Intergovernmental Organizations	303
1.1. Organization for Economic Co-operation & Development (OECD) .	303
1.2. World Health Organization – Regional Office for Europe	305
1.3. The Proposed Treaty on Copyright Exceptions and Limitations for Persons with Visual Impairments at the World Intellectual Property Organization	309
2. European Civil Society Organizations	317
2.1. The European Disability Forum	317
2.2. Inclusion Europe	322
2.3. European Network on Independent Living (ENIL)	327
2.4. The European Coalition for Community Living (ECCL)	331
2.5. Mental Disability Advocacy Centre (MDAC)	333
3. Studies & Reports	337
3.1. The International Convention on The Rights of People with Disabilities and Its Impact on the Spanish Legal System	337
PART III: LITERATURE REVIEW	339
LITERATURE REVIEW	341
1. Disability Law and Policy Books	341
2. Disability Law and Policy Journal Articles	347
PART IV: ANNEX OF KEY DOCUMENTATION	365
COUNCIL DECISION OF 26 DECEMBER 2009 CONCERNING THE CONCLUSION, BY THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITY OF THE UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES	367
COUNCIL CONCLUSIONS ON ACCESSIBLE INFORMATION SOCIETY	379
RECOMMENDATION CM/REC(2010)2 OF THE COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS TO MEMBER STATES ON DEINSTITUTIONALISATION AND COMMUNITY LIVING OF CHILDREN WITH DISABILITIES	385
EDF PROPOSAL FOR A EUROPEAN PACT ON DISABILITY	395
WASTED TIME, WASTED MONEY, WASTED LIVES...A WASTED OPPORTUNITY? - EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	
ECCL FOCUS REPORT ON HOW THE CURRENT USE OF STRUCTURAL FUNDS PERPETUATES THE SOCIAL EXCLUSION OF DISABLED PEOPLE IN CENTRAL AND EASTERN EUROPE BY FAILING TO SUPPORT THE TRANSITION FROM INSTITUTIONAL CARE TO COMMUNITY-BASED SERVICES	403