

SOCIAL SECURITY AS A PUBLIC INTEREST

A multidisciplinary inquiry
into the foundations of the
regulatory welfare state

Edited by

Gijsbert VONK
Albertjan TOLLENAAR

In co-operation with:

Alex CORRÀ
Mirjam PLANTINGA
KO DE RIDDER
Bram RIJPKEMA



intersentia

Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

Distribution for the UK:
Hart Publishing Ltd.
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 51 75 30
Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Tel.: +1 503 287 3093
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinerstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishers
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Social Security as a Public Interest
Gijsbert Vonk and Albertjan Tollenaar

© 2010 Intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
www.intersentia.com

ISBN 978-94-000-0110-7
D/2010/7849/18
NUR 825

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is the result of the research programme 'public governance and the welfare state'. The members of the research group are Gijsbert Vonk (programme leader), Ko de Ridder (supervision), Mirjam Plantinga, Albertjan Tollenaar (both post doctoral researchers), Bram Rijpkema and Alex Corrà (both PhD fellows). They are all affiliated with the University of Groningen. The researchers wish to acknowledge their gratitude to the Stichting Instituut Gak (SIG) that funded this research programme.

Earlier versions of the chapters included in the book have been discussed at an international conference organized by the newly founded Groningen Centre for Law and Governance (GCL). The GCL (www.rug.nl/gcl) conducts legal research into the balance between public and private interests.

Groningen, July 2010

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xiii

Research plan and outline of the book

Gijsbert VONK and Albertjan TOLLENAAR	1
1. Background and purpose of this study	1
2. Central research questions and composition of this book	2
3. Some preliminary observations	3
3.1. Social security as a public interest: a tautology?	3
3.2. Chosen abstraction	5
3.3. Social security versus social welfare	5
3.4. Nature and ambit of the study	5
4. Short analysis of the contributions	6
4.1. Part A: Social security as a public interest	6
4.2. Part B: The instrumentalisation of the public interest: towards the regulatory welfare state	11
5. Conclusions	16
5.1. Social security as a public interest	16
5.2. Social security and private responsibility	16
5.3. Division of responsibilities between the state and others	17
5.4. Clouds on the horizon: the instrumentalisation of the public interest	18
5.5. The regulatory welfare state: a viable concept?	18

PART A

SOCIAL SECURITY AS A PUBLIC INTEREST

The public interest in social security: an economic perspective

Andries NENTJES and Edwin WOERDMAN	23
1. Introduction	23
2. An economic definition of the public interest	24
3. Market failure and the emergence of social security	27
3.1. Caring: an economic theory of solidarity	27

3.2. Solidarity in the Netherlands	30
3.3. Mandatory insurance for wage-dependent workers	34
3.4. Summary	39
4. The economic-political life cycle in social security	39
5. Public sector failures and the reform of social security	41
5.1. Overproduction	42
5.2. Overconsumption	44
5.3. Lack of choice	45
5.4. X-inefficiency	45
5.5. Lack of innovation	47
6. Conclusion	47
The public interests of social security: a social science perspective	
Mirjam PLANTINGA	49
1. Introduction	49
2. State of the art	50
2.1. From public interests to public values	50
2.2. Identifying public values	51
2.3. Identifying public values failures	53
3. Applying the social science approach to the welfare state	54
3.1. Identifying public values in welfare states	54
3.2. Identifying public values failures in welfare states	55
4. Identifying public values failures in Western welfare states	58
4.1. Western welfare states	58
4.2. Public support for Western welfare states	59
4.3. Explaining differences in public support	61
5. Towards an interdisciplinary approach to defining public interests	63
The public interest and the welfare state: a legal approach	
Gijsbert VONK and George KATROUGALOS	67
1. Introduction	67
2. The public interest as a legal concept	68
3. The historical foundation of social security as a socio-economic right	69
3.1. The 'social question' of the 19 th century	69
3.2. The constitutionalisation of socio-economic rights	71
4. Social security as a fundamental socio-economic right; state responsibility	74
5. Social security; substantive legal standards	79
5.1. Protection	81
5.2. Universality	83

5.3. Inclusion.....	84
5.4. Reliability.....	86
5.5. Solidarity.....	87
5.6. Equality and non discrimination.....	88
5.7. Good governance.....	89
6. Concluding remarks.....	90

The public interest and the welfare state: contemporary political philosophy

Onno BRINKMAN.....	91
1. Introduction.....	91
2. The communitarian roots of social security.....	93
3. Egalitarian liberalism.....	97
3.1. Capability approach.....	100
3.2. Luck egalitarianism.....	101
3.3. Democratic liberalism.....	102
4. Libertarianism.....	103
4.1. Nozick.....	103
4.2. Left libertarians.....	107
5. Communitarian criticism.....	108
5.1. MacIntyre.....	108
5.2. Walzer.....	109
5.3. Etzioni and Giddens.....	111
6. Balance.....	112
7. Epilogue.....	116

PART B

THE INSTRUMENTALISATION OF THE PUBLIC INTEREST

Instrumentalisation of the public interest in social security:

an economic perspective

Andries NENTJES and Edwin WOERDMAN.....	119
1. Introduction.....	119
2. Three decades of repair and reconstruction.....	120
2.1. Macro-economic signals.....	120
2.2. Lower benefits, fewer entitlements, more obligations.....	121
2.3. Restricting eligibility.....	122
2.4. Changing public sector supply incentives.....	124
2.5. Mitigating X-inefficiency.....	125
2.6. Strengthening competition between suppliers.....	126
2.7. Increasing choice for consumers.....	129
3. Construction and reconstruction in health care.....	130

4. A paradigm change?	132
5. Conclusion	134

Instrumentalisation of public values in social security:
a public administration perspective

KO DE RIDDER	137
--------------------	-----

1. Introduction	137
2. Safeguarding	139
3. Variations in safeguarding	141
3.1. Variations in intervention	141
3.2. Variations in levels of safeguarding	143
3.3. Variations in the tools of government	144
4. Safeguarding public values in social security	145
5. Safeguarding at the input side	146
6. Safeguarding through system design	148
7. Safeguarding at the output side	149
8. Conclusion	151

Instrumentalisation of public interests: a legal perspective

Albertjan TOLLENAAR	153
---------------------------	-----

1. Introduction	153
1.1. The legal character of instruments	153
1.2. Approach	154
2. Law as a safeguarding instrument	154
2.1. Identifying legal instruments	154
2.2. Legislative powers	155
2.3. Division of powers between the administration and the judiciary ..	157
2.4. Private law as a safeguarding instrument	161
3. Legal safeguarding instruments in social security	163
3.1. Legislative powers in social security	164
3.2. The division of powers between the administration and the judiciary	167
3.3. Private law as a safeguarding instrument in social security	169
4. How do the legal instruments work?	171

Instrumentalisation of the public sphere: a philosophical perspective

Pauline WESTERMAN	173
-------------------------	-----

1. Introduction	173
2. Making oneself understood	174
3. Degrees of abstraction	177

4. Public interests	179
5. The welfare state and the public sphere	181
6. Alternatives: the norm-addressees	185
7. The judiciary	188
8. Possible directions	190
9. Conclusion	192

PART C

CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS & PROSPECTS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

Conference proceedings	197
1. Introduction	197
2. Defining public interests	197
2.1. Finding the equilibrium	197
2.2. The social context of the welfare state	199
2.3. The origin of the welfare state	202
3. Instruments to safeguard public interests	203
3.1. The necessity of a strong public sphere	203
3.2. Muddling through or the pursuit of values	204
3.3. The need for a careful analysis, in the light of international standards, of private social security arrangements	206
Prospects for the regulatory welfare state: recommendations for further research into social markets	
Gijsbert VONK and Albertjan TOLLENAAR	209
1. The outcome of the experiment	209
2. Articulating the public interest	210
3. Governance instruments	210
4. Conceptualising social markets	211
<i>List of references</i>	213
<i>About the authors</i>	227

ABBREVIATIONS

BGB	Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch (German Civil Code)
BW	Burgerlijk Wetboek (Dutch Civil Code)
CBS	Centraal Bureau voor de Statistiek (Statistics Netherlands)
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CFREU	Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union
CPB	Centraal Plan Bureau (Netherlands Bureau for Economic Policy Analysis)
EC	European Commission
ECJ	European Court of Justice
ECSR	European Committee of Social Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EEC	European Economic Community
ESC	European Social Charter
EU	European Union
ICESR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ILO	International Labour Organization
SGB	Sozialgesetzbuch (German Social Security Act)
VAT	Value Added Tax
UN	United Nations
UWV	Uitvoeringsinstituut WerknemersVerzekeringen (Netherlands Employee Insurance Agency)