

COLLECTIVE VIOLENCE
AND INTERNATIONAL
CRIMINAL JUSTICE

An interdisciplinary approach

Edited by

Alette SMEULERS

Distribution for the UK:
Hart Publishing Ltd.
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 51 75 30
Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Tel.: +1 503 287 3093
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinerstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishers
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Collective Violence and International Criminal Justice – An Interdisciplinary Approach
Alette Smeulers (ed.)

© 2010 Intersentia
Antwerpen – Oxford – Portland
www.intersentia.com

Cover illustration: Francisco De Goya (1746–1828), Etching, Plate 19 from ‘Los desastres de la guerra’

ISBN 978-94-000-0099-5
D/2010/7849/100
NUR 824

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This conference book is the outcome of an expert-meeting organized in June 2009 by the Amsterdam Centre of Interdisciplinary Research on International Crimes and Security (ACIC) which is based at the VU University in Amsterdam. The expert-meeting was financed by the Netherlands Science Organization (NWO) for the research project entitled 'A criminological approach to individual criminal responsibility for international crimes' in the innovational research incentive scheme and which had been granted to me in December 2005. A first expert-meeting was organized in April 2007 at Maastricht University. The conference book thereof was also published by Intersentia in this series and is entitled: *Supranational criminology: towards a criminology of international crimes* and was edited by Roelof Haveman and myself. This book is a follow up on the first conference book.

I wish to thank a number of people for helping to organize the conference and for their support or advice with the editing of the conference book, namely Elies van Sliedregt, Lotte Hoex, Barbora Holá, Klaas Rozemond, Nicole Lijs and Diana Turcas. I would furthermore like to thank all the contributors to the conference book for their contributions. I am also grateful to the participants of the expert-meeting who did not submit a chapter but nevertheless contributed to the discussions during the expert-meeting: Elies van Sliedregt, Leila Sadat and Larissa van den Herik. I furthermore wish to thank Stephan Parmentier and Howard Morrison who both turned out to be excellent chairs and thus greatly contributed to the success of the meeting by ensuring a continuous and lively debate.

I sincerely hope that this book will further contribute to this newly developing field of international crimes and of international criminology and that it will stimulate the academic and interdisciplinary debate on international crimes in order to enhance our knowledge and understanding of these crimes and thus ultimately contribute to preventing such crimes in the future.

Alette Smeulers
Amsterdam, June 4 2010

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements v

INTRODUCTION

Chapter 1. Collective violence and international criminal justice –
towards an interdisciplinary approach

Alette SMEULERS 3

1. Introduction 3

2. A brief history of the international criminal justice system 3

3. New areas of expertise 6

4. Outline of the book 8

References 13

PART I.

PERPETRATORS OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMES

Chapter 2. The ordinariness of extraordinary evil: the making of
perpetrators of collective violence

James E. WALLER 19

1. Introduction 19

2. Ordinary origins of extraordinary human evil 22

3. Cultural construction of worldview 26

4. Psychological construction of the “other” 28

5. Social construction of cruelty 31

6. Conclusion 36

References 37

Chapter 3. Rethinking the subjectivity of perpetrators of political violence

Don FOSTER 39

1. Introduction 39

2. Dominant accounts of perpetrators 40

3. Criticism of the dominant accounts 42

4. An alternative approach 44

5. Two case studies	48
5.1. The Eichmann case	48
5.2. The case of John Deegan	54
6. Implications and concluding remarks	58
References	60

PART II.

COLLECTIVE CRIMES – INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITY

Chapter 4. Discourses on international criminality Athanasios CHOULIARAS	65
---	----

1. Introduction	65
2. The collective nature of core crimes as the common ground of different fields of knowledge	67
3. Criminology: state and state-corporate crime as instances of organizational deviance	70
4. International criminal law: looking for the individual criminal, losing the delinquent state	77
4.1. Contextual elements and admissibility criteria: ‘Walks like a duck, swims like a duck, and quacks like a duck’... Ain’t a duck!	78
4.2. Modes of individual criminal liability: in search of the organizational role	84
5. The rationale for the international criminal justice system	89
6. Discussion	92
References	94

Chapter 5. Ascribing individual liability within a bureaucracy of murder Mark OSIEL	105
--	-----

1. Introduction	105
2. Easing superior responsibility: a new concept of effective control	106
2.1. Roxin’s theory of “domination over an organizational apparatus”	107
3. Difficulties with Roxin’s approach: a post-Weberian update	110
3.1. The fungibility of subordinates	114
3.2. Discretion enjoyed by subordinates	114
3.3. Non-western military organization	116
3.4. Shifting the evidentiary onus	119
3.5. The sociology of mass atrocity	122
3.6. The mental element	124
4. Conclusion	125
References	127

Chapter 6. Seizing the “Grotian Moment”: application of joint criminal enterprise liability to the proceedings of the Cambodia genocide tribunal Michael P. SCHARF.	131
1. Introduction	131
2. Did the Nuremberg precedent establish JCE as customary international law?	134
2.1. Application of JCE at Nuremberg.	134
2.2. Nuremberg as a “Grotian Moment”	143
2.3. The Concept of “Grotian Moment”	146
3. Conclusion	148
References	151
 Chapter 7. Criminologically explained reality of genocide, structure of the offence and the ‘intent to destroy’ requirement Kai AMBOS	 153
1. Introduction	153
2. Typologies in criminology	154
3. The significance of the criminological typology of perpetrators for the offence of genocide	159
4. Correspondence of categories of international criminal law with criminological typologies of perpetrators	163
4.1. Regarding top-level perpetrators “intent to destroy” means knowledge and purpose	166
4.2. As to mid-level perpetrators the knowledge-based approach is applicable	166
4.3. Regarding the low-level perpetrators it is necessary to distinguish between state agents and private actors. While the former are normally informed about the genocidal (state) plan, the latter are not	168
5. Conclusion: the structure of the genocide offence in light of the criminological findings	170
References	171
 Chapter 8. ICTY and the culpability of different types of perpetrators of international crimes Alette SMEULERS and Barbora HOLÁ	 175
1. Introduction	175
2. Culpability of different types of perpetrators	179
2.1. Highest level of blameworthiness: criminal masterminds	180
2.2. High level of blameworthiness: careerists and fanatics	181

2.3. Medium level of blameworthiness: devoted warriors	183
2.4. Low level of blameworthiness: “criminals and sadists” and the otherwise law abiding citizens	185
2.5. Lowest level of blameworthiness: compromised perpetrator	188
3. ICTY sentencing case law	188
4. Empirical findings	190
4.1. Methodology	190
4.1.1. Data Collection	190
4.1.2. Method	193
4.2. Results	194
4.3. Discussion	200
5. Conclusions	203
References	204

Chapter 9. Child soldiers: agency, enlistment, and the collectivization of
innocence

Mark A. DRUMBL	207
1. Introduction	207
2. Criminally punishing adults for the conscription, enlistment, or use of child soldiers in hostilities	210
2.1. Special Court for Sierra Leone	210
2.2. International Criminal Court	213
2.3. The agency of child soldiers: assumptions, narratives, and strategies	215
2.4. Conclusion	218
3. How do children end up in fighting forces?	218
3.1. Forced conscription	219
3.2. Voluntary enlistment	222
3.3. Summary	226
4. Conclusion	227
References	229

PART III.

REFLECTIONS ON INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL JUSTICE AND
THE ICC

Chapter 10. The rough edges of the delicate mosaic: complexity theory
and the early practice of the International Criminal Court

Salim A. NAKHJAVANI	235
1. Introduction	235
2. Some characteristics of complex adaptive systems	237

3. Lens, metaphor, analogy, model ... or nothing at all?	239
4. Seeking complexity in international criminal justice	243
4.1. The entry-into-force of the Rome Statute sets in motion a nonlinear, dynamic system	243
4.2. Outcomes of decisions of the Court may be sensitively dependent on initial conditions and path-dependent	245
4.3. The Rome Statute may co-evolve with ‘neighboring’ treaties	246
5. Novel insights or repackaged goods?	250
References	251

Chapter 11. The law and politics of self-referrals

Sarah NOUWEN and Wouter WERNER	255
--------------------------------------	-----

1. Introduction	255
2. Self-referrals and complementarity	257
2.1. Inaction as a ground for admissibility	260
2.2. Narrowing down the definition of a ‘case’	264
2.3. Broadening the concept of unwillingness	265
2.4. Conclusion: legal aspects of self-referrals	267
3. The politics of self-referrals	267
3.1. ICC politics	267
3.2. National politics	268
3.3. Conclusion: politics of self-referrals	269
References	270

PART IV.

FROM FACTS TO FIGURES

Chapter 12. On research methods for international crimes –
methodological issues in the empirical study of international crimes

Catrien BIJLEVELD	275
-------------------------	-----

1. Introduction	275
2. Criminological areas of study	276
3. Methodological backdrop to social science research	278
3.1. Working with samples	278
3.2. Causality	280
3.3. The role of assumptions	282
4. Research on international crimes	283
4.1. Studying prevalence	283
4.2. Etiology	288
4.3. (Legal) reaction	291
4.4. Victim studies	292

5. Conclusion and some ways forward 294
 References 295

Chapter 13. Sexual violence during war: variation and accountability

Elisabeth Jean WOOD 297

1. Introduction 297
 2. Key concepts 299
 3. Incomplete explanations 303
 3.1. Type of conflict 303
 3.2. Opportunity 303
 3.3. Incentives 305
 3.4. Rape as a substitution for consensual sex 306
 3.5. Female combatants 307
 3.6. Sexual violence as instrumental for the group 307
 4. Theoretical framework 309
 4.1. Individual combatants 309
 4.2. Leadership strategy 310
 4.3. Institutions for combatant socialization 310
 4.4. Wartime dynamics 312
 4.5. Military hierarchy 313
 5. When is wartime rape a strategy of war? When is it rare? Top-down
 and bottom-across logics 314
 5.1. Explaining the absence of sexual violence: two logics 315
 5.1.1. The top-down logic 315
 5.1.2. The bottom-across logic 317
 5.2. Explaining rape as a strategy (or tactic) of war: two logics 318
 5.2.1. Top-down logic: rape as a strategy of war 318
 5.2.2. Bottom-across logic: rape as a tactic of war 318
 6. Conclusion 319
 References 322

Chapter 14. Learning the hard way at the ICTY: statistical evidence of
 human rights violations in an adversarial information environment

Amelia HOOVER GREEN 325

1. Introduction 325
 2. The prosecution’s analysis 327
 2.1. Descriptive analysis 327
 2.2. Causal analysis 330
 3. Defense challenges 333
 3.1. Defining “statistics” and “the scientific method” 334
 3.2. “Fundamental flaws” 336

4. The judgment	337
5. Lessons learned	343
6. Conclusions	349
References	350

PART V.

FROM FIGURES TO FACTS

Chapter 15. Methodology for the criminal investigation of international crimes

Xabier AGIRRE ARANBURU	355
1. Introduction	355
2. Seize the opportunity structure	356
3. Beware of the inquisitorial temptation.	358
4. Take a multi-disciplinary approach	361
5. Disregard simplistic explanations.	364
6. Analysis first.	365
7. Focus on specific and contextual elements	367
8. Prioritize documentary evidence	369
9. Look at the evidence as sample	375
10. Prioritize insider and international witnesses	376
11. Anticipate security needs	379
References	380

Chapter 16. Closing the gap in truth finding: from the facts of the field to the judge's chambers

Martin WITTEVEEN.	383
1. Introduction	383
2. The facts.	384
3. The investigation	386
3.1. Time lapse	386
3.2. Consequences of time lapse.	388
3.3. Lack of documentation	388
4. Issues of witnesses' memory	389
4.1. Encoding phase	390
4.2. Retention phase.	392
4.3. Retrieval phase	393
5. Witnesses' recount of the facts – unprecedented challenges in the context of international crimes	395
5.1. Trauma	396
5.2. Quantative answers	397

5.3. Misunderstandings.....	398
5.4. Language challenges.....	399
5.4.1. Rare languages	400
5.4.2. Translation errors.....	400
5.4.3. Lack of vocabulary.....	401
5.5. Cultural differences	402
5.5.1. Education and personal identities.....	402
5.5.2. Behavior of witnesses.....	403
5.5.3. Misinterpretation.....	404
5.5.4. Witness's reluctance.....	404
5.5.5. Oral culture and lack of sourcing	405
6. After the witnesses the professionals take over	406
6.1. Role of investigators	406
6.2. Role of the prosecutor or trial attorney.....	407
6.3. Role of the judges	408
6.4. Dilemmas and possible changes.....	409
7. The final stage – The judge's chambers.....	411
References.....	411

Chapter 17. Preserving the overview of law and facts: the Case Matrix

Morten BERGSMO, Olympia BEKOU and Annika JONES	413
1. Introduction	413
2. Some difficulties faced in relating law to facts in core international crimes cases	416
2.1. Understanding the legal requirements for the prosecution of core international crimes.....	416
2.2. Applying the legal requirements to large quantities of evidence	419
3. The significance of an informed, efficient and precise approach to the application of law to facts in core international crimes cases	420
3.1. The ability to pursue justice and the quality of the process.....	421
3.2. The efficiency of the criminal justice process and the fight against impunity.....	422
3.3. Promotion of the rights of the accused	423
3.4. Summary	424
4. The Case Matrix and the facilitation of the application of law to facts....	425
4.1. The Case Matrix	425
4.2. The facilitation of the application of law to facts through use of the Case Matrix.....	428
5. The ICC and the Case Matrix	429
5.1. Adoption of the Case Matrix logic.....	429
5.2. Justifications for the approach of the Chambers	431

5.2.1. Expediency of the criminal process	431
5.2.2. Protection of the rights of the accused	432
6. Conclusion	433
References	433

EPILOGUE

Chapter 18. Future perspectives on collective violence and international criminal justice

Stephan PARMENTIER and Estelle ZINSSTAG	439
1. Introduction	439
2. Types of violence: collective, international and political	439
3. Types of responses: criminal prosecutions and beyond	442
4. The need for an interdisciplinary approach	445
References	445
<i>Contributors</i>	447