

VICTIMOLOGICAL APPROACHES
TO INTERNATIONAL CRIMES:
AFRICA

Edited by

Rianne LETSCHERT
Roelof HAVEMAN
Anne-Marie DE BROUWER
Antony PEMBERTON



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:
Hart Publishing Ltd.
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 51 75 30
Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nvw.at

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishers
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Victimological Approaches to International Crimes: Africa
Rianne Letschert, Roelof Haveman, Anne-Marie de Brouwer and Antony
Pemberton (eds.)

© 2011 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover illustration: Francisco de Goya (1746-1828), Etching, Plate 15 from The
Disparates

ISBN 978-94-000-0090-2
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this
book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or
any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

WORDS OF APPRECIATION

We would like to express some special words of appreciation. First, we wish to thank the director of TAI/GLR, Alphonse Muleefu, who was instrumental in organising the conference and inviting local stakeholders from Rwanda and other African countries. Secondly, we thank Tim van den Meijdenberg, student assistant at the department of Criminal Law of Tilburg Law School, who was responsible for compiling the bibliography list. Finally, a special word of thank you goes to Tilburg Law School, whose ambition to encourage international and interdisciplinary projects and facilitate networking seminars enabled us to pursue this project by covering for the expenses made.

CONTENTS

<i>Words of Appreciation</i>	v
Introduction: Victimological Approaches to International Crimes	1
PART I	
VICTIMS OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMES	
I. Genocide, Crimes against Humanity and War Crimes. A Victimological Perspective on International Criminal Justice Marc S. GROENHUIJSEN and Antony PEMBERTON	9
1. Introduction	9
2. Special features of genocide, war crimes and crimes against humanity ..	11
3. Victims of crime committed or condoned by the State	13
3.1. The culture of impunity as the ultimate perversion of the rule of law	13
3.2. Reinstating the rule of law: backward and forward looking aspects .	14
3.3. Reacting to atrocities: Adapting criminal justice	15
3.4. Some unresolved questions in International Criminal Justice	16
3.5. A rupture between backward and forward-looking functions of ICJ	17
3.6. Basic premises of a victimological perspective	19
3.7. Consequences of state crime for a victimological perspective	20
4. Large numbers of victims	22
4.1. The presumption of victimhood	23
4.2. Procedural rights	24
4.3. Reparation	25
4.4. Notions from a victimological perspective	26
5. Victims are perceived as enemies and as perpetrators	28
5.1. The social death of victims	28
5.2. The characteristics of perpetration of genocide and a victimological perspective	30
6. A victimological framework for reviewing international criminal justice	32

II. The Victimological Concern as the Driving Force in the Quest for Justice for State-Sponsored International Crimes Athanasios CHOULIARAS	35
1. Introduction.....	35
2. Constructing the victim.....	37
2.1. From positivist to critical victimology and to sociology of harm ...	37
2.2. The victims of state: Delimitation through the concept of state crimes.....	42
2.3. A qualitative analysis of state crime victimization.....	44
2.4. Recognition of state-sponsored crime victims at international level.....	50
3. Dealing with state-sponsored crimes and addressing the plight of its victims.....	52
3.1. Contextualisation and policy considerations	53
3.2. (International) criminal trials	54
3.3. Non-criminal justice strategies: The case of truth and reconciliation commissions as restorative justice mechanisms.....	59
4. A tentative conclusion: Pluralising justice as victims' need, victimized societies' demand and (international) law's wager	63
III. Eroding the Myth of Pure Evil. When Victims become Perpetrators and Perpetrators Victims Alette SMEULERS	65
1. Introduction.....	65
2. The role of past victimhood in genocidal and other violent ideologies ...	66
3. Committing crimes while asserting the right to self defence.....	68
4. Enforced compliance and cooperation	69
5. Case studies	71
5.1. The role of the Jews in the Holocaust	72
5.2. The South African Askaris	75
5.3. Child soldiers	79
5.4. Parallels and differences	82
6. The aftermath.....	84
7. Conclusion	86
IV. Victims of the Genocide against the Tutsi in Rwanda Etienne RUVEBANA	89
1. Historical background of the genocide against the Tutsi.....	89
2. The perpetrators and victims of the Rwandan genocide	93
2.1. The perpetrators of the genocide and their techniques/means.....	93

2.2. Victims during the genocide	97
3. The consequences and needs of victims post-genocide	107
3.1. Disabilities and incurable diseases	107
3.2. Widows and widowers	109
3.3. Plight of children	110
3.4. Trauma	114
4. Conclusion	115
V. Primary and Secondary Victims and Victimization during Protracted Conflict. National Trauma through Literary Lens in Jerusalem and Kigali Edna EREZ and Tikva MEROZ-AHARONI	117
1. Introduction	117
2. Between Kigali and Jerusalem	118
3. Secondary victimization and victims – A conceptual framework	120
4. Literature as constitutive and expressive of secondary victimization ...	122
5. Secondary victimization, tertiary victims	124
5.1. Literary work written by Israeli authors during periods of mass victimization	124
5.2. Historical background: Arab-Jewish/Israeli relations in the lens of literature	129
5.3. Comparison of literary works written before and after the second Intifada	130
5.4. The Rwandan literary presentation of personal and national trauma	134
6. Summary and conclusion	139
PART II	
REPARATIVE JUSTICE	
VI. Victims' Need for Justice. Individual versus Collective Justice Jo-Anne WEMMERS	145
1. Introduction	145
2. Justice at the level of the individual	145
2.1. Procedural and interactional justice	146
2.2. Distributive justice	147
3. Justice at the level of the group	148
3.1. Procedural justice	149
3.2. Distributive justice	150
4. Concluding remarks	152

VII.	Providing Reparation in Situations of Mass Victimization. Key Challenges Involved	
	Rianne LETSCHERT and Theo VAN BOVEN.	153
1.	Setting a trend towards reparative justice.	153
2.	Outline chapter	156
3.	Parameters of reparative justice	156
3.1.	Right to know, right to justice, right to reparation	157
3.2.	Reparation-as-right, as-symbol, as-process	160
4.	First challenge – Conceptualization of victimhood	161
5.	Second challenge – Individual versus collective reparations.	165
5.1.	Individual (legal) approach to reparations.	166
5.2.	Collective reparation; latitudes and limits	169
5.3.	Collective reparation; affirmation and assertion.	170
6.	Third challenge – Linking reparative justice to development aid	173
6.1.	Human security and reparative justice.	173
6.2.	Linking reparative justice and development goals	177
7.	Victims’ perspectives on reparations.	178
8.	Concluding remarks	181
VIII.	Reparations for Victims of Massive Crimes. Making Concrete a Message of Inclusion	
	Cristian CORREA	185
1.	Introduction.	185
2.	Aims of a reparations program for massive crimes.	187
3.	The coherence of the message of acknowledgment and inclusion	191
4.	Elements of a reparations program	194
4.1.	Guaranteeing income	196
4.2.	Providing health care and psychosocial support	202
4.3.	Guaranteeing access to education	205
4.4.	Housing and other forms of support.	208
4.5.	Collective reparations	208
5.	Financing reparations.	210
6.	Implementing reparations	215
6.1.	Defining victims and beneficiaries	216
6.2.	Transforming recommendations into law	219
6.3.	Defining and establishing implementing institutions	221
6.4.	Registering victims.	223
6.5.	Providing services and goods.	228
6.6.	Victims’ participation and communication efforts	229
7.	Conclusions	230

IX. Massive Trauma and the Healing Role of Reparative Justice Yael DANIELI	235
1. Introduction.....	235
2. Conspiracy of silence	236
3. The need for a multidimensional, multidisciplinary integrative framework	238
4. Post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and other diagnostic conditions.....	240
5. Survivor's shame and guilt	242
6. The healing process.....	244
7. Necessary elements of healing (summary)	245
8. Impunity – A societal instance of the conspiracy of silence	247
9. The reparative aspects of victims' participation in the justice process. . .	249
9.1. (Missed) opportunities and further victimisation	250
9.2. Remote, exclusionary, and partial justice: Justice for the world vs. justice for victims	251
9.3. Being treated with dignity and respect.....	254
9.4. Being afforded support, assistance and protection.....	257
10. Conclusion	259
 PART III	
AMNESTY, TRUTH, RECONCILIATION AND TRADITION	
X. Drawing the Line: Amnesty, Truth Commissions and Collective Denial Frank HALDEMANN	265
1. Introduction.....	265
2. Blocking out the past	267
3. Collective denial as misrecognition.....	270
4. Vocabularies of recognition.....	272
4.1. Interpersonal recognition.....	273
4.2. Collective recognition	276
5. South Africa's search for truth and reconciliation.....	278
6. Truth, amnesty and denial	282
7. Concluding remarks.....	286

XI. Should We Ever Say Never? Arguments against Granting Amnesty Tested Joris VAN WIJK	289
1. Introduction	289
2. Arguments against granting amnesty	291
2.1. Dogmatic arguments	292
2.1.1. International community's moral obligation	292
2.1.2. Victims' rights	293
2.2. Pragmatic arguments	293
2.2.1. Granting amnesty leads to impunity	294
2.2.2. Granting amnesty creates a culture of impunity	294
2.2.3. Granting amnesty does not take the victims' wishes into account	296
2.2.4. Granting amnesty increases victim traumatisation	296
2.2.5. Granting amnesty leads to vigilante justice by the victims	297
2.2.6. Granting amnesty hinders truth-seeking	298
2.2.7. Granting amnesty obstructs (sustainable/lasting) peace	300
3. The effects of amnesties in Mozambique, Angola and Uganda	300
3.1. Three countries	302
3.1.1. Mozambique	302
3.1.2. Angola	303
3.1.3. Uganda	305
3.2. Pragmatic arguments reinterpreted	306
3.2.1. Does granting amnesty create a culture of impunity?	306
3.2.2. Does granting amnesty not take victims' wishes into account?	308
3.2.3. Does granting amnesty increase the risk of victim traumatisation?	309
3.2.4. Does granting amnesty lead to vigilante justice by victims?	309
3.2.5. Does granting amnesty hinder truth seeking?	311
3.2.6. Does granting amnesty obstruct (sustainable/lasting) peace?	311
4. Conclusion	313
XII. The South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission. Challenges in Contributing to Reconciliation Robert PEACOCK	315
1. Introduction	315
2. Brief overview of Apartheid	315
3. Legislative framework and nature of the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission	318

4.	Truth and reconciliation	319
4.1.	Politicians	321
4.2.	Media	322
4.3.	Business	323
4.4.	Church	324
4.5.	Individual victims	325
5.	Assessing the TRC's contribution to truth and reconciliation	328
6.	The false victim – Offender dichotomy	332
7.	Conclusion	333
XIII.	Voices from the Field. Empirical Data on Reconciliation in Post-War Bosnia and Their Relevance for Africa Stephan PARMENTIER and Pietro SULLO	335
1.	Introduction	335
2.	Reconciliation: What is in a name?	336
3.	Bosnia and post-war reconciliation	339
3.1.	Reconciliation and trust	341
3.2.	Inter-personal reconciliation	342
3.3.	The macro level of reconciliation and trust	343
3.4.	The meaning of reconciliation	346
3.5.	Interim conclusion on Bosnia	348
4.	The relevance of empirical studies for Africa	348
4.1.	Example of empirical studies on post-conflict justice in Africa	349
4.2.	Problems of doing empirical research about reconciliation and post-conflict justice	350
5.	Conclusion	352
XIV.	Justice at the Doorstep. Victims of International Crimes in Formal Versus Tradition-Based Justice Mechanisms in Sierra Leone, Rwanda and Uganda Martien SCHOTSMANS	353
1.	Introduction	353
2.	Background to the conflicts	354
3.	Formal v. tradition-based justice	356
3.1.	Formal justice	356
3.2.	Traditional justice	357
3.3.	Some differences and some nuances	358
3.4.	From traditional to tradition-based to hybrid	362
4.	Rights and needs of victims	364
4.1.	International instruments	364

4.2. Restorative justice.....	365
4.3. In country research	365
4.4. Concluding on victims' rights and needs.....	367
5. Victims in the three countries	368
5.1. Sierra Leone: Formal justice and non-official use of tradition	369
5.2. Rwanda: Formal justice and official hybridization of tradition	371
5.3. Uganda: Official complementarity	377
6. Preliminary assessment.....	380
7. Conclusion	384
XV. Prosecution of Genocidal Rape and Sexual Torture before the Gacaca Tribunals in Rwanda	
Usta KAITESI and Roelof HAVEMAN	385
1. Introduction.....	385
2. Sexual violence during the genocide	386
3. Gacaca.....	387
3.1. Genocide and crimes against humanity	388
3.2. The procedure.....	390
3.3. Hearing and judgement.....	392
3.4. Participative lay justice	393
4. Specific rules regarding rape and sexual torture	395
5. Training the Inyangamugayo	398
5.1. Background to the training	398
5.2. Harmonising the training manual	400
5.3. The training.....	402
5.4. Sharing experiences: Breaking the ice.....	404
6. Epilogue	406
XVI. The Role of Civil Society in Addressing Problems Faced by Victims in Post-Genocide Rwanda	
Alphonse MULEEFU.....	411
1. Introduction.....	411
2. Some civil society organisations.....	414
3. Civil society interventional role	418
3.1. Housing, poverty and education	419
3.2. Health conditions.....	424
3.3. Prosecution of perpetrators	427
3.4. Reparation	429
3.5. Protection of victims and witnesses	432
3.6. Raising awareness on victim's rights.....	433

4. Challenges in addressing problems of victims	434
5. Conclusion	435

PART IV

INTERNATIONAL AND NATIONAL LEGAL AND POLICY APPROACHES

XVII. Universal Justice?.....	439
The Practice and Politics of Universal Jurisdiction Cases Relating to Crimes Committed in Africa	
Carla FERSTMAN and Jürgen SCHURR	439

1. Introduction.....	439
2. The challenges associated with the exercise of universal jurisdiction ...	441
3. The practice of universal jurisdiction	442
4. Extraterritorial jurisdiction cases relating to Africa.....	444
4.1. A review of key territorial prosecutions in Africa	445
4.2. A review of key universal jurisdiction cases regarding crimes allegedly committed in African States	447
4.2.1. Genocide cases relating to Rwanda	447
4.2.2. Senegal and the Hissène Habré case	450
4.2.3. Liberia and the case of Chuckie Taylor in the United States ..	451
4.2.4. Congo Brazzaville and the ‘Disappeared of the Beach’ case in France.....	451
4.2.5. Mauritania and the Ely Ould Dah case in France	452
4.2.6. Tunisia and the case of Khaled Ben Said in France.....	453
4.2.7. Rwanda and the RPF cases in France and Spain	453
5. The politics of universal jurisdiction	456
6. Prospects and trends of universal jurisdiction.....	459
7. Conclusion	460

XVIII. Survivors of the Rwandan Genocide under Domestic and International Legal Procedures	
Felix NDAHINDA	463

1. Introduction.....	463
2. Living after death: The realities of survivors after the genocide	464
2.1. Living in the aftermath of the genocide	464
2.2. Negotiating post-genocide social harmony: Justice and sacrifices.....	465
2.3. The voice of survivors in the aftermath of the 1994 genocide.....	467
3. Legal procedures in Rwanda and the position of genocide survivors ...	468
3.1. Post-1994 judicial landscape.....	468

3.2.	The status of survivors under relevant post-genocide legislation.	470
3.2.1.	Survivors rights under the Organic Law No. 08/96.	471
3.2.2.	Survivors under the Gacaca system	473
3.2.3.	The Fund for the support and assistance to the survivors of the genocide against the Tutsi and other crimes against humanity	475
3.3.	Assessing the position of victims in post-genocide Rwanda.	476
4.	Justice for survivors outside Rwanda.	478
4.1.	Survivors and the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR)	479
4.1.1.	Accountability, deterrence, reconciliation and pacification.	479
4.1.2.	The survivors before the ICTR	481
4.1.3.	Cooperation or condemnation?	482
4.2.	Survivors' involvement in foreign judicial proceedings.	486
5.	Conclusion	491
XIX.	Understanding Limitations.	
	Victim Participation and the International Criminal Court	
	Brianne McGONIGLE LEYH	493
1.	Introduction.	493
2.	Procedural framework of the Court in relation to victims	496
3.	The participatory regime	498
3.1.	Definition of victims	499
3.2.	Victims of a 'situation' and victims of a 'case'	501
3.3.	Complex maze of participatory provisions	502
4.	Seeking to make an impact	505
4.1.	New charges against the accused.	506
4.2.	In situ proceedings.	508
5.	Fragmentation and inconsistency	510
5.1.	Article 68(3) and the modalities of participation	510
5.1.1.	Systematic approach	511
5.1.2.	Piecemeal approach	513
5.2.	Anonymous and non-anonymous victims.	515
5.2.1.	Drawing a distinction.	515
5.2.2.	Drawing no distinction	517
6.	Addressing the need for improvements.	518
6.1.	Greater clarity: Appeals chamber role	518
6.2.	Greater clarity: Trial chamber role	521
7.	Conclusion	524

XX.	Survivors of Sexual Violence in Conflict. Challenges in Prevention and International Criminal Prosecution Sandra Ka Hon CHU, Anne-Marie DE BROUWER and Renée RÖMKENS.	527
1.	Introduction.	529
2.	Sexual violence in times of conflict and peace: Prevalence, nature, societal attitudes and impact.	530
2.1.	Prevalence and nature of sexual violence in times of conflict.	530
2.2.	Sexual violence in ‘peace time’: Prevalence and gendered attitudes	532
2.3.	Silencing of survivors of sexual violence: The double assault	535
2.4.	Impact of mass sexual violence	537
2.4.1.	Physical and mental health problems	537
2.4.2.	Social isolation, stigma and ongoing victimization.	538
2.4.3.	Poverty and economic damage	539
2.5.	Needs of survivors of mass sexual violence	539
2.5.1.	Physical and mental health support	540
2.5.2.	Physical security	541
2.5.3.	Financial support and compensation.	542
2.5.4.	Justice and the need for recognition and validation	543
3.	Responses of the international community: Potential and limits of preventive policies and criminal prosecution.	544
3.1.	International responses: Prevention	544
3.2.	International responses: Prosecution	549
3.2.1.	Victim participation and reparation	550
3.2.2.	Protective and support measures	554
3.2.3.	Gender balance and expertise as structural characteristics of the institution	555
3.2.4.	Charges of sexual violence.	556
4.	Final remarks: One size does not fit all	558
XXI.	Victims of Sexual Violence in the International Criminal Court. Challenges Related to Legal Representation and Protection Gabbi MESTERS and Adesola ADEBOYEJO.	561
1.	General introduction	561
2.	Gender-based crimes: Definition and charges.	563
2.1.	Introduction	563
2.2.	Charges for gender-based crimes in the cases before the ICC	565
2.2.1.	Prosecutor v. Lubanga	565
2.2.2.	Prosecutor v. Katanga <i>et al.</i>	569
2.2.3.	Prosecutor v. Mbarushimana	570

2.2.4. Prosecutor v. Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo	570
2.2.5. Prosecutor v. Harun and Kushayb	572
2.2.6. Prosecutor v. Omar Al Bashir	572
2.2.7. Prosecutor v. Joseph Kony <i>et al.</i>	574
2.3. Final remarks	575
3. The various forms of assistance to victims under the legal text of the Court and related challenges	576
3.1. Introduction	576
3.2. Victim participation	577
3.3. Notification	578
3.4. Protection measures	579
3.5. Common legal representatives	583
4. Some practical challenges when assisting victims/survivors of sexual violence before the Court	583
4.1. Legal qualification for victims' representative under the legal texts of the Court	583
4.2. Gender- and geographical imbalance in ICC's List of Counsel	584
4.3. General challenges	585
4.4. Specific challenges when assisting dual status witnesses	587
4.5. Specific challenges for common legal representatives	588
5. Conclusion	590

XXII. Responding to the Most Vulnerable.

Child Victims of International Crimes

Michelle G. GROSSMAN	593
----------------------------	-----

1. Introduction	593
2. Key terms	595
2.1. Child	596
2.2. Victim	597
2.3. International crimes	598
3. Consideration of child victims of international crimes over time	598
4. Children – A distinct group of vulnerable victims	600
4.1. Child victims as a vulnerable population/obligation to protect. . . .	600
4.2. Child victims as the next generation	604
5. The needs of child victims of crime	605
5.1. Fundamental needs of child crime victims	605
5.2. Needs of child victims participating in criminal justice proceedings	606
5.3. Addressing the needs of child victims of international crimes	607
6. The Rome Statute's consideration of child victims	610
7. The assistance/service providers	614

8. Conclusion – Improving the effectiveness of response to child victims of international crimes	616
--	-----

PART V

VICTIMOLOGICAL APPROACHES TO INTERNATIONAL CRIMES

XXIII. Victimological Approaches Applied to International Crimes.	
Concluding Remarks	621
Rianne LETSCHERT, Roelof HAVEMAN, Anne-Marie DE BROUWER and Antony PEMBERTON	621
1. Introduction	621
2. International crimes: The ultimate perversion of the rule of law	624
3. Mass victimization and ‘the social death of victims’	625
4. Reparative justice	627
5. Individual versus group perspective	629
6. The ICC and the ICTR	631
6.1. Victims of sexual violence	633
6.2. Child victims	635
7. National procedures	637
7.1. Universal jurisdiction	637
7.2. Territorial jurisdiction	638
8. Preventive measures	639
9. Truth, reconciliation, amnesty and tradition	640
10. Final remarks: Central features of a victimological perspective on international crimes	645
<i>The Authors</i>	647
<i>Bibliography</i>	657