

CORRUPTION & HUMAN RIGHTS:  
INTERDISCIPLINARY PERSPECTIVES



CORRUPTION & HUMAN RIGHTS:  
INTERDISCIPLINARY  
PERSPECTIVES

*Edited by*  
Martine BOERSMA  
Hans NELEN



intersentia

Antwerp – Cambridge – Portland

*Distribution for the UK:*  
Hart Publishing Ltd.  
16C Worcester Place  
Oxford OX1 2JW  
UK  
Tel.: +44 1865 51 75 30  
Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*  
International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Tel.: +1 503 287 3093  
Email: info@isbs.com

*Distribution for Austria:*  
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag  
Argentinerstraße 42/6  
1040 Wien  
Austria  
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24  
Email: office@nwv.at

*Distribution for other countries:*  
Intersentia Publishers  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Corruption & Human Rights: Interdisciplinary Perspectives  
Martine Boersma and Hans Nelen (eds.)

© 2010 Intersentia  
Antwerp – Cambridge – Portland  
www.intersentia.com

Cover photograph: ©iStockphoto.com/Matthew Rambo

ISBN 978-94-000-0085-8  
D/2010/7849/126  
NUR 824

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The present volume is the result of the conference ‘Corruption & Human Rights’, organised by the Maastricht Centre for Human Rights on October 22–23, 2009. The editors are indebted to Maastricht University’s Faculty of Law; the Research and Documentation Centre of the Ministry of Justice (WODC); and the Scientific Bureau of the Public Prosecution Service (WBOM) for their financial support for this event. Moreover, the editors wish to thank the other members of the organisational committee, i.e. Fons Coomans, Paul Frielink, Roland Moerland and David Roef, and gratefully acknowledge the continuous efforts of Chantal Kuypers, administrator of the Centre. Finally, all speakers and participants to the conference are thanked for their input.



# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	v
Chapter I. General Introduction	
MARTINE BOERSMA and HANS NELEN .....	1
1. The Problem of Corruption .....	1
2. Programme of the Conference ‘Corruption & Human Rights’ .....	2
2.1. Introduction .....	2
2.2. Keynote Lectures .....	2
2.3. Interdisciplinary Workshops .....	3
3. Contributions to the Present Volume .....	3
Chapter II. Adopting a Human Rights Approach Towards Combating Corruption	
JOHN HATCHARD .....	7
1. Is Corruption a Human Rights Issue? .....	7
1.1. Definitional Issues .....	7
1.2. Corruption and Human Rights: Some Examples From UNCAC .....	9
1.2.1. Political Rights .....	10
1.2.2. Right to a Fair Trial .....	11
2. Why Do Existing Anti-Corruption Techniques Require Additional Support? .....	14
3. How Can Human Rights Strategies Assist in Combating Corruption? .....	16
3.1. Enforcing Constitutional Rights .....	17
3.2. Utilising National Human Rights Institutions .....	19
3.3. Investigative and Remedial Powers .....	20
4. Some Conclusions .....	22
Chapter III. Corruption and Human Rights: Making the Connection	
MAGDALENA SEPÚLVEDA CARMONA and JULIO BACIO-TERRACINO .....	25
1. Introduction .....	25
2. Determining When Human Rights are Violated .....	26
2.1. Three Levels of State Obligations .....	27
2.2. The Causal Link .....	29

2.2.1. Direct Violations .....	29
2.2.2. Indirect Violations (Corruption as a Necessary Condition) ...	29
2.2.3. Remote Violations (Where Corruption is One Factor Amongst Others) .....	30
3. Linking Acts of Corruption with Specific Human Rights .....	31
3.1. When Corruption May Violate the Principles of Equality and Non-Discrimination. ....	31
3.2. When Acts of Corruption May Violate the Rights to a Fair Trial and to an Effective Remedy. ....	34
3.2.1. Standards Related to the Administration of Justice .....	35
3.2.2. Standards Related to the Rights of the Parties Involved .....	36
3.2.3. Standards Related to the Efficiency of the Procedure. ....	36
3.2.4. Vulnerable Groups and the Right to a Fair Trial. ....	36
3.2.5. The Right to an Effective Remedy .....	37
3.3. When Corruption May Violate the Rights of Political Participation. .	38
3.4. When Corruption May Violate Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....	39
3.5. When Corruption May Violate the Right to Food .....	40
3.6. When Corruption May Violate the Right to Adequate Housing .....	41
3.7. When Corruption May Violate the Right to Health .....	42
3.7.1. Core Content of the Right to Health .....	42
3.8. When Corruption May Violate the Right to Education .....	43
3.9. When Corruption May Violate the Right to Water. ....	45
3.10. When Embezzlement of Funds Allocated to Social Programmes May Violate Human Rights. ....	45
4. Conclusion: Why is It Relevant to Link Human Rights to Corruption? ...	47

Chapter IV. Corruption as a Violation of Economic, Social and  
Cultural Rights: Reflections on the Right to Education

MARTINE BOERSMA .....	51
1. Introduction .....	51
1.1. The Detrimental Nature of Educational Corruption .....	51
1.2. Structure and Methodology .....	52
2. The Multi-Headed Monster Named Corruption .....	54
2.1. Definitional Problems .....	54
2.2. Public vs. Private Sector Corruption .....	56
2.3. Grand vs. Petty Corruption. ....	57
2.4. Typology. ....	58
2.4.1. Bribery .....	59
2.4.2. Embezzlement. ....	60
2.4.3. Trading in Influence .....	61



2.4.4. Abuse of Functions.....	61
2.4.5. Illicit Enrichment.....	61
3. Corruption as a Violation of the ICESCR: Article 2(1).....	62
3.1. Content.....	62
3.2. International Human Rights Practice.....	66
3.2.1. Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	66
3.2.2. Committee on the Rights of the Child.....	68
3.2.3. Former Special Rapporteur on Corruption.....	69
3.2.4. Findings.....	71
3.3. Taking the Issue Further.....	72
4. Corruption as a Violation of the Right to Education: Article 13 ICESCR ..	74
4.1. The Right to Education.....	74
4.1.1. Legal Bases.....	74
4.1.2. Normative Content.....	76
4.1.3. State Obligations.....	77
4.1.4. Violations.....	79
4.2. International Human Rights Practice.....	80
4.2.1. Committee on the Rights of the Child.....	80
4.2.2. Special Rapporteur on the Right to Education.....	81
4.2.3. Findings.....	84
4.3. Taking the Issue Further.....	84
5. Conclusions and Recommendations.....	87
Chapter V. Health Sector Corruption and Human Rights: A Case Study	
BRIGIT TOEBES.....	91
1. The Case Study: Health Sector Corruption in ‘Painland’.....	91
2. Introduction: Linking the Case Study with the Analysis in this Chapter ..	94
3. Why are Health Systems so Prone to Corruption?.....	96
4. Does It Matter How a Health System is Financed and Organised?.....	97
5. How Do We Define Corruption?.....	99
6. International Anti-Corruption Legislation.....	100
7. The International Human Rights Framework.....	102
8. Who are the Responsible Actors?.....	104
9. The State and All Its Agents.....	105
9.1. The Policy Dimension: From ‘AAAQ’ to ‘AAAQAP’.....	105
9.2. The Legal Dimension: Obligations to Respect, Protect and Fulfil ...	110
10. Non-State Actors: Focus on Hospitals and Health Workers.....	115
11. The Human Rights Violations in the Case Study.....	119
12. Conclusions.....	121

Chapter VI. Post-Hurricane Katrina and Human Rights Violations in New Orleans, Louisiana	
PATRICK D. WALSH †, WILLIAM E. THORNTON and LYDIA VOIGT . . . . .	125
1. Introduction . . . . .	125
2. Corruption and Human Rights. . . . .	127
3. Research Related to Disasters and Corruption Facilitation . . . . .	129
4. The Katrina Disaster and Human Rights Violations . . . . .	131
5. The Katrina Disaster and Corruption and Human Rights Violations in New Orleans. . . . .	133
5.1. Katrina Fraud . . . . .	134
5.2. FEMA Trailer and Toxic Fume Debacle . . . . .	137
5.3. Housing Authority of New Orleans. . . . .	138
5.4. Police Corruption . . . . .	140
5.5. Facilitation of Wage Thefts from Immigrant Migrant Workers and Government Facilitation of Human Rights Violations of Migrant Workers. . . . .	143
6. The Cost of Corruption and Concluding Comment . . . . .	149
Chapter VII. Corruption and Gender Equality: A Human Rights Concern?	
DOROTHÉE DE NÈVE and TINA OLTEANU . . . . .	153
1. Introduction: Gender and Corruption. . . . .	153
2. Perceptions of Corruption . . . . .	158
3. Causes of Corruption . . . . .	160
3.1. Criminal Attitudes . . . . .	161
3.2. Power and Corruption . . . . .	164
3.3. Old Boys' Networks . . . . .	171
4. Conclusion . . . . .	173
Chapter VIII. International Financial Institutions, Corruption and Human Rights Violations	
DAWN L. ROTHE. . . . .	177
1. Introduction . . . . .	177
2. Crimes of Globalization . . . . .	179
3. International Financial Institutions. . . . .	181
4. Cases of Complicity, Facilitation, Corruption and IFI Policies . . . . .	183
5. Motivating Factors and Situational Opportunities . . . . .	190
6. Concluding Thoughts . . . . .	194

Chapter IX. Corruption and Human Rights in Police Work: One of a Kind?	
EMILE KOLTHOFF. ....	197
1. Introduction .....	197
2. Corruption and Integrity .....	198
3. Integrity .....	199
4. Integrity Policy for Public Administration in The Netherlands .....	204
5. Police Corruption .....	207
6. Police Corruption and Integrity Violations in The Netherlands .....	208
7. The Connection Between Corruption and Human Rights .....	210
8. Corruption and Human Rights in Police Work: One of a Kind? .....	212
9. Conclusion .....	217
 Chapter X. Linking Corruption and Human Rights: An Unwelcome Addition to the Development Discourse	
MORAG GOODWIN and KATE ROSE-SENDER. ....	221
1. Introduction .....	221
2. The Rise of Anti-Corruptionism .....	223
3. The Cost of Anti-Corruptionism .....	227
4. But is It Human Rights? Linking Human Rights and Corruption .....	229
5. It's Politics, Stupid .....	235
6. Conclusion .....	239
 Chapter XI. Corruption and Human Rights: An Afterword	
DAVID NELKEN .....	241
1. How are Corruption and Human Rights Linked? .....	242
1.1. 'Making' a Connection. ....	242
1.2. Only Connect? .....	246
2. Why Fight Corruption Through Human Rights? .....	250
2.1. Fighting and Re-Framing .....	251
2.2. But Will It Work? (And Should It?) .....	258
 <i>About the Authors</i> .....	263

