

LABOUR LAW OR SOCIAL COMPETITION LAW?  
On labour in its relation with capital through law

Francqui Chair Lectures

Marc RIGAUX  
Social Law Unit  
University of Antwerp

 intersentia  
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

*Distribution for the UK:*

Hart Publishing Ltd.  
16C Worcester Place  
Oxford OX1 2JW  
UK  
Tel: +44 1865 51 75 30  
Fax: +44 1865 51 07 10

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*

International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 85<sup>th</sup> Ave Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Tel: +1 503 287 3093  
Fax: +1 503 280 8832  
Email: info@isbs.com

*Distribution for Switzerland and*

*Germany:*

Schulthess Verlag  
Zwingliplatz 2  
CH-8022 Zürich  
Switzerland  
Tel: +41 1 251 93 36  
Fax: +41 1 261 63 94

*Distribution for other countries:*

Intersentia Publishers  
Groenstraat 31  
BE-2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel: +32 3 680 15 50  
Fax: +32 3 658 71 21

Labour Law or Social Competition Law? On Labour in Its Relation with  
Capital Through Law

Marc Rigaux

[www.ua.ac.be/socialrecht](http://www.ua.ac.be/socialrecht)  
Translated by Erika Peeters  
Lay-out by Els Peeters

© 2009 Intersentia  
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland  
[www.intersentia.be](http://www.intersentia.be)

ISBN 978-90-5095-942-1  
D/2009/7849/52  
NUR 825

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>LABOUR LAW OR SOCIAL COMPETITION LAW? A JUSTIFICATION OF CONTENT AND STRUCTURE</b> .....	1
<b>LECTURE 1. LABOUR LAW AS A CORRECTION OF THE FREE LABOUR MARKET AND SOCIAL COMPETITION</b> .....	5
Introduction .....	5
Outline 1. Labour as a commodity of which the price is set by a market mechanism .....	5
I. Production within a capitalist system or the dominance of the owners of the means of production .....	5
II. Labour as a commodity dissociated from the person who produces it .....	6
III. The (internal and external) labour market generates social competition .....	6
1. The external labour market .....	7
2. The internal market (within the enterprise or group of enterprises) .....	8
3. Degree of employability .....	8
4. Social competition in the internal labour market .....	8
IV. Social competition as the principal cause of social exploitation and social exclusion .....	9
1. Exploitation .....	9
2. Social exclusion .....	9
Outline 2. The law as an instrument for the institutionalization of the dominance of capital over labour .....	10
I. Individual right of ownership, freedom of enterprise and labour, contractual freedom based on and legitimized by the individual freedom and equality in law of citizens .....	10
II. The predominance of the fundamental economic rights over the (fundamental) social rights .....	11

Outline 3. Labour law and the protection against social competition .....	13
I. The correction mechanisms of labour law in general .....	13
II. Interventions in the functioning of the external and internal labour markets.....	13
1. The external market .....	13
2. The internal labour market within the enterprise or group of enterprises.....	14
III. The standardization of pay and working conditions by means of mandatory legal regulations.....	15
1. The restriction of contractual freedom – The “incorporatieveer” (theory of incorporation) .....	15
2. The regulation of the terms of employment by mandatory provisions of law.....	16
IV. Standardization by means of collective bargaining (or right of co- decision).....	17
1. The fundamental social right of collective bargaining .....	17
2. The supremacy of collective contractual freedom over the individual one .....	18
3. The collective agreement and the power of co-determination and co-decision as important instruments of standardization.....	19
V. The introduction of a representative system borrowed from politics.....	20
VI. The preliminary and necessary conditions for social intervention in the free labour market and social competition .....	21
1. A political (state controlled) structure capable of restraining the economic power and imposing social corrections .....	21
2. Citizenship as an indispensable instrument for the individualization of protection for employees.....	23
3. A social counterforce.....	23
Outline 4. Labour law does not change the economic order, it only corrects it very marginally .....	24
I. Society’s undervaluation of the contribution of labour in the process of production .....	24
II. Labour as a negligible factor in the legal specification of the enterprise .....	24
1. The contribution of labour does not usually lead to the right to acquire shares in a trading company .....	24
2. The consultative bodies and representative bodies are not part of the company’s managerial and administrative structures .....	25
III. The employment contract was defined in terms of authority .....	25

1. The employment contract, a barrier to the employee's space of action ...	25
2. The employment contract as concretization of the dominance of the economic order over the idea of citizenship .....	26
Outline 5. Conclusion: from labour law to social competition law .....	27

<b>LECTURE 2. THE EMPLOYMENT CONTRACT AS A BARRIER TO THE EMPLOYEE'S LEGAL INVOLVEMENT IN THE POLICY OF THE ENTERPRISE.....</b>	<b>31</b>
Introduction.....	31
Outline 1. The employment contract or the instrument of access to and ties with the internal labour market .....	32
I. Preliminary reflections .....	32
II. The individual employment contract as an instrument for access to and ties with the internal labour market .....	34
The contract of employment withdraws the worker from the external labour market – The prospective worker becomes an employee.....	34
III. The contract of employment creates a legal tie with the employer and not with the other employees – The contract of employment institutionalizes the alienation of work.....	35
IV. The internal labour market is a semi-planned market .....	36
V. The model of the internal labour market sometimes gets transposed to a section of the external labour market or to a group of enterprises.....	36
Outline 2. The contract of employment concretizes the position of labour within the economic order and specifies its objectives .....	37
I. The acceptance of the dominance of capital over labour.....	37
II. The contract of employment concretizes the objectives of the contribution of labour in the process of production.....	38
III. The contract of employment as a barrier to the employee's legal involvement in the enterprise's activities and policy .....	39
Outline 3. Lifting the structural limitation on the employee's involvement, resulting from the employment contract – The means on the individual level.....	39
I. Lifting the restrictions on the employee's legal involvement in the social correction of the labour market .....	39
II. The subject of the employment contract.....	40
III. The concept of "agreed labour" and the changing and complementary function of good faith.....	41
IV. The broadening effect of the "institutional theory" of the enterprise....	42

V. The intrinsic limitations of the means mentioned supra I to IV .....	44
VI. Categories of legal origin or of collective conventional origin to broaden legal involvement.....	46
Outline 4. Removing the barrier to legal involvement – The collective dimension – The right to develop a social counterforce – The collective claim to legal involvement.....	47
I. The right to develop a social counterforce: an element of citizenship.....	47
II. A social counterforce in the enterprise: not only a matter of union representation .....	48
1. The various elements of social counterforce .....	48
2. Union representation as the core of a social counterforce .....	49
A. Interpretation of the phenomenon.....	49
B. The union representation or the coexistence of the contract of employment with the contract of association .....	50
C. The trade union representative’s immunity.....	51
D. The right to co-negotiate .....	52
E. The residuary competence of the trade union representation: the competence with regard to labour relations.....	53
III. Social counterforce and the right to collective action.....	54
1. The right to collective action within the framework of the (Revised) European Social Charter .....	54
2. The right to collective action in the sense of Article 6.4 (R)ESC.....	55
3. The limits to the right of collective action.....	55
IV. Social counterforce and collective bargaining .....	57
1. The right of collective bargaining and the collective agreements .....	57
2. The collective labour agreements are concluded at various levels .....	57
3. Sanctions in the event of non-observance .....	58
Conclusion: various legal techniques lead to a partial removal of the barrier to legal involvement .....	58
 <b>LECTURE 3. TOWARDS A NEW DEFINITION OF EMPLOYER WITHIN COLLECTIVE LABOUR LAW</b> .....	59
Outline 1. The concept of “employer” (or enterprise): a crucial element in the effectiveness of labour law norms.....	59
I. The enterprise in labour law: a contractual matter .....	59
II. The employer or the application in law of the dominance of capital over labour.....	60

III. The employer or the power of decision with regard to the employment contract: the right to decide unlawfully on the contract of employment.....	61
IV. The employer, the power of decision (and the right of decision) in the enterprise and the collective labour relations within the same enterprise .....	62
V. The employer, the benchmark for the law of collective labour relations within the enterprise .....	63
VI. The effectiveness of labour law: the use of the power of decision in accordance with labour law .....	64
Outline 2. Labour relations: the relation between economically unequal employees and employers, including at the collective level .....	64
I. The primacy of the employer's power of decision .....	64
II. The individual labour relation, the relation between economically unequal parties and the limits of labour law protection.....	65
1. The constitutive elements of labour law protection .....	65
A. The curtailment of contractual freedom .....	65
B. The primacy of the collective contractual freedom over the individual one.....	66
C. Formalism .....	68
D. Argumentation .....	68
2. The limits of correction.....	69
III. The economic inequality between employees and employers at the collective level.....	69
1. The theory of the same weapons .....	69
2. The right to form a social counterforce: a direct correction of the inequality .....	70
3. Other corrections .....	70
Outline 3. The collective labour relations and their anchoring in the law: the quadrangle of the fundamental rights to information, concertation, collective bargaining and collective action .....	71
I. The fundamental right to information: foundation of the law on collective labour relations.....	71
1. The absence of employee participation .....	71
2. The fundamental right to information: a collective fundamental right with an individual dimension.....	72
II. The relation of the fundamental right to information with the fundamental rights of concertation and collective bargaining .....	73
III. The institutionalized function of the right of collective action.....	73

1. The triad of the European Social Charter (ESC) .....	73
2. The institutionalized function .....	74
IV. The relation between collective labour relations and the power of decision in the enterprise: a matter of claiming involvement in the application of the power of decision .....	74
1. Stake and purpose .....	74
A. The first issue: preservation of employment.....	74
B. The second issue: standardization and optimization of pay and working conditions .....	75
2. The shape of the involvement .....	75
A. The institutionalized form .....	75
B. The non-institutionalized claim to involvement .....	76
V. Effectiveness of the call for involvement: factual and legal power of decision in the enterprise have to coincide.....	76
Outline 4. Increasing formalism of the concept of employer and enterprise or the disconnection between the right of decision and the power of decision in the enterprise .....	77
I. Mechanisms of formalism.....	77
II. The network company .....	79
1. Definition.....	79
2. The collective rights of employees at stake .....	79
A. Direct and indirect dismantlement .....	79
B. Right to information and concertation.....	80
C. The right of collective bargaining at enterprise level.....	80
D. The right of representation .....	81
E. The right of collective action .....	81
III. Corporate governance .....	81
Outline 5. Broadening the concept of employer (enterprise) ... or beyond formalism .....	82
I. Searching for techniques that will connect the collective rights of the employees with the power of decision.....	82
II. Overview of the techniques and legal concepts which de lege lata allow a broadening of the concept of employer.....	83
III. The technical business unit .....	83
1. The notion.....	83
2. Presumption of technical business unit.....	84
3. Limits to the broadening .....	84
IV. The consolidated annual accounts.....	85
V. The enterprises and groups with a community dimension .....	85



VI. The European company .....	85
Outline 6. Towards a closer connection between the (collective) notion of entrepreneurship as laid down in labour law and economic reality and the reality of corporate law.....	86
<b>LECTURE 4. TOWARDS AN INTEGRATED APPROACH IN COMMUNITY LAW OF THE PROCEDURE OF INFORMATION AND CONCERTATION IN THE EVENT OF RESTRUCTURING.....</b>	<b>87</b>
Outline 1. Restructuring or the redrafting and reconstruction of the internal labour market .....	87
I. Restructurings, a logical consequence of the merger oriented European economic integration policy .....	87
II. Restructuring or the change in the structures and organization of the production and therefore also of labour .....	88
III. Preliminary: the internal labour market and its corrections .....	88
1. Tied to the internal labour market .....	88
2. The social correction of the internal labour market under pressure ....	89
A. The elements of social correction.....	89
B. The corrections under pressure.....	89
C. Social correction linked to a static conception of the internal labour market .....	90
IV. New contours of social competition as a consequence of redrawing the internal labour market.....	90
1. Redrawing the internal labour market.....	90
A. The components .....	90
B. Rearranging the organization of labour.....	91
C. The precariousness of restructuring .....	91
2. Restructuring and social competition.....	92
3. Social competition and right to information.....	92
Outline 2. Restructuring: an economic concept, but not a labour law category.....	93
I. The marginal use of the term in European and Belgian labour law .....	93
II. Restructuring in labour law, a combination of different legal concepts .....	93
III. Restructuring in labour law, a combined application of rules of law with a different content, purpose and legal nature .....	94
Outline 3. The Community regulations with regard to information and consultation in the event of restructuring: a mosaic with badly fitting pieces.....	95

I. The right to information: a fundamental right, also according to community regulations .....	95
II. Restructuring within community law, also a matter of collective bargaining .....	96
III. Secondary community regulation .....	96
IV. The comparison between the various directives, an exploratory sketch .....	97
1. An exploratory sketch .....	97
2. Points of interest.....	97
3. The actual comparison .....	98
Outline 4. Restructuring or the discrepancy between an economic, often transnational, phenomenon and a chiefly nationally organized information and consultation procedure.....	102
I. An amalgam of norms: information and consultation, mere eyewash....	102
1. A multitude of legal norms: the fundamental right to information and concertation realized in various ways .....	102
2. Terminological vagueness with regard to concertation and consultation .....	102
3. Restructuring: not a specific legal category.....	103
4. Lack of rapport between the directives .....	103
5. Absence of an adequate information and consultation platform .....	103
6. The lack of a Community definition .....	103
7. No alignment of the procedures at the various levels.....	104
8. Community structures without the institution of an adequate European legal frame of reference.....	104
II. De lege ferenda: some proposals to achieve better efficiency and effectiveness.....	104
Outline 5. The information and consultation procedures throughout the implementation legislation: suffering from the same? .....	105
I. An amalgam of badly fitting dissimilar rules .....	105
II. Information in advance: a persistent obstacle .....	106
III. The shortcomings at community level also exist at national level .....	107
IV. Information and consultation at the level of the production plant – No information at the level of the group .....	107
V. Fragmentation as far as sanctions are concerned: the best guarantee for inefficiency and ineffectiveness.....	107
VI. Unclear about the existence and legal position of the social plan.....	108
VII. Absence of an informative and consultative structure in small and medium sized enterprises.....	108

VIII. An integrated procedure is possible. Both in Europe community and nationally the legal ground is available... political will must follow ..108

**LECTURE 5. THE EMPLOYEE, ALSO A CITIZEN IN THE ENTERPRISE..109**

Outline 1. From labour law to social competition law, a logical consequence of the dominance of market ideology .....	109
I. Social relations, a principle of communicating vessels.....	109
II. Economism and the dominance of market ratio .....	110
The globalization of the economic and financial relations as the cause of a globalized labour market.....	110
III. From labour law to social competition law, the factors external to the law.....	110
1. The disruption of the (national) labour market and the increase of social competition.....	110
2. Dismantlement of the national state .....	111
3. The inadequacy of the nationally organized social counterforce.....	111
4. Devaluation of (national) citizenship?.....	112
5. Increased autonomy for the individual .....	112
IV. From social law to social competition law, the factors internal to the law.....	113
1. From labour law to labour organization law .....	113
2. Contractual labour protection.....	114
A. Transition from public order law to imperative law .....	114
B. Contractual approach and subsidiarity .....	114
3. The growing significance of the anti-discrimination legislation as an element of labour protection .....	115
4. HRM or the core of social competition law .....	116
5. From labour protection law to competition law... and citizenship....	116
Outline 2. The pursuit of homogeneity in the law: contributory cause of the juridification of social relations and labour relations? .....	117
I. Juridification of social relations as a peripheral phenomenon of economism and market ideology .....	117
II. The law and the social relations: the ultimate formalized way of conflict settlement.....	117
III. Furthering the juridical homogeneity and an umbrella covering private relations.....	118
1. Homogeneity in the law.....	118
A. Open or undetermined norms .....	118

B. The application of the fundamental rights in private legal relationships .....	119
C. Judicial testing of the law against the fundamental rights listed and guaranteed in treaties.....	119
D. Removing the partitions between public and private law .....	119
E. Removing the partitions between national and supranational law.....	119
2. Increased appeal to the judge.....	120
A. Increased appeal to the judge: some of the causes .....	120
B. “Le gouvernement des juges”, back from whence it came? .....	120
IV. ... and therefore also an umbrella for labour relations .....	122
The juridification of labour relations .....	122
A. Judicial intervention in collective labour disputes .....	122
B. Juridification and increased insecurity .....	122
V. Legal homogeneity, an element of juridification?.....	123
Outline 3. The employee’s citizenship, conceptually inherent to the genesis and existence of labour law .....	123
I. Citizenship and labour law: the three dimensions .....	123
1. The technical level, the instrument of individualization of the correction of social competition .....	123
2. The citizen as a legal subject: bearer of fundamental rights.....	124
3. Citizenship as a reference for the connection of labour protection legislation and fundamental rights .....	124
II. The birth of labour law, a realization of fundamental rights before the term even existed .....	125
1. Genesis of labour law .....	125
2. Fundamental social rights, rationalization post factum.....	125
III. The right of union freedom: the employees’ most basic fundamental right? .....	127
1. The various functions of the right of union freedom .....	127
2. Union freedom: the most basic fundamental social right? .....	127
IV. The connection of labour law and fundamental rights .....	128
1. The relative indivisibility of fundamental rights .....	128
2. The connection .....	128
V. Labour law: the worker manifests himself as a citizen .....	128
Outline 4. The essential function of the fundamental rights (and consequently of citizenship) for the protection of the employees’ dignity ....	129
I. The fundamental rights or the legitimacy of the correction of social competition.....	129

1. Labour law as a field of tension between social competition and citizenship.....	129
2. The fundamental (social) rights draw their legal power from the political legitimacy .....	130
3. The essential function of the fundamental rights .....	130
II. Labour law or concretizing the right to lead a decent life at the level of labour relations.....	131
III. The fundamental social rights: the legitimacy of the employees' claim to involvement in the use of the power of decision in the enterprise .....	131
Outline 5. The precedence in law of the fundamental rights over the employer's right of authority – The field of tension between social competition and citizenship – Fundamental rights versus economic power .	132
I. The application of the fundamental rights in the relation between citizen and government .....	132
II. The basic application and applicability of the fundamental rights of the first generation to the relationship between private persons .....	133
1. Gradual fading of the distinction between the first and second generations of fundamental rights.....	133
A. The relevance of the distinction questioned.....	133
B. The issue of direct effects .....	134
C. The standstill principle.....	134
D. The obligatory protection of the basic core of the fundamental right. ....	134
2. The application of the fundamental rights of the first generation in the private domain .....	135
3. Arguments for application .....	135
4. The application of the fundamental social right in private relations..	135
A. Direct enforceability .....	135
B. Indirect enforceability .....	136
III. Contractual limitations on fundamental rights .....	136
1. The basis: the employee as bearer of fundamental rights.....	136
2. Fundamental rights higher-ranking than the employer's right of authority .....	136
3. Freedom of enterprise, a fundamental right? .....	136
4. Limits on the contractual restriction of fundamental rights .....	137
Outline 6. Towards an application of labour law on the basis of fundamental rights .....	138

Labour law or social competition law?

<b>CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS</b> .....	139
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b> .....	143