

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

VOLUME XXV

**THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR RWANDA
2006–2007**

André KLIP and Göran SLUITER (eds.)



intersentia

Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

Distribution for the UK:

Hart Publishing Ltd.
16 C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 51 75 30
E-mail: mail@hartpub.co.uk

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Tel.: +1 503 287 3093
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishers
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Please cite as: ICTR, Decision on the Prosecutor's Application for Severance and Leave to Amend the Indictment Against Idelphonse Hategekimana, *Prosecutor v. Nizeyimana and Hategekimana*, Case No. ICTR-00-55-I, T. Ch. III, 25 September 2007, Klip/Sluiters, ALC XXV-27.

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)

Cover illustration: Eva Sterkens

© 2010 Intersentia
Antwerp - Oxford - Portland
www.intersentia.com

ISBN 978-90-5095-916-2
D/2010/7849/54
NUR 828

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface	11
Part 1/ Preliminary matters	
1. Indictment and severance	
Decision on Aloys Ntabakuze’s Interlocutory Appeal on Questions of Law Raised by the 29 June 2006 Trial Chamber I Decision on Motion for Exclusion of Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-AR73, A. Ch., 18 September 2006 . .	13
Decision on the Prosecutor’s Application for Severance and Leave to Amend the Indictment Against Idelphonse Hategekimana, <i>Prosecutor v. Nizeyimana and Hategekimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-55-I, T. Ch. III, 25 September 2007	27
Commentary <i>Eduardo Faria Coracini</i>	35
Part 2/ Procedural matters	
2. Disclosure	
Decision on Interlocutory Appeal Relating to Disclosure Under Rule 66(B) of the Tribunal’s Rules of Procedure and Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-AR73, A. Ch., 25 September 2006	41
Decision on Joseph Nzirorera’s Motion for Inspection of Statement of Pierre Celestin Mbonankira (Rule 66 (B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 20 September 2007	47
Commentary <i>Shamiso Zinzombe</i>	51
3. Use of statements of witnesses and accused	
Decision on Request for Subpoenas of United Nations Officials, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 6 October 2006	55
Decision on “Appeal of Accused Arsène Shalom Ntahobali Against the Decision on Kanyabashi’s Oral Motion to Cross-Examine Ntahobali Using Ntahobali’s Statements to Prosecution Investigators in July 1997”, <i>Prosecutor v. Ntahobali and Nyiramasuhuko</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-AR73, A. Ch., 27 October 2006	61
Decision on the Prosecution Joint Motion for Re-Opening its Case and for Reconsideration of the 31 January 2006 Decision on the Hearing of Witness Michel Bagaragaza via Video-Link (Rules 54, 73, 73bis (E), and 85 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Zigiranyirazo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-73-T, T. Ch. III, 16 November 2006	67

Decision on Prosecution Motion for Admission of Evidence of Rape and Sexual Assault Pursuant to Rule 92bis of the Rules; and Order for Reduction of Prosecution Witness List (Rules 92bis and 73bis (D) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 11 December 2006	75
Decision on Prosecution Prospective Experts Witnesses Alison Des Forges, André Guichaoua and Binaifer Nowrojee (Rules 89 and 94bis of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 25 October 2007	83
Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Admission Into Evidence of Post-Arrest Interviews With Joseph Nzirorera and Mathieu Ngirumpatse (Rules 89 (C) and 95 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 2 November 2007	91
Decision on Prosecution Motion for Reconsideration of the Decision on Prospective Experts Guichaoua, Nowrojee and Des Forges, or for Certification (Rule 73(B)bis of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 16 November 2007.	101
Commentary <i>Rosemary Rayfuse</i>	107
 4. Witness proofing	
Decision on Defence Motions to Prohibit Witness Proofing (Rule 73 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 15 December 2006	117
Decision on Interlocutory Appeal Regarding Witness Proofing, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR73.8, A. Ch., 11 May 2007	125
Commentary <i>Stefanie Bock</i>	130
 5. Other evidentiary issues	
Decision on Ferdinand Nahima’s Motion for the Translation of RTLM Tapes in Exhibit C7, <i>Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, A. Ch., 20 November 2006.	137
Decision on Motions Relating to the Appellant Hassan Ngeze’s and the Prosecution’s Requests for Leave to Present Additional Evidence of Witnesses ABC1 and EB, <i>Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, A. Ch., 27 November 2006	147
Decision on the <i>Voir Dire</i> Hearing of the Accused’s <i>Curriculum Vitae</i> (Rules 2, 42 and 95 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Zigiranyirazo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-73-T, T. Ch. III, 29 November 2006	163
Decision on Appellant Jean-Bosco Barayagwiza’s Motions for Leave to Present Additional Evidence Pursuant to Rule 115 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, <i>Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, A. Ch., 8 December 2006.	167
Decision on Appeals Chamber Remand of Judicial Notice (Rules 94 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 11 December 2006	181

Decision on the Prosecutor’s Application to Admit Into Evidence the Transcript of the Accused’s Interview as a Suspect and the Defense’s Request to Hold a <i>Voir Dire</i> (Article 17 of the Statute; Rules 42, 43 and 95 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Nchamihigo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-63-T, T. Ch. III, 5 February 2007	205
Commentary <i>Michele Caianiello</i>	211
 6. Right to be present	
Decision on Interlocutory Appeal, <i>Zigiranyirazo v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-73-AR73, A. Ch., 30 October 2006	219
Decision on Nsengiyumva Motion for Adjournment due to Illness of the Accused, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 17 November 2006	229
Decision on Joseph Nzirorera’s Motion for Stay of Proceedings While he is Unfit to Attend Trial or Certification to Appeal (Article 20 of the Statute, Rule 73(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 11 July 2007	233
Decision on Nzirorera’s Interlocutory Appeal Concerning his Right to be Present at Trial, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR73.10, A. Ch., 5 October 2007	239
Commentary <i>Goreth Kyakuwa</i>	244
 7. Cooperation of States	
Modalities for Presentation of a Witness, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 20 September 2006	251
Decision on Request for Subpoena of Ami R. Mpungwe, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 19 October 2006	255
Decision on Prosecution’s Motion to Unseal the Transcripts of Witness WDUSA, <i>Prosecutor v. Ndayambaje</i> (Case No. ICTR-96-8-T), <i>Prosecutor v. Kanyabashi</i> (Case No. ICTR-96-15-T), <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> (Case No. ICTR-97-21-T), <i>Prosecutor v. Nsabimana and Nteziryayo</i> (Case No. ICTR-97-29-T), Joint Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 1 November 2006	259
Second Order for Further Submissions Concerning the Request for Referral of the Indictment to the Kingdom of the Netherlands, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagaragaza</i> , Case No. ICTR-2005-86-11bis, T. Ch. III, 6 March 2007	263
Decision on Prosecutor’s Request for Referral of the Indictment to the Kingdom of the Netherlands, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagaragaza</i> , Case No. ICTR-2005-86-11bis, T. Ch. III, 13 April 2007	267
Decision on Prosecutor’s Extremely Urgent Motion for Revocation of the Referral to the Kingdom of the Netherlands Pursuant to Rule 11bis (F) & (G), <i>Prosecutor v. Bagaragaza</i> , Case No. ICTR-2005-86-11bis, T. Ch. designated under Rule 11bis, 17 August 2007	277

Decision on the Request by Human Rights Watch for Leave to Appear as <i>Amicus Curiae</i> in the Proceedings for Referral of the Indictment Against Fulgence Kayishema to Rwanda (Rules 11 <i>bis</i> and 74 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Kayishema</i> , Case no. ICTR-2001-67-I, T. Ch. III, 8 November 2007	281
Commentary <i>André Klip</i>	286
 8. Certification and reconsideration	
Decision on Request for Reconsideration of the Decision on Request for Review, <i>Niyitegeka v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-14-R, A. Ch., 27 September 2006.	291
Declaration of Judge Shahabuddeen	294
Separate Opinion of Judge Meron	295
Decision on Motion for Reconsideration, <i>Ntabakuze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-AR73, A. Ch., 4 October 2006	297
Decision on Defence Motion for Certification to Appeal the Chamber’s Decision on Nzirorera’s <i>Ex Parte</i> Motion for Order for Interview of Defence Witnesses NZ1, NZ2 and NZ3 (Rule 73(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 30 October 2006	303
Decision on Request for Review, <i>Niyitegeka v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-14-R, A. Ch., 6 March 2007	307
Declaration of Judge Shahabuddeen	316
Separate Opinion of Judge Meron	317
Order Concerning the Filing of the Notice of Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Seromba</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-66-A, A. Ch., 22 March 2007.	319
Declaration of Judge Schomburg	322
Decision Reconsidering Exclusion of Evidence Related to Accused Kabiligi, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 23 April 2007	323
Decision on Defence Request for Certification to Appeal the Chamber’s Decision Pursuant to Rule 98 <i>bis</i> , <i>Prosecutor v. Ndindiliyimana, Bizimungu, Nzuwonemeye and Sagahutu</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-56-T, T. Ch. II, 24 April 2007	333
Commentary <i>Steven W. Becker</i>	337
 9. Fair trial (Rule 15<i>bis</i> of the ICTR RPE)	
Decision on Continuation of the Proceedings (Rule 15 <i>bis</i> of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 6 March 2007	347
Decision on Appeals Pursuant to Rule 15 <i>bis</i> (D), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR15 <i>bis</i> .3, A. Ch., 20 April 2007	369

Scheduling Order for the Resumption of the Trial (Rules 15bis (F) and 54 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 2 May 2007	381
Decision on Motion for Disqualification of Judges, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsenyiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, The Bureau, 28 May 2007.	385
Decision on “Joseph Nzirorera’s Interlocutory Appeal of Decision on Obtaining Prior Statements of Prosecution Witnesses After They Have Testified”, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR73.9, A. Ch., 31 May 2007.	393
Decision on Joseph Nzirorera’s Submission to Substitute Judge, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 8 June 2007.	399
Decision on Motions to Vacate Decisions, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 17 July 2007	403
Commentary <i>Maria Kaiafa-Gbandi and Yannis Naziris</i>	409

10. Undue delay

Decision on Prosper Mugiraneza’s Second Motion to Dismiss for Deprivation of his Right to Trial Without Undue Delay (Articles 19 and 20(4)(c) of the Statute of the Tribunal), <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 29 May 2007	419
Decision on Justin Mugenzi’s Motion Alleging Undue Delay and Seeking Severance, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 14 June 2007	428
Commentary <i>Göran Sluiter</i>	434

Part 3/ Judgement and sentencing

11. Judgements

Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44C-T, T. Ch. III, 20 September 2006. .	439
Commentary <i>Alexander Zahar</i>	509
Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Seromba</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-66-T, T. Ch. III, 13 December 2006	523
Commentary <i>Caroline Fournet</i>	609
Judgement, <i>Ndindabahizi v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-01-71-A, A. Ch., 16 January 2007.	620
Commentary <i>Steven Freeland</i>	671
Sentencing Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Nzabirinda</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-77-T, T. Ch. II, 23 February 2007	679
Commentary <i>Denis Abels</i>	703
Judgement, <i>Muhimana v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1B-A, A. Ch., 21 May 2007	717
Commentary <i>Pedro Caeiro</i>	781

Sentencing Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Rugambarara</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-59-T, T. Ch. II, 16 November 2007	789
Commentary <i>Denis Abels</i>	807
Judgement, <i>Simba v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-07-76-A, A. Ch., 27 November 2007	817
Commentary <i>Fabián Raimondo</i>	901
 Part 4/ Post conviction or acquittal issues	
 12. Appropriate remedy and early release	
Decision on Appropriate Remedy, <i>Prosecutor v. Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44C-T, T. Ch. III, 31 January 2007	907
Decision on Appeal Against Decision on Appropriate Remedy, <i>Rwamakuba v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44C-A, A. Ch., 13 September 2007	927
Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen	939
Commentary <i>Piet-Hein van Kempen</i>	941
Decision on Samuel Imanishimwe’s Application for Early Release, <i>Prosecutor v. Imanishimwe</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-46-S, Pres., 30 August 2007	951
Commentary <i>Piet-Hein van Kempen</i>	954
 Index	 963
 Contributors and Editors	 967

PREFACE

This is the twenty-fifth volume in the series 'Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals' and contains the most important decisions of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR) from 12 September 2006 up to and including 27 November 2007. It is the ninth volume in the series containing decisions of the ICTR. Further selected volumes on ICTR case law will be volumes 31 and 32, which cover decisions up to 1 January 2009.

The present volume is in its approach and structure similar to previous volumes. Thus, the book contains the full text of all the decisions and judgements, including separate, concurring and dissenting opinions, as well as annexes to the decisions. As with previous volumes, the editors have ensured that the decisions are fully identical to the *written* original text, as issued by the ICTR Press and Information Office and which bears the signatures of the Judges. We are aware that more and more decisions are available on the internet. However, only the written decisions bearing the signatures of the Judges can be considered as authoritative versions. In the course of our editorial work on this and previous volumes, we have occasionally discovered inconsistencies between the written original version of the decision and the internet version, if the latter is available at all. Much of our editorial efforts consist in making the texts in this series identical to the written original version.

We could only include the full text of the decisions in this volume by reducing their original format. Still, we wanted the reader to be able to identify the page number of the original text, which is throughout the text put in brackets []. We are again very happy that a number of scholars in the field of international criminal law were prepared to write interesting and stimulating commentaries regarding the decisions.

A few words regarding the selection of decisions may give the user an insight into our working method. In principle, we select all final judgements. In addition, we publish decisions taken at any stage of the procedure that are important for other reasons: because they deal with a specific legal question, because they are representative of a specific type of decision, or because they enter new legal waters. Of course, we cannot publish all decisions. As a result, we may not publish decisions in which issues have been decided in a way similar or identical to a decision that has already been selected.

The decisions are presented in different parts and under different headings.

Part 1, 'Preliminary Matters', relates to two decisions concerning the indictment and the severance of proceedings.

Part 2 deals with procedural matters. Whereas some decisions concern the way the proceedings are conducted in view of the requirements of a fair trial, others relate to the rights and obligations of witnesses, or to disclosure and the cooperation of states.

Part 3, 'Judgement and Sentencing', contains seven judgements and covers by far the largest part of this volume. As mentioned above, judgements are by definition included in this series, because of their importance, both from a factual and legal perspective.

Part 4, 'Post Conviction or Acquittal Issues', deals with various issues arising after the proceedings have come to an end.

We owe acknowledgements to many persons without whom we could not have completed this twenty-fifth volume. These include Registrar Adama Dieng of the ICTR and his staff, who offered generous assistance in obtaining all the hard copies of decisions. Our publisher Intersentia, in particular Hans Kluwer, Tom Scheirs and Isabelle van Dongen, facilitated our work. We also acknowledge the work of our student assistants, Mariam Pathan (Maastricht), who took over in 2009 from Thom Dieben, and Robert-Jan Winters (Amsterdam), who both assisted with the corrections of the text and without whom we would not be able to publish this series. We are most grateful to Thom for the excellent work he has done for all the volumes since volume 9 on the Special Court for Sierra Leone, which appeared in 2006. The Netherlands School of Human Rights Research stimulated our work. Professor Steven Freeland from the University of Western Sydney,

Australia, offered tremendous help by correcting our English. Last but not least, we wish to thank the distinguished authors for their commentaries on the decisions.

We hope that this volume will contribute to the further dissemination of the important work of the ICTR and that it will provide access to its decisions to practitioners, academics and students.

André Klip and Göran Sluiter

Maastricht/ Amsterdam, April 2010