

## METHODS OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH



# METHODS OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH

*Edited by*

Fons COOMANS

Fred GRÜNFELD

Menno T. KAMMINGA



intersentia

Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

*Distribution for the UK:*

Hart Publishing  
16C Worcester Place  
Oxford OX1 2JW  
UK  
Tel.: +44 1865 51 75 30  
Fax: +44 1865 51 07 10

*Distribution for the USA  
and Canada:*

International Specialized Book  
Services  
920 NE 58th Ave Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Tel.: +1 503 287 3093  
Fax: +1 503 280 8832  
Email: info@isbs.com

*Distribution for Switzerland  
and Germany:*

Schulthess Verlag  
Zwingliplatz 2  
CH-8022 Zürich  
Switzerland  
Tel: + 41 1 251 93 36  
Fax: + 41 1 261 63 94

*Distribution for other countries:*

Intersentia Publishers  
Groenstraat 31  
BE-2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel: + 32 3 680 15 50  
Fax: + 32 3 658 71 21

Methods of Human Rights Research  
Fons Coomans, Fred Grünfeld and Menno T. Kamminga (eds.)

Cover illustration: © Danny Juchtmans

© 2009 Intersentia  
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland  
www.intersentia.com

ISBN 978-90-5095-879-0  
D/2009/7849/65  
NUR 828

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm  
or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## A PRIMER

FONS COOMANS, FRED GRÜNFELD and MENNO T. KAMMINGA .....	11
1. Problems with Methods of Human Rights Research.....	12
2. Some Suggestions.....	14

## SOCIAL SCIENCE METHODS AND HUMAN RIGHTS

TODD LANDMAN .....	19
1. Introduction.....	19
2. Human Rights as an ‘Object of Inquiry’ .....	21
2.1. Absence of Agreed Philosophical Foundations.....	21
2.2. Contestation over the Meaning of Human Rights .....	22
2.3. Applicability of the Social Sciences .....	24
3. Methods in Social Science.....	25
3.1. Dimensions of Social Science Research .....	26
3.1.1. Epistemological Continuum.....	26
3.1.2. Cross-National Generalisations and Comparative Methods .....	31
3.1.2.1. Global Comparative Analysis.....	31
3.1.2.2. Few-Country Comparisons .....	33
3.1.2.3. Single-Country Studies.....	36
3.2. Quantitative and Qualitative Evidence .....	39
4. Conclusion: Methods Matter .....	41

## REDEFINING NORMATIVE LEGAL SCIENCE: TOWARDS AN ARGUMENTATIVE DISCIPLINE

JAN M. SMITS.....	45
1. Introduction.....	45
2. From Internal to External Approaches of Legal Science .....	46
3. Towards a Redefinition of Normative Legal Scholarship: the <i>Homo Juridicus</i> .....	48
4. The Methodology of Normative Legal Scholarship .....	50
4.1. Law as the Science of Competing Arguments.....	50

4.2. How Can the Better Arguments Be Found?.....	51
4.3. Three Consequences.....	54
5. Two Examples: Fundamental Rights in Relationships between Private Parties ....	55
6. Conclusions: Legal Science as a Scholarly Discipline .....	57

**HUMAN RIGHTS STUDIES: ON THE DANGERS OF LEGALISTIC ASSUMPTIONS**

DAVID P. FORSYTHE.....	59
------------------------	----

1. Introduction.....	59
2. Legalistic Studies .....	62
2.1. General Overview .....	63
2.2. A Focus on Impact.....	70
2.3. A Focus on Legal Obligation.....	71
3. Conclusion .....	74

**METHODS IN LEGAL HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH**

EVA BREMS.....	77
----------------	----

1. Introduction.....	77
2. Research Question(s) and Method.....	77
2.1. Research Questions .....	77
2.2. Method.....	78
2.2.1. Examining the Attitudes and Practice of Researchers.....	78
2.2.2. Examining the Research Output.....	82
3. Results of the Empirical Research .....	83
3.1. Questionnaire .....	83
3.1.1. Who?.....	83
3.1.2. The Importance of Methodology.....	83
3.1.3. Training and Guidance.....	84
3.1.4. Methods Used .....	85
3.1.5. Empirical vs. Normative Research.....	86
3.1.6. Some Conclusions from the Questionnaire.....	87
3.2. Examination of the Corpus .....	87
4. Normative Conclusions .....	89

**THE NEED FOR EVIDENCE-BASED HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH**

HANS-OTTO SANO and HATLA THELLE.....	91
--------------------------------------	----

1. Introduction.....	91
2. The Sources of Human Rights Research.....	95

3. Empowerment and Making Claims — Two Different Contexts.....	101
4. Evidence-Based Research: an Example of the Complexities Involved .....	104
5. Conclusion .....	108
 <b>MEASURE FOR MEASURE: UTILIZING LEGAL NORMS AND HEALTH DATA IN MEASURING THE RIGHT TO HEALTH</b>	
DABNEY EVANS and MEGAN PRICE .....	111
 1. Introduction.....	
2. Global Health Inequalities Between States .....	111
3. Establishment of Right to Health under International Human Rights Law.....	112
4. A New Theoretical Model: The Synergistic Approach.....	114
4.1. The International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination.....	117
4.2. Special Rapporteur on the Right to the Highest Attainable Standard of Physical and Mental Health .....	119
4.3. General Comment 14 .....	120
5. Applying the Synergistic Approach.....	121
6. Barriers and Challenges to the Approach.....	123
7. Conclusion and Implications .....	130
 <b>METHODS IN HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH: TOWARDS A SPIRAL OF CO-LEARNING</b>	
MARIA STUTTAFORD .....	131
 1. Introduction.....	
2. Health and Human Rights .....	135
3. Review of Methods Used in Health and Human Rights Research.....	136
3.1. Methods Used in Research into Developing Policy and Programmes.....	137
3.2. Methods Used in Research into Analysing and Critique Government Performance .....	138
3.3. Methods Used in Research Providing Evidence in Redress for those who Suffer Violations of their Rights.....	139
3.4. Methods Used in Research into Supporting Advocacy and Civil Society Mobilization.....	140
4 Reflections on Research Design and Methods Used to Explore Health and Human Rights.....	141
4.1. Exploring Collective Rights to Public Health for Homeless People .....	142
4.2. Towards Establishing a Learning Network to Advance Health Equity Through Human Rights Strategies .....	144
	145

4.3. Learning by Doing and Doing by Learning: A Civil Society Network to Realise the Right to Health.....	146
4.4. Strengths and Weaknesses of Methods used in the Completed Research Projects.....	146
5. A Learning Network to Facilitate a Spiral of Co-Learning.....	148
6. Mixed Methods of Research in the Learning by Doing Network.....	153
7. Conclusions.....	156

**TELLING TRUTH? THE METHODOLOGICAL CHALLENGES OF TRUTH COMMISSIONS**

PAUL GREADY .....	159
-------------------	-----

1. Introduction.....	159
2. Concepts and Methods.....	160
3. Qualitative and Quantitative Methods.....	163
4. Truth as Genre.....	167
5. Legitimacy and Impacts Beyond Report ‘Fetishization’ .....	170
6. Speaking Truth with and to Power .....	175
7. History as Saviour? .....	179
8. Conclusion .....	184

**METHODOLOGICAL CHALLENGES IN COUNTRY OF ORIGIN RESEARCH**

MARCO FORMISANO.....	187
----------------------	-----

1. Introduction.....	187
2. A Definition of Country of Origin Information .....	189
3. The Quasi-Judicial Character of Country of Origin Information and Its Role in Asylum Law .....	191
4. The Three Elements of COI Research: the Observer, the Facts and the Research Instruments .....	196
4.1. The Observer .....	196
4.2. The Facts .....	197
4.3. The Research Strategy .....	198
4.4. Procedural Principles .....	200
4.4.1. Impartiality and Objectivity .....	200
4.4.2. Public vs. Anonymous Sources .....	201
4.4.3. Assessing Sources.....	202
4.5. Substantive Principles .....	203
4.5.1. Relevance .....	203
4.5.2. Accuracy .....	204
4.5.3. Reliability.....	206



4.5.4. Currency .....	207
4.6. Presenting Research Results .....	208
5. Conclusions.....	210
<b>TREATY INTERPRETATION AND THE SOCIAL SCIENCES</b>	
KOEN DE FEYTER.....	213
1. Introduction.....	213
2. Multidisciplinarity in Treaty Interpretation .....	213
3. The <i>Awat Tingni</i> Judgment .....	219
4. Subsequent Case Law .....	226
5. Lessons for Human Rights Research.....	230
<b>METHODS OF PHILOSOPHICAL RESEARCH ON HUMAN RIGHTS</b>	
ANDREAS FOLLESDAL .....	233
1. Introduction.....	233
2. Amartya Sen .....	235
3. Charles Beitz.....	237
4. The Method of Reflective Equilibrium .....	237
4.1. Three Main Features .....	238
4.1.1. The Aim of Arriving at Reflective Equilibrium is Practical: To Attain Agreement on Specific Moral Issues.....	238
4.1.2. The Starting Points of the Procedure are Non-Foundational Empirical and Normative ‘Considered Judgments’ .....	238
4.1.3. The Theory Claims That There Is a rational Procedure by Which This Aim Sometimes Can Be Reached.....	239
4.2. Elaboration.....	240
4.2.1. Partial, Wide, Ideal Reflective Equilibrium .....	240
4.2.2. The Method of Reflective Equilibrium .....	240
4.2.3. Justification by Reflective Equilibrium .....	241
4.2.4. Four Norms that Guide the Method of Reflective Equilibrium.....	241
5. The Method of Reflective Equilibrium applied: Sen and Beitz.....	242
5.1. On Sen: Why are Philosophical Human Rights Overriding?.....	243
5.2. On Beitz: The Complexity of Object-dependent Theories and of Multiple Roles for Human Rights.....	243
6. Conclusions.....	245

Table of Contents

<b>About the Authors</b> .....	247
<b>Subject Index</b> .....	253