

The World Trade Organization and Import
Bans in Response to Violations of
Fundamental Labour Rights

The cover picture is part of the WTO logo.

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 30

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

The World Trade Organization and Import
Bans in Response to violations of
Fundamental Labour Rights
Jeroen Denkers



Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

Jeroen Denkers
The World Trade Organization and Import Bans in Response to Violations of
Fundamental labour Rights

ISBN 978-90-5095-855-4

© 2008 Intersentia
www.intersentia.com

Behoudens uitzondering door de wet gesteld, mag zonder schriftelijke toestemming van de rechtshebbende(n) op het auteursrecht c.q. de uitgevers van deze uitgave, door de rechtshebbende(n) gemachtigd namens hem (hen) op te treden, niet uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of anderszins, hetgeen ook van toepassing is op de gehele of gedeeltelijke bewerking. De uitgevers zijn met uitsluiting van ieder ander onherroepelijk door de auteur gemachtigd de door derden verschuldigde vergoedingen van copieëren als bedoeld in artikel 17 lid 2 van de Auteurswet 1912 en in het KB van 20-6-'64 (Stb. 351) ex artikel 16b der Auteurswet 1912, te doen innen door (en overeenkomstig de reglementen van) de Stichting Reprorecht te Amsterdam.

Niets uit deze uitgave mag worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of op welke andere wijze ook, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgevers.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photocopy, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publishers.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Although it is an impossible task to mention all people who have, in some way or another, contributed to the process of writing this book, there are a few people who deserve special thanks. My first word of thanks goes to my supervisors, Professor Van Genugten and Professor Pennings, for giving me the opportunity to work on this research project and for their constant support. Moreover, I am indebted to them for their comments and the discussions that followed which proved to be invaluable in the process of writing this book. I would also like to express my gratitude to Dr. Panagiotis Delimatsis who, in the final stage of the project, was willing to read and comment on parts of the manuscript. His detailed comments proved to be of great help. My appreciation also goes to Dr. Nicola Jägers with whom I have written several articles and had interesting discussions in the course of writing my dissertation.

Thanks are also due to the members of the PhD committee, Professor Schrijver, Professor Van den Bossche, and Professor Wouters for reading and commenting on the final manuscript. I have also greatly benefited from Ineke Sijtsma's work. She patiently corrected my English. Finally, I wish to thank all my colleagues for their contribution to the pleasant atmosphere at the EIP department in the past four years.

Jeroen Denkers
August 2008

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	v
Table of Contents	vii
Abbreviations	xi

INTRODUCTION

1 The Social Clause Debate	1
2 Unilateral Trade Restrictions in Response to a Prior Breach	5
3 Research Question and Structure of the Study	8

CHAPTER I

IMPORT BANS IN RESPONSE TO LABOUR RIGHTS VIOLATIONS UNDER WTO LAW

1 Introduction	11
2 How Does the WTO Dispute Settlement Process Work?	13
2.1 The Limited Jurisdiction of the WTO Dispute Settlement Mechanism	14
2.2 Violation Claims	16
2.3 Non-Violation Claims	17
3 Article I of the GATT	19
3.1 Likeness under Article I of the GATT	21
3.2 Unconditionality	22
3.3 The Enabling Clause	24
4 Article III of the GATT	25
4.1 Are Process-Based Import Bans Covered by Article III of the GATT?	28
4.2 The TBT and SPS Agreements	32
4.3 Are Process-Based Import Bans Covered by the TBT Agreement?	36
4.4 The Operationalization of Article III:4 of the GATT	38
4.4.1 The Determination of Likeness	38
4.4.2 Less Favourable Treatment	44
4.4.3 Case Law on Less Favourable Treatment	45
4.4.4 The Application of the 'Less Favourable Treatment' Test	52
5 Making the Production Process Detectable: Certification Schemes	54
5.1 Voluntary Certification Schemes	55
5.2 Mandatory Certification Schemes	58
5.2.1 Unilateral Mandatory Schemes	58
5.2.2 Mandatory Schemes Based on Mutual Recognition	62
6 Conclusions	64

**CHAPTER II
IMPORT BANS AS COUNTERMEASURES UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW**

1	Introduction	69
2	From Bilateralism to Community Interest	71
2.1	Traditional Approach to State Responsibility	71
2.2	Human Rights Law and State Responsibility	76
2.3	Do Human Rights Instruments Exclude Recourse to Countermeasures?	77
3	Legal Consequences of the Violation of an Obligation <i>Erga Omnes</i>	81
3.1	Specially Affected States	81
3.2	Invocation of Responsibility by States other than the Injured State	86
3.3	Additional Consequences of a Serious Breach of a Peremptory Norm	91
3.3.1	The Relationship between <i>Jus Cogens</i> and Obligations <i>Erga Omnes</i>	91
3.3.2	The Seriousness of the Breach	94
3.3.3	Cooperation to Bring the Breach to an End	96
3.3.4	The Obligation of Non-Recognition	100
3.3.5	The Obligation Not to Render Aid or Assistance in Maintaining the Situation Created by a Breach	102
4	Conclusions	108

**CHAPTER III
WORKERS' RIGHTS OF A PEREMPTORY CHARACTER**

1	Introduction	111
2	Norms <i>Juris Cogentis</i>	111
3	Article 53 of the Vienna Convention	115
3.1	Sources of a Peremptory Norm	115
3.1.1	Conventional Law	115
3.1.2	Customary International Law	117
3.2	<i>Opinio Juris Cogentis</i>	119
4	Frequently Used Examples of <i>Jus Cogens</i>	123
5	Fundamental Workers' Rights as Peremptory Norms?	126
5.1	Freedom of Association and Collective Bargaining	128
5.2	The Prohibition of Forced or Compulsory Labour	132
5.3	The Prohibition of Child Labour	136
5.4	Non-Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation	138
6	Conclusions	140

**CHAPTER IV
WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT AND THE APPLICATION OF NON-WTO LAW**

1	Introduction	143
2	Defining the Notion of Conflicts in the Applicable Law	144
3	Contracting Out	147

3.1	Conflict Clauses in Treaties	148
3.2	WTO Law as <i>Lex Posterior</i> ?	149
3.3	WTO Law as <i>Lex Specialis</i> ?	151
3.4	Contracting out is not General Exclusion	152
3.5	Limits to Contracting out	154
4	The Applicable Law in WTO Dispute Settlement	156
5	Conclusions	167

CHAPTER V
CONFLICT AVOIDANCE THROUGH GATT EXCEPTION CLAUSES

1	Introduction	169
2	The Presumption against Conflict	170
3	Justification under Article XX of the GATT	174
3.1	(a) Necessary to Protect Public Morals	179
3.1.1	Public Morals	179
3.1.2	Necessary	182
3.2	(b) Necessary to Protect Human, Animal, or Plant Life or Health	187
3.3	(d) Necessary to Secure Compliance with Laws or Regulations which are Not Inconsistent with the Provisions of the GATT	189
3.4	(e) Relating to Products of Prison Labour	191
3.5	The <i>Chapeau</i> of Article XX of the GATT	194
3.5.1	Arbitrary or Unjustifiable Discrimination	195
3.5.2	Disguised Restriction on International Trade	199
4	Justification under Article XXI of the GATT	200
5	Conclusions	203

CONCLUDING REMARKS

1	Consistency with Substantive WTO Law	208
2	Import Bans as Countermeasures	211
3	Labour Rights with <i>Jus Cogens</i> Status	215
4	The Application of Non-WTO Law in WTO Dispute Settlement	216
5	Conflict Avoidance	217
6	Alternative Unilateral Actions	220

	Nederlandse samenvatting (Dutch summary)	223
--	--	-----

	Bibliography	229
--	--------------	-----

	Table of cases	241
--	----------------	-----

| Table of Contents

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ASR	Draft Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts
ATC	Agreement on Textiles and Clothing
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CERD	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
DCPIA	Dolphin Protection Consumer Information Act
DSB	Dispute Settlement Body
DSU	Dispute Settlement Understanding
EC	European Community
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EPZ	Export Processing Zone
EU	European Union
ETP	Eastern Tropical Pacific
FSC	Forest Stewardship Council
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GPA	Government Procurement Agreement
GSP	Generalised System of Preferences
HRC	Human Rights Committee
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICFTU	International Confederation of Free Trade Unions
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ILC	International Labour Conference
ILC	International Law Commission
ILO	International Labour Organization
ITO	International Trade Organization
KPCS	Kimberley Process Certification Scheme
MERCOSUR	Mercado Común del Sur (Southern Common Market)
MFN	Most Favoured Nation
MMPA	Marine Mammal Protection Act
NAALC	North American Agreement on Labor Cooperation
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement

List of Abbreviations

OAU	Organization of African Unity
OECD	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
OTCA	Omnibus Trade and Competitiveness Act
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PPM	Process and Production Methods
RIAA	Reports of International Arbitral Awards
SA8000	Social Accountability 8000
SAI	Social Accountability International
SCM	Subsidies and Countervailing Measures
SPS	Sanitary and Phytosanitary
TBT	Technical Barriers to Trade
TPRM	Trade Policy Review Mechanism
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
US	United States
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WHO	World Health Organization
WTO	World Trade Organization