

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

**VOLUME XXII:
THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR RWANDA
2005**

André KLIP and Göran SLUITER (eds.)



Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

Distribution for the UK:

Hart Publishing Ltd.
16 C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel: +44 1865 51 75 30
Fax: +44 1865 51 07 10

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Tel: +1 503 287 3093
Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Switzerland and Germany:

Schulthess Verlag
Zwingliplatz 2
CH-8022 Zürich
Switzerland
Tel: +41 1 251 93 36
Fax: +41 1 261 63 94

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishers
Groenstraat 31
BE-2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel: +32 3 680 15 50
Fax: +32 3 658 71 21

Please cite as: ICTR, Judgement and Sentence, *Prosecutor v. Muhimana*, Case No. ICTR-95-1B-T, T. Ch. III, 28 April 2005, Klip/Sluiter, ALC-XXII-413

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)

Cover illustration: Anna Louise Klip

© 2009 Intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
www.intersentia.com

ISBN 978-90-5095-851-6

D/2009/7849/16

NUR 828

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----|
| Table of Contents | 5 |
| Preface | 11 |
| Part 1/ Preliminary matters | |
| 1. Issues related to the indictment | |
| Decision on the Prosecutor’s Motion for Leave to Amend the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Renzaho</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-31-I, T. Ch. II, 18 March 2005 | 13 |
| Decision on Joseph Nzirorera’s Motion to Dismiss for Selective Prosecution (Articles 15, 17(1) and 20(1) of the Statute), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-PT, T. Ch. III, 22 March 2005 | 23 |
| Decision on Prosecution Interlocutory Appeal Against Trial Chamber II Decision of 23 February 2005, <i>Prosecutor v. Muvunyi</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-55A-AR73, A. Ch., 12 May 2005 | 27 |
| Decision on Count Seven of the Amended Indictment – Violence to Life, Health and Physical or Mental Well-Being of Persons (Article 4(a) of the Statute), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-A4(a), T. Ch. III, 5 August 2005 | 43 |
| Decision on Defence Motion Challenging the Jurisdiction of the Tribunal – Joint Criminal Enterprise (Rule 72 and 73 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-R72, T. Ch. III, 5 August 2005 | 47 |
| Decision on Kabiligi Request for Particulars of the Amended Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 27 September 2005 | 51 |
| Decision on the Prosecutor’s Request for Leave to Amend the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Bisengimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-60-I, T. Ch. II, 27 October 2005 | 57 |
| Commentary <i>Astrid Reisinger Coracini</i> | 64 |
| Part 2/ Procedural matters | |
| 2. Fair trial | |
| Decision on Motion to Compel Accused to Testify Prior to Other Defence Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 11 January 2005 | 79 |
| Decision on the Prosecutor’s Motion Pursuant to Rule 73(B) for Certification to Appeal the Decision Denying Leave to File an Amended Indictment and for Stay of Proceedings, <i>Prosecutor v. Muvunyi</i> , Case No. ICTR-2000-55A-T, T. Ch. II, 16 March 2005 | 83 |
| Decision on Joseph Nzirorera’s Motion for Order Finding Prior Decisions to be of “No Effect” (Rules 46(A) and 73 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-PT, T. Ch. III, 24 May 2005 | 87 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Decision on the Defence Motions for Reconsideration of Protective Measures for Prosecution Witnesses (Rule 73 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-PT, T. Ch. III, 29 August 2005 | 91 |
| Decision on the “Requête d’Arsène Shalim Ntahobali en Autorisation de Rencontrer le Détenu Georges Rutaganda en l’Absence d’un Représentant du Procureur et du Greffe” (Article 20, Statute of the Tribunal and Rule 73, Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, Joint Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 21 September 2005. | 95 |
| Decision on Joseph Nzirorera’s Motion for Reconsideration or Certification to Appeal Decision on Motion for Order Allowing Meeting with Defence Witness (Rule 73(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 11 October 2005 | 101 |
| Decision on the Defence Motion for Admission of the Defence Investigator to Closed Hearings of Defence Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Seromba</i> , Case. No. ICTR-T-2001-66-T, T. Ch. III, 8 November 2005 | 105 |
| Commentary <i>Anne Pieter van der Mei</i> | 108 |
| 3. Joinder | |
| Decision on Severance of André Rwamakuba and for Leave to File Amended Indictment (Articles 6, 11, 12 <i>quater</i> and 20 of the Statute; Rules 47, 50 and 82(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse, Nzirorera and Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-PT, T. Ch. III, 14 February 2005. | 119 |
| Decision on Request for Severance by Accused Kabiligi, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 24 March 2005. | 133 |
| Commentary <i>Masha Fedorova</i> | 139 |
| 4. Undue delay | |
| Decision on Defence Motion for Stay of Proceedings (Article 20 of the Statute), <i>Prosecutor v. Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44C-PT, T. Ch. III, 3 June 2005. | 147 |
| Decision on Prosecution Motion for Reconsideration or, in the Alternative, Certification to Appeal Chamber’s Decision Denying Request for Adjournment (Article 19 of the Statute and Rule 73(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44C-T, T. Ch. III, 29 September 2005. | 157 |
| Commentary <i>Susana Assis Martins</i> | 164 |
| 5. Disclosure | |
| Decision on Motion to Unseal <i>Ex Parte</i> Submissions and to Strike Paragraphs 32.4 and 49 from the Amended Indictment (Rule 66(A)(i) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-R66, T. Ch. III, 3 May 2005 | 171 |
| Decision on Disclosure of Materials Relating to Immigration Statements of Defence Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 27 September 2005. | 177 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Decision on Defence Urgent Motion to Exclude Some Parts of the Prosecution Pre-Trial Brief (Rule 73bis of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Zigiranyirazo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-73-PT, T. Ch. III, 30 September 2005 | 183 |
| Decision on Interlocutory Appeals of Decision on Witness Protection Orders, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-AR73 & ICTR-98-41-AR73(B), A. Ch., 6 October 2005 | 189 |
| Commentary <i>Desi Stoitchkova</i> | 202 |
| 6. Witnesses and protective measures | |
| Decision on Admission of Statements of Deceased Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 19 January 2005 | 209 |
| Decision on Nyiramasuhuko's Strictly Confidential <i>Ex-Parte</i> – Under Seal – Motion for Additional Protective Measures for Some Defence Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, Joint Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 1 March 2005 | 219 |
| Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Sanctions Against Counsel for Nzirorera for Violation of Witness Protection Order and for an Injunction Against Further Violations (Rule 46(A) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-R46, T. Ch. III, 19 April 2005 | 231 |
| Decision on Defence Motion for Exclusion of Portions of Testimony of Expert Witness Dr. Alison des Forges, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 2 September 2005 | 235 |
| Decision on Defence Motion to Recall Prosecution Witness OAB for Cross-Examination, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 19 September 2005 | 245 |
| Decision on Defence Motion for Protective Measures (Rules 69 and 75 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44C-T, T. Ch. III, 21 September 2005 | 249 |
| Decision on Exclusion of Testimony Outside the Scope of the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 27 September 2005 | 253 |
| Decision on the Prosecution's Request to add Witness AHY, <i>Prosecutor v. Mpambara</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-65-T, T. Ch. I, 27 September 2005 | 261 |
| Decision on Tharcisse Muvunyi's Motion for Protection of Defence Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Muvunyi</i> , Case No. ICTR-2000-55A-T, T. Ch. II, 20 October 2005 | 265 |
| Commentary <i>Ousman Njikam</i> | 271 |
| 7. ICRC | |
| Reasons for the Chamber's Decision on the Accused's Motion to Exclude Witness TQ, <i>Prosecutor v. Muvunyi</i> , Case No. ICTR-2000-55A-T, T. Ch. II, 15 July 2005 | 279 |
| Commentary <i>Shamiso Zinzombe</i> | 284 |

8. Counsel

| | |
|--|-----|
| Decision on the Defence Motion for the Reinstatement of Jean Yaovi Degli as Lead Counsel for Gratien Kabiligi, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 19 January 2005 | 289 |
| Decision on Request for Private Representation of Gratien Kabiligi, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 4 March 2005 | 303 |
| Decision on Request for Certification of Appeal Concerning Private Representation, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 24 March 2005 | 309 |
| Decisions on Maitre Paul Skolnik’s Application for Reconsideration of the Chamber’s Decision to Instruct the Registrar to Assign him as Lead Counsel for Gratien Kabiligi, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 24 March 2005 | 313 |
| Commentary <i>Steven Freeland</i> | 322 |

Part 3/ Rights of a detained person

9. Right to marry

| | |
|---|-----|
| Registrar’s Decision Pursuant to Article 8(3) (C) on the Request for Marriage and Other Reliefs, <i>Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52A, Registrar, 12 January 2005 | 331 |
| Decision on Hassan Ngeze’s Application for Review of the Registrar’s Decision of 12 January 2005, <i>Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-1999-52-A, Pres., 14 September 2005 | 337 |
| Decision on Hassan Ngeze’s Application to set Aside President Møse’s Decision and Request to Consummate his Marriage, <i>Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, A. Ch., 6 December 2005 | 343 |
| Commentary <i>Dov Jacobs</i> | 346 |

10. Conditions of detention

| | |
|--|-----|
| Request for Reversal of Decision Prohibiting Contact With Other Detainees, <i>Prosecutor v. Munyakazi</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-36-I, Pres., 15 February 2005 | 355 |
| Request for Reversal of the Prohibition of Contact, <i>Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, Pres., 29 July 2005 | 359 |
| Commentary <i>Caroline Fournet</i> | 362 |

Part 4/ Judgement and sentencing

11. Judgements

| | |
|--|-----|
| Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Rutaganira</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1C-T, T. Ch. III, 14 March 2005 | 373 |
| Commentary <i>Katalin Ligeti</i> | 403 |
| Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Muhimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1B-T, T. Ch. III, 28 April 2005 | 413 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Commentary <i>Michael Bohlander</i> | 516 |
| Judgement, <i>Semanza v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-20-A, A. Ch., 20 May 2005 | 525 |
| Separate Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen and Judge Güney | 611 |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pocar | 613 |
| Commentary <i>Florian Jessberger and Oliver Schüttpelz</i> | 620 |
| Judgement, <i>Kajelijeli v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44A-A, A. Ch., 23 May 2005 | 625 |
| Commentary <i>Maria Kaiafa-Gbandi and Yannis Naziris</i> | 711 |
| Judgement, <i>Kamuhanda v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-54A-A, A. Ch., 19 September 2005 | 721 |
| Separate Opinion of Presiding Judge Theodor Meron | 806 |
| Separate Opinion of Judge Wolfgang Schomburg | 807 |
| Separate and Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Mohamed Shahabuddeen | 813 |
| Separate Opinion of Judge Inés Mónica Weinberg de Roca on Paragraph 77 of the Judgement | 817 |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Inés Mónica Weinberg de Roca | 818 |
| Commentary <i>Suzannah Linton</i> | 831 |
| Index | 849 |
| Contributors and Editors | 853 |

PREFACE

This is the twenty-second volume in the series 'Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals' and contains the most important decisions of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR) from 1 January 2005 up to and including 8 November 2005. It is the seventh volume in the series containing decisions of the ICTR. A further selected volume on ICTR case law will be volume 24, and others will follow.

The present volume is in its approach and structure similar to the previous volumes. Thus, the book contains the full text of all the decisions and judgements, including separate, concurring and dissenting opinions, as well as annexes to the decisions. As with the previous volumes, the editors have ensured that the decisions are fully identical to the *written* original text, as issued by the ICTR Press and Information Office and which bears the signatures of the Judges. We are aware that more and more decisions are available on the internet. However, only the written decisions bearing the signatures of the Judges can be considered as authoritative versions. In the course of our editorial work on this and previous volumes, we have discovered inconsistencies between the written original version of the decision and the internet version, if the latter is available at all. Much of our editorial efforts consist in making the texts in this series identical to the written original version.

We could only include the full text of the decisions in this volume by reducing their original format. Still, we wanted the reader to be able to identify the page number of the original text, which is throughout the text put in brackets []. We are again very happy that a number of scholars in the field of international criminal law were prepared to write interesting and stimulating commentaries regarding the decisions.

A few words regarding the selection of decisions may give the user insight into our working method. In principle, we select all final judgements. In addition, we publish decisions taken at any stage of the procedure that are important for other reasons: because they deal with a specific legal question, because they are representative of a specific type of decision or because they enter new legal waters. Of course, we cannot publish all decisions. As a result, we may not publish decisions in which issues have been decided in a way similar or identical to a decision that has already been selected.

The decisions are presented in different parts and under different headings.

Part 1, 'Preliminary Matters', relates to various decisions concerning the indictment.

Part 2 deals with procedural matters. Whereas some decisions concern the way the proceedings are conducted in view of the requirements of a fair trial, others relate to the rights and obligations of witnesses.

Part 3, 'Rights of a detained person', deals with issues related to the conditions of detention and the question of whether detained persons are equally entitled to rights that ordinary citizens have, in particular the right to marry.

Part 4, 'Judgement and Sentencing', contains five judgements and covers by far the largest part of this volume. As mentioned above, judgements are by definition included in this series, because of their importance, both from a factual and legal perspective.

We owe acknowledgements to many persons without whom we could not have completed this twenty-second volume. These include Registrar Adama Dieng of the ICTR and his staff, who offered generous assistance in obtaining all the hard copies of decisions. We are particularly most grateful to Registrar Dieng and Ms Nana Moeljadi for arranging an official translation into English of decisions available only in French. Our publisher Intersentia, in particular Hans Kluwer, Tom Scheirs and Isabelle van Dongen, facilitated our work. We also acknowledge the work of our student assistants, Thom Dieben (Maastricht) and Hadassa Noorda (Amsterdam), who assisted with the corrections of the text and without whom we would not be able to publish this series. The Netherlands School of Human Rights Research stimulated our work. Steven Freeland from the University of Western Sydney, Australia, offered tremendous help by correcting our English. Last but not least, we wish to thank the distinguished authors for their commentaries on the decisions.

We hope that this volume will contribute to the further dissemination of the important work of the ICTR and that it will provide access to its decisions to practitioners, academics and students.

André Klip and Göran Sluiter
Maastricht/ Amsterdam, January 2009