

---

# The Principle of *Numerus Clausus* in European Property Law

Ius Commune Europaeum

Bram Akkermans  
PhD-thesis

The Principle of *Numerus Clausus* in European Property Law

ISBN-13: 978-90-5095-824-0  
D/2008/7849/65  
NUR 822

© 2008 Intersentia Antwerp – Oxford – Portland  
[www.intersentia.com](http://www.intersentia.com)

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photo copy, micro-film or any other means, without written permission from the author.

## PREFACE

It is a great joy to finish a project after having worked on it for a period of four years. The work in this book is the result of research on my Ph.D. thesis at the Faculty of Law of Maastricht University, undertaken in the period from February 2004 until December 2007.

During my research I have had the honour and pleasure to discuss my work with various property law and comparative law experts across the world. Some of them deserve a special word of thanks.

First and foremost I owe gratitude to my supervisor Prof. dr. Sjef van Erp. Few in the world are patient enough to sit and listen to a beginning researcher and always make time to think and reflect with him. Many thanks for opening his incredible network for me. In the past years I have very much enjoyed working together, a cooperation I hope to continue for many more years.

Second, the members of the *Ius Commune* Casebook Team on Property law must be mentioned. William Swadling of Brasenose College, Oxford University, for hosting me, both in the early as well as in the more advanced stages of my research. Vincent Sagaert for his enthusiastic support and relentless – and very successful – attempts to focus my attention on French and Belgian law. Monika Hinteregger, for keeping my focus on the German tradition and her kind and expertise criticism on my work. Caroline Lebon for sharing my experiences as junior researcher. Michael Milo for always taking an interest in my progress, and Alexandra Braun for showing me new insights in the law of trusts.

Third, during my research I was hosted by Reinhard Zimmermann, director of the Max Planck Institute in Hamburg, who kindly offered me the opportunity to present my work in his workshop in Hamburg, where I first survived critical German views on the law of property. Reiner Schulze, dean of the law faculty and director of CEP in Münster hosted me several times. Also with him I could discuss my research and he kindly allowed me to present my research to his researchers and guests. Christoph Schmid, director of ZERP in Bremen, allowed me to stay at his institute, present my research, and, perhaps most importantly, introduced me to the world of European private international law. Finally, Marius de Waal was kind enough to allow a former student time, space, and host a visit for him in Stellenbosch.

The members of the reading committee of my thesis deserve as special mentioning for their willingness to read through the lengthy manuscript. Special thanks must go to René de Groot, Vincent Sagaert, Reiner Schulze, William Swadling and Marius de Waal, for their willingness to sit on my reading committee. I am honoured by their willingness to read through the whole manuscript.

There are two more groups that deserve mentioning. Of my direct colleagues in Maastricht, I owe special thanks to Lars van Vliet for his relentless support and difficult questions, always sharpening the mind or attempting to crack our brains on the doctrine of the law of property. To Tanja van der Meer for her support and always inspiring views on the law of property, both from a modern, as well as from a historical perspective. It is through her that I really learned to enjoy teaching.

And last, but most certainly not least, my (international) friends and colleagues at the faculty without whom I would never have finished at all. It is through their friendship and support that I kept motivated to continue and finish.

A wise colleague once stated that without a personal life there is no professional life possible. To her thanks for her friendship, but in particular thanks for showing me this insight. To my family, my parents, but to Irene in particular, thanks for your patience and stamina to stick with me. It is to her that this book is dedicated.

Finally, on the contents of this book, the research was closed on 31 December 2007. I have only been able to make small changes and additions after that.

Brussels, July 2008.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  |    |
|--|----|
| PREFACE .....  | v  |
| <b>CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION</b> .....                               | 1  |
| 1. Introduction .....  | 1  |
| 1.1. Personal Rights and Property Rights .....                     | 2  |
| 1.2. Property Law .....  | 4  |
| 1.2.1. Principles of Property Law .....                            | 5  |
| 1.2.2. <i>Numerus Clausus</i> of Property Rights .....             | 6  |
| 1.3. European Private Law .....                                    | 7  |
| 2. Legal Systems .....   | 9  |
| 2.1. Civil Law: French, German and Dutch Law .....                 | 10 |
| 2.2. Common Law: English Law .....                                 | 11 |
| 2.3. South African Law as a Comparative Factor .....               | 12 |
| 3. Methodology .....   | 12 |
| 4. Terminology .....   | 13 |
| 5. Searching for a <i>Numerus Clausus</i> .....                    | 15 |
| <b>CHAPTER 2: THE DEVELOPMENT OF PROPERTY RIGHTS</b> .....         | 19 |
| 1. Introduction .....  | 19 |
| 2. (Pre-) Classical Roman Law .....                                | 21 |
| 2.1. Introduction .....  | 21 |
| 2.2. General Principles of (Pre-) Classical Roman Law .....        | 22 |
| 2.3. Ownership .....   | 24 |
| 2.4. Other Property Rights .....                                   | 29 |
| 2.5. A <i>Numerus Clausus</i> in (Pre-) Classical Roman Law? ..... | 43 |
| 2.6. Summary .....   | 45 |
| 3. Codified Roman Law – The <i>Corpus Iuris Civilis</i> .....      | 45 |
| 3.1. Introduction .....  | 45 |

Table of Contents

|                                    |   |           |
|------------------------------------|---|-----------|
| 3.2.                               | General Principles of the <i>Corpus Iuris Civilis</i> .....         | 47        |
| 3.3.                               | Ownership .....   | 47        |
| 3.4.                               | Other Property Rights .....   | 50        |
| 3.5.                               | <i>A Numerus Clausus</i> in the <i>Corpus Iuris Civilis</i> ? ..... | 55        |
| 3.6.                               | Summary .....   | 56        |
| 4.                                 | The <i>Ius Commune</i> .....  | 56        |
| 4.1.                               | Introduction .....  | 56        |
| 4.1.1.                             | Sources of Law: Problems with the <i>Ius Proprium</i> .....         | 58        |
| 4.2.                               | General Principles of the <i>Ius Commune</i> .....                  | 60        |
| 4.3.                               | Ownership .....   | 61        |
| 4.4.                               | Other Property Rights .....   | 64        |
| 4.5.                               | Summary .....   | 66        |
| 5.                                 | Natural Law and the French Revolution .....                         | 67        |
| 5.1.                               | Introduction .....  | 67        |
| 5.2.                               | General Principles .....  | 69        |
| 5.3.                               | Ownership .....   | 70        |
| 5.3.1.                             | Natural Law School .....  | 70        |
| 5.3.2.                             | The French Revolution .....   | 72        |
| 5.4.                               | Other Property Rights .....   | 74        |
| 5.4.1.                             | Natural Law School .....  | 74        |
| 5.4.2.                             | The French Revolution .....   | 76        |
| 5.5.                               | <i>A Numerus Clausus</i> after the French Revolution? .....         | 77        |
| 5.6.                               | Summary .....   | 78        |
| 6.                                 | Conclusion .....  | 78        |
| 6.1.                               | General Summary .....   | 78        |
| 6.2.                               | Conclusion .....  | 80        |
| <b>CHAPTER 3: FRENCH LAW .....</b> |   | <b>83</b> |
| 1.                                 | Introduction .....  | 83        |
| 2.                                 | The Right of Ownership .....  | 89        |
| 2.1.                               | Ownership .....   | 91        |
| 2.2.                               | Co-Ownership including Apartments .....                             | 99        |
| 2.3.                               | Security Ownership .....  | 105       |
| 3.                                 | Other Property Rights .....   | 116       |
| 3.1.                               | Real Servitudes .....   | 118       |
| 3.2.                               | Personal Servitudes .....   | 125       |
| 3.3.                               | <i>Superficies</i> .....  | 130       |
| 3.4.                               | <i>Emphyteusis</i> .....  | 133       |
| 3.5.                               | Pledge .....  | 136       |
| 3.6.                               | Hypothec .....  | 142       |
| 3.7.                               | Priority Rights .....   | 146       |
| 4.                                 | Borderline Cases in French Property Law .....                       | 148       |
| 4.1.                               | Right of Retention .....  | 148       |

|                                    |  |            |
|------------------------------------|--|------------|
| 4.2.                               | Real Obligations .....   | 151        |
| 4.3.                               | <i>Concession Immobilière</i> .....                                | 154        |
| 4.4.                               | Real Suretyship.....   | 156        |
| 4.5.                               | <i>Fiducie</i> .....   | 158        |
| 4.6.                               | Lease .....  | 159        |
| 5.                                 | A <i>Numerus Clausus</i> in French Property Law?.....              | 161        |
| <b>CHAPTER 4: GERMAN LAW .....</b> |  | <b>169</b> |
| 1.                                 | Introduction .....   | 169        |
| 2.                                 | The Right of Ownership.....  | 175        |
| 2.1.                               | Normal Ownership .....   | 176        |
| 2.2.                               | Co-Ownership .....   | 180        |
| 2.3.                               | Ownership of an Apartment .....                                    | 181        |
| 2.4.                               | <i>Treuhand</i> Ownership.....                                     | 184        |
| 2.5.                               | Security Ownership .....   | 186        |
| 3.                                 | Other Property Rights .....  | 191        |
| 3.1.                               | Real Servitudes .....  | 199        |
| 3.2.                               | Personal Servitudes: Usufruct and Limited Personal Servitudes..... | 205        |
| 3.3.                               | <i>Superficies</i> .....   | 211        |
| 3.4.                               | Expectation Rights: Pre-Emptive Right and Acquisition Right .....  | 214        |
| 3.5.                               | Real Burden ( <i>Reallast</i> ) .....                              | 221        |
| 3.6.                               | Pledge .....   | 224        |
| 3.7.                               | Hypothec .....   | 228        |
| 3.8.                               | <i>Grundschild</i> .....   | 232        |
| 4.                                 | Borderline Cases in German Property Law .....                      | 235        |
| 4.1.                               | Old Property Rights.....   | 235        |
| 4.2.                               | Pre-Emptive Registration ( <i>Vormerkung</i> ).....                | 236        |
| 4.3.                               | Entitlement to Possession through the Law of Obligations .....     | 239        |
| 4.4.                               | Lease of Immovable Objects .....                                   | 240        |
| 4.5.                               | <i>Treuhand</i> Bank Account.....                                  | 243        |
| 5.                                 | A <i>Numerus Clausus</i> in German Property Law? .....             | 244        |
| <b>CHAPTER 5: DUTCH LAW .....</b>  |  | <b>253</b> |
| 1.                                 | Introduction .....   | 253        |
| 2.                                 | The Right of Ownership.....  | 256        |
| 2.1.                               | Normal Ownership .....   | 258        |
| 2.2.                               | Co-Ownership .....   | 262        |
| 2.3.                               | Security Ownership .....   | 263        |
| 3.                                 | Other Property Rights .....  | 270        |
| 3.1.                               | Real Servitudes.....   | 272        |
| 3.2.                               | Usufruct.....  | 275        |
| 3.3.                               | <i>Emphyteusis</i> .....   | 280        |

Table of Contents

|                                    |   |            |
|------------------------------------|---|------------|
| 3.4.                               | <i>Superficies</i> .....                                      | 283        |
| 3.5.                               | Right of Apartment.....                                       | 286        |
| 3.6.                               | Pledge.....   | 289        |
| 3.7.                               | Hypothech.....  | 293        |
| 4.                                 | Borderline Cases in Dutch Property Law.....                   | 298        |
| 4.1.                               | Priority Rights.....  | 298        |
| 4.2.                               | Old Property Rights.....                                      | 299        |
| 4.3.                               | Lease of Immovable Objects.....                               | 300        |
| 4.4.                               | Registration of a Consumer Contract of a Sale of a House..... | 302        |
| 4.5.                               | After-Effects of Property Rights.....                         | 304        |
| 4.6.                               | Privative Mandate.....  | 306        |
| 4.7.                               | Obligations as Part of Property Rights.....                   | 308        |
| 4.8.                               | 'Qualitative Duties' and Chain Clauses.....                   | 311        |
| 4.9.                               | EC and International Influences.....                          | 315        |
| 5.                                 | <i>A Numerus Clausus</i> in Dutch Property Law?.....          | 320        |
| <b>CHAPTER 6: ENGLISH LAW.....</b> |   | <b>331</b> |
| 1.                                 | Introduction.....   | 331        |
| 1.1.                               | Terminology.....  | 332        |
| 1.2.                               | Common Law and Equity.....                                    | 334        |
| 1.3.                               | Personal Property Law and Land Law.....                       | 337        |
| 1.4.                               | Commercial Law.....   | 338        |
| 1.5.                               | Trust Law.....  | 338        |
| 2.                                 | Property Rights in Respect of Land.....                       | 343        |
| 2.1.                               | Fee Simple.....   | 346        |
| 2.2.                               | Lease of Land.....  | 351        |
| 2.3.                               | Easement.....   | 359        |
| 2.4.                               | Profit à Prendre.....   | 361        |
| 2.5.                               | Restrictive Covenant.....                                     | 363        |
| 2.6.                               | Rentcharges over Land.....                                    | 365        |
| 2.7.                               | Estate Contracts.....   | 366        |
| 2.8.                               | Options to Purchase.....                                      | 367        |
| 2.9.                               | Mortgage of Land and Equity of Redemption.....                | 367        |
| 2.10.                              | Charges of Land.....  | 371        |
| 3.                                 | Property Rights in Respect of Personalty.....                 | 373        |
| 3.1.                               | Title / Ownership.....  | 373        |
| 3.2.                               | Leases / Bailment?.....                                       | 376        |
| 3.3.                               | Mortgage of Chattels and Equity of Redemption.....            | 379        |
| 3.4.                               | Charges, Fixed and Floating.....                              | 380        |
| 3.5.                               | Pledge.....   | 384        |
| 3.6.                               | Liens.....  | 385        |
| 4.                                 | <i>A Numerus Clausus</i> in English Property Law?.....        | 387        |



|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>CHAPTER 7: COMPARATIVE OVERVIEW</b> .....  | 397 |
| 1. Introduction .....   | 397 |
| 1.1. Property Law in Development .....  | 398 |
| 1.2. The Increasing Role of Contract Law .....  | 400 |
| 1.3. Considering <i>Numerus Clausus</i> .....   | 402 |
| 1.3.1. Requirements of <i>Numerus Clausus</i> .....   | 402 |
| 1.3.2. <i>Numerus Clausus</i> as a Principle or as a Rule? .....  | 403 |
| 1.3.3. Historical Origins of <i>Numerus Clausus</i> .....   | 403 |
| 1.3.4. <i>Numerus Clausus</i> as a Principle of ‘Constitutional’ Property Law,<br>or as a Framework Principle ..... | 407 |
| 2. The Content of Property Law Systems in Europe .....  | 408 |
| 2.1. Of Primary Property Rights and Lesser Property Rights .....  | 410 |
| 2.2. Of Ways to Create a Lesser Property Right .....  | 413 |
| 2.3. Primary Property Rights .....  | 417 |
| 2.4. Lesser Rights to Use .....   | 420 |
| 2.4.1. Lesser Rights to Use for a Limited Period of Time .....  | 421 |
| 2.4.2. Lesser Rights to Use for an Unlimited Period of Time .....   | 423 |
| 2.4.3. Lesser Rights to Use of an Apartment .....   | 427 |
| 2.4.4. Evaluation .....   | 428 |
| 2.5. Lesser Rights as Security .....  | 428 |
| 2.5.1. Security Rights in Respect of Movables and Chattels .....  | 429 |
| 2.5.2. Security Rights in Respect of Immovables and Land .....  | 430 |
| 2.5.3. Evaluation .....   | 432 |
| 2.6. Lesser Rights Used to Acquire a Certain Legal Position (Anticipatory<br>Rights) .....                          | 433 |
| 3. <i>Numerus Clausus</i> in Property Law Systems in Europe? .....  | 436 |
| 3.1. Justifications for a <i>Numerus Clausus</i> from within the Legal System .....                                 | 437 |
| 3.2. Law and Economics on <i>Numerus Clausus</i> .....  | 440 |
| 3.2.1. Fragmentation: Not too Many Rights; on Commons and<br>Anti-Commons .....                                     | 442 |
| 3.2.2. <i>Numerus Clausus</i> as Optimal Standardisation of Property Rights .....                                   | 445 |
| 3.2.3. <i>Numerus Clausus</i> as Verification of Property Rights .....  | 448 |
| 3.2.4. Critical Analysis of the Approach to <i>Numerus Clausus</i> in Law and<br>Economics .....                    | 450 |
| 3.3. <i>Numerus Clausus</i> in Comparative Analysis .....   | 453 |
| 3.4. Struycken: Why we Need a <i>Numerus Clausus</i> .....  | 458 |
| 3.5. Füller: Restructuring Property Law but Maintaining a Closed System .....                                       | 464 |
| 3.6. Van Erp: a Less Rigid <i>Numerus Clausus</i> .....   | 467 |
| 3.7. Smits and Sagaert: Property Law as a System of Obligations .....   | 469 |
| 3.8. A Legal System without a <i>Numerus Clausus</i> : South African Law .....                                      | 473 |
| 4. Conclusion: <i>Numerus Clausus</i> in Property Law Systems in Europe .....                                       | 482 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| CHAPTER 8: <i>NUMERUS CLAUSUS</i> IN A EUROPEAN PROPERTY LAW? .....   | 489 |
| 1. Introduction .....   | 489 |
| 1.1. European Property Law .....  | 489 |
| 1.2. Private International Law .....  | 490 |
| 1.3. European Union Law .....   | 494 |
| 2. The European Union and the Need for a European Property Law .....  | 496 |
| 2.1. EC Private Law .....   | 497 |
| 2.1.1. Legal Framework: Primary Community Law .....   | 497 |
| 2.1.2. Legal Framework: Secondary Community Law .....   | 500 |
| 2.1.3. European Commission Initiatives for Future Legislation .....   | 503 |
| 2.2. The ECJ as a Motor for the Development of European Private Law .....   | 509 |
| 2.2.1. Free Movement of Goods .....   | 510 |
| 2.2.1.1. Obstacles to Trade .....   | 510 |
| 2.2.1.2. Grounds for Justification .....  | 513 |
| 2.2.1.3. Proportionality .....  | 513 |
| 2.2.1.4. Moving Towards a Market Access Test? .....   | 514 |
| 2.2.1.5. Conclusion .....   | 516 |
| 2.2.2. Freedom of Establishment and its Effect on Substantive Private Law .....   | 517 |
| 2.3. Voluntary Harmonisation .....  | 521 |
| 2.4. The Effects of European Law on the Law of Property .....   | 522 |
| 2.4.1. Article 295 EC Treaty and European Property Law .....  | 523 |
| 2.4.2. The Effects of Internal Market Law on Property Law .....   | 525 |
| 2.4.2.1. Obstacles to Trade .....   | 525 |
| 2.4.2.2. Grounds for Justification .....  | 529 |
| 2.4.2.3. Proportionality .....  | 530 |
| 2.4.2.4. Example: Krantz .....  | 532 |
| 2.4.2.5. Evaluation .....   | 534 |
| 2.4.2.6. Other Freedoms .....   | 536 |
| 2.4.2.7. Conclusion .....   | 537 |
| 3. The Making of European Property Law .....  | 538 |
| 3.1. The Influence of European Law on National Property Law Systems .....   | 540 |
| 3.2. The Status of European Property Law .....  | 542 |
| 3.3. Two Fundamental Questions for a Coherent European Property Law .....   | 547 |
| 3.3.1. Separation between the Law of Obligations and the Law of Property? .....   | 547 |
| 3.3.2. <i>Numerus Clausus</i> : the Available Menu of Property Rights? .....  | 548 |
| 3.4. A Possible Model for a European Property Law: <i>Numerus Clausus</i><br>as a Constitutive Element of European Property Law ..... | 550 |
| 3.4.1. Towards a European Property Law as a Flexible System of<br>Property Rights .....   | 552 |
| 3.4.2. A Limited Open System of Property Relations .....  | 553 |
| 3.4.3. Formulating the Access Test .....  | 555 |
| 3.4.4. Advantages of an Access Test and a Limited Open System of<br>Property Rights .....   | 558 |
| 3.4.5. Possible Objections to an Access Test and to a Limited Open<br>System of Property Rights .....                                 | 561 |

|                               |     |
|-------------------------------|-----|
| 4. Conclusions.....           | 563 |
| <b>SUMMARY</b> .....          | 565 |
| <b>SAMENVATTING</b> .....     | 571 |
| <b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b> .....     | 579 |
| <b>INDEX</b> .....            | 651 |
| <b>CURRICULUM VITAE</b> ..... | 657 |