

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF  
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

**VOLUME XVII:**

**THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR RWANDA  
2003 – 2004**

**André KLIP and Göran SLUITER (eds.)**



Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

*Distribution for the UK:*

Hart Publishing Ltd.  
16 C Worcester Place  
Oxford OX1 2JW  
UK  
Tel: +44 1865 51 75 30  
Fax: +44 1865 51 07 10

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*

International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Ave Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Tel: +1 503 287 3093  
Fax: +1 503 280 8832  
Email: [info@isbs.com](mailto:info@isbs.com)

*Distribution for Switzerland and Germany:*

Schulthess Verlag  
Zwingliplatz 2  
CH-8022 Zürich  
Switzerland  
Tel: +41 1 251 93 36  
Fax: +41 1 261 63 94

*Distribution for other countries:*

Intersentia Publishers  
Groenstraat 31  
BE-2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel: +32 3 680 15 50  
Fax: +32 3 658 71 21

Please cite as: ICTR, Judgement and Sentence, *Prosecutor v. Kamuhanda*, Case No. ICTR-95-54A-T, T. Ch. II, 22 January 2004, Klip/ Sluiter, ALC-XVII-531

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals  
André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)  
Cover illustration: Anna Louise Klip

© 2008 Intersentia  
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland  
<http://www.intersentia.com>

ISBN 978-90-5095-798-4  
D/2008/7849/74  
NUR 828

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Table of Contents</b> .....	5
<b>Preface</b> .....	7
<b>Part 1/ Procedural Matters</b>	
Decision on the Request for Documents Arising From Judicial Proceedings in Rwanda in Respect of Prosecution Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsemgyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 16 December 2003 .....	9
Commentary <i>Shamiso Zinzombe</i> .....	13
Decision on Prosecutor's Interlocutory Appeals Regarding Exclusion of Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsemgyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-AR93 & ICTR-98-41-AR93, 2, A. Ch., 19 December 2003 .....	17
Commentary <i>Shamiso Zinzombe</i> .....	23
<b>Part 2/ Judgements</b>	
Judgment and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Kajelijeli</i> , Case No. 98-44A-T, A. Ch., 1 December 2003. . .	27
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Arlette Ramaroson .....	203
Commentary: <i>William Schabas</i> .....	217
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-T, T. Ch. I, 3 December 2003 .....	221
Commentary: <i>Caroline Fournet</i> .....	518
Judgment and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Kamuhanda</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-54A-T, T. Ch. II, 22 January 2004 .....	531
Judge Maqutu's Separate and Concurring Opinion on the Verdict .....	695
Judge Maqutu's Dissent on the Sentence .....	707
Commentary: <i>Daniel Ntanda-Nsereko</i> .....	710
Index .....	715
Contributors and Editors .....	717

## PREFACE

This is the seventeenth volume in the series “Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals” and contains the most important decisions of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR) from 1 December 2003 up to and including 22 January 2004. It is the fifth volume in the series containing decisions of the ICTR. Forthcoming volumes in this series on ICTR case law will be volumes 18, 22 and 24.

This volume covers an extraordinarily short period of time, due primarily to the three rather voluminous judgements rendered during the period. We decided that it is important to maintain the chronological order. As a result, we have only included two procedural decisions, apart from the three judgements.

The present volume is in its approach and structure similar to the previous sixteen volumes. Thus, the book contains the full text of all the decisions and judgements, including separate, concurring and dissenting opinions, as well as annexes to the decisions. As in the previous volumes, the editors have ensured that the decisions are fully identical to the *written* original text, as issued by the ICTR Press and Information Office and which bears the signatures of the Judges. We are aware that more and more decisions are available on the internet. However, only the written decisions bearing the signatures of the Judges can be considered authoritative versions. In the course of our editorial work on this and previous volumes, we have discovered inconsistencies between the written original version of the decision and the internet version, if the latter is available at all. Much of our editorial efforts consist in making the texts in this series identical to the original written version.

We could only include the full text of the decisions in this volume by reducing their original format. Still, we wanted the reader to be able to identify the page number of the original text, which is throughout the text put in brackets [ ]. We are again very happy that a number of scholars in the field of international criminal law were prepared to write interesting and stimulating commentaries to the decisions.

A few words regarding the selection of decisions may give the user insight into our working method. In principle, we select all final judgements. In addition, we publish decisions taken at any stage of the procedure that are important for other reasons: because they deal with a specific legal question, because they are representative of a specific type of decision or because they enter new legal waters. Of course, we cannot publish all decisions. As a result we may not publish decisions in which issues have been decided in a way similar or identical to a decision that has already been selected.

The decisions are presented in different parts and under different headings.

Part 1 deals with procedural matters and comprises two decisions on evidentiary issues.

Part 2 contains three judgements, handed down shortly after each other, and covers by far the largest part of this volume. As mentioned above, judgements are by definition included in this series, because of their importance, both from a factual and legal perspective.

We owe acknowledgements to many persons without whom we could not have completed this seventeenth volume. These include Registrar Adama Dieng of the ICTR and his staff, who offered generous assistance in obtaining all the hard copies of decisions. Our publisher Intersentia, in particular Hans Kluwer and Isabelle van Dongen, facilitated our work. We also acknowledge the work of our student assistants Thom Dieben (Maastricht) and Hadassa Noorda (Amsterdam), who assisted with the corrections of the text and without whom we would not be able to publish these series. The Netherlands School of Human Rights Research encouraged our work. Steven Freeland from the University of Western Sydney, Australia, offered tremendous help by correcting our English. Last but not least, we wish to thank the distinguished authors for their commentaries to the decisions.

We hope that this volume will contribute to the further dissemination of the important work of the ICTR and that it will provide access to its decisions to practitioners, academics and students.

André Klip and Göran Sluiter  
Maastricht/Amsterdam, June 2008