

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## INTRODUCTION

Fabrizio CAFAGGI and Hans-W. MICKLITZ . . . . .	1
1. The frame . . . . .	1
2. The questions. . . . .	7
3. Public/private enforcement in a multi-level structure – The US, Canada and Europe compared . . . . .	11
4. The transatlantic scenario – the regulatory role of aggregate litigation in North America and its institutional pre-conditions. . . . .	21
5. Adjudication and transborder litigation in North America and the EU . . . . .	29
6. Purpose and content of this book . . . . .	38

## *PART I. COMPARATIVE INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS*

### THE INSTITUTIONAL DIMENSION OF CONSUMER PROTECTION

Samuel ISSACHAROFF and Ian SAMUEL . . . . .	47
Introduction. . . . .	47
1. The Typology. . . . .	50
2. Institutions and Private Enforcement . . . . .	56

### PUBLIC AND PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT IN CONSUMER PROTECTION: GENERAL COMPARISON EU-USA

Jules STUYCK . . . . .	63
Introduction. . . . .	63
1. The EU Constitutional Framework for Enforcement of Consumer Rights . . . . .	65
1.1. EU Competence and Its Limits. . . . .	65
1.2. The Autonomy of the Member States in the Field of Remedies and Its Limits. . . . .	70
1.3. The Lack of Horizontal Direct Effect of EU (Consumer) Directives . . . . .	74
1.4. Conclusion . . . . .	76

2. Individual and Collective Redress for Consumers in the Member States: The Public-Private Enforcement Divide and Mix .....	76
2.1. Consumer Law as Part of Private or Public Law .....	76
2.2. Public or Private Enforcement or Public and Private Enforcement? ..	77
A. General Discussion .....	77
B. The Injunctions Directive .....	78
C. The Administrative Cooperation Regulation .....	79
D. Conclusion .....	79
2.3. Collective Actions for Damages: Comparison with US Class Actions	80
3. Claims for Damages in the Case of Infringement of the EC Antitrust Rules .....	82
4. A Case for Community Legislation? The Difficulties of Multinational Litigation of Collective Action .....	86
General Conclusion .....	89

**PUBLIC AND PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT OF CONSUMER LAW IN  
CENTRAL AND EASTERN EUROPE: INSTITUTIONAL CHOICE IN  
THE SHADOW OF EU ENLARGEMENT**

Antonina BAKARDJIEVA ENGELBREKT .....	91
1. Introduction .....	91
2. Analytical Approach .....	93
3. The Evolution of Consumer Protection Law and Policy in CEE Countries .	96
3.1. The Constitutional Setting .....	96
3.2. Consumer Protection by Conditionality .....	96
4. Institutional Choice and Design .....	101
4.1. Administrative Enforcement .....	101
A. Institutional Design .....	102
B. <i>Ex Post v. Ex Ante</i> .....	103
C. Individual v. Collective Interests .....	104
D. Injunctions v. Penalties .....	106
E. Why Public Enforcement? .....	109
F. What Advantages Are There with Public Enforcement? The Costs and Benefits of Participation .....	111
4.2. Judicial Collective Enforcement .....	114
A. Injunctions v. Damages .....	114
B. Institutional Actors: Consumer Organisations and Lawyers ...	119
C. The Problem of Confused Incentives: Converting Private Vice into Public Virtue? .....	123
D. The Judiciary as a Decision-Making Process .....	124

4.3. Novel Forms of Consumer Participation and Representation. . . . .	126
A. Abstract Control of Legality. . . . .	126
B. State Liability . . . . .	127
C. Cooperative v. Bifurcated Strategies . . . . .	128
D. Individual Consumers as Avengers of Collective Interests . . . . .	129
E. European Judicial Governance: Another Forum for Consumer Voice? . . . . .	130
5. The Role of Enlargement Revisited . . . . .	130
6. Conclusion. . . . .	133

## ***PART II. PUBLIC AND PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT IN CONSUMER PROTECTION***

### **AN INSTITUTIONAL PERSPECTIVE ON THE REGULATION OF PRODUCTS IN THE UNITED STATES**

Catherine M. SHARKEY. . . . .	139
Introduction. . . . .	139
1. Theoretical Considerations . . . . .	141
1.1. Common Law Liability versus Safety Regulation . . . . .	142
1.2. State versus Federal Regulation . . . . .	142
2. Institutional Considerations. . . . .	143
Conclusion . . . . .	149

### **DEVELOPING APPROACHES TO PUBLIC AND PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT IN ENGLAND AND WALES**

Christopher HODGES. . . . .	151
1. Private Law Claims. . . . .	152
2. Compensation Schemes. . . . .	155
3. Powers of Public Authorities and Consumer Bodies . . . . .	157
3.1. Compensation Orders in Criminal Proceedings. . . . .	157
3.2. Specific Powers on Restitution . . . . .	158
3.3. Enforcement of EU Consumer Protection Law . . . . .	158
3.4. Competition Law Mechanisms. . . . .	161
4. Developing Linkages Between Consumer, Competition and Economic Policy . . . . .	163
5. A Revolutionary Policy Linking Enforcement and Redress Policies . . . . .	164
6. An Unfinished Story: Scope for a Unified Approach? . . . . .	167

**TAKING THE COLLECTIVE INTEREST OF CONSUMERS SERIOUSLY:  
A VIEW FROM POLAND**

Marek SAFJAN, Łukasz GORYWODA and Agnieszka JAŃCZUK .....	171
1. Introduction .....	171
2. Collective Interest of Consumers and Its Functions. ....	175
2.1. Collective Interest of Consumers as a Procedural Instrument .....	176
2.2. Possible Approaches to Building a Definition of the Collective Interest of Consumers .....	179
2.3. An Attempt to Build a Definition. ....	179
A. Compensation and Deterrence Perspective. ....	179
B. The Role of Individual Interest. ....	181
C. Towards a Positive Definition .....	186
D. A Proposal for the Definition. ....	187
3. Public Interest and Consumer Protection in Poland .....	188
3.1. The Period of Socialism .....	188
3.2. After the Transformation .....	193
3.3. The Current State of Play. ....	196
4. Conclusions .....	199
References. ....	200
Abbreviations .....	206

**EFFICIENCY OF THE PROTECTION OF COLLECTIVE INTERESTS:  
JUDICIAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE ENFORCEMENT IN THE CZECH  
REPUBLIC**

Luboš TICHÝ and Jan BALARIN .....	207
1. Introduction .....	207
1.1. Topic and Purpose .....	207
1.2. Methodology. Definitions and Notions. ....	208
2. Procedural Protection of Collective Interests .....	210
2.1. Developments of Collective Litigation .....	210
A. Beginning .....	210
B. Civil Procedural Law. ....	211
2.2. Administrative Protection. ....	211
2.3. Adhesion Procedure Within Administrative and Criminal Procedure .....	212
2.4. Differences Within the Procedural Modes of Protection. ....	212
2.5. Institutional Background .....	213
A. Consumer Organisations .....	213
B. Public Bodies. ....	214

2.6. Efficiency of Protection . . . . .	215
2.7. Protection <i>Ex Post, Ex Ante</i> . . . . .	216
3. Analysis of the Regulation of Judicial Enforcement . . . . .	216
3.1. Community Action . . . . .	216
3.2. Class Action. . . . .	217
3.3. Negative Consequences of Class Action . . . . .	218
4. Practical Experience. . . . .	219
4.1. Actions of Consumer Organisations . . . . .	219
4.2. Motions to Administrative Bodies. . . . .	220
4.3. Conclusion . . . . .	221
5. Overcoming the Individual Protection Pattern, Critique of Positive Law and the Collective Action <i>De Lege Lata</i> . . . . .	221
5.1. Importance of the Civil Procedure Code Provisions . . . . .	221
5.2. Collective Actions and Public Interest . . . . .	222
5.3. Abstract Control, Public Interest and Consumer Rights . . . . .	225
5.4. Duties of Public Bodies and Their Relation to the Parties . . . . .	226
5.5. Principle of Party Presentation and Officiality Principle. . . . .	226
5.6. Human Rights Aspects: Is It an Academic or a Political Debate or Both?. . . . .	227
A. Opt-In, Opt-Out . . . . .	227
B. Informing the Aggrieved Consumers. . . . .	227
C. <i>Res Judicata</i> . . . . .	228
D. Participation in Proceedings . . . . .	228
5.7. Solution <i>De Lege Lata</i> . . . . .	228
6. Administrative Enforcement . . . . .	229
6.1. Status of Consumer Organisations at the Regulatory Authorities . . . . .	229
6.2. Indirect and Direct Enforcement, Abstract and Concrete Control . . . . .	230
6.3. Regulatory Authorities and Further Perspectives . . . . .	230
7. Unlimited Protection of Collective Interests – A Model for Europe? Conclusion. . . . .	231
7.1. State of Judicial Enforcement . . . . .	231
7.2. Neglect of Public Interest and Importance of Private Initiative . . . . .	232
7.3. Collective Action Solution <i>De Lege Lata</i> . . . . .	232
7.4. Administrative Protection – A Guarantee? . . . . .	232
7.5. Post-Communist Revival of Public Interest . . . . .	233

**PUBLIC AND PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT IN CONSUMER PROTECTION – A DUTCH PERSPECTIVE**

Ewoud HONDIUS .....	235
Summary .....	235
1. Introduction .....	235
2. Consumer Complaints and Access to Justice .....	237
3. Complaints Boards .....	239
4. Small Claims Procedures .....	242
5. Collective Action .....	245
6. Mass Damage Transactions .....	247
6.1. The DES Case .....	247
6.2. The Dexia Case .....	251
6.3. Shell Hydrocarbon Reserves .....	252
6.4. Doctrinal Comments .....	252
7. Public Enforcement .....	254
8. Conclusions .....	255
Selected Bibliography .....	255

***PART III. COMPARING REMEDIES IN PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT***

**COMPENSATION AND DETERRENCE IN CONSUMER CLASS ACTIONS IN THE UNITED STATES AND EUROPE**

Geoffrey P. MILLER .....	263
1. The Goals of Compensation and Deterrence in Consumer Law .....	264
2. Compensation and Deterrence Under US Law .....	267
2.1. Substantive Remedies .....	267
A. Federal Law .....	267
B. State Law .....	268
2.2. Small Claims Cases .....	270
2.3. Limitations on the Class Action Remedy .....	274
3. Compensation and Deterrence in European Class Action Law .....	279
Conclusion .....	281

**THE REFORM OF DIRECTIVE 98/27/EC**

Cristina PONCIBÒ .....	283
1. Setting the Scene .....	283
1.1. The Collective Interests of the Consumers .....	286

1.2. The “Collective Damage”	288
1.3. The Limits of the Injunctions Directive	289
1.4. A Lack of Courage: The Issue of Standing	290
2. The Reform of the Injunctions Directive: Enlarging Associational Standing?	292
2.1. Developments in EC Competition Law	293
2.2. National Experimentation: Article 140- <i>bis</i> of the Consumer Code	294
2.3. Consumer Associations and Lawyers	296
3. An Impact Assessment of the Reform	299
3.1. Empowering the Consumer-Citizen	299
3.2. The Evolution of the Consumer Movement	301
4. Conclusions	302

## GROUP ACTIONS AS A REMEDY TO ENFORCE CONSUMER INTERESTS

Astrid STADLER	305
1. Introduction	305
2. Mass Litigation and Small Damage Cases	307
3. Collective Redress for Damages: How to Cope with Mass Litigation	308
3.1. Mass Claim Situations in Europe	308
3.2. US-Style Class Actions as a Role Model for Europe?	310
3.3. Test Case Proceedings	312
4. Group Actions	315
4.1. Justification of Group Actions	315
A. Procedural Economy and Justice	315
B. Access to Court and Market Regulatory Function of Group Actions	316
4.2. Constitutional Rights of Group Members: Opt-In or Opt-Out?	317
4.3. Selection of the Appropriate Group Plaintiff	318
A. Group Plaintiff Assigned by the Group Members	319
B. “First Come, First Serve” Principle or Appointment of the Group Plaintiff by the Court	320
4.4. Objective and Basic Procedural Structure of Group Actions	322
4.5. Case Management and Participation of Group Members	323
5. Group Actions and Small Damage Cases	325
6. Conclusion	327

**COLLECTIVE CONSUMER REDRESS REFORM – WILL IT BE A PAPER TIGER?**

Geraint HOWELLS ..... 329

1. Introduction ..... 329

2. Class Action, Group Actions and Representative Procedures. .... 330

3. Current Law. .... 331

4. Reform ..... 334

5. Key Features of the New Regime ..... 337

    5.1. Scope ..... 337

    5.2. Opt-In or Opt-Out ..... 338

    5.3. Who Can Bring an Action? ..... 339

    5.4. Incentives ..... 341

6. Conclusion. .... 343

**NEGOTIATION AND ADJUDICATION. CLASS ACTIONS AND ARBITRATION CLAUSES IN CONSUMER CONTRACTS**

Norbert REICH ..... 345

1. A New Interest in the Class-Action Device in Member Countries and the EU. .... 345

2. US Experiences ..... 347

3. Canadian Experiences ..... 350

4. Applicable EU and Member State Law ..... 351

    4.1. Claro Revisited: Ordre Public also Against an “Arbitration Defence Clause”? ..... 351

    4.2. The Importance of Brussels Regulation 44/2001 for Consumer Arbitration. .... 354

    4.3. Collective Actions Based in Tort ..... 355

5. Conclusion. .... 357

***PART IV. TRANSBORDER LITIGATION AND INTERNATIONAL PRIVATE LAW***

**TRANSBORDER LITIGATION AND PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW: THE VIEW FROM CANADA**

Geneviève SAUMIER. .... 361

1. Introduction to the Private International Law Challenges to the Transborder Consumer Class Action ..... 362

2. Jurisdictional Issues for Transborder Consumer Class Actions. .... 364



3. Multiple Competent Courts, <i>Forum Non Conveniens</i> and Consolidation: the Canadian Experience.....	370
4. Choice of Law, Diverse Legal Traditions and Transborder Class Actions. .	374
5. Conclusion.....	376

## CROSS-BORDER COLLECTIVE DAMAGE ACTIONS IN THE EU

Peter ROTT .....	379
1. Introduction .....	379
2. Jurisdiction .....	381
2.1. Scope of Application of the Regulation.....	381
2.2. Available Courts .....	383
A. The Member State Where the Defendant is Domiciled .....	383
B. The Special Jurisdiction for Consumer Contracts .....	383
C. Special Jurisdictions in Contract and Tort Law Cases.....	384
D. An Additional Jurisdiction by Way of Joining?.....	384
3. Procedural and Substantive Limitations of the Various Collective Actions .....	385
3.1. Legal Standing.....	386
A. Collective Actions Brought by Representatives.....	386
B. Collective Actions Brought by Consumers Themselves.....	387
3.2. Substantive Legitimacy to Bring the Claim ( <i>Aktivlegitimation</i> ).....	387
3.3. A Limited “Collective Interest of Consumers” and Other Disincentives .....	388
3.4. Limitations as to the Type of Claims that are Eligible for Collective Actions .....	389
3.5. Discretion as to the Joining or Admittance of Individual Claims ...	390
4. Private International Law .....	390
4.1. Contract Law Cases .....	390
A. Consumer Contracts .....	391
B. Other Contracts .....	392
C. Representative Actions .....	392
4.2. Tort Law Cases .....	392
4.3. Conclusion .....	393
5. Summing Up – The Situation in the EC.....	393
6. Looking Beyond the EC Borders .....	394
6.1. Service of the Claim .....	395
6.2. Recognition and Enforcement of Class Action Judgments .....	396
A. Punitive Damages and Treble Damages.....	396
B. Legislative Activities .....	397
7. Outlook .....	397

**PART V. CONCLUSION****ADMINISTRATIVE AND JUDICIAL ENFORCEMENT IN CONSUMER PROTECTION: THE WAY FORWARD**

Fabrizio CAFAGGI and Hans-W. MICKLITZ . . . . .	401
1. The Relationship Between Administrative and Judicial Enforcement in Consumer Protection: The Way Ahead. . . . .	401
2. Administrative and/or Judicial Co-Operation in Europe . . . . .	408
2.1. Actions for Injunction . . . . .	408
A. Shift from Judicial Collective Enforcement to Administrative Co-Operation? . . . . .	408
B. The European Minimum Standard – Action of Injunctions. . . . .	409
2.2. European Group Actions and American Class Actions. . . . .	411
2.3. Three Models of Group Actions in 27 Member States . . . . .	414
A. The Search for the Perfect European Model . . . . .	414
B. The Key Role of Consumer Associations . . . . .	416
C. Collective Consumer Actions in New Democracies. . . . .	419
2.4. Regulating Entry and Exit. Comparing <i>Ex Ante</i> and <i>Ex Post</i> Intervention . . . . .	420
A. Consumer Organisations . . . . .	422
B. Self or <i>Ad Hoc</i> Organisations. . . . .	424
C. Administrative Agencies. . . . .	425
D. Lead Plaintiffs and Lawyers in Tandem . . . . .	426
3. Reframing the European Debate in the Light of the US and Canadian Experiences . . . . .	427
3.1. The Constitutional Balance Between Collective and Individual Redress in Light of the Debate Between Public and Private Enforcement. . . . .	427
3.2. Administrative and Judicial Enforcement . . . . .	430
3.3. Injunctions and Pecuniary Remedies . . . . .	431
3.4. The ‘Indirect’ Effects of National Legislation Concerning Group Actions on Substantive Consumer Law. . . . .	434
3.5. The Players . . . . .	434
3.6. The Role for European Governance to Foster Effective Aggregate Litigation in Consumer Law . . . . .	438
4. Concluding Remarks . . . . .	442
 INDEX . . . . .	 447