

CHILDREN AND THEIR PARENTS

EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW SERIES

Published by the Organising Committee of the

Commission on European Family Law

Prof. Katharina Boele-Woelki (Utrecht)

Prof. Frédérique Ferrand (Lyon)

Prof. Cristina González Beilfuss (Barcelona)

Prof. Maarit Jänterä-Jareborg (Uppsala)

Prof. Nigel Lowe (Cardiff)

Prof. Dieter Martiny (Frankfurt/Oder)

Prof. Walter Pintens (Leuven)

CHILDREN AND THEIR PARENTS

A comparative study of the legal position of children
with regard to their intentional and biological parents
in English and Dutch law

MACHTELD VONK



intersentia

Antwerpen – Oxford

Distribution for the UK:

Hart Publishing Ltd.
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel: + 44 1865 51 75 30
Fax: + 44 1865 51 07 10

*Distribution for Switzerland and
Germany:*

Stämpfli Verlag AG
Wölflistrasse 1
CH-3001 Bern
Switzerland
Tel: + 41 (0)31 300 63 18
Fax: + 41 (0)31 300 66 88

Distribution for North America:

Gaunt Inc.
Gaunt Building
3011 Gulf Drive
Holmes Beach
Florida 34217-2199
USA
Tel: + 1 941 778 5211
Fax: + 1 941 778 5252

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishers
Groenstraat 31
BE-2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel: + 32 3 680 15 50
Fax: + 32 3 658 71 21

This volume is based on the dissertation defended by the author at Utrecht University on 19 December 2007.

Typesetting: G.J. Wiarda Institute for Legal Research, Boothstraat 6, 3512 BW Utrecht.

Machteld Vonk

Children and their parents. A comparative study of the legal position of children with regard to their intentional and biological parents in English and Dutch law

ISBN 978-90-5095-732-8
D/2007/7849/101
NUR 822

© 2007 Intersentia
www.intersentia.com

Behoudens uitzondering door de wet gesteld, mag zonder schriftelijke toestemming van de rechthebbende(n) op het auteursrecht c.q. de uitgevers van deze uitgave, door de rechthebbende(n) gemachtigd namens hem (hen) op te treden, niets uit deze uitgave worden veelevoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of anderszins, hetgeen ook van toepassing is op de gehele of gedeeltelijke bewerking. De uitgevers zijn met uitsluiting van ieder ander onherroepelijk door de auteur gemachtigd de door derden verschuldigde vergoedingen van kopiëren, als bedoeld in artikel 17 lid 2 der Auteurswet 1912 en in het KB van 20-6-'64 (Stb. 351) ex artikel 16b der Auteurswet 1912, te doen innen door (en overeenkomstig de reglementen van) de Stichting Reprorecht te Amsterdam.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photo copy, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publishers.



For Julia, Sebastiaan and David

You make life an adventure, every day!

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

When I started studying law in September 1998, I was working as a court interpreter and legal translator. It seemed a good idea to expand my legal knowledge for the benefit of my translating work. Little did I suspect that precisely 9 years later I would be sitting here writing the acknowledgements for my PhD thesis. My translating and interpreting work did indeed benefit from my 'expanding' legal knowledge, as did my studies from my work in practice. However, the longer I studied, the more I realised that I wanted to be more than a linguistic intermediary between people in a legal setting. I wanted to be more involved with the law itself. So when I saw an advertisement for a PhD position in comparative family law at the University of Utrecht towards the end of my studies in 2002, I did not hesitate and applied.

The subject of the research 'children and their parents' has proven to be every bit as interesting as I thought it would be. But besides the content of the work, the working environment is probably the most important reason why I have enjoyed the past five years. The Molengraaff Institute is a very inspiring working environment, and the Private International and Comparative Law group in particular. I want to thank my direct colleagues (Bente, Christina, Ellen, Merel, Nora, Richard and Vesna) for the various ways in which they have contributed to the completion of this book. I want to thank Wendy Schrama and Ian Curry-Sumner in particular, for their invaluable suggestions and comments and inspirational discussions on the topic of my research. Furthermore, I want to thank Ian Curry-Sumner for reading my writing with the eyes of a common lawyer.

I could not have asked for a better supervisor than Katharina Boele-Woelki. Katharina, you have given me the freedom and confidence to form my own ideas about how to approach the research topic. You know how to inspire people and how to make them work, simply by setting such an excellent example. I admire you for your formidable scientific insight, your sense of fairness and your straightforwardness. Thank you!

A number of legal scholars have read and commented on the manuscript of this book. I want to thank them for their comments and suggestions: Professor

Antokolskaia, Professor Masson, Professor Sijmons, Professor Wortmann and Dr Schrama. I want to thank Peter Morris for editing my English and Titia Kloos, Frans van Eck and Willemien Vreekamp of the Wiarda Institute for making the manuscript camera-ready.

I want to thank my dear friends and family for their friendship and support, without them I would not be where I am now. My parents I want to thank for many things, but in the context of this book in particular for their help and support with all kinds of things, not in the least for being such marvellous grandparents!!! I want to thank my father for all his last-minute reading and the many, many hours he spent on perfecting the tables and figures in the book.

Furthermore, I want to thank my 'seconds', who will assist me during my PhD defence, Ian and Karen, for their friendship and support. As the English say, a friend in need is a friend indeed. You both know what I mean.

Last, but of course far from least, there is my family. Arie, what can I say? Life with two jobs and three children may be somewhat hectic from time to time, but I would not want it any other way! With you I can be me, what more could anyone want? I dedicate this book to my children. Julia, Sebastiaan and David: you make life an adventure, every day!

This research has been made possible by a grant from the Netherlands Organisation of Scientific Research (NWO).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	vii
List of abbreviations	xix

PART I: IT'S ALL IN THE FAMILY

Chapter 1.	
Introduction	3
1.1. Setting the scene	3
1.2. The three (legal) dimensions of the child's family circle	7
1.3. Research question	9
1.4. Methodology	12
1.4.1. Comparative method	12
1.4.2. Structure of the book	13
1.4.3. Terminology	16
1.5. Choice of jurisdictions	17
1.6. Recent developments	19
Chapter 2.	
The family tree	21
2.1 Introduction	21
2.2. The family tree	23
2.2.1. The branches of the tree	23
2.2.2. Family pictures	26
2.3. Genetic families	27
2.4. Partially genetic primary families	28
2.5. Partially genetic secondary families	32
2.6. Non-genetic families	34
2.7. Working with the family tree	35

PART II: TYPICAL FAMILIES

Chapter 3.

Traditional genetic families	39
3.1. Introduction	39
3.2. England: Legal parenthood	41
3.2.1. Marriage	44
Maternity	44
Establishment of paternity	44
Rebuttal of paternity	44
Post-mortal procreation	45
3.2.2. Non-formalised relationship	46
Maternity	46
Voluntary establishment of paternity with(out) maternal cooperation	46
Involuntary establishment of paternity	48
Paternity and assisted conception	49
Rebuttal of paternity	51
Post-mortal procreation	51
3.2.3. Internal comparison	52
Maternity	52
Establishment of paternity	52
Denial/rebuttal of paternity	52
Paternity and assisted conception	52
Post-mortal procreation	53
3.3. The Netherlands: Legal parenthood	53
3.3.1. Marriage	54
Maternity	54
Establishment of paternity	55
Denial of paternity	55
Post-mortal procreation	55
3.3.2. Non-marital registered relationship	56
Maternity	56
Voluntary establishment of paternity with(out) maternal cooperation	56
Involuntary establishment of paternity	57
Paternity and assisted conception	58
Denial of paternity	58
Post-mortal procreation	58

3.3.3. Non-formalised relationship	58
Maternity	58
Voluntary establishment of paternity with(out) maternal cooperation	59
Involuntary establishment of paternity	60
Paternity and assisted conception	61
Denial of paternity	61
Post-mortal procreation	61
3.3.4. Internal comparison	62
Maternity	62
Establishment of paternity	62
Denial of paternity	62
Paternity and assisted conception	63
Post-mortal procreation	63
3.4. External Comparison: Legal parenthood	64
Maternity	64
Establishment of paternity	64
Denial/rebuttal of paternity	65
Paternity and assisted conception	65
Post-mortal procreation	66
An English case under Dutch law and vice versa	66
Some concluding remarks	68
3.5. England: Parental responsibility	70
3.5.1. Marriage	72
Attribution	72
Termination and relationship breakdown	72
3.5.2. Non-formalised relationship	73
Attribution to mother	73
Attribution to father with maternal cooperation	73
Attribution to father without maternal cooperation	74
Attribution to father who is not a legal parent	75
Termination and relationship breakdown	75
3.5.3. Internal comparison	76
Attribution to mother	76
Attribution to father	76
Termination and relationship breakdown	76
Concluding remarks	76

3.6.	The Netherlands: Parental responsibility	77
3.6.1.	Marriage	77
	Attribution	77
	Termination and relationship breakdown	78
3.6.2.	Non-marital registered relationship	78
	Attribution	78
	Termination and relationship breakdown	78
3.6.3.	Non-formalised relationship	80
	Attribution to mother	80
	Attribution to father with maternal cooperation	80
	Attribution to father without maternal cooperation	81
	Attribution to father who is not a legal parent	82
	Termination and relationship breakdown	82
3.6.4.	Internal comparison	83
	Attribution to mother	83
	Attribution to father	83
	Termination	83
	Some concluding remarks	84
3.7.	External Comparison: Parental responsibility	84
	Attribution to mother	84
	Attribution to father with maternal cooperation	85
	Attribution to father without maternal cooperation	86
	Attribution to father who is not a legal parent	86
	Termination and relationship breakdown	86
	Some concluding remarks	88
3.8.	Children and their legal position vis-à-vis their parents	89
3.8.1.	Legal parenthood	89
3.8.2.	Parental responsibility	89

PART III: ATYPICAL FAMILIES

Chapter 4.

Partially genetic secondary families 93

4.1.	Introduction	93
4.2.	Tendencies	96
4.3.	Legal parenthood	99
4.3.1.	Re-registration or recognition by the new parent	99

4.3.2. Adoption by the new parent	102
4.3.2.1. Adoption: consent of the parent outside the secondary family	103
A. The other parent has parental responsibility	104
B. The other parent is a biological and/or legal parent but has no parental responsibility	105
C. The child has a biological parent who is not a legal parent	107
D. The child has a social parent with parental responsibility	109
4.3.2.2. Adoption: other requirements	111
Stability in the relationship	112
Living with the child	112
Consent of the child to the adoption	112
Age of the adopter and the adoptee	113
4.3.3. Overall view on the new parent and legal parenthood	113
4.4. Parental responsibility	115
4.4.1. The new parent has become a legal parent	115
4.4.1.1. Through recognition of re-registration	115
4.4.1.2. Through adoption	117
4.4.2. The new parent has not become a legal parent	118
4.4.3. Some problems highlighted	124
4.4.4. Overall view on parental responsibility	127
Chapter 5.	
Surrogate genetic families	131
5.1. Introduction	131
5.2. England	132
5.2.1. Commissioning parents are married: the parental order	134
5.2.2. Commissioning parents <i>not</i> eligible for a parental order: adoption	135
5.2.3. Internal comparison	137
5.3. The Netherlands	137
5.3.1. Divestment of parental responsibility followed by joint adoption	141
5.3.2. Recognition followed by divestment of parental responsibility and partner adoption	142
5.3.3. Recognition followed by the transfer of parental responsibility and partner adoption	143

5.3.4. Internal comparison	144
5.4. External comparison	145
Chapter 6.	
Partially genetic primary families	147
6.1. Introduction	147
6.2. Gamete donation and legal parenthood	150
6.2.1. Birth mother	152
6.2.2. The father is married to the birth mother	152
6.2.2.1. Establishment of paternity	152
Sperm donation	152
Egg donation	157
6.2.2.2. Post-mortal procreation	157
6.2.3. The father is in a registered partnership with the birth mother	158
6.2.3.1. Voluntary establishment of paternity with(out) maternal consent	158
6.2.3.2. Involuntary establishment of paternity	158
6.2.3.3. Paternity and post-mortal procreation	159
6.2.4. The father is not in a formalised relationship with the birth mother	159
6.2.4.1. Establishment of paternity	159
Sperm donation	159
Egg donation	162
6.2.4.2. Post-mortal procreation	163
6.2.5. Co-mother in a female same-sex relationship	163
6.2.5.1. Adoption by the co-mother	167
Stability in the relationship	167
Living with the child	168
Parental consent and the position of the biological father	169
6.2.5.2. Establishing a co-mothers legal parenthood without her cooperation	174
6.2.5.3. Post-mortal procreation	174
6.2.6. Comparison legal parenthood	174
6.2.6.1. Legal parenthood of the birth mother's partner	174
By operation of law	174
Voluntary establishment (with maternal consent)	175
Establishment without maternal consent	176
Involuntary establishment	176

Post-mortal procreation	177
Denial by the child of the legal parenthood of the co-mother or non-biological father	177
6.2.6.2. Status of the sperm donor	178
6.2.6.3. Concluding remarks	180
6.3. Gamete donation and parental responsibility	182
6.3.1. Birth mother	182
6.3.2. Father	182
6.3.2.1. Marriage	182
6.3.2.2. Non-marital registered relationship (the Netherlands only)	182
6.3.2.3. Non-formalised relationship	183
6.3.2.4. Termination of parental responsibility	184
6.3.3. Co-mother	185
6.3.3.1. Marriage	185
6.3.3.2. Non-martial registered relationship	185
6.3.3.3. Non-formalised relationship	187
6.3.3.4. Termination of parental responsibility	190
6.3.4. Parental responsibility and the biological father/donor	191
6.3.5. Comparison: Parental responsibility	191
6.3.5.1. Unmarried fathers and co-mothers	191
6.3.5.2. Without maternal cooperation	192
6.3.5.3. The biological father	192
6.3.5.4. Termination of parental responsibility	192
6.3.5.5. Some concluding remarks	193
6.4. Gamete donation: English and Dutch cases compared	194
6.4.1. Parenthood in lesbian families	195
6.4.2. Extramarital sex and the rights of the biological father	197
6.4.3. Some concluding remarks	198
6.5. Surrogacy in combination with egg or sperm donation	199
6.5.1. Scenarios 1 and 2: Partially genetic commissioning different-sex couples	200
6.5.2. Scenario 3: Partially genetic commissioning female same-sex couples	202
6.5.3. Scenario 4: Partially genetic commissioning male same-sex couples	202
6.6. The birth mother reigns (almost) supreme	204

PART IV: ALL OTHER THINGS BEING EQUAL

Chapter 7.	
Family analysis	209
7.1. Introduction	209
7.1.1. Key concepts of the analysis	209
7.1.2. The structure of the chapter	210
7.2. Legal parenthood in traditional genetic and partially genetic primary families	211
7.2.1. The birth mother	212
7.2.2. Legal parenthood for the birth mother's partner by operation of law	213
7.2.2.1. Legal consequences of the use of third party genetic material	215
7.2.2.2. Children in Dutch different-sex registered partnerships	218
7.2.3. Voluntary establishment of the legal parenthood of the birth mother's partner with maternal cooperation	219
7.2.4. Voluntary establishment of the legal parenthood of the birth mother's partner without maternal cooperation	220
7.2.5. Involuntary establishment of the legal parenthood of the birth mother's partner	222
7.2.6. Challenging non-biological parenthood	223
7.2.7. Comparison	225
7.3. Parental responsibility	228
7.3.1. Traditional genetic and partially genetic primary families	228
7.3.1.1. Birth mother	229
7.3.1.2. Attribution to the birth mother's partner by operation of law	229
7.3.1.3. Parental responsibility for the partner with parental cooperation	231
7.3.1.4. Parental responsibility for the partner without parental cooperation	233
7.3.2. Secondary families	235
7.3.2.1. Parental responsibility for the new partner by operation of law	236
7.3.2.2. Parental responsibility for the new partner with parental cooperation	237
7.3.2.3. Parental responsibility for the new partner without the cooperation of the parent	239

7.3.3. Comparison	240
7.4. Adoption and transfer of full parental status	243
7.4.1. Adoption	243
7.4.1.1. Joint adoption	245
7.4.1.2. Partner adoption	246
7.4.2. The transfer of full parental status after a surrogacy arrangement	247
7.4.3. Concluding remarks	248
7.5. The legal position of children in male same-sex relationships under English and Dutch law	249
7.6. Family analysis visualised	251
7.6.1. On fundamentals and connecting factors	252
Biology and intention	252
Marriage	253
Non-marital registered relationships	254
Non-formalised relationships	254
7.6.2. A diagram of fundamentals and connecting factors	255
7.6.2.1. Legal parenthood	257
7.6.2.2. Parental responsibility	258
7.6.3. Towards the future	258
Chapter 8.	
Towards a new concept of parenthood: <i>Procreational responsibility</i>	259
8.1. Introduction	259
8.2. The legal position of children in a family with one biological parent and one non-biological parent	260
8.2.1. The child's options to acquire two legal parents	260
Children in different-sex and female same-sex families	260
Children in male same-sex families	262
8.2.2. Protection of the child's position in his or her family	262
Children in different-sex and female same-sex families	262
Children in male same-sex families	265
8.2.3. Possible explanation for the differences and similarities between the jurisdictions	265
8.3. <i>Procreational responsibility</i>	267
8.3.1. The legal dimensions revisited	267
8.3.2. Explanation of the new concept <i>procreational responsibility</i>	270

8.4.	Application of the concept of <i>procreational responsibility</i>	271
8.4.1.	Children born into relationships with one biological parent and one non-biological parent	271
8.4.1.1.	Legal parenthood for intentional parents without evaluating the donor's intentions	273
8.4.1.2.	Legal parenthood for the intentional parent with regard to the intentions of the donor	273
8.4.2.	Children in surrogate families	276
8.5.	How to proceed?	277
8.6.	A brief glance at the future	279

Appendices

Bibliography	285
Table of Cases	299
Curriculum Vitae	303

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AA 1976	Adoption Act 1976
AC	Appeal Cases (England)
ACA 2002	Adoption and Children Act 2002
Adoption Convention	The Hague Convention of 29 May 1993 on Protection of Children and Co-operation in Respect of Intercountry Adoption
All ER	All England Law Reports
art./arts	article/articles
BDRA 1953	Births and Deaths Registration Act 1953
CA 1989	Children Act 1989
CCP	Code of Criminal Procedure (The Netherlands)
CEFL	Commission of European Family Law
Children's convention	UN Convention on the rights of the child
CPA 2004	Civil Partnership Act 2004
CSA 1991	Children Support Act 1991
CSPSSA 2000	Child Support Pensions and Social Security Act 2000
DCC	Dutch Civil Code
DIY	Do it yourself
ECHR	European Convention of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ed/eds	editor/editors
e.g.	for example
et al.	and others
EWCA Civ	Court of Appeal Civil Division (England)
FLA 1986	Family Law Act 1986
FLR	Family Law Reports (England and Wales)
FLRA 1969	Family Law Reform Act 1969
FLRA 1987	Family Law Reform Act 1987
HFEA	Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority
HFEA 1990	Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990
HR	Hoge Raad (Dutch Supreme Court)
ICSI	Intracytoplasmic sperm injection
i.e.	that is; in other words

IVF	In vitro fertilisation
LJN	Landelijk jurisprudentienummer
NJ	Nederlandse Jurisprudentie
no	number
para.	paragraph
QBD	Queen's Bench Division (England)
s.	section
SAA 1985	Surrogacy Arrangements Act 1985
Tissue Bill	The Human Tissue and Embryos (Draft) Bill issued published on 17 May 2007
UKHL	United Kingdom House of Lords
v.	versus