

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**Acknowledgements** ..... v

**Abbreviations** ..... xi

**PART I: SETTING THE SCENE**

**Chapter 1: Introduction** ..... 3

1. Introduction ..... 3

2. Research Questions and Purposes ..... 8

3. Methodology ..... 9

4. Scope and Structure ..... 11

5. The Legal and Socio-Political Impetus for this Research ..... 14

**Chapter 2: Placing Equality Law in Context** ..... 19

1. Introduction ..... 19

2. Equality and Non-Discrimination in the Context of EU Law ..... 20

2.1. From Early Economic Sex Equality Ideals to Equality as a Rights-Based Value ..... 20

2.2. Fostering the Ethical Cause for Equality ..... 26

2.3. The Article 13 EC ‘Acquis’ and Novelty in EC Gender Equality Law ..... 29

2.3.1. Introductory Remarks ..... 29

2.3.2. The RD, EFD and AETD: an Overview ..... 29

2.3.2.1. The RD and the EFD ..... 29

2.3.2.2. Interim Observations ..... 33

2.3.2.3. The AETD ..... 33

2.3.2.4. Cross-Cutting Issues ..... 35

2.3.3. Interim Conclusions ..... 37

2.4. Closing Remarks ..... 38

3.	Equality and Non-Discrimination: the Case of the Netherlands.....	38
3.1.	The Legal Framework.....	38
3.2.	The Equal Treatment Commission .....	42
4.	Equality and Non-Discrimination: the Case of England .....	44
5.	Closing Remarks .....	47
<b>PART II: CONCEPTS OF DISCRIMINATION</b>		
1.	Presenting the Structure for Research .....	51
2.	The Concept of Direct Discrimination.....	53
<b>Chapter 3: Indirect Discrimination .....</b>		
<b>Chapter 3: Indirect Discrimination .....</b>		
1.	Introduction .....	57
2.	Theoretical Aspects of Indirect Discrimination .....	59
2.1.	Introduction .....	59
2.2.	The Concept of Indirect Discrimination and the Formal <i>v.</i> the Substantive Equality Divide.....	60
2.3.	The Concept of Indirect Discrimination and the Models of Individual and Group Justice .....	62
2.3.1.	Comparative Justice.....	62
2.3.2.	Individual Justice .....	63
2.3.3.	Group Justice .....	64
3.	Indirect Discrimination in EC Law .....	67
3.1.	Introduction .....	67
3.2.	Indirect Discrimination: the Shift from a Case by Case Approach to a Legislative Framework.....	68
3.2.1.	The Emergence of Indirect Discrimination in ECJ Case Law.....	68
3.2.2.	A Legislative Approach to Indirect Discrimination .....	70
3.3.	Proving Indirect Discrimination .....	73
3.3.1.	The Partially Reversed Burden of Proof .....	73
3.3.2.	Indirect Discrimination, Statistical Evidence and Beyond .....	74
3.3.3.	Disparate Impact .....	75
3.3.3.1.	Introduction .....	75
3.3.3.2.	Identifying the Pool for Comparison.....	76
3.3.3.3.	Legal Options for Establishing Disparate Impact.....	77
3.3.3.4.	The Required Degree of Disparate Impact .....	80
3.4.	Justifiability.....	82
3.4.1.	Objective Justification and Justification by way of Reasonable Accommodation .....	82
3.4.2.	Interpreting Justification by way of Reasonable Accommodation (Article 2(2)(b) ii EFD) .....	84
3.4.3.	The Motives behind the Insertion of Article 2(2)(b) ii EFD: ‘Bottom-Up Influence’ .....	85

3.4.4.	Objective Justification and the Case Law by the ECJ .....	87
3.4.4.1.	Introductory Remarks .....	87
3.4.4.2.	Private Employers, Indirect Discrimination and Objective Justification.....	87
3.4.4.3.	Statutory Legislation, Indirect Discrimination and Objective Justification..	90
3.4.4.4.	Objective Justification: Balancing Rival Interests .....	97
3.5.	Conclusions.....	98
4.	Indirect Discrimination in English Non-Discrimination Law: a Top-Down Analysis.....	98
4.1.	Introduction .....	98
4.2.	A Background Note to Indirect Discrimination in English Law .....	100
4.3.	Demarcating the Borderlines between Direct and Indirect Discrimination: James v. Eastleigh Borough Council .....	102
4.4.	Top-Down Analysis.....	104
4.4.1.	Introduction .....	104
4.4.2.	Legislative Definitions of Indirect Discrimination: a Dual Approach .....	105
4.4.2.1.	Definitions of Indirect Discrimination in the RRA and SDA as Amended	105
4.4.2.2.	A Fragmented Framework .....	107
4.4.3.	Indirect Discrimination: Analysing the Case Law .....	109
4.4.3.1.	Introduction .....	109
4.4.3.2.	Legal Constituents of Indirect Discrimination Pre- and Post- Implementation of EC Law.....	110
4.4.3.3.	Requirement and Condition versus Provision/Criterion/Practice .....	110
4.4.3.4.	Disparate Impact Versus a Particular Disadvantage.....	113
4.4.3.5.	Objective Justification.....	118
4.4.4.	Conclusions.....	125
5.	Indirect Discrimination in Dutch Equal Treatment Law: a Top-Down Analysis.....	125
5.1.	Introduction .....	125
5.2.	Legislative Definitions of Indirect Distinction .....	126
5.3.	Indirect Distinction: Analysing the Case Law.....	129
5.3.1.	The Notion of 'Disparate Impact' .....	129
5.3.2.	Establishing Disparate Impact .....	130
5.3.3.	Objective Justification.....	134
5.4.	Conclusions.....	135
6.	Conclusions and Cross-Country Comparison .....	136
<b>Chapter 4: Harassment .....</b>		<b>139</b>
1.	Introduction .....	139
2.	Theoretical Reflections .....	140
2.1.	Harassment as a Matter of Equality and Non-Discrimination .....	140
2.2.	Harassment, Equality and Dignity .....	142
2.3.	Harassment, Equality, Exclusion and Participation.....	144
2.4.	Dignity and Participation: Mutually Exclusive Paradigms? .....	146

3.	Harassment in EC Law.....	147
3.1.	Historical Development of the Concept of Harassment.....	147
3.2.	Harassment in the RD, EFD and AETD.....	149
3.2.1.	Introduction.....	149
3.2.2.	The Concept of Harassment in the RD and the EFD.....	149
3.2.2.1.	Defining Harassment.....	149
3.2.2.2.	Establishing a Case of Ground-Related Harassment.....	150
3.2.2.3.	Establishing Ground-Related Harassment ‘in accordance with the National Laws and Practice of the Member States’.....	151
3.2.3.	Harassment in the AETD.....	153
3.2.3.1.	Defining Sexual Harassment and Sex-Based Harassment.....	153
3.2.3.2.	Establishing Sex-Based and Sexual Harassment ‘in accordance with the National Laws and Practice of the Member States’.....	155
3.3.	Closing Remarks.....	156
4.	Harassment in English Non-Discrimination Law: a Top-Down Analysis.....	156
4.1.	Introduction.....	156
4.2.	What Type of Conduct May Amount to Harassment?.....	157
4.3.	The Statutory Test for Establishing a Case of Ground-Related Harassment: a Top-Down Comparison.....	160
4.3.1.	Introduction.....	160
4.3.2.	Harassment Pre-Implementation of EC Law: a Direct Discrimination Approach.....	160
4.3.2.1.	Introduction.....	160
4.3.2.2.	Conceptualising Harassment as Direct Discrimination: the Statutory Elements.....	162
4.3.2.3.	Conceiving Harassment as Direct Discrimination: the Comparative Exercise.....	164
4.3.2.4.	The House of Lords’ Judgment in Pearce.....	168
4.3.3.	Harassment Post-Implementation of EC Law.....	170
4.3.3.1.	Harassment: a Freestanding Approach.....	170
4.3.3.2.	An Objective or Subjective Test for Establishing Harassment?.....	173
4.3.4.	The Pre- and Post-Implementation Approaches to ‘Harassment’ Compared.....	174
4.4.	Liability for Harassment.....	175
4.4.1.	Forms of Liability.....	175
4.4.2.	Vicarious Liability: the Employer’s Liability for Acts Done by His Employees.....	175
4.4.2.1.	The ‘Outside the Course of Employment’ Defence.....	176
4.4.2.2.	The Reasonable Steps Defence.....	177
4.4.2.3.	The Worker’s Personal Liability for Harassment.....	180
4.4.3.	The Employer’s Direct Liability for Acts Committed by Third Parties.....	181
4.4.4.	Interim Conclusions.....	184
5.	Harassment in Dutch Equal Treatment Law: a Top-Down Analysis.....	184
5.1.	Introduction.....	184

5.2.	The Regulation of Harassment in the Act on Working Conditions .....	186
5.2.1.	The AWC and Harassment.....	186
5.2.2.	Defining Sexual Harassment, Aggression and Violence .....	187
5.2.3.	The Employer’s Obligations under the AWC .....	189
5.3.	Harassment as a Matter of Equal Treatment Law .....	190
5.3.1.	Harassment Pre-Implementation of EC Law .....	190
5.3.1.1.	The Statutory Framework.....	190
5.3.1.2.	The Case Law by the ETC.....	191
5.3.2.	Harassment Post-Implementation of EC Law.....	192
5.3.2.1.	Harassment: a Freestanding Form of Distinction.....	192
5.3.2.2.	Explaining the Statutory Provisions on ‘Harassment’ and ‘Sexual Harassment’ .....	193
5.3.2.3.	Liability for Harassment .....	196
6.	Conclusions and Cross-Country Comparison .....	199
 <b>PART III: PROACTIVE STRATEGIES</b>		
 <b>Chapter 5: Positive Action .....</b>		
1.	Introduction.....	207
2.	Positive Action: Forms and Purposes.....	208
2.1.	Forms of Positive Action.....	208
2.2.	What Purposes Do Positive Action Measures Pursue?.....	213
2.2.1.	Introductory Remarks .....	213
2.2.2.	Positive Action: Rationales and Purposes .....	214
3.	Positive Action and Theoretical Issues of Equality .....	216
3.1.	‘Equality’: a Multiply-Edged Principle .....	216
3.2.	Positive Action and the Theory of Equality .....	218
4.	Positive Action and EC law .....	221
4.1.	Introduction.....	221
4.2.	Mapping the Legislative Framework – a Chronological Overview of Existing Law .....	223
4.3.	Positive Action in the Case Law of the Court .....	227
4.3.1.	From Kalanke to Briheche.....	227
4.3.2.	Conclusions.....	234
5.	Positive Action in English Law .....	235
5.1.	Introduction.....	235
5.2.	Positive Action: ‘Race’ and ‘Sex’ .....	236
5.2.1.	Introduction.....	236
5.2.2.	Positive Action Measures in the Realm of Employment .....	237
5.2.2.1.	Outreach Measures: Status-Conscious Training Measures and Job Encouragement Measures.....	238
5.2.2.2.	Measures Redefining ‘Merit’: the Genuine Occupational Requirement Exception.....	243

5.2.2.3.	Other Statutory Provisions and Alternative Measures.....	244
5.2.3.	Positive Action Measures Seeking to Address Power Structures in Decision-Making Processes.....	245
5.3.	Positive Action: Religion, Belief and Sexual Orientation.....	248
5.4.	Positive Action under the DDA 1995 – Asymmetry Rules.....	249
5.5.	Top-Down and Cross-Ground Comparison.....	249
6.	Positive Action in Dutch Law.....	250
6.1.	Introduction.....	250
6.2.	Legislative Framework.....	251
6.3.	Case Law of the ETC.....	254
6.3.1.	‘Sex’ and ‘Race’: Divergence or Convergence in Positive Action Law?.....	254
6.3.2.	The Legal Parameters of Positive Action.....	254
6.4.	Top-Down and Cross-Ground Comparison.....	259
7.	Conclusions and Cross-Country Comparison.....	259
 <b>PART IV: STRETCHING THE SCOPE OF NON-DISCRIMINATION AND EQUALITY LAW</b>		
1.	Presenting the Structure for Research.....	263
2.	The Role of the European Convention on Human Rights.....	265
2.1.	Introduction.....	265
2.2.	The Relevant Convention Framework.....	266
2.3.	Explaining the ‘First Question’.....	271
2.4.	Explaining the ‘Second Question’.....	277
2.5.	Strasbourg Convention Law and Employment Law.....	279
2.6.	Closing Remarks.....	281
 <b>Chapter 6: Religion and Belief.....</b>		
1.	Introduction.....	283
2.	The Intrinsic Values of ‘Religion’ and ‘Belief’.....	284
3.	Discrimination on Grounds of Religion and Belief in EC Law: an Analysis in light of Dutch and ECHR Law.....	286
3.1.	Introduction.....	286
3.2.	The Meaning of ‘Religion’ and ‘Belief’.....	288
3.3.	Concepts of Discrimination and the Resolution of Religious Disputes.....	291
3.3.1.	Introduction.....	291
3.3.2.	The Concept of Direct Discrimination.....	293
3.3.3.	Indirect Discrimination and Reasonable Accommodation.....	293
3.3.4.	Resolving Religious Conflicts at Work: the Case of the Netherlands.....	295
3.3.4.1.	Disputes over Religious Dress.....	296
3.3.4.2.	Time Off from Work Cases.....	298
3.3.4.3.	The Employee’s Refusal to Perform Certain Duties of the Job.....	299
3.3.5.	Headscarf Cases before the Strasbourg Court.....	301
3.3.6.	Interim Conclusions.....	307

3.4.	Exceptions .....	307
3.4.1.	Introduction .....	307
3.4.2.	Article 4(1) EFD .....	308
3.4.3.	Article 4(2) EFD .....	309
3.4.3.1.	The Meaning of 'Religious Ethos' .....	309
3.4.3.2.	A Genuine, Legitimate and Justified Occupational Requirement .....	311
3.4.3.3.	The 'Sole Ground Construction' and Conflicting Rights .....	313
4.	Discrimination on Grounds of Religion in English Law: a Comparative Analysis .....	316
4.1.	Introduction .....	316
4.2.	The Meaning of 'Religion' and 'Belief' .....	318
4.3.	Aspects of Direct and Indirect Discrimination .....	319
4.4.	Exceptions .....	329
5.	Conclusions .....	330
<b>Chapter 7: Sexual Orientation</b> .....		<b>333</b>
1.	Introduction .....	333
2.	Sexual Orientation as a Ground of Discrimination .....	334
2.1.	The Underlying Logic of 'Sexual Orientation': Cross-Ground Perspectives .....	334
2.2.	Conclusions .....	339
3.	Discrimination, Sexual Orientation and EC Law .....	340
3.1.	The Legal Framework Ex Ante the EFD .....	340
3.2.	Conclusions .....	348
3.3.	The Legal Framework Ex Post the EFD .....	349
3.3.1.	Introduction .....	349
3.3.2.	Concepts of Discrimination: a Tailor-Made Analysis in the Context of Sexual Orientation Law .....	349
3.3.3.	The Notion of 'Sexual Orientation' .....	355
3.3.4.	Exceptions to the Central Norm .....	356
3.3.5.	Conclusions .....	358
4.	Legal Novelties in English Non-Discrimination Law .....	359
4.1.	Introduction .....	359
4.2.	The Scope of 'Sexual Orientation' .....	361
4.3.	Concepts of Discrimination .....	362
4.4.	Exceptions to the Prohibition of Sexual Orientation Discrimination .....	363
4.5.	Conclusions .....	370
5.	Concluding Remarks .....	371
<b>Chapter 8: Disability</b> .....		<b>373</b>
1.	Introduction .....	373

2.	Equality, Non-Discrimination and Disability: Mapping the Theory .....	375
2.1.	Introduction .....	375
2.2.	The Underlying Logic of 'Disability': Cross-Ground Perspectives .....	376
2.3.	The Medical and Social Model of Disability: Antagonistic Approaches to the Locus of Disadvantage .....	381
2.3.1.	Introduction .....	381
2.3.2.	The Medical Model of Disability and its Relationship with the Principle of Equality .....	381
2.3.2.1.	The Medical Model of Disability .....	381
2.3.2.2.	Reconciling the 'Medical Model' with the Discourse on 'Formal Equality' .....	383
2.3.3.	The Social Model of Disability .....	384
2.3.3.1.	General Analysis of the Social Model .....	384
2.3.3.2.	Sub Models of the Social Model of Disability .....	386
2.4.	Interim Conclusions .....	388
3.	Discrimination, Disability and EC Law .....	389
3.1.	Shifting Theoretical Bedrocks .....	389
3.2.	The EFD and Disability: a Tailor-Made Analysis .....	391
3.2.1.	Introduction .....	391
3.2.2.	(A)symmetry? .....	392
3.2.3.	The Definition of Disability .....	393
3.2.4.	The Concept of Reasonable Accommodation .....	394
3.2.5.	Conclusions .....	400
4.	Comparative Law Analysis .....	401
4.1.	Introduction .....	401
4.2.	Domestic Disability Discrimination Law in a Nutshell .....	401
4.2.1.	The DETA 2003 .....	401
4.2.2.	The DDA 1995 as Amended .....	404
4.3.	The Principles of Symmetry and Asymmetry .....	405
4.4.	Defining Disability .....	407
4.4.1.	Preliminary Issues .....	407
4.4.2.	The Definition of Disability in the DDA 1995 as Amended by the DDA 2005 .....	408
4.4.2.1.	The Statutory Test for Defining 'Disability' .....	408
4.4.2.2.	Situations which Are Expressly Covered or for which Special Provision is Made .....	414
4.4.2.3.	Discrimination on Grounds of a Past Disability, a Perceived Disability and 'Associated Discrimination' .....	416
4.4.3.	Conclusions .....	416
4.5.	The Concept of Reasonable Accommodation .....	417
4.5.1.	Introduction .....	417
4.5.2.	Reasonable Accommodation in Dutch Law: Top-Down Comparison .....	417
4.5.3.	Reasonable Accommodation in English Law: Top-Down Comparison .....	422
4.5.4.	Reasonable Accommodation: Cross-Country Comparison .....	428



5.	Conclusions.....	430
<b>Chapter 9: Age.....</b>		
1.	Introduction.....	433
2.	The Intrinsic Values of Age as a Ground of Discrimination .....	434
3.	Age Discrimination in EC Law .....	438
3.1.	Translating the Intrinsic Values of ‘Age’ into Provisions of EC Law.....	438
3.2.	The ECJ’s Judgment In Mangold v. Helm .....	441
4.	The Principle of Equal Treatment in Respect of Age in Dutch Law .....	446
4.1.	Introduction.....	446
4.2.	The AETA.....	448
4.2.1.	General Overview of the AETA .....	448
4.2.2.	The Exceptions of Articles 7 and 8 AETA Examined in the Light of Article 6 EFD.....	452
4.2.2.1.	Article 7 AETA .....	452
4.2.2.2.	Article 8 AETA .....	460
4.2.3.	Interim Conclusions.....	461
4.3.	The AETA and the Case Law by the ETC.....	461
4.3.1.	Seniority Provisions.....	462
4.3.2.	Recruitment and Selection .....	466
4.3.3.	Education and Vocational Training.....	469
4.3.4.	Conditions of Employment and Pension Provision .....	470
5.	Conclusions.....	472
<b>PART V: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS</b>		
<b>Chapter 10: Conclusions .....</b>		
1.	General Concluding Observations .....	477
2.	Conclusions with respect to the Research Questions.....	479
<b>Samenvatting: Thema’s in het gelijkebehandelingsrecht: een veellagige rechtsvergelijkende analyse van het Europese, Engelse en Nederlandse recht ..</b>		
		<b>497</b>
<b>List of Cases .....</b>		
		<b>507</b>
<b>Bibliography .....</b>		
		<b>519</b>
<b>Curriculum Vitae.....</b>		
		<b>551</b>