

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## GENERAL REPORT

JOHAN MEEUSEN, MARTA PERTEGÁS, GERT STRAETMANS, FREDERIK SWENNEN . . . . 1

Chapter 1. Introduction . . . . .	1
Chapter 2. European harmonisation of substantive family law . . . . .	2
Chapter 3. The human rights perspective . . . . .	4
Chapter 4. The harmonisation of private international family law within the free movement law framework . . . . .	7
A. Introduction . . . . .	7
B. Economic free movement . . . . .	8
B.1. Do conflict of law rules constitute obstacles to trade? . . . . .	8
B.2. How does internal market law affect family law? . . . . .	8
C. Non-economic free movement . . . . .	10
C.1. Limitations to the right to reside . . . . .	10
C.2. Limitations to the right to equal treatment . . . . .	11
C.3. How to reconcile the case law with Directive 2004/38 . . . . .	11
Chapter 5. The harmonisation of international family law . . . . .	12
A. Introduction . . . . .	12
B. What is the legal basis in the EC Treaty? . . . . .	13
C. What is the most adequate community instrument for harmonisation? . . . . .	14
D. Harmonisation of choice-of-law rules and/or procedural rules (jurisdiction/ recognition and enforcement) . . . . .	15
E. What choice-of-law rules for family law, taking into account the requirements of EC Law? . . . . .	16
F. What role is there for the public policy exception in European international family law? . . . . .	19
G. How to treat characterisation in European international family law . . . . .	21

## RAPPORT GÉNÉRAL

JOHAN MEEUSEN, MARTA PERTEGÁS, GERT STRAETMANS, FREDERIK SWENNEN . . . . 25

Chapitre I. Introduction . . . . .	25
Chapitre II. Harmonisation européenne du droit matériel de la famille . . . . .	26

Chapitre III. La perspective des droits de l'homme .....	29
Chapitre IV. L'harmonisation du droit international privé de la famille dans le cadre du droit de libre circulation .....	31
A. Introduction .....	31
B. Libre circulation économique .....	33
B.1. Les règles de conflit de lois constituent-elles un obstacle au commerce ? .....	33
B.2. Comment le marché intérieur peut-il affecter le droit de la famille ? .....	33
C. Libre circulation non économique .....	34
C.1. Limites au droit de séjour .....	34
C.2. Limites au droit à l'égalité de traitement .....	35
C.3. Comment concilier la jurisprudence avec la directive 2004/38 ? ...	36
Chapitre V. L'harmonisation du droit international privé de la famille .....	36
A. Introduction .....	36
B. Quelle base juridique dans le traité CE ? .....	37
C. Quel est l'instrument communautaire le plus adéquat pour l'harmonisation ? .....	39
D. Harmonisation des règles de conflit de lois et/ou des règles de procédure (compétence, reconnaissance et exécution) ? .....	40
E. Quelles règles de conflit de lois pour le droit de la famille, compte tenu des exigences du droit communautaire ? .....	41
F. Quel rôle pour l'exception d'ordre public en droit international européen de la famille ? .....	44
G. Comment traiter la qualification en droit international européen de la famille ? .....	46
1. OBJECTIVES AND VALUES OF SUBSTANTIVE FAMILY LAW MASHA ANTOKOLSKAIA .....	49
Chapter 1. Compromise between the conflicting values and contradictory objectives in the background of family law reforms, with a few examples .....	51
A. Example one: a non-compromise reform based on progressive values ...	51
B. Example two: a workable compromise with conservative flavour .....	52
C. Example three: an unworkable compromise .....	53
Chapter 2. Persistent ideological discord in family law .....	54
A. The historical roots of the current discord .....	54
B. Discord on the level of particular states .....	60
Chapter 3. Searching for shared values and objectives of substantive family law .....	62

A.	Searching for pan-European values	62
B.	Searching for shared values and objectives on a domestic level	65
	Chapter 4. Conclusion	67

## 2. OBJECTIVES AND VALUES OF (PRIVATE) INTERNATIONAL LAW IN FAMILY LAW

	DIETER MARTINY	69
	Chapter 1. Introduction	69
A.	Private international law	69
A.1.	Different models of private international law	69
a.	Uniform European conflict rules	69
b.	Different international and national rules	71
A.2.	Substantive conflict of law rules	71
A.3.	Recognition of legal effects (reconnaissance des situations juridiques), principle of origin	72
A.4.	Creation of a European Judicial Area and international family law	72
B.	Family law matters	73
B.1.	Different matters	73
B.2.	Single matters	73
	Chapter 2. International family law and internal substantive law	77
A.	Trends and goals in internal substantive law	77
B.	Traditional goals and values in international family law	78
B.1.	The “statut personnel”	78
a.	Concept of “statut personnel”	78
(1)	Determination and consequences of personal status	78
(2)	Unity of the family	79
b.	Creation of different categories of applicable law	79
c.	Registered partnerships, non-marital cohabitation	79
B.2.	Legal certainty and predictability in international family law	80
B.3.	Avoidance of limping status and uniformity of results	80
	Chapter 3. Demands of the internal market	81
A.	Harmonisation and unification of international family law	81
B.	Special demands of Community law	82
C.	Harmonisation with international civil procedure	83
C.1.	Context with the Area of Justice and Freedom	83
C.2.	Links with issues of jurisdiction	83
C.3.	Recognition v. closest connection	84
	Chapter 4. Societal change and connecting factors	85

Table of contents

A.	Different connecting factors and closest connection	85
B.	Cultural ties with the home country and nationality	86
B.1.	Personal relationships and nationality	86
B.2.	Trends against the nationality principle	87
a.	“Mariage mixte” and equality of sexes	87
b.	Dual nationality	87
C.	Increasing mobility within the Community and the place of habitual residence of the parties	88
D.	Expectations of the parties and principle of party autonomy	90
E.	<i>Lex rei sitae</i>	91
F.	Specific techniques and goals of international family law	92
F.1.	Favour versus fixed connecting factors	92
F.2.	Alternative connections	92
a.	Different connecting factors	92
b.	Formal requirements	93
F.3.	Protection of the weaker party, child protection	93
F.4.	Protection of third parties	93
G.	Application of the <i>lex fori</i>	94
	Chapter 5. General part of private international law and international family law	95
A.	Stability and change of applicable law (‘conflict mobile’)	95
B.	Renvoi within and outside the community	96
C.	Public policy and defence of values	96
	Chapter 6. International cooperation in the Community	97
	Chapter 7. Conclusion	98

	3. EU FAMILY LAW: A HUMAN RIGHTS PERSPECTIVE	
	HELEN STALFORD	101

	Chapter 1. The relationship between human rights and family law	103
	Chapter 2. The role of human rights in developing <i>EU</i> family law	107
A.	The development of family rights in the context of Union citizenship	108
B.	Family rights and the Charter of Fundamental Rights in the European Union	111
C.	Family rights following the Treaty of Amsterdam	113
	Chapter 3. Human rights and the New Brussels II Regulation	114
A.	The right to a fair trial under the Brussels II Regulation	116
B.	The right to family life under the Brussels II Regulation	121

Chapter 4. EU enforcement of human rights under the Brussels II Regulation .....	125
Chapter 5. Conclusion .....	127

#### 4. INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK: ADEQUATE INSTRUMENTS AND THE EXTERNAL DIMENSION

ALEGRÍA BORRÁS .....	129
Introduction .....	129
Chapter 1. The Community action .....	130
A. Legal basis .....	131
B. The choice of instrument .....	133
C. The choice of technique .....	135
Chapter 2. External competence of the European Community with regard to international family law .....	147
Chapter 3. Final considerations .....	147

#### 5. CONSTRAINTS OF INTERNAL MARKET LAW ON FAMILY LAW

MARC FALLON .....	149
Introduction .....	149
Chapter 1. Evolution of constraints of internal market law .....	150
A. Evolution of the scope of internal market law .....	151
A.1. Notion of a Community case .....	151
A.2. Notion of obstacle to movement .....	152
B. Evolution of the content of internal market law .....	157
B.1. Presentation of the rules on obstacles to movement .....	158
B.2. Application of the rules to conflict of laws .....	159
Chapter 2. Incidence of internal market law on family law .....	163
A. Identity of the person .....	164
A.1. Freedom of movement of civil status records .....	165
a. Transliteration of the name .....	165
b. Probative value of a foreign public Act .....	166
A.2. Freedom of movement of a name .....	169
B. Matrimonial relations .....	171
B.1. Recognition of same-sex unions .....	172
B.2. Recognition of a marriage celebrated abroad .....	175
Chapter 3. Conclusion .....	179

6. NON-ECONOMIC FREE MOVEMENT OF EUROPEAN UNION CITIZENS AND FAMILY LAW MATTERS	
GERT STRAETMANS	183
Chapter 1. General introduction	183
Chapter 2. Non-economic movement in the EC in the case law of the Court of Justice	185
A. Discrimination on grounds of nationality – the Court’s expansive view on economic movement: minimising the exercise of an economic activity, stretching the cross-border element and defining obstacles to trade on the basis of deterrence	185
B. European Union citizenship: early cases 1997-2002	190
C. European Union citizenship: toward an autonomous interpretation of citizens’ rights: 2003 to date	199
D. Directive 2004/38 on Union citizens’ right to reside	210
E. Union citizenship in the European Constitution	214
F. Conclusion	216
F.1. Totally outside the context of an economic activity?	216
F.2. Only cross-border situations?	217
F.3. Union citizen’s freedom to move and reside	220
a. Right to first entry and right to reside	220
b. Right to reside and right to equal treatment	223
F.4. Beyond discrimination?	225
F.5. Less progressive than expected?	229
Chapter 3. Non-economic free movement and family law issues: the internal market and its boundaries	234
7. SYSTEM SHOPPING IN EUROPEAN PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW IN FAMILY MATTERS	
JOHAN MEEUSEN	239
Chapter 1. Introduction	239
Chapter 2. From <i>Van Binsbergen</i> , over <i>Centros</i> , to <i>Emsland-Stärke</i> : a single and coherent approach to system shopping and abuse of Community law?	241
A. A variety of cases, but a single approach?	241
B. Two early, but important cases: <i>Van Binsbergen</i> and <i>Knoors</i>	242
C. <i>Centros</i> : confirmation of the earlier solutions or breakthrough of a new ultra-liberal approach?	243
D. <i>Emsland-Stärke</i> : confirmation of a more systematic doctrine of abuse of Community law?	247

Chapter 3. <i>Akrich</i> and <i>Chen</i> : system shopping and the use of family status as a tool for immigration purposes . . . . .	248
A. <i>Akrich</i> – the doctrine of abuse on a new road? . . . . .	249
B. <i>Chen</i> – no more surprises . . . . .	252
Chapter 4. The ECJ’s approach to system shopping and abuse: a fair balance between the private, Community and Member State interests involved? . . . . .	255
A. The search for a single and coherent approach to system shopping and abuse of Community law . . . . .	255
B. The crux of the matter: the achievement of the purposes of Community law . . . . .	256
C. A focus on intra-Community mobility and the search for the most favourable legal system . . . . .	259
Chapter 5. Family law, system shopping and intra-Community mobility – the Brussels IIbis Regulation and beyond . . . . .	260
A. Introduction . . . . .	260
B. Community private international law and the free movement of persons . . . . .	261
C. Jurisdiction and recognition in matrimonial matters . . . . .	263
D. Mutual recognition in family matters . . . . .	265
E. System shopping in family matters . . . . .	266
E.1. Intra-Community mobility in spite of substantive and choice-of-law diversity... to what extent? . . . . .	266
E.2. A better balance through harmonisation of choice-of-law rules and a proper interpretation of public policy . . . . .	269
a. The harmonisation of choice-of-law rules in family matters . . . . .	269
b. A rethinking of the public policy exception in family matters . . . . .	273
Chapter 6. Conclusion and outlook . . . . .	276
8. THE EXCEPTION OF PUBLIC POLICY IN FAMILY LAW WITHIN THE EUROPEAN LEGAL SYSTEM	
SYLVAINÉ POILLOT PERUZZETTO . . . . .	279
Introduction . . . . .	279
Chapter 1. The variety of the cases with involvement of the European legal system . . . . .	285
A. The national public policy mechanism under the control of the European legal system . . . . .	285
A.1. The European control . . . . .	285

Table of contents

A.2.	The strength of the European control .....	289
a.	The European substantial control and the European formal control .....	289
b.	The control of the national distinction between creation and recognition of a situation .....	290
c.	The control of the national distinction between proximity and absence of proximity .....	291
d.	Impact of the existence of European conflict rules on the European control .....	292
B.	The national public policy mechanism used by the European legal system .....	293
B.1.	The European legal system guides the national mechanism of public policy by a kind of “clause d’exception d’ordre public” .....	293
B.2.	The European legal system uses the national mechanism of public policy by providing it with a European content .....	294
Chapter 2.	Variety of the effects .....	297
A.	The evolution of the national mechanism of public policy within the European context .....	297
A.1.	The enhancement of the mechanism of public policy .....	297
A.2.	The enhancement of the function of public policy .....	298
A.3.	The modification of the content of public policy .....	299
B.	The evolution of the European legal system through the discovery of the exception of public policy .....	300
B.1.	A new tool to control the national laws, either of foreign States or of the Member States .....	300
B.2.	A new tool to draft European rules .....	300
B.3.	A new tool to apply the European standards .....	301
Conclusions and proposals	.....	301

9. THE EC TREATY AND THE USE OF NATIONALITY AND HABITUAL RESIDENCE AS CONNECTING FACTORS IN INTERNATIONAL FAMILY LAW	
MICHAEL BOGDAN .....	303
Chapter 1. Introduction .....	303
Chapter 2. The use of nationality as a connecting factor in view of the prohibition in EC Law of discrimination based on nationality: the situation before the Amsterdam Treaty .....	306



Chapter 3. The use of nationality as a connecting factor in view of the prohibition in EC Law of discrimination based on nationality: the situation after the Amsterdam Treaty .....	308
Chapter 4. The use of habitual residence as a connecting factor in view of the freedom of movement pursuant to EC Law .....	315
Chapter 5. Conclusions .....	316

#### 10. BEYOND NATIONALITY AND HABITUAL RESIDENCE: OTHER CONNECTING FACTORS IN EUROPEAN PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW IN FAMILY MATTERS

MARTA PERTEGÁS .....	319
Chapter 1. Introduction .....	319
Chapter 2. The <i>lex fori</i> in European conflict of laws in family matters: a qualified ‘yes’? .....	321
Chapter 3. The place of celebration as connecting factor .....	326
Chapter 4. Selecting the forum and the governing law in cross-border family disputes .....	328
A. Party autonomy in evolving private international law .....	329
A.1. Conflict of jurisdictions .....	329
A.2. Conflict of laws .....	330
B. Party autonomy in forthcoming European instruments in family matters .....	331
B.1. Forum selection under the Brussels IIbis Regulation .....	332
B.2. Forum selection in other family law areas .....	335
B.3. Law selection .....	336
Chapter 5. Conclusion .....	339

#### 11. CHARACTERISATION IN FAMILY MATTERS FOR PURPOSES OF EUROPEAN PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW

Laura Tomasi, Carola Ricci and Stefania Bariatti .....	341
Chapter 1. Family law notions used in EU/EC acts and instruments .....	341
A. Preliminary remarks .....	341
B. Family notions .....	342
B.1. The notion of “marriage” .....	342
B.2. “Descendants” .....	347
B.3. The notion of “minor” .....	348
B.4. “Parental responsibility” and related notions .....	350

Table of contents

B.5.	The definition of the “members of the family”	351
B.6.	The notions of “dependent family member” and “maintenance obligations”	352
B.7.	The notion of “matrimonial causes”	354
C.	Conclusions: autonomous, “host state oriented” and “home state oriented” definitions or different characterisation options	354
Chapter 2.	The interpretation of family law notions by the EC Courts	358
A.	Preliminary remarks	358
B.	The quest for autonomous interpretation	358
B.1.	The notion of “spouse”	359
B.2.	Other autonomous concepts developed by the EC Courts	364
a.	Notions of dependent family members: “children”	364
b.	The nature of family allowances	367
c.	Matrimonial property, maintenance obligation and creditor under the 1968 Brussels Convention	368
B.3.	Subsidiary reference to the conflicts of laws rules of the Member States	369
C.	Reference to the substantive law of the Member States	372
D.	Community law versus national laws: is a flexible solution possible?	374
Chapter 3.	Principles of interpretation and characterisation in EC private international law and family matters	374
A.	Introductory remarks	374
B.	Characterisation and interpretation in EC private international law	375
B.1.	Does “characterisation” have the same meaning in national conflicts of laws and in EC conflicts of laws?	375
B.2.	The problem of interpretation of legal terms used by EC conflicts of laws rules: is it a new problem?	377
B.3.	How to provide a solution to interpretative questions? The principles of interpretation developed by the EC Courts	378
B.4.	When should each method of interpretation apply and when is the search for autonomous interpretation appropriate?	383
B.5.	A test case: the notion of “maintenance obligations”	385
12.	ATYPICAL FAMILIES IN EU (PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL) FAMILY LAW	
FREDERIK SWENNEN		389
Chapter 1.	Introductory remarks	389
Chapter 2.	Horizontal family law	393
A.	(Same-sex) marriage	395

A.1.	PIL: Dissolution .....	395
A.2.	PIL: Maintenance obligations .....	399
A.3.	Staff Regulations .....	400
A.4.	Movement and residence rights .....	401
A.5.	Conclusion .....	405
B.	Registered partnerships .....	407
B.1.	PIL .....	407
B.2.	Staff Regulations .....	410
B.3.	Movement and residence rights .....	411
C.	<i>De facto</i> cohabitation .....	413
C.1.	PIL .....	413
C.2.	Staff Regulations .....	414
C.3.	Movement and residence rights .....	414
Chapter 3.	Vertical family law .....	415
A.	PIL: Parental responsibility .....	415
B.	Staff regulations .....	419
C.	Movement and residence rights .....	420
Chapter 4.	Conclusion .....	422
13. ISLAMIC FAMILY LAW IN THE EUROPEAN UNION		
CRISTINA GONZÁLEZ BEILFUSS .....		425
Chapter 1.	Introduction .....	425
Chapter 2.	Is there a Community competence to legislate? .....	426
Chapter 3.	Is Community action necessary? .....	428
A.	Characterisation .....	428
B.	Diversity creates obstacles to free movement .....	430
B.1.	Diversity in national private international law systems .....	430
a.	Polygamy .....	431
b.	Repudiation .....	432
c.	Child marriage .....	433
B.2.	Divergence hinders the free movement of persons .....	434
C.	Islamic law in Community legislation .....	435
Chapter 4.	How should the Community act? .....	437
Chapter 5.	Concluding remarks .....	438

14. MIGRATIONS AND FAMILY LAW	
JEAN-YVES CARLIER and SYLVIE SAROLÉA	439
Introduction: links between migrations and private international law	439
Chapter 1. Migrations and the European Union	440
A. From free movement of workers to the common policy in asylum and immigration matters	440
B. Erosion of national sovereignty	442
Chapter 2. Migrations and human rights	444
A. Priority of national sovereignty	445
B. Restricted protection of the migrant's family	447
B.1. The family life of the migrant	447
B.2. The double penalty	449
C. Protecting the migrant family	451
Chapter 3. Migrations and family law	452
A. Context	452
A.1. Diversity of migrations	452
A.2. Variety of families	454
a. Who is spouse?	455
b. Who is a child?	456
B. Solutions	457
B.1. Standardisation of substantive law	457
B.2. Substantive law adapted to migrations	457
B.3. Bilateral treaty	457
B.4. Private international law	458
Conclusion	459
Short bibliography	460