## Supranational Criminal Prosecution of Sexual Violence: The ICC and the Practice of the ICTY and the ICTR

Anne-Marie L.M. de Brouwer

INTERSENTIA Antwerpen – Oxford This volume is an adapted version of a dissertation defended at Tilburg University on 2 November 2005.

Anne-Marie L.M. de Brouwer Supranational Criminal Prosecution of Sexual Violence: The ICC and the Practice of the ICTY and the ICTR

ISBN 90-5095-533-9 D/2005/7849/91

© 2005 INTERSENTIA www.intersentia.com

Behoudens uitzondering door de wet gesteld, mag zonder schriftelijke toestemming van de rechthebbende(n) op het auteursrecht c.q. de uitgevers van deze uitgave, door de rechthebbende(n) gemachtigd namens hem (hen) op te treden, niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of anderszins, hetgeen ook van toepassing is op de gehele of gedeeltelijke bewerking. De uitgevers zijn met uitsluiting van ieder ander onherroepelijk door de auteur gemachtigd de door derden verschuldigde vergoedingen van copiëren, als bedoeld in artikel 17 lid 2 der Auteurswet 1912 en in het KB van 20-6-'64 (Stb. 351) ex artikel 16b der Auteurswet 1912, te doen innen door (en overeenkomstig de reglementen van) de Stichting Reprorecht te Amsterdam.

Niets uit deze uitgave mag worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of op welke andere wijze ook, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgevers.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photo copy, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publishers.

Supranational Criminal Prosecution of Sexual Violence: The ICC and the Practice of the ICTY and the ICTR

The drawing on the cover of this book was made by Grace, a Tutsi woman. She was a victim of multiple rapes during the 1994 genocide in Rwanda at the age of 14. Due to the genocide, Grace has lost her parents and all her four brothers and sisters. As a result of the rapes, Grace is now infected with AIDS.

The drawing depicts her story as well as those of millions of other women worldwide who have become victims of sexual violence as genocide, a crime against humanity or a war crime.



#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

The idea to write a book on the prosecution of sexual violence before the International Criminal Court (ICC), with the practice of the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY) and the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR) in mind, originated during my LL.M. studies in international human rights law at the University of Essex (UK) in 1998/1999. A subsequent internship at the ICTY in 1999 further strengthened this idea. During this internship, I became further acquainted with the hard reality that sexual violence is an all too common phenomenon in the context of genocide, crimes against humanity or armed conflict. Women, especially, are the victims of these crimes. A strong disbelief and indignation that such horrendous crimes could ever be failed to be properly addressed on the international level (especially in light of the precedents set by the Nuremberg and Tokyo Tribunals) directed me to study to what extent justice can or should be done to victims of sexual violence by the supranational criminal law system.

When I started this study at the Law Faculty of Tilburg University in 2000, the ICTY and ICTR had already been in operation for a few years. The ICTY and ICTR Statutes and Rules of Procedure and Evidence contain better provisions than their Nuremberg and Tokyo counterparts where the interests of victims of sexual violence are concerned. I was intrigued by the question as to whether the ICTY and ICTR *practice* would appropriately take into account concerns of victims of sexual violence. Furthermore, I wanted to explore how the ICC, supported by even more elaborate provisions for victims of sexual violence than the ICTY and the ICTR, could deal with sexual violence prosecution and to what extent it should follow ICTY and ICTR practice. In this book, I have tried not only to study and explain the relevant law and to provide recommendations for a more comprehensive supranational criminal prosecution of sexual violence, but also to give a voice to victims of sexual violence and their suffering.

Completing this study would not have been possible without a great many people. In the first place, a special word of thanks goes to my supervisors, Willem van Genugten and Marc Groenhuijsen, for their support over the last five years. I would like to thank Willem for always having given me the space to grow as an academic: his support to and trust in me, both as a researcher and a lecturer in international (criminal) law, has been truly heartwarming. Marc has always been a very active proponent of victims' rights and his commitment thereto has been a real inspiration to me. I will always treasure our meetings and discussions. I am also indebted to the members of the reading committee: Kelly Askin, Theo van Boven, Cyrille Fijnaut, André Klip and Theo de Roos, for having read and commented on my manuscript. Their writings have been at the basis of this study.

#### Acknowledgements

I would also like to express my gratitude to the ICTR, for having given me the opportunity to work there as an intern by assigning me to the Office of the Prosecutor, viz., the *Butare* team, in 2003. This experience gave me many more insights into the prosecution of sexual violence before an international criminal tribunal. Moreover, during this period, I also had the opportunity to visit Rwanda several times; visits which have left an indelible impression on me. I would especially like to thank Richard Karegyesa, Senior Trial Attorney at the ICTR, for our inspirational talks and subsequent e-mail discussions on sexual violence prosecution.

This research could not have been possible without NWO (the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research), which provided me with the grant, for which I am truly grateful. I would also like to acknowledge the Schoordijk Institute at the Tilburg University Faculty of Law for their services provided to PhD researchers, and the Netherlands School of Human Rights Research for the many interesting meetings pertaining to human rights issues. As to the finalisation of the manuscript I would like to thank the publisher Intersentia. I would also like to thank Marlene Havens, Michelle Möhl and Charlotte Raaimakers for helping me complete the bibliography. I thank Julie Tims, information specialist at Tilburg University Library, who has been of great help in tracing documents I was unable to find. I would furthermore like to express my sincere gratitude to Grace for her drawing and Jean Gakwandi from Solace Ministries in Rwanda for helping me with finding this drawing for the cover of my book.

Many more people have contributed to this book in one way or another, often only just by inquiring about the progress of my research. Here, I would like to thank Marieke van Eik and Chiseche Mibenge for their support in the final stage of my research. I would also like to thank my colleagues at the Department of European and International Public Law at Tilburg University. Some of them have been instrumental in making life at university even more fun and have become true friends. Margreth de Bonth and Ruben Weigel, who introduced me to the life of 'AIO-hood'. Saskia Lavrijssen-Heijmans, for her enduring optimism and words of encouragement. Susan Mathews, for her endless interest in my research and for proof-reading some of my chapters. Rianne Letschert, for sharing all ups and downs inherent to writing a PhD thesis; I could not have wished for a better and more caring 'office mate'.

Last but certainly not least, I would like to thank a few people who are very dear to me. I am very grateful to my parents Jef and Leonie and my sister Vanessa, of whom I am proud. I thank them for their continuing support and love. I pay special tribute to Freek, who has supported me during this research in uncountable ways. He helped me put my troubles concerning this study into perspective at times when I needed it most. My gratitude for his love, faith, patience and encouragement cannot be expressed in words.

Anne-Marie de Brouwer Tilburg/The Hague, September 2005

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

vii

Acknowledgements				
Та	Table of Contents			
Αl	bbreviations	xiii		
In	TRODUCTION	1		
1	Sexual violence and supranational criminal prosecutions: Historical			
	development	4		
	1.1 From ancient times to World War II	4		
	1.2 The Nuremberg and Tokyo Tribunals	5		
	1.3 The ICTY and the ICTR	9		
	1.3.1 Sexual violence in the former Yugoslavia	9		
	1.3.2 Sexual violence in Rwanda	11		
	1.3.3 Creation of the international criminal tribunals	15		
	1.4 The ICC	19		
	1.4.1 Situations pending before the Court	22		
	1.5 The way ahead	23 23		
2	Central question			
3	Terminology	24		
	3.1 Victims, survivors, witnesses and victim-witnesses	25		
	3.2 Sexual violence and gender crimes	26		
4	Working materials	27		
5	Method and structure	31		
6	Scope and limitations	34		
PA	ART I SEXUAL VIOLENCE IN SUPRANATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW	37		
In	troduction to Part I	39		
Cl	hapter 1 Sexual Violence as Genocide	41		
1	Introduction			
2	The genocidal acts	41 48		
_	2.1 Killing members of the group	48		
	2.2 Causing serious bodily or mental harm to members of the group	51		
	2.3 Deliberately inflicting on the group conditions of life calculated to	51		
	bring about its physical destruction in whole or in part	56		
	2.4 Imposing measures intended to prevent births within the group	58		

## Table of Contents

	2.5 Forcibly transferring children of the group to another group	59
3	The elements common to genocide	60
	3.1 The degree of intent	60
	3.1.1 Different modes of liability	61
	3.1.1.1 Superior criminal responsibility	63
	3.1.1.2 Complicity in genocide	65
	3.1.1.3 Joint criminal enterprise (variant three)	67
	3.2 Destruction of the group, as such	72
	3.3 In whole or in part 3.4 Proof of intent	75
4	Final remarks	76 79
4	4.1 The genocidal acts and the prosecution of sexual violence	80
	4.2 The elements common to genocide and the prosecution of sexual	00
	violence	82
	4.3 A proposal for an amended definition of genocide that includes	02
	genocidal rape and gender as a group	83
	8	-
Cl	hapter 2 Sexual Violence as a Crime against Humanity	85
1	Introduction	85
	Enslavement	86
3	Torture	95
4	Specific sexual violence crimes	102
	4.1 Rape	103
	4.1.1 ICTY and ICTR case law on the definition of rape	105
	4.1.1.1 The Akayesu Judgment	105
	4.1.1.2 The Furundžija Judgment	111
	4.1.1.3 The Kunarac, Kovač and Vuković Judgment	116
	4.1.1.4 Intermezzo	127
	4.1.2 The ICC's Elements of Crimes on the definition of rape	129
	4.1.3 Some closing remarks on the definition of rape	135
	4.2 Sexual slavery	137
	<ul><li>4.3 Enforced prostitution</li><li>4.4 Forced pregnancy</li></ul>	141 143
	4.5 Enforced sterilisation	143
	4.6 Any other form of sexual violence of comparable gravity	147
5	Persecution on the ground of gender	152
6		162
7		166
8	Superior responsibility for sexual violence as a crime against humanity	168
9	Final remarks	169
Cl	hapter 3 Sexual Violence as a War Crime	175
1	Introduction	175
2	War crimes in international armed conflict	178
_	2.1 Grave breaches of the 1949 Geneva Conventions	179
	2.1.1 Torture or inhuman treatment, including biological experiments	181

		2.1.1.1 Torture	181			
		2.1.1.1.1 Severe physical or mental pain or suffering	184			
		2.1.1.1.2 Prohibited purposes	187			
		2.1.1.1.3 ICTY case law	189			
		2.1.1.2 Inhuman treatment	193			
		2.1.2 Wilfully causing great suffering, or serious injury to body or				
		health	196			
	2.2	Other serious violations of the laws and customs applicable in				
		international armed conflict	197			
		2.2.1 Committing outrages upon personal dignity, in particular				
		humiliating and degrading treatment	198			
		2.2.2 Committing rape, sexual slavery, enforced prostitution, forced				
		pregnancy, as defined in Article 7(2)(f), enforced sterilisation,				
		or any other form of sexual violence also constituting a grave				
		breach of the 1949 Geneva Conventions	199			
_		Elements common to war crimes in international armed conflict	201			
3		crimes in non-international armed conflict	202			
	3.1		200			
		Conventions	202			
		3.1.1 Violence to life and person, in particular murder of all kinds,	205			
		mutilation, cruel treatment and torture 3.1.1.1 Cruel treatment	205			
			205 206			
		3.1.1.2 Torture	200			
		3.1.2 Committing outrages upon personal dignity, in particular humiliating and degrading treatment	211			
	3.2		211			
	3.2	Other serious violations of the laws and customs applicable in non- international armed conflict				
		3.2.1 Committing rape, sexual slavery, enforced prostitution, forced	215			
		pregnancy, as defined in Article 7(2)(f), enforced sterilisation,				
		and any other form of sexual violence also constituting a				
		serious violation of Article 3 common to the 1949 Geneva				
		Conventions	216			
	3.3	Elements common to war crimes in non-international armed conflict	220			
4	Final remarks					
			220			
Ev	aluat	tion of Part I	225			
D۸	RT II	SEXUAL VIOLENCE IN SUPRANATIONAL CRIMINAL PROCEDURE	227			
ΓA	KII	SEXUAL VIOLENCE IN SUPRANATIONAL CRIMINAL FROCEDURE	441			
In	trodu	ection to Part II	229			
Cł	apte	r 4 Protective and Special Measures for Victims of Sexual Violence	231			
1	Inte	duction	221			
1		oduction	231 231			
2 The rationale for and forms of protective measures						
3 4	Witness protection versus the rights of the accused					
4	Protection from the public or the press 4.1 Non-disclosure of information to a third party					
	4.1	rion-disclosure of information to a tillu party	239			

#### Table of Contents

	4.2 <i>In camera</i> proceedings	242			
	4.3 Testimony presented by electronic or other special means	244			
	4.4 Live video conference link	244			
5	Protection from the accused				
	5.1 The ICTY's experience	249			
	5.2 The ICC: Where to go?	252			
	5.3 Some policy considerations in relation to sexual violence crimes	254			
	5.4 Protection after the trial	256			
6	Protection from retraumatisation				
	6.1 Avoiding face-to-face confrontation with the accused	258			
	6.2 Special evidentiary rules	260			
	6.2.1 Corroboration	261			
	6.2.2 Consent	263			
	6.2.3 Prior or subsequent sexual conduct	268			
	6.3 Prior recorded testimony	269			
	6.4 Other special measures	271			
	6.4.1 Attendance of counsel, legal representative, psychologist or				
	family member	271			
	6.4.2 Manner and length of questioning	272			
	6.5 Guidelines on treatment of victims of sexual violence in court	275			
7	The Victims and Witnesses Unit				
8	Final remarks	278			
Cł	hapter 5 Participation of Victims of Sexual Violence in the Proceedings	283			
1	Introduction	283			
2	Victim participation at the ICTY and the ICTR				
	2.1 Victim impact statements	284 286			
	2.2 Amicus curiae submissions				
	2.3 Directly approaching the Office of the Prosecutor				
3	Victim participation at the ICC				
	3.1 Notification	302			
	3.2 Application for participation	304			
	3.3 Forms of participation	305			
	3.4 The right to be informed	305			
	3.5 Legal representation				
4	Final remarks	308			
Ev	valuation of Part II	311			

PA	RT II			OLENCE AND THE LEGAL CONSEQUENCES OF THE ONAL CRIMINAL LAW SYSTEM	315
Int	rodu	ction t	o Part II	I	317
Ch	apter	6 Se	ntencing	in Cases of Sexual Violence	319
1	Intro	duction	1		319
2	Sente	encing			319
	2.1	The IC	CTY and	the ICTR	320
		The IC			325
3				ice for sexual violence	330
			cing stat		330
			icing resu		338
		3.2.1		ng ranges	339
				Sexual violence as genocide	340
				Sexual violence as a crime against humanity	340
				Sexual violence as a grave breach Sexual violence as a violation of the laws or customs	342
			3.2.1.4	of war	342
			3.2.1.5	Sexual violence as a violation of Article 3 common to the 1949 Geneva Conventions and of 1977 Additional	342
				Protocol II	343
			3.2.1.6	Preliminary results	343
4	Sente	encing	determin	ants	345
				sentencing practice in national courts	345
			avity of t		358
				peau of the crime	358
				chy of crimes?	359
				d mitigating circumstances	362
			Conduct	tances relevant for sexual violence crimes not charged in the indictment, false defences and	363
				ctful courtroom behaviour	372
5 Cumulative (charges and) convictions		and) convictions	375		
6	Final	remar	ks		377
Ch	apter	7 Re	paration	to Victims of Sexual Violence	383
1	Intro	duction	1		383
2	A spe	ecial ne	eed for re	paration to victims of sexual violence	386
	2.1 Rwanda				388
3	The 1	CTY a	and the IC	CTR	394
	3.1	Repara	ation pos	sibilities	394
		3.1.1	Restituti	on of property and proceeds	395
		3.1.2			398
			Rehabili		400
				mpensation within the Tribunals?	406
	3.3	The ro	ole of the	Tribunals: The Tribunals at an impasse?	409

#### Table of Contents

<ul> <li>4 The ICC</li> <li>4.1 The ICC: A necessary departure from the Tribunals?</li> <li>4.2 The ICC reparation regime for victims</li> <li>4.2.1 Court orders to award reparation</li> <li>4.2.2 The Trust Fund for victims and their families</li> <li>5 Final remarks</li> </ul>	410 410 411 412 416 420	
Evaluation of Part III	423	
PART IV CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	425	
Chapter 8 Towards a More Comprehensive Supranational Criminal Prosecution of Sexual Violence	427	
1 Introduction 2 Sexual violence in supranational criminal law 3 Sexual violence in supranational criminal procedure 3.1 Protective and special measures for victims of sexual violence 3.2 Participation of victims of sexual violence in the proceedings 4 Sexual violence and the legal consequences of the supranational criminal law system 4.1 Sentencing in cases of sexual violence 4.2 Reparation to victims of sexual violence 5 Final thoughts  Summary  Nederlandse Samenvatting (Dutch summary)  Appendix ICTY and ICTR Judgments on Sexual Violence  Bibliography	427 427 435 436 441 442 443 447 453 455 467 481	
List of Documents	521	
Overview of Cases	539	
Overview of Legislation	557	
Index	563	
Curriculum Vitae	567	
School of Human Rights Research Series		

### **ABBREVIATIONS**

ABiH Army of Bosnia and Herzegovina ACHR American Convention on Human Rights

AI Amnesty International

AIDS Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome

Art. Article

AFRC Armed Forces Revolutionary Council

ARV Anti-retroviral

ASP Assembly of States Parties

BiH Republic of Bosnia and Herzegovina

CAT Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or

**Degrading Treatment or Punishment** 

CCL Control Council Law No. 10

CEDAW Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women

Doc. Document

DRC Democratic Republic of the Congo

ECHR European Convention on Fundamental Rights and Fundamental

Freedoms

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

EoC Elements of Crimes

FAR Forces Armées Rwandaises (Rwandan Armed Forces) FARG Fonds d'Assistance aux Rescapés du Génocide

FIND Fonds d'Indemnisation

FWS Foča Witness Statements (Prosecution witness pseudonyms)

GC Geneva Convention

HIV Human Immunodeficiency Virus

HRW Human Rights Watch

HVO Croatian Defence Council (the Croatian Community of HZ-HB

armed forces)

HZ-HB Herzeg-Bosna

IACHR Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

ICC International Criminal Court

ICCPR International Convention on Civil and Political Rights

ICRC International Committee of the Red Cross ICTR International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

ICTY International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia

ICTY/R ICTY and ICTR

ICJ International Court of Justice

IGO International Governmental Organisation

ILA International Law Association
ILC International Law Commission

#### Abbreviations

ILM International Legal Materials

IMFTE International Military Tribunal for the Far East (Tokyo Tribunal)

IMT International Military Tribunal (Nuremberg Tribunal)

ILO International Labour Organisation NGO Non-Governmental Organisation

MONUC United Nations Mission in the Democratic Republic of Congo

 $\begin{array}{ccc} No. & Number \\ Nos. & Numbers \\ N^{\underline{o}} & Num\acute{e}ro \end{array}$ 

OTP Office of the Prosecutor

p. pagepp. pagespara. paragraphparas. paragraphs

PrepCom Preparatory Commission for the ICC RPE Rules of Procedure and Evidence

Res. Resolution

RPF Rwandese Patriotic Front RUF Revolutionary United Front

RTLM Radio Télévision Libre de Mille Collines

SC Security Council

SFRY Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia

Suppl. Supplement
UK United Kingdom
UN United Nations

UNAMIR United Nations Assistance Mission for Rwanda

UN Doc United Nations Document

UNGA United Nations General Assembly UNSC United Nations Security Council

UNSCR United Nations Security Council Resolution

UNTS United Nations Treaty Series

US United States v. versus Vol. Volume

VPRS Victims' Participation and Reparations Section

VRS Bosnian Serb Army

WVSS Witnesses and Victims Support Section

VWU Victims and Witnesses Unit