

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements .....	v
Table of Contents .....	vii
List of Abbreviations .....	xvii

## PART I: INTRODUCTION

### CHAPTER I

#### INTRODUCTION

I.1 PRELUDE .....	3
I.2 SOCIAL AND ACADEMIC SETTING .....	5
I.3 THE RESEARCH QUESTION .....	6
I.4 METHODOLOGY AND TERMINOLOGY .....	7
I.4.1 Structure of the Book .....	7
I.4.2 Comparative Methodology .....	8
I.4.3 Special Case of Northern Ireland .....	10
I.4.4 Terminology .....	11
I.5 JURISDICTIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY .....	12

### CHAPTER II

#### CHARACTERISATION: THE PROBLEM

II.1 INTRODUCTION .....	17
II.2 THEORIES OF CHARACTERISATION .....	20
II.2.1 Ignorance of Incomprehension of the Problem .....	20
II.2.2 <i>Lex Fori</i> Approach .....	21
II.2.3 <i>Leges Causae</i> Approach .....	23
II.2.4 Comparative Law Approach .....	24
II.2.5 <i>Via Media</i> Approach .....	25
II.2.6 Evaluation .....	27

## PART II: SUBSTANTIVE LAW

### CHAPTER III

#### BELGIUM

III.1	INTRODUCTION .....	33
III.2	EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE AND STATISTICS .....	33
III.3	HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE .....	34
III.3.1	Socialist Proposal .....	34
III.3.2	Coalition Proposal .....	36
III.3.3	Proposal for Statutory Cohabitation .....	38
III.3.4	Registered Partnership Proposal .....	39
III.3.5	Same-Sex Marriage .....	40
III.4	ESTABLISHMENT .....	41
III.4.1	Position of the Institution .....	41
III.4.2	Exclusivity .....	42
III.4.3	Sex of the Parties .....	43
III.4.4	Minimum Age .....	43
III.4.5	Residency .....	44
III.4.6	Prohibited Degrees of Relationship .....	44
III.4.7	Competency and Consent .....	45
III.4.8	Formal Validity .....	46
III.5	LEGAL EFFECTS .....	47
III.5.1	General .....	47
III.5.2	Civil Status .....	47
III.5.3	Nationality .....	48
III.5.4	Name Law .....	49
III.5.5	Taxation, Social Security and Pensions .....	50
III.5.6	Rights and Duties of the Partners to Each Other .....	53
III.5.7	Property Law .....	59
III.5.8	Inheritance Law .....	61
III.5.9	Children .....	64
III.6	DISSOLUTION .....	67
III.6.1	General .....	67
III.6.2	Judicial: Joint Petition .....	68
III.6.3	Judicial: Unilateral Petition .....	68
III.6.4	Administrative: Joint Declaration .....	68
III.6.5	Administrative: Unilateral Declaration .....	69
III.6.6	Annulment Proceedings .....	69
III.6.7	Death and Presumption of Death .....	70
III.6.8	Entry into Marriage / Conversion .....	70
III.6.9	Effects of Dissolution .....	71

**CHAPTER IV****FRANCE**

IV.1 INTRODUCTION .....	73
IV.2 EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE AND STATISTICS .....	73
IV.3 HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE .....	74
IV.3.1 Early History .....	74
IV.3.2 Contrat de partenariat civil .....	75
IV.3.3 Contrat d'union civile .....	76
IV.3.4 Contrat d'union sociale .....	77
IV.3.5 Contrat d'union civile et sociale .....	77
IV.3.6 Pacte d'intérêt commun .....	79
IV.3.7 Pacte civil de solidarité .....	80
IV.4 ESTABLISHMENT .....	82
IV.4.1 Position of the Institution .....	82
IV.4.2 Exclusivity .....	82
IV.4.3 Sex of the Parties .....	82
IV.4.4 Minimum Age .....	83
IV.4.5 Residency .....	84
IV.4.6 Prohibited Degrees of Relationship .....	84
IV.4.7 Competency and Consent .....	85
IV.4.8 Formal Validity .....	86
IV.5 LEGAL EFFECTS .....	89
IV.5.1 General .....	89
IV.5.2 Civil Status .....	89
IV.5.3 Nationality .....	91
IV.5.4 Name Law .....	92
IV.5.5 Taxation, Social Security and Pensions .....	93
IV.5.6 Rights and Duties of the Partners to Each Other .....	94
IV.5.7 Property Law .....	99
IV.5.8 Inheritance Law .....	102
IV.5.9 Children .....	104
IV.6 DISSOLUTION .....	110
IV.6.1 General .....	110
IV.6.2 Judicial: Joint Petition .....	110
IV.6.3 Judicial: Unilateral Petition .....	111
IV.6.4 Administrative: Joint Declaration .....	111
IV.6.5 Administrative: Unilateral Declaration .....	111
IV.6.6 Annulment Proceedings .....	112
IV.6.7 Death and Presumption of Death .....	113
IV.6.8 Entry into Marriage / Conversion .....	114
IV.6.9 Effects of Dissolution .....	115

**CHAPTER V****THE NETHERLANDS**

V.1	INTRODUCTION .....	117
V.2	EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE AND STATISTICS .....	117
V.3	HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE .....	118
V.3.1	Dutch Court Decisions .....	118
V.3.2	First Kortmann Committee .....	119
V.3.3	Second Kortmann Committee .....	120
V.4	ESTABLISHMENT .....	122
V.4.1	Position of the Institution .....	122
V.4.2	Exclusivity .....	122
V.4.3	Sex of the Parties .....	123
V.4.4	Minimum Age .....	123
V.4.5	Residency .....	123
V.4.6	Prohibited Degrees of Relationship .....	124
V.4.7	Competency and Consent .....	125
V.4.8	Formal Validity .....	125
V.5	LEGAL EFFECTS .....	127
V.5.1	General .....	127
V.5.2	Civil Status .....	127
V.5.3	Nationality .....	128
V.5.4	Name Law .....	129
V.5.5	Taxation, Social Security and Pensions .....	130
V.5.6	Rights and Duties of the Partners to Each Other .....	130
V.5.7	Property Law .....	135
V.5.8	Inheritance Law .....	137
V.5.9	Children .....	138
V.6	DISSOLUTION .....	148
V.6.1	General .....	148
V.6.2	Judicial: Joint Petition .....	149
V.6.3	Judicial: Unilateral Petition .....	149
V.6.4	Administrative: Joint Declaration .....	150
V.6.5	Administrative: Unilateral Declaration .....	152
V.6.6	Annulment Proceeding .....	152
V.6.7	Death and Presumption of Death .....	153
V.6.8	Entry into Marriage / Conversion .....	153
V.6.9	Effects of Dissolution .....	155

**CHAPTER VI**  
**SWITZERLAND**

VI.1	INTRODUCTION .....	159
VI.2	EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE AND STATISTICS .....	159
VI.3	HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE .....	160
VI.3.1	Early Parliamentary History .....	160
VI.3.2	Mounting Parliamentary Pressure .....	161
VI.3.3	Report of the Ministry of Justice .....	162
VI.3.4	Cantonal Change .....	163
VI.3.5	Consultation Procedure and Beyond .....	164
VI.4	ESTABLISHMENT .....	165
VI.4.1	Position of the Institution .....	165
VI.4.2	Exclusivity .....	166
VI.4.3	Sex of the Parties .....	166
VI.4.4	Minimum Age .....	168
VI.4.5	Residency .....	168
VI.4.6	Prohibited Degrees of Relationship .....	169
VI.4.7	Competency and Consent .....	170
VI.4.8	Formal Validity .....	171
VI.5	LEGAL EFFECTS .....	173
VI.5.1	General .....	173
VI.5.2	Civil Status .....	174
VI.5.3	Nationality .....	174
VI.5.4	Name Law .....	176
VI.5.5	Taxation, Social Security and Pensions .....	177
VI.5.6	Rights and Duties of the Partners to Each Other .....	178
VI.5.7	Property Law .....	186
VI.5.8	Inheritance Law .....	188
VI.5.9	Children .....	189
VI.6	DISSOLUTION .....	194
VI.6.1	General .....	194
VI.6.2	Judicial: Joint Petition .....	194
VI.6.3	Judicial: Unilateral Petition .....	197
VI.6.4	Administrative: Joint Declaration .....	198
VI.6.5	Administrative: Unilateral Declaration .....	198
VI.6.6	Annulment Proceedings .....	198
VI.6.7	Death and Presumption of Death .....	200
VI.6.8	Entry into Marriage / Conversion .....	200
VI.6.9	Effects of Termination .....	200

<b>CHAPTER VII</b>	
<b>UNITED KINGDOM</b>	
VII.1 INTRODUCTION .....	203
VII.2 EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE AND STATISTICS .....	204
VII.3 HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE .....	205
VII.3.1 Legislation Prior to the CPA 2004 .....	205
VII.3.2 Specific Partnership Legislation .....	206
VII.3.3 House of Commons .....	207
VII.3.4 House of Lords .....	208
VII.3.5 Government Bill and the Consultation Process .....	209
VII.4 ESTABLISHMENT .....	210
VII.4.1 Position of the Institution .....	211
VII.4.2 Exclusivity .....	211
VII.4.3 Sex of the Parties .....	212
VII.4.4 Minimum Age .....	213
VII.4.5 Residency .....	214
VII.4.6 Prohibited Degrees of Relationship .....	215
VII.4.7 Competency and Consent .....	216
VII.4.8 Formal Validity .....	217
VII.5 LEGAL EFFECTS .....	221
VII.5.1 General .....	221
VII.5.2 Civil Status .....	222
VII.5.3 Nationality .....	223
VII.5.4 Name Law .....	225
VII.5.5 Taxation, Social Security and Pensions .....	225
VII.5.6 Rights and Duties of the Partners to Each Other .....	226
VII.5.7 Property Law .....	232
VII.5.8 Inheritance Law .....	234
VII.5.9 Children .....	238
VII.6 DISSOLUTION .....	244
VII.6.1 General .....	244
VII.6.2 Judicial: Joint Petition .....	245
VII.6.3 Judicial: Unilateral Petition .....	246
VII.6.4 Administrative: Joint Declaration .....	248
VII.6.5 Administrative: Unilateral Declaration .....	248
VII.6.6 Annulment Proceedings .....	249
VII.6.7 Death and Presumption of Death .....	250
VII.6.8 Entry into Marriage / Conversion .....	250
VII.6.9 Effects of Dissolution .....	251

**CHAPTER VIII****COMPARISON AND EVALUATION**

VIII.1 INTRODUCTION .....	257
VIII.2 ESTABLISHMENT .....	257
VIII.2.1 Internal and External Consistency .....	259
VIII.2.2 External Inconsistency but Internal Consistency .....	261
VIII.2.3 Internal and External Inconsistency .....	263
VIII.2.4 Overall Comparison and Evaluation .....	266
VIII.3 DISSOLUTION .....	278
VIII.3.1 Internal and External Consistency .....	278
VIII.3.2 External Inconsistency but Internal Consistency .....	282
VIII.3.3 Internal and External Inconsistency .....	283
VIII.3.4 Overall Comparison and Evaluation .....	286
VIII.4 LEGAL EFFECTS .....	291
VIII.4.1 Extent of Legal Effects .....	291
VIII.4.2 Method of Extending Legal Effects .....	298
VIII.4.3 Overall Comparison and Evaluation .....	299
VIII.5 OVERALL EVALUATION .....	307
VIII.5.1 Existing Classifications .....	307
VIII.4.2 Towards a New Classification .....	309

**PART III: PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW****CHAPTER IX****CHARACTERISATION: REVISITED**

IX.1 INTRODUCTION .....	317
IX.2 THEORETICAL BACKGROUND .....	318
IX.2.1 Characterisation According to Contract .....	318
IX.2.2 Characterisation According to Personal Status .....	326
IX.2.3 Classification Within the Category of Personal Status ...	330
IX.3 COMPARATIVE OVERVIEW .....	335
IX.3.1 Belgium .....	335
IX.3.2 France .....	337
IX.3.3 The Netherlands .....	337
IX.3.4 Switzerland .....	339
IX.3.5 United Kingdom .....	341
IX.4 COMPARSION AND EVALUATION .....	343
IX.5 APPLICATION OF CRITERIA .....	347
IX.5.1 State Regulated .....	347
IX.5.2 Exclusivity .....	350
IX.5.3 Registration by Competent Authority .....	352

IX.5.4	Rights and Duties Attached .....	355
IX.5.5	Aims of Legislation and Social Interest .....	356
IX.6	SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS .....	363

## CHAPTER X

### ESTABLISHMENT OF A NON-MARITAL REGISTERED RELATIONSHIP

X.1	INTRODUCTION .....	367
X.2	CHOICE OF LAW RULES .....	368
X.2.1	Formal Validity .....	369
X.2.2	Essential Validity .....	375
X.3	RECOGNITION RULES .....	394
X.3.1	Anglo-France-Belgian System .....	396
X.3.2	Dutch-Swiss System .....	399
X.3.3	Specific Problems .....	400
X.3.4	Evaluation .....	408
X.4	CONSULAR AND DIPLOMATIC REGISTRATIONS .....	411
X.4.1	Non-Marital Relationships Registered in the Forum .....	412
X.4.2	Non-Marital Relationships Registered Abroad .....	415
X.4.3	Evaluation .....	418
X.5	PUBLIC POLICY EXCEPTION .....	420
X.5.1	Age Requirements .....	421
X.5.2	Prohibited Degrees of Relationship .....	421
X.5.3	Consent Requirements .....	422
X.5.4	Exclusivity Requirements .....	422
X.5.5	Different-Sex Relationships .....	423
X.5.6	Evaluation .....	424
X.6	SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS .....	425

## CHAPTER XI

### DISSOLUTION OF A NON-MARITAL REGISTERED RELATIONSHIP

XI.1	INTRODUCTION .....	427
XI.2	INTERNATIONAL JURISDICTION .....	427
XI.2.1	Brussels IIa Regulation .....	427
XI.2.2	Domestic Jurisdictional Rules for Marriage Dissolution .....	429
XI.2.3	Domestic Jurisdictional Rules for Dissolution of Non-Marital Registered Relationships .....	434
XI.2.4	Evaluation .....	438
XI.3	CHOICE OF LAW RULES .....	446
XI.3.1	Rules With Respect to Marriage Dissolution .....	448
XI.3.2	Rules With Respect to Dissolution of a Non-Marital Registered Relationships .....	456



XI.3.3 Evaluation .....	460
XI.4 RECOGNITION AND ENFORCEMENT .....	463
XI.4.1 Brussels IIa Regulation .....	463
XI.4.2 Domestic Rules on the Recognition of Foreign Divorces and Dissolutions of Non-Marital Registered Relationships .....	465
XI.4.3 Evaluation .....	476
XI.5 PUBLIC POLICY .....	479
XI.5.1 Administrative Dissolutions .....	479
XI.5.2 Unilateral Dissolutions .....	480
XI.5.3 Dissolution by virtue of Marriage .....	481
XI.5.4 Evaluation .....	482
XI.6 SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS .....	483
 <b>CHAPTER XII</b>	
<b>LEGAL EFFECTS OF A NON-MARITAL REGISTERED RELATIONSHIP</b>	
XII.1 INTRODUCTION .....	485
XII.2 LEGAL EFFECTS IN THE PUBLIC LAW SPHERE .....	486
XII.3 LEGAL EFFECTS IN THE PRIVATE LAW SPHERE .....	488
XII.3.1 Matters Relating to Children .....	489
XII.3.2 Matters Relating to Inheritance .....	492
XII.3.3 Pecuniary Matters .....	494
XII.3.4 Non-Pecuniary Matters .....	507
XII.4 SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS .....	516
 <b>CHAPTER XIII</b>	
<b>TOWARDS A UNIFIED SYSTEM OF LAW?</b>	
XIII.1 INTRODUCTION .....	517
XIII.2 SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS .....	519
XIII.3 DESIRABILITY .....	521
XIII.3.1 Advantages of Harmonisation/Unification .....	521
XIII.3.2 Disadvantages of Harmonisation/Unification .....	522
XIII.3.3 Evaluation .....	524
XIII.4 FEASIBILITY .....	525
XIII.4.1 European Group for Private International Law .....	525
XIII.4.2 International Commission on Civil Status (ICCS) .....	526
XIII.4.3 Council of Europe .....	527
XIII.4.4 European Union .....	528
XIII.4.5 Hague Conference for Private International Law .....	532
XIII.4.6 Evaluation .....	533
XIII.5 THE FUTURE .....	534

## **PART IV: APPENDICES**

### **Appendix 1**

Non-Marital Registered Relationship Legislation in the EU ..... 537

### **Appendix 2**

Non-Marital Registered Relationship Legislation in the non-EU,  
Council of Europe Member States ..... 542

### **Appendix 3**

Non-Marital Registered Relationship Legislation and Case Law  
outside Europe ..... 544

### **Appendix 4**

Legislation / Case Law on Same-Sex Marriage around the World ..... 546

Bibliography ..... 549

Case List ..... 587

Curriculum Vitae ..... 599