

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	
THEO VAN BOVEN .....	v
INTRODUCTION	
STEPHAN PARMENTIER and KOEN DE FEYTER .....	1
PART ONE. GENERAL FRAMEWORK	
THE UNITED NATIONS PRINCIPLES AND GUIDELINES ON REPARATIONS: CONTEXT AND CONTENTS	
DINAH SHELTON .....	11
Introduction .....	11
1. Origin and Development of the UN Basic Principles and Guidelines .....	14
1.1. The van Boven Drafts .....	15
1.2. Draft of Independent Expert Cherif Bassiouni .....	17
1.3. Consultative Meetings and Further Revisions .....	17
1.4. Contents of the Basic Principles and Guidelines .....	19
2. Reparations in Other Work of the Commission on Human Rights .....	23
2.1. Enforced Disappearance .....	24
2.2. Impunity .....	26
2.3. Durban and its Aftermath .....	27
3. United Nations Treaty Bodies .....	29
Conclusions and Prospects .....	31
VICTIMS AND CITIZENS: THE DISCOURSE OF REPARATION(S) AT THE DAWN OF THE NEW MILLENNIUM	
JOHN TORPEY .....	35
Introduction .....	35
1. The Meaning of “Reparations” .....	36

2. Victim Consciousness vs. Civic Identity .....	41
3. Fixing the Past vs. Fixing the Present .....	45
Conclusion .....	49

**PART TWO. KEY ISSUES**

REPARATION AS A COMPONENT OF TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE:  
PURSUING ‘REPARATIVE JUSTICE’ IN THE AFTERMATH OF  
VIOLENT CONFLICT

RAMA MANI .....	53
Introduction .....	53
1. The Emergence of Transitional Justice .....	53
1.1. The Aim and Conundrum of Transitional Justice .....	55
1.2. Evaluating Trials and Truth Commissions as Measures of Transitional Justice .....	56
1.2.1. Trials .....	57
1.2.2. Truth Commissions .....	60
1.3. Transitional Justice and Reparations .....	62
1.4. Beyond the Divisiveness of Transitional Justice .....	66
2. Rebuilding an Inclusive Political and Moral Community of Survivors .....	69
2.1. Articulating ‘Survivors Justice’ through the Conceptualisation of ‘Reparative Justice’ .....	71
2.2. From Theory to Application: The Promise and Challenges of Reparative Justice .....	75
2.3. Reparative Justice, Restorative Justice and Transformative Justice ...	78
Conclusion: Mobilising Reparative Justice – Guilt or Responsibility? .....	80

DESERVING AND UNDESERVING VICTIMS: POLITICAL CONTEXT  
AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK OF HARD CASES OF REPARATION

ELAZAR BARKAN .....	83
Introduction: History as Identity .....	83
1. Morality and Grey Zones .....	84
2. German Victims .....	90
3. Population Transfers .....	99
4. Undeserving Victims? .....	102
Conclusion .....	103

VICTIMS' EXPECTATIONS, NEEDS AND PERSPECTIVES AFTER GROSS AND SYSTEMATIC HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS	
MARTIEN SCHOTSMANS .....	105
Introduction .....	105
1. Physical Security .....	107
2. Recognition of Suffering .....	109
2.1. The Risk of Promises .....	109
2.2. Recognition and Relief .....	111
2.3. The Larger Agenda .....	113
3. Some Kind of Justice and Acknowledgment of the Wrong Done to Them .....	114
3.1. Acknowledgement by the Perpetrators .....	115
3.2. Acknowledgement by the Person(s) Bearing Command Responsibility .....	117
3.3. Acknowledgement by the State or by an Official Body .....	118
4. Truth .....	120
4.1. The Search for Truth .....	120
4.2. Obstacles to Truth .....	122
5. Some Kind of Reparation .....	125
5.1. False Promises and Exploitation .....	125
5.2. The Long Road to Reparation .....	127
5.3. Identifying the Victims .....	132
Conclusion .....	133
THE DILEMMA'S OF REPARATIONS: IN SEARCH OF A PROCESS-DRIVEN APPROACH	
BRANDON HAMBER .....	135
Introduction .....	135
1. Repairing the Irreparable .....	135
2. Interlinking Truth, Justice and Reparations .....	137
3. Reparations as Process .....	141
4. The South African Case .....	142
5. Civil Society, Activism and Reparations .....	147
Conclusion .....	149

REPARATIONS FOR GROSS HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS AS AN  
OUTCOME OF CRIMINAL VERSUS CIVIL COURT PROCEEDINGS

JEREMY SARKIN ..... 151

Introduction ..... 151

1. The Reality of Victim Reparation ..... 155

2. Reparation from Domestic Courts ..... 157

    2.1. Cases from around the World ..... 160

    2.2. The Roles and Rights to Reparations of Victims in Common  
    Law Criminal Justice Systems ..... 165

    2.3. The Roles and Rights to Reparations of Victims in Non  
    Common Law Criminal Justice Systems ..... 170

3. Types of Reparation Payable ..... 174

4. Reparation for Individuals in International Law ..... 174

5. Recent Developments before International(ised) Criminal Bodies ..... 176

    5.1. Victims' Rights at the War Crimes Tribunals ..... 176

    5.2. Victims' Rights to Reparation at the International Criminal  
    Court ..... 177

    5.3. Victims' Rights in Hybrid or Internationalised Domestic  
    Courts ..... 180

6. Regional Systems and Reparation for Victims ..... 182

7. Other (Non Judicial) Means to Obtain Reparations ..... 184

Conclusion ..... 187

**PART THREE. CASE STUDIES**

THE EXPANDING SCOPE AND IMPACT OF REPARATIONS  
AWARDED BY THE INTER-AMERICAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

DOUGLAS CASSEL ..... 191

Introduction ..... 191

1. International vs. National Law ..... 192

2. Summary of Reparations and Remedies Ordered by the Court ..... 193

    2.1. Access to Justice ..... 194

        2.1.1. National Judicial Proceedings ..... 194

        2.1.2. Inter-American Judgments and Publication ..... 195

        2.1.3. Compliance Monitoring, Reports and Supervision ..... 196

    2.2. Restitution ..... 197

    2.3. Compensation ..... 198

2.3.1. Compensatory Damages . . . . .	198
2.3.2. Litigation Costs and Attorneys' Fees . . . . .	200
2.3. Rehabilitative Services . . . . .	202
2.4. Satisfaction and Guarantees of Non-Repetition . . . . .	203
2.4.1. Investigation and Prosecution . . . . .	203
2.4.2. Symbolic Measures . . . . .	204
2.4.3. Remains and Burial . . . . .	204
2.4.4. Legislative Reform . . . . .	205
2.4.5. Administrative and Policy Reform . . . . .	206
2.4.6. Civil Society Participation . . . . .	207
2.5. Access to Information . . . . .	207
3. Two Illustrative Cases: Reparations Then and Now . . . . .	208
4. Reasons for Evolution in the Court's Jurisprudence on Reparations . . . . .	211
Conclusion . . . . .	213
Appendix 1: Judgments on Reparations of Inter-American Court of Human Rights, 1989-2004 . . . . .	215
Appendix 2: Summary of Reparations Ordered by Inter-American Court . . . . .	217
THE TRUST FUND FOR VICTIMS OF THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT: BETWEEN POSSIBILITIES AND CONSTRAINTS	
PABLO DE GREIFF and MARIEKE WIERDA . . . . .	225
Introduction . . . . .	225
1. The Legal Framework Governing Reparations and the Trust Fund for Victims . . . . .	228
2. Reparation Programmes: Goals and Forms . . . . .	231
2.1. Normative Considerations of Reparation Programmes . . . . .	232
2.2. Practical Design of Reparation Programs . . . . .	235
3. Practical Reasons for According an Expanded Role to the TFV . . . . .	237
3.1. Compensation Payments to Individuals . . . . .	237
3.2. Designing a Field Program . . . . .	239
4. Considerations for Activating the TVF and the Design of Programmes . . . . .	241
Conclusion . . . . .	243

REPARATION BY THE HUMAN RIGHTS CHAMBER FOR BOSNIA  
AND HERZEGOVINA

MANFRED NOWAK ..... 245

Introduction: The Need for Reparation in the Former Yugoslavia ..... 245

1. Mandate of the Human Rights Chamber ..... 246

2. Remedies and Reparation Ordered by the Chamber ..... 248

    2.1. Capital Punishment and Non-Refoulement ..... 248

    2.2. Arbitrary Detention, Torture, Ill-Treatment and Forced Labour ... 249

    2.3. Enforced Disappearances ..... 252

    2.4. Administration of Justice ..... 255

    2.5. Freedom of Religion ..... 257

    2.6. Right to Property and Protection of the Home ..... 262

    2.7. Discrimination and Obstruction of Minority Returns ..... 273

    2.8. Political Rights and Freedoms ..... 277

3. Contribution of the Chamber to an Emerging Right of Reparation  
for Victims of Human Rights Violations ..... 277

    3.1. Right to an Effective Remedy ..... 277

    3.2. Forms of Reparation ..... 282

Conclusions ..... 286

REPARATION PRACTICES IN SIERRA LEONE AND THE TRUTH AND  
RECONCILIATION COMMISSION

WILLIAM A. SCHABAS ..... 289

Introduction ..... 289

1. Reparations in the *Lomé Peace Agreement* ..... 290

2. Establishment of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission ..... 291

3. Other Bodies Taking Responsibility for Reparations ..... 296

4. Responsibility for Reparations ..... 298

5. The Conceptual Framework for Reparations ..... 299

6. Specific Measures ..... 302

7. Implementation ..... 307

REPARATION FOR VICTIMS IN RWANDA: CAUGHT BETWEEN THEORY AND PRACTICE	
HEIDY ROMBOUITS and STEF VANDEGINSTE .....	309
Introduction .....	309
1. Socio-political Framework .....	309
1.1. Historical and Political Context .....	310
1.2. The Institutional Framework of Reparation .....	314
1.2.1. Judicial mechanisms .....	314
1.2.2. Non-judicial mechanisms .....	316
2. Who Bears the Duty to Provide Reparation? .....	316
2.1. Introductory Remark .....	316
2.2. Reparation by the Rwandan State .....	317
2.2.1. At the national level .....	317
2.2.2. At the regional level .....	319
2.3. Reparation by Individual Perpetrators .....	320
2.3.1. At the national level .....	320
2.3.2. At the global level .....	321
2.3.3. At the level of third States .....	324
2.4. Reparation by Third States .....	325
3. Forms of Reparation .....	327
3.1. Restitution .....	328
3.2. Compensation .....	328
3.3. Rehabilitation .....	332
3.4. Satisfaction and Guarantees against Non-repetition .....	334
4. Who is Entitled to Reparation? .....	335
Conclusion .....	340
PART FOUR. ANTWERP/LEUVEN RESEARCH PROJECT	
THE RIGHT TO REPARATION FOR VICTIMS OF GROSS AND SYSTEMATIC VIOLATIONS OF HUMAN RIGHTS	
HEIDY ROMBOUITS, PIETRO SARDARO and STEF VANDEGINSTE .....	345
INTRODUCTION .....	345
1. Background and Context .....	345
2. Object, Approach and Structure .....	347
2.1. Object .....	347
2.2. Approach .....	347

2.3. Structure . . . . .	348
3. The Specific Research Focus: Reparation for Gross and Systematic Human Rights Violations . . . . .	348
3.1. “Gross and Systematic” Human Rights Violations . . . . .	349
3.2. Reparation for Gross and Systematic Human Rights Violations . . . . .	352
<b>PART I. LAW AND PRACTICE OF REPARATION FOR HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS . . . . .</b>	<b>354</b>
1. The International Right to Reparation for Victims of Human Rights Violations: An Overview . . . . .	355
1.1. General Remarks on the Modern International Protection of Human Rights . . . . .	355
1.1.1. Towards the age of enforcement . . . . .	355
1.1.2. The victims’ perspective . . . . .	358
1.2. The International Normative Framework . . . . .	362
1.2.1. The substantive dimension of reparation . . . . .	362
a. International law of State responsibility . . . . .	362
b. International humanitarian law and international criminal law . . . . .	364
c. Traditional human rights law . . . . .	365
1.2.2. Reparation as a component of effective domestic remedies . . . . .	368
1.2.3. Reparation as a consequence of the duty to execute an international judgment . . . . .	369
1.2.4. Additional instruments and documents confirming the international right to reparation . . . . .	370
2. Remedies at the International Level . . . . .	371
2.1. Remedial Powers of International Bodies . . . . .	371
2.2. Human Rights Adjudication . . . . .	373
2.2.1. Reparation and remedial powers in human rights instruments . . . . .	373
2.2.2. Reparation by monetary awards . . . . .	378
a. Determination with respect to the existence of relevant/recoverable damage and decision on the opportunity/necessity of making a financial award in that respect . . . . .	380
b. Quantification/calculation of damages . . . . .	386
c. Findings contained in the judgment in lieu of financial compensation . . . . .	392
2.2.3. Reparation by specific performances . . . . .	395
a. Restoration of the infringed human rights . . . . .	396
b. Specific performances of redress . . . . .	398



c.	General measures of prevention .....	409
2.3.	Traditional Inter-State Adjudication .....	411
2.3.1.	Judicial remedies .....	411
2.3.2.	Arbitral tribunals and claims commissions .....	417
2.4.	International Criminal Justice Mechanisms .....	418
3.	Remedies at the National Level .....	420
3.1.	Introductory Considerations .....	420
3.2.	The Right to Reparation at the Domestic Level: The Requirements under International Law .....	424
3.2.1.	The right to an effective domestic remedy .....	424
3.2.2.	The right to a court .....	424
3.3.	The Legislative Recognition of the Victims' Right to Reparation: Jurisdictional Competence and Remedial Powers of National Courts .....	426
3.3.1.	International remedial rights in domestic courts and the role of the legislator .....	426
3.3.2.	Direct incorporation of the international right to reparation in the domestic legal order: a few examples .....	428
3.3.3.	Constitutional remedies .....	430
3.3.4.	Compensatory remedies .....	433
3.4.	The 'Extraterritorial' Implementation of the Right to Reparation ...	436
3.4.1.	Claims containing a foreign element directed against the State of the forum or its agents .....	437
3.4.2.	Claims against foreign States and State officials .....	441
a.	The establishment of jurisdiction .....	442
b.	Jurisdictional bars .....	445
4.	Appraisal of the Victims' Right to Reparation under International Law: Between Myth and Reality .....	451
4.1.	Normative Significance and Salient Features of the Right to Reparation in International Human Rights Law .....	451
4.2.	The Obstacles to Effective Implementation of the Right to Reparation .....	454
4.2.1.	Judicial reluctance: right to reparation as a right that is not self-executing .....	454
4.2.2.	Political reluctance: right to reparation as a sensitive issue ...	454
4.2.3.	Right to reparation in the aftermath of gross and systematic violations of human rights .....	455

<b>PART II. CHALLENGES AND PROSPECTS WITH RESPECT TO REPARATION FOR GROSS AND SYSTEMATIC VIOLATIONS</b> .....	455
1. The Substance of Reparation .....	456
1.1. Standard of Reparation .....	457
1.2. Individual and Collective Reparation Measures .....	460
1.3. Tangible and Symbolic Reparation Measures .....	464
1.4. Reparation Measures and the Importance of Acknowledgment ....	465
2. The Beneficiaries of Reparation .....	466
2.1. Particular Features of Victims of Gross and Systematic Human Rights Violations .....	467
2.2. Reparation and Delimitations .....	468
2.3. Victim Dynamics in the Context of Reparation .....	472
2.3.1. Victim competition .....	473
2.3.2. Politicisation of victimhood .....	475
2.4. The Voice of Victims in the Reparation Debate .....	475
3. Who Bears the Duty to Repair? .....	476
3.1. Concurrent Responsibilities and the Fragmentation of International Law .....	476
3.2. Solidarity and Enrichment as Alternative Justifications for the Duty to Repair .....	479
3.3. State Responsibility for Reparation in the Case of Regime Succession .....	481
3.4. Extraterritorial Responsibility of States .....	483
3.5. Corporations and the Duty to Provide Reparation .....	485
4. Modalities and Forums .....	487
4.1. Judicial and Non-Judicial Approaches .....	488
4.1.1. Difficulties and assets of a judicial approach .....	488
4.1.2. Reparation programmes and their impact on individual victims' access to court .....	490
4.1.3. Forms of reparation programmes .....	493
4.2. National and International Levels .....	495
5. The Process of Reparation .....	496
5.1. Endeavour to Develop a Model for a Comprehensive Reparation Process .....	497
5.2. Initial Observations of the Model in Practice: Challenges and Stepping-Stones .....	498
<b>CONCLUSIONS</b> .....	500

ANNEX  
The United Nations Basic Principles and Guidelines on the Right to a  
Remedy and Reparation for Victims of Gross Violations of International  
Human Rights Law and Serious Violations of International Humanitarian  
Law ..... 505

ABOUT THE AUTHORS ..... 517