

TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD BY MARY ROBINSON	xix
FOREWORD BY HARTWIG DE HAEN	xxiii
TECHNICAL NOTE	xxv
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	xxvii
OVERVIEW OF INTERNATIONAL AND REGIONAL BINDING HUMAN RIGHTS INSTRUMENTS REFERRED TO IN THIS BOOK	xxxi
EDITORIAL INTRODUCTION	xxxiii
 <i>I. FOOD IN THE HUMAN RIGHTS SYSTEM</i>	
 CHAPTER 1.	
THE IMPORTANCE OF ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RIGHTS IN THE AGE OF ECONOMIC GLOBALISATION	
ASBJØRN EIDE	3
1. Introduction	3
2. The Human Rights Project in the Globalising Vision of the United Nations	4
2.1. The Future World Order Envisaged by the UN Charter	4
2.2. The Project to Make Human Rights Universal	5
3. Globalisation through Interstate Cooperation: Initiatives and Failures 1945-1980	8
3.1. Conflicts East-West and North-South	9
3.2. The Rise and Fall of the 'New International Economic Order'	10
3.3. Breakdown: The Debt Crisis	12
4. Corporate Globalisation through Neo-Liberal Market Extension	13
4.1. Neo-Liberal Actors and Writers	14
4.2. The Bretton Woods Institutions in New Roles	15
4.3. The Washington Consensus	16

4.4.	WTO: Trade, not Development	17
4.5.	From Wealth of Nations to Wealth of Corporations	18
5.	Assessing the Threefold Obstacles to Responsible Globalisation	19
6.	Towards Rights-Based Globalisation	22
6.1.	The Normative Basis for Rights-Based Development	22
6.2.	The Millennium Declaration and Human Rights	22
6.3.	Guidelines and Strategies	24
6.4.	Illustration: Obligations and Strategies Regarding the Right to Food	26
7.	In the Context of Globalisation	27
7.1.	Rights-Based Development Cannot be Achieved through National Isolation	27
7.2.	Required: Global Cooperation	28
7.3.	Major Areas of Action	29
7.3.1.	The Human Rights Movement	29
7.3.2.	International Monitoring and Complaint Mechanisms	30
7.3.3.	Academia and Research	31
7.3.4.	Corporate Responsibility	31
7.3.5.	Controlling and Taxing Financial Klangs	32
7.3.6.	Involving the International Financial Institutions in Rights-Based Development	33
7.3.7.	Redirecting the WTO: From Free Trade to Fair Trade	35
8.	Concluding Remarks: Global Governance for Socially Conscious Globalisation	36
	References	37

CHAPTER 2.

DEMOCRACY AND THE POLITICS OF HUNGER

	DAN BANIK	41
1.	Introduction	41
1.1.	The Inheritance from Amartya Sen	41
1.2.	India, Famines and Food Security	42
1.3.	Dimensions of Democracy in India	44
2.	The Politics of Government Intervention	45
2.1.	Intervention in Food Markets	45
2.2.	The Politics of Famine vs. Chronic Hunger and Malnutrition	47
3.	Two Case Studies	49
3.1.	Kalahandi, Orissa: Drought and Starvation Deaths	49
3.2.	Purulia, West Bengal: Scoring Better Despite Poverty	52

4.	Examples of Adversarial Politics and Government Response	53
4.1.	Government Response to Reports of Starvation Deaths in Kalahandi	53
4.2.	Bureaucratic Mobility as a Constraint to the Implementation of Public Programmes	55
4.3.	Press Coverage of Starvation Deaths	58
5.	Concluding Remarks	62
	References	63

CHAPTER 3.

FROM FOOD SECURITY TO THE RIGHT TO FOOD

	WENCHE BARTH EIDE	67
1.	Introduction	67
2.	The Right to Food in Context	68
3.	Beyond Food Production: The Shift to a Food Security Focus and Its Significance in the Food Debate over Three Decades	70
3.1.	Aggregated Food Security and the Critique to its Limitations	70
3.2.	Responses within the UN System	73
3.3.	Zooming in on Individuals' Access to Food in Context through Household Food Security	75
4.	Food Security in Shaping a Normative Foundation for the Right to Adequate Food Concept	76
4.1.	A Tool for Elaborating Rights and Corresponding Obligations: A 'Right to Food Matrix'	77
4.2.	A Forgotten Step: The FAO <i>Food Security Compact</i> of the Mid-1980s – an Effort Towards a Quasi-Legal Instrument for Food Security	78
5.	Significant Further Developments Enabling a Pro-Rights Environment for the Food Security Debate	80
5.1.	The First Study on the Right to Food for the United Nations	81
5.2.	The Vienna Conference on Human Rights	82
5.3.	Other UN Development Agencies	83
5.4.	Further Contributions from UN Human Rights Bodies	85
5.5.	Inter-Agency Potentials	87
5.6.	Non-Governmental Organisations	89
5.7.	Scholarly Institutions in Transition	89
6.	Concluding Remarks: 2005 and Beyond	91
	Appendix. "The Right to Food Matrix"	93
	References	94

CHAPTER 4.

THE RIGHT TO ADEQUATE FOOD IN HUMAN RIGHTS

INSTRUMENTS: LEGAL NORMS AND INTERPRETATIONS

WENCHE BARTH EIDE and UWE KRACHT	99
1. Introduction	99
2. The Right to Adequate Food in the International Normative Framework of Human Rights	100
3. Defining the Content of the Right to Food and the Broad Parameters for its Implementation	104
3.1. General Comment No. 12 on the Right to Adequate Food (GC12)	105
3.1.1. The Normative Content of the Right to Adequate Food ..	105
3.1.2. State Obligations and Responsibilities of Society as a Whole	106
3.1.3. National Implementation	108
3.1.4. On the Issue of 'Justiciability' of the Right to Food	110
3.1.5. The International Dimension of the Right to Food	112
3.2. From Expert Interpretation to Stakeholder-Owned Guidelines for Action	113
4. Concluding Reflections on Food as a Human Right	114
References	116

CHAPTER 5.

WHOSE RIGHT TO FOOD? VULNERABLE GROUPS AND

THE HUNGRY POOR

UWE KRACHT	119
1. Introduction	119
2. Trends in Under- and Malnutrition and Related Poverty	120
2.1. Undernutrition	121
2.2. Protein-Energy Malnutrition in Preschool Children	122
2.3. Overnutrition	122
2.4. Micronutrient Deficiency Disorders	123
2.5. Hunger, Malnutrition and Poverty	124
2.6. Trends in Global Poverty	125
3. Who are the Hungry Poor?	125
3.1. Hunger and Poverty – Still a Predominantly Rural Phenomenon ..	125
3.2. Who Are the Poor: Poverty-Vulnerable Population Groups	126
3.3. Toward a Food- and Nutrition-Focused Typology of Vulnerable Groups and Associated Vulnerability Causes	128

3.4. Need for a Sharper Focus on Vulnerable Groups and the Hungry Poor in Country-Specific Contexts	132
4. Conclusion	133
Annex Tables	134
References	138

CHAPTER 6.

THE INTERRELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN THE RIGHT TO FOOD AND OTHER HUMAN RIGHTS

MARGRET VIDAR	141
1. Introduction	141
2. Right to Non-Discrimination	142
3. Right to Health	144
4. Right to Education	146
5. Right to Work	147
6. Right to Social Security	148
7. Rights Related to Water	150
8. Rights Related to Land	151
9. Cultural Rights	153
10. Freedom of Opinion, Expression and Information	155
11. Freedom of Assembly and Association	156
12. Right to Participation	157
13. Right to Proper Administration of Justice	158
14. Conclusions	159
References	159

II. *LEGAL AND INSTITUTIONAL DIMENSIONS*

CHAPTER 7.

JUSTICIABILITY OF SOCIO-ECONOMIC RIGHTS: REFLECTIONS ON NORWEGIAN AND SOUTH AFRICAN DEBATE AND EXPERIENCE

MARGIT TVEITEN	163
1. Socio-Economic Rights as a Necessary Control of Government Action ..	163
2. Socio-economic Rights in South African and Norwegian Law	166
3. Arguments Against Justiciability	170
4. Justiciability in Practice in South Africa	172
4.1. Interference in Resource Allocation	172

4.2.	Vagueness	174
4.3.	Court Cases are Resource Demanding	175
4.4.	Retroactivity	176
4.5.	Dependence on Specific Facts and Parties	176
4.6.	Complexity	177
5.	Judicialisation as a Threat to Democracy. A Norwegian Perspective	178
6.	“Judicial Democracy”	179
7.	Conclusion	183
	References	184

CHAPTER 8.

THE ROLE OF FRAMEWORK LEGISLATION IN REALISING THE RIGHT TO FOOD: USING SOUTH AFRICA AS A CASE STUDY OF THIS NEW BREED OF LAW

	SIBONILE KHOZA	187
1.	Introduction	187
2.	Constitutional Obligations	189
2.1.	Interpreting the Right to Food in Textual, Social and Historical Contexts	190
2.2.	Applying International Law in the Domestic Legal System	192
3.	The Right to Food in International Law and the Emergence of Framework Law	193
3.1.	Framework Law: A New Breed of Law	193
3.2.	Content of Framework Law	194
3.3.	Crucial Issues Concerning the Content of Framework Law	195
3.4.	The Benefits of Framework Legislation	196
4.	The Significance of Framework Law in South Africa	197
4.1.	The Complexity of the Food Situation	197
4.2.	The Nature of Recognition Accorded to the Right to Food	198
4.3.	Emerging Domestic Trends Towards Framework Law	199
4.4.	Relevant Human Rights Principles and Democratic Norms for a Framework Law Process	200
5.	Towards a Framework Law Approach in South Africa: The Integrated Food Security Strategy and the Food Security Draft Bill	200
5.1.	The Integrated Food Security Strategy (IFSS)	201
5.2.	The National Food Security Draft Bill	202
6.	Conclusion	203
	References	203

CHAPTER 9.**THE ROLE OF THE UN HUMAN RIGHTS BODIES IN PROMOTING
AND PROTECTING THE RIGHT TO FOOD**

SALLY-ANNE WAY	205
1. Introduction	205
2. The UN Commission on Human Rights	208
2.1. The Commission and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	208
2.2. Establishing a Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food of the Commission	209
2.3. Challenges Facing the Commission	211
3. The Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights	212
3.1. The Sub-Commission and the Right to Food	213
3.2. Challenges Facing the Sub-Commission	214
4. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	215
4.1. The CESCR and the Right to Food	215
4.2. Participation of Non-Governmental Organisations in the Supervisory Process	216
4.3. Challenges Facing the Committee	217
5. The Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights	219
5.1. The OHCHR and the Right to Food	220
5.2. Challenges Faced by the OHCHR	221
6. The Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food of the Commission on Human Rights	222
6.1. The Mandate of the Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food	222
6.2. Challenges Faced by the Special Rapporteur	224
7. Conclusions	225
References	226

CHAPTER 10.**PROGRAMMING WITH A HUMAN RIGHTS APPROACH: A UNICEF
EXPERIENCE IN OPERATIONAL PRACTICE**

FABIO SABATINI	229
1. Introduction	229
2. A Sequential Approach	231
2.1. Initial Obstacles in Introducing the Concept to Staff and Allies ...	231
2.2. Early Identification of Programmatic Steps	232
3. Operationalising the Approach: Zimbabwe 1998-2002	242

3.1.	Sensitisation and Training on HRBAP Concepts and CCD Operations	242
3.2.	Using Rights-Based Analysis as Prerequisite for Project Implementation	244
3.3.	A First Case Study: Integrated Management of Childhood Illnesses (IMCI)	245
4.	Programmatic Implications of a HRBAP	245
4.1.	The Value Added of HRBAP: From Participation to Obligation ...	245
4.2.	HRBAP Demands Process-Conscious and Outcome-Oriented Programming	247
4.3.	Multisectoral and Community-Driven Work is Unavoidable under a HRBAP	247
4.4.	HRBAP Requires Expanding Partnerships with Civil Society	248
5.	Benefits of HRBAP	248
5.1.	Community Level	249
5.2.	Local Authority Level	250
5.3.	At All Levels	250
6.	Possible Threats to HRBAP Operationalisation	251
6.1.	Organisational Doubts	251
6.1.1.	HRBAP is Process Oriented and Management Intensive ..	251
6.1.2.	CCD is 'too' Cost-Effective and Not Necessarily Linked to Programme Deliverables	251
6.2.	Community-Related Challenges	252
6.2.1.	A Time Intense Process with Spread-Out Benefits	252
6.2.2.	Sustaining Community Commitment	252
6.2.3.	Committed Leadership	253
6.2.4.	Access to Relevant Information	253
6.2.5.	Uneven Participation and Process Ownership	253
6.2.6.	Breaking the Dependency Syndrome	253
6.3.	System-Related Challenges	254
6.3.1.	The Persistence of the Project Approach	254
6.3.2.	Weak Institutional Environment	254
6.3.3.	The Challenge to Generate a Bottom-Up Approach within a Top-Down Environment	255
6.3.4.	Community/District Interface: Positioning CMs in Relation to District Level Technocrats	256
6.3.5.	The Need to Strengthen the Quality of Community Assessment and Analysis	256
6.3.6.	Advocacy for Sustained Support and Resource Mobilisation	257

7.	Untapped Opportunities and Potentials for Mainstreaming	257
7.1.	Assessment of Capacity of Local Authorities	257
7.2.	Monitoring and Evaluation and Reporting Systems for Impact Assessment	257
7.3.	Systematic, Large-Scale Training on HRBAP/CCD	258
8.	Conclusion: Changing Minds, Changing Lives	258
	References	258

CHAPTER 11.

DEVELOPING VOLUNTARY GUIDELINES FOR IMPLEMENTING THE RIGHT TO ADEQUATE FOOD: ANATOMY OF AN INTERGOVERNMENTAL PROCESS

	ARNE OSHAUG	259
1.	Introduction	259
2.	Anatomy of the Intergovernmental Process 2003-2004	264
2.1.	IGWG I – 24 th to 26 th March 2003	264
2.2.	IGWG II – 27 th to 29 th October 2003	266
2.3.	IGWG Inter-Sessional Meeting – 2 nd to 5 th February 2004	270
2.4.	IGWG III – 5 th to 9 th July 2004	272
2.5.	‘Friends of the Chair’ Meeting – 20 th to 22 nd September 2004	275
3.	Overall Assessment: How Useful are the New Voluntary Guidelines? ...	276
	References	280

III. ASPECTS OF THE RIGHT TO FOOD –SELECTED TOPICS

CHAPTER 12.

THE RIGHT TO FOOD OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLES

	SIRI DAMMAN	285
1.	Introduction	285
2.	Background	286
2.1.	Indigenous Food Insecurity and Malnutrition	286
2.2.	Who are the Indigenous Peoples and What Characterises their Ways of Life?	287
2.3.	Evolution of Indigenous Peoples’ Rights	289
2.3.1.	The International Historical Context	289
2.3.2.	Non-Discrimination, Affirmative Action, and Special Rights for Indigenous Peoples	292

Table of Contents

2.3.3.	The Right to Culture of Indigenous Peoples	293
3.	Two Cases	295
3.1.	Indigenous Vulnerability	295
3.2.	The Case of Jujuy	297
3.2.1.	The Food Security Situation	297
3.2.2.	Legal Protection	298
3.2.3.	The Right to Land: Intentions and Realities	299
3.3.	The Case of Nunavut	301
3.3.1.	Land and Food Security	301
3.3.2.	Legal Protection and Governance	306
4.	Principles Guiding the Exploration of the Indigenous Right to Food	307
5.	Self-Determination or an Actively Involved State? Delineating Options for State Responsibilities	309
5.1.	Contrasting and Comparing Two Models	309
5.2.	Emerging Coinciding Problems – a Function of the Assisting State Model in Action?	310
5.3.	Can Lessons Be Drawn From the Nunavut Experience to Other Situations?	311
6.	Practical Options for a Positive Change	312
6.1.	The Significance of the Human Rights Standards and Their Interpretation for Indigenous Peoples	312
6.2.	Culture, including Food Culture, is at the Core of Indigenous Food Security	313
6.3.	Concluding Remarks	315
	References	318

CHAPTER 13.

BREASTFEEDING: BABY'S RIGHT AND MOTHER'S DUTY?

	ELISABET HELSING	323
1.	Introduction: Issues and Premises	323
1.1.	Why are Human Rights Important in Breastfeeding?	323
1.2.	Key Definitions and Standards in Infant Feeding	324
1.3.	Provisions Relevant to Breastfeeding in International Human Rights Instruments	324
1.4.	Identifying Obligations – Building the Case	325
2.	Biology Re-Examined: Is Species Specific Food Important for the Young?	326
2.1.	Each Species has its Own Baby Food Recipe and Strategy for Care	326

2.2.	The Human Mammal is no Exception	327
2.3.	Is it Biologically Possible to Force a Mother to Breastfeed?	328
2.4.	Some Situations where Breast may not be best	328
2.5.	Is there any Alternative to the Species-Specific Milk?	330
2.5.1.	Why the Cow?	331
3.	The Historical Contribution of the Health Profession to the Replacement of Breastfeeding	332
3.1.	Emergency Feeding of Babies – Historically a Risky Business	332
3.2.	Reproduction of the Labour Force Becoming “Modernised”	333
3.3.	Artificial Feeding Made Safe	333
3.4.	The Medical Connection – a Dangerous Liaison	333
3.4.1.	New Milk in New Vessels	334
3.5.	Bottle-Feeding Routines for Making Breastmilk?	335
3.6.	Why did it Happen, and whose Interests were Served?	335
4.	Introducing Human Rights to the Breast Feeding Movement and Discourse	337
4.1.	Meeting a Series of Dilemmas	337
4.2.	Does Baby’s Right Lead to Mother’s Duty?	338
5.	Mothers’ Human Right to Breastfeed	339
5.1.	Feminist Perspectives	339
5.1.1.	Equality at All Costs?	340
5.1.2.	Having it Both Ways?	340
5.2.	The Role of Sexuality	341
5.2.1.	Differences Between Male and Female Sexuality	341
5.2.2.	Breasts both for Fun and Food	341
6.	“Informed Choice” – and Shirking Responsibility?	342
7.	Defining the Obligations of States in a Human Rights Perspective	343
7.1.	The Turning of the Tide – Breastfeeding Reclaimed	343
7.1.1.	Re-Capturing the Art of Breastfeeding and the Science of Studying Human Milk	343
7.1.2.	Taking back Control of “The Human Experiment”	344
7.1.3.	Important Documents Supportive of the Right to Practice Breastfeeding	344
7.1.4.	The Long Step from Theory to Action	347
7.2.	Establishing a Framework for State Obligations	348
7.3.	Implications for Policy	349
7.4.	Lessons Learnt by the Nordic Experience	350
8.	Conclusion: A Question of Rights and Conditional Duties and Obligations of the State	351
	References	353

CHAPTER 14.

HIV/AIDS, FOOD SECURITY AND HUMAN RIGHTS: CONCEPTS AND LINKAGES

IDA-ELINE ENGH	357
1. In Search of Linkages	357
2. The Problem	359
3. An Organising Framework	360
4. Establishing the Linkages	361
4.1. Food Security and HIV/AIDS	362
4.1.1. Impacts of the HIV/AIDS Epidemic on Food Security	363
4.1.2. Impacts of Food Insecurity on Vulnerability to HIV/AIDS	365
4.2. HIV/AIDS and Human Rights Relevant to Food	366
4.2.1. HIV/AIDS and the Right to Health	367
4.2.2. HIV/AIDS, Discrimination and Stigmatisation	369
4.2.3. The Rights of Children Affected and Orphaned by HIV/AIDS	371
4.3. Linking the Three Dimensions: HIV/AIDS, Food Security and the Right to Food	372
5. Implications for the State: An Attempt to Define its Obligations for Addressing HIV/AIDS and Food Insecurity	374
5.1. Addressing HIV/AIDS and Food Insecurity	374
5.2. Identifying Obligations	375
5.2.1. The Obligation to Respect	376
5.2.2. The Obligation to Protect	377
5.2.3. The Obligation to Facilitate	378
5.2.4. The Obligation to Provide	379
6. The Need to Specify Obligations <i>and</i> Capacities to Meet Them	380
7. Conclusion	384
References	385

CHAPTER 15.

HIV/AIDS, INFANT FEEDING AND HUMAN RIGHTS

GEORGE KENT	391
1. Questionable Coercion	391
2. Uncertainty Regarding HIV Transmission through Breastfeeding	393
2.1. Definitions and Indicators of Transmission and Infection	393
2.2. Likelihood of Transmission	396
2.3. Morbidity and Mortality	397

2.4. The Protective Effects of Breastfeeding	399
3. Health Outcomes and Implications for Feeding Choices	400
4. Global Policy Recommendations on HIV/AIDS and Infant Feeding	403
5. Human Rights Law and Principles Relating to Infant Feeding	404
5.1. Provisions of Specific Interest in the International Human Rights Instruments	404
5.2. Focus on the Principle of Informed Choice	408
6. Is HIV/AIDS Exceptional?	410
6.1. Evidence, or Lack of it?	410
6.2. Who Decides?	411
6.3. The AFASS Conditions	412
7. Summary and Conclusion	413
Appendix. Observational Research on HIV and Infant Feeding	417
References	420

CHAPTER 16.

THE RIGHT TO FOOD, THE RIGHT TO BENEFIT FROM SCIENCE AND THE TRIPS AGREEMENT

HANS MORTEN HAUGEN	425
1. Introduction	425
1.1. Historical Context	427
2. Relevant Human Rights Provisions	428
2.1. The Right to an Adequate Standard of Living, Including the Right to Food	428
2.2. The Right to Enjoy the Benefits of Scientific Progress	429
2.3. The Right of Authors to Benefit from Moral and Material Interests of Production	431
2.4. The Right of People to their Natural Resources	433
3. Intellectual Property Rights and the TRIPS Agreement under International Economic Law	434
3.1. The Nature of IPRs under International Economic Law	434
3.2. Objectives and Contents of the TRIPS Agreement	436
3.3. Patent Protection and Plant Breeders Rights	437
4. Assessing the Impact of TRIPS	441
4.1. Will Patents Generate Long-Term Growth and Facilitate Investment in Developing Countries?	441
4.2. Commercial Interests and Human Rights	443
5. Conflicts and Violations	444
5.1. Defining and Identifying Conflict between Treaties	444