

BETWEEN SEXUALITY, GENDER AND REPRODUCTION

European Family Law Series

Published by the Organising Committee of the
Commission on European Family Law

Prof. Katharina Boele-Woelki (Utrecht)

Prof. Frédérique Ferrand (Lyon)

Prof. Cristina González Beilfuss (Barcelona)

Prof. Maarit Jänterä-Jareborg (Uppsala)

Prof. Nigel Lowe (Cardiff)

Prof. Dieter Martiny (Frankfurt/Oder)

Prof. Velina Todorova (Plovdiv)



An open access online version of this book is available, thanks to financing by
the German Federal Ministry of Education and Research.
Visit www.intersentiaonline.com for more information.

BETWEEN SEXUALITY, GENDER AND REPRODUCTION

On the Pluralisation of Family Forms

Edited by
Nina DETHLOFF
Katharina KAESLING



Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Mews
Wellington Street | Cambridge
CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1223 736 170
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and
Rest of the World (incl. Eastern Europe)*
NBN International
1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley
Milton Keynes MK13 8LD
United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe
Lefebvre Sarrut Belgium NV
Hoogstraat 139/6
1000 Brussels
Belgium
Tel: +32 (0)2 548 07 13
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada
Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Between Sexuality, Gender and Reproduction. On the Pluralisation of Family Forms © The editors and contributors severally 2023

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

An online version of this work is published under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>.

Intersentia was given an exclusive commercial license to print and distribute the printed version of the book.

Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the Creative Commons Open Access license above should be addressed to Intersentia.

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third parties directly.

ISBN 978-1-83970-312-6

D/2023/7849/12

NUR 822

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This edited volume contains contributions based on the presentations given at a conference held by the Käte Hamburger Center for Advanced Study in the Humanities ‘Law as Culture’ of the University of Bonn, organised by the editors. On 17 and 18 November 2021, researchers from Australia, Austria, Germany, Poland, Portugal, South Africa and the USA came together online to discuss aspects of social and legal recognition of diverse family forms and the role of sexuality, gender and reproduction in these contexts.

First and foremost, we would like to thank all of the contributors for not only enriching the conference, but also documenting their thoughts in this edited volume. We are likewise grateful to the Organising Committee of the Commission on European Family Law, namely Katharina Boele-Woelki, for including this volume in the European Family Law series, which will – we hope – spark further transnational discussions on the topic.

Thanks are also due to Rebecca Moffat, Ahmed Hegazi and their team from Intersentia, as well as to Stefan Finger, Candice Kerestan, Michèle Nickel and Isabel Pohl from the Käte Hamburger Center ‘Law as Culture’. Very special thanks go to Felix Leven, research assistant at the Center, whose exceptionally diligent and competent work was essential for the completion of this volume.

Nina Dethloff and Katharina Kaesling
Bonn/Dresden, September 2022

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xi

From Marriage to Family: Plurality of Family Forms from a Comparative Perspective

Nina DETHLOFF, Katharina KAESLING and Felix LEVEN	1
1. Introduction	1
2. Major Shifts	4
3. Between Sexuality, Gender and Reproduction	18

PART I. COEXISTENCE OF LEGAL SYSTEMS

Uncoupling and the New Social Compact: A Paradigm Shift in Western Family Organisation

June CARBONE	25
1. Paradigm Shifts and Family Norms	28
2. Family Formation and Economic Organisation	32
3. Uncoupling and the New Social Compact: Remaking the State Role	41

Diverse Legal Cultures, Common Core? The CEFL Principles of European Family Law

Dieter MARTINY	51
1. Context of the CEFL Principles	51
2. Legal System, Legal Culture, and Diversity	52
3. Harmonisation of Family Law	54
4. A Common Core and the CEFL	55
5. Conclusion	60

Families and Legal Pluralism in South Africa: Celebrating Diversity but at what Cost?

Christa RAUTENBACH	61
1. Introduction	61
2. The Plurality of Marriage Laws	69

3. The Cost of Plurality	79
4. Conclusion: A Single Marriage Act?	90

The Catholic Concept of ‘Family’ in the Secular State

Judith HAHN	93
-------------------	----

1. The Catholic Concept of Family	95
2. Marriage and Family in Church and State	102
3. Conclusion	105

PART II. CONCEPTIONS OF FAMILY AND THE INTERNATIONAL COMMUNITY OF STATES

Pluralisation of Family Forms in the Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights

Angelika NußBERGER and Cathérine VAN DE GRAAF	111
---	-----

1. Family Law between Universal Human Rights and Particular Cultural Traditions	111
2. Article 12 ECHR: A Brake on Evolutive Interpretation?	114
3. Article 8 ECHR: A Gateway for Innovation?	116
4. Differences that Matter vs. Differences that do not Matter	122
5. East–West Divide and Fragmentation of Common European Standards	128
6. Conclusion	132

The Shaping of the Law by the Highest Courts in the Realm of Families

Johannes MASING	133
-----------------------	-----

1. The Cases	134
2. The Framework	136
3. The Argumentative Approach of the Court	140
4. The Political Role of the European Court of Justice	144
5. Outlook	149

Conditions for LGBTIQ⁺ Families in Poland: Breaking Away from the Community of States?

Marta BUCHOLC	155
---------------------	-----

1. Legal Framework	157
2. Key Problems and their Cultural Backdrop: The ‘LGBT-Free Zones’	164
3. Trends and Tendencies	169
4. Conclusion	172

PART III. NATURE AND NURTURE AND THE IN-BETWEEN:
THE ROLE OF GENETIC LINKS FOR THE RECOGNITION
OF FAMILIES

**The Determination of Parenthood in the Portuguese Legal System
and the Law of Medically Assisted Procreation: Rolling the Dice Again**

- | | |
|--------------------------|-----|
| Paula TÁVORA VÍTOR | 175 |
|--------------------------|-----|

- | | |
|--|-----|
| 1. Introduction | 175 |
| 2. The 'Classic' System of Determination of Parenthood | 176 |
| 3. Determining Parenthood in the Law of Medically Assisted
Procreation (MAP)..... | 178 |

**Genetics and the Construction of Parenthood: The ECtHR Jurisprudence
on Transnational Surrogacy**

- | | |
|----------------------|-----|
| Alice MARGARIA | 189 |
|----------------------|-----|

- | | |
|---|-----|
| 1. Introduction | 189 |
| 2. <i>Mennesson v. France</i> : Surrogacy Enters the ECtHR's Scene | 191 |
| 3. <i>Paradiso and Campanelli v. Italy</i> : In the Absence of Genetics | 192 |
| 4. The Advisory Opinion on the Recognition of Intended (Non-Genetic)
Motherhood..... | 194 |
| 5. <i>D v. France</i> : Resembling the Two-Parent Biological Model | 196 |
| 6. <i>Valdís Fjölnisdóttir v. Iceland</i> : Surrogacy in the Context of Lesbian
Parenthood | 198 |
| 7. Conclusion: A Gendered Regulation of Parenthood..... | 199 |

PART IV. DIVERSITY OF FAMILIES IN MEDIA AND ART

**Families, Images, Media: A Brief History of Family Images from
Paint to Television to Social Media**

- | | |
|-------------------------------|-----|
| Sascha TRÜLTZSCH-WIJNEN | 205 |
|-------------------------------|-----|

- | | |
|--|-----|
| 1. Background: Stereotypes and Role Models..... | 206 |
| 2. Family Role Models and Families..... | 209 |
| 3. Historical Perspectives | 211 |
| 4. Family Pictures in More Recent Fictional Television Series..... | 218 |
| 5. The Internet and Family Images..... | 221 |
| 6. Conclusion..... | 224 |

Rainbow Families on Social Media: Diversity and Plurality as Matters of Platform Regulation

Katharina KAESLING	227
1. Doing Family as Part of Online Mass Creativity	227
2. Social Media as Modern Gatekeepers	230
3. Regulatory Approaches	235
4. Regulatory Perspectives Beyond Subjective Rights	248
5. Conclusions	251

Rainbow Connections: Representations of LGBTI⁺ Families in Children's Picture Books

Paul VENZO	253
1. Queer Children's Literature	254
2. Queer Families and Politics in Children's Literature	256
3. Censorship	258
4. Children's Picture Books and Marriage Equality	260
5. Contemporary and Future Directions	261
6. Conclusion	263

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Prof. Dr. Marta Bucholc

Professor at the Faculty of Sociology, University of Warsaw, Poland

Prof. June Carbone

Professor of Law, Robina Chair in Law, Science and Technology, University of Minnesota School of Law, United States of America

Prof. Dr. Nina Dethloff, LL.M.

Professor of Civil Law, Private International Law, Comparative Law and European Private Law, Director at the Institute for German, European, and International Family Law, University of Bonn, Germany

Prof. Dr. Judith Hahn

Professor of Canon Law, Faculty of Catholic Theology, University of Bonn, Germany

JProf. Dr. Katharina Kaesling, LL.M.

Tenure Track Junior Professor of Civil Law, Intellectual Property, in particular Patent Law, and Legal Issues of AI, University of Dresden (TU), Member of the Board of the Research Center for Legal Issues of New Technologies as well as Data Law (For:Tech), Bonn, Germany

Felix Leven, Mag. iur.

Research Assistant at the Institute for German, European, and International Family Law, University of Bonn, Germany

Dr. Alice Margaria, LL.M.

Senior Research Fellow at the Law and Anthropology Department of the Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology Halle (Saale), Germany

Prof. em. Dr. Dieter Martiny

Emeritus Professor at the European University Viadrina Frankfurt (Oder), Affiliate at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative and International Private Law Hamburg, Germany

Prof. Dr. Dr. h.c. Johannes Masing

Professor of Public Law, Director at the Institute for Public Law, University of Freiburg, Former Justice at the German Federal Constitutional Court (First Senate), Germany

Prof. Dr. Dres. h.c. Angelika Nußberger, M.A.

Professor of Constitutional Law, Public International Law and Comparative Law,
Director at the Academy for European Human Rights Protection, University
of Cologne, Former Vice President at the European Court of Human Rights,
Germany

Prof. Dr. Christa Rautenbach

Professor of Law, North-West University in Potchefstroom, Chair of the Advisory
Committee of Project 144 of the South African Law Reform Commission,
South Africa

Prof. Dr. Paula Távora Vítor

Professor at the Faculty of Law, Researcher of the Family Law Center and of the
Institute for Legal Research (IJ | UCILeR), University of Coimbra, Portugal

Assoz. Prof. PD Mag. Dr. Sascha Trültzsch-Wijnen

Professor at the Department of Communication Studies, University of Salzburg,
Austria

Dr. Cathérine Van de Graaf

Postdoctoral Researcher at the Academy for European Human Rights Protection,
University of Cologne, Germany

Dr. Paul Venzo

Senior Lecturer in Writing and Literature at the School of Communications
and Creative Arts, Faculty of Arts and Education, Deakin University, Australia