

FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS VIOLATIONS BY PRIVATE ACTORS AND THE  
PROCEDURE BEFORE THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 98

Cover design by Danny Juchtmans/ [www.dsigngraphics.be](http://www.dsigngraphics.be)

Cover illustration by Maaïke Canne/ [www.maaikecanne.com](http://www.maaikecanne.com)

A commercial edition of this dissertation will be published by Intersentia under ISBN 978-1-83970-283-9

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in an automated data system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission from the author/publisher.



# **Fundamental rights violations by private actors and the procedure before the European Court of Human Rights**

A study of verticalised cases

**Grondrechtenschendingen door private partijen en de  
procedure bij het Europees Hof voor de Rechten van de Mens**

Een onderzoek naar geverticaliseerde zaken

(met een samenvatting in het Nederlands)

## **Proefschrift**

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor

aan de Universiteit Utrecht

op gezag van de rector magnificus, prof.dr. H.R.B.M. Kummeling,

ingevolge het besluit van het college voor promoties

in het openbaar te verdedigen op

vrijdag 30 september 2022 des ochtends te 10.15 uur

door

**Claire Marie Sophie Loven**

geboren op 28 maart 1993

te Roermond

Promotor:

Prof. dr. J.H. Gerards  
Prof. dr. C.M.J. Ryngaert

Beoordelingscommissie:

Prof. dr. A.C. Buyse  
Prof. dr. A.E.M. Leijten  
Prof. dr. C. van de Heyning  
Prof. P. Leach  
Dr. E. Bates

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I really enjoyed the last four years, the whole process that led to this book. This is for a large part owed to my supervisors, colleagues, friends and family. I like to compare this with music, which can also inspire you, help you to see things more clearly, put things into perspective, or just make things even more enjoyable than they already are.

First of all, I would like to thank my wonderful supervisors, Janneke Gerards and Cedric Ryngaert, who have been incredibly supportive over the last years. Janneke, I can hardly describe how your kindness, enthusiasm and unparalleled knowledge have helped and motivated me. I have still not figured out how you do it, but despite your busy schedule, you always made time to patiently discuss my research and thoughts and to give the most valuable feedback and advice. Cedric, I am thankful for your always instant willingness to read my work and your supportive comments, which helped me to not forget the broader picture. I would also like to thank the members of the assessment committee for their willingness and time to read and assess my dissertation.

Thanks to my colleagues and former colleagues at Utrecht University, I could write my PhD among and supported by a group of wonderful people. In particular, I would like to mention Leonie, Manon, Melanie, Sim, Tim and, of course, Elif, one of my paranymphs. Although we did not know each other when we started our PhD at the very same day under the supervision of Janneke, we have been partners in crime ever since. I will never forget our first international conference together as well as many other PhD and non-PhD related activities including case law lunches, blog posts, concerts, dinners, baby visits and weddings.

Over the last four years, my beloved friends and family have offered welcome distraction and support. Nils and Cindy, my dear geographers, you are both very good in always being there, making me laugh and reminding me to not take life too seriously. I have lost count of all the (Christmas) dinners, board games, holidays, concerts, festivals and baking sessions, but each and every one of them was memorable and I hope that many more will follow. Jonas, due to some considerable distance, we do not see each other that often, but when we see (or call) each other it always feels like yesterday and we can keep talking for hours. You are also one of the persons that has always been truly interested in my research and expressed sincere belief in me making it to the finish line, for which I am grateful.

I am also grateful to my parents who have, both in their very own and unique way, supported and encouraged me to follow my own path. The same goes for my brother, Ta.

Together with Tania, you also bring some lovely Spanishness into my life. Finally, my sister, Cha. Asking you to be one of my paranymphs was one of the easiest decisions I had to make. You are a big sister in the best possible way, always helping and encouraging me while I stumble through life. Even more importantly, you are one of my dearest friends, and love (trail)running adventures as much as I do.

# CONTENTS

|                                                                                                     |    |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| <b>Acknowledgments</b> .....                                                                        | v  |
| <b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....                                                                           | 1  |
| <b>Chapter 1. Introduction</b> .....                                                                | 3  |
| 1. Setting the stage .....                                                                          | 3  |
| 2. Research aim and questions .....                                                                 | 8  |
| 3. Delineation of the scope of the research .....                                                   | 9  |
| 4. Research methods .....                                                                           | 11 |
| 5. Outline .....                                                                                    | 14 |
| <b>PART I.</b>                                                                                      |    |
| <b>INTRODUCTION TO THE CONVENTION SYSTEM</b> .....                                                  | 17 |
| <b>Chapter 2. Short History of the Convention System</b> .....                                      | 19 |
| 1. Introduction .....                                                                               | 19 |
| 2. Intentions behind the Convention system .....                                                    | 19 |
| 3. Legal obligations imposed by the Convention .....                                                | 23 |
| 4. The Convention and its enforcement mechanisms: from inter-State to individual applications ..... | 24 |
| 5. Conclusion .....                                                                                 | 33 |
| <b>Chapter 3. Guiding Convention Principles</b> .....                                               | 35 |
| 1. Introduction .....                                                                               | 35 |
| 2. Principle of effectiveness .....                                                                 | 35 |
| 3. Principle of subsidiarity .....                                                                  | 37 |
| 3.1. General background .....                                                                       | 37 |
| 3.2. Manifestations .....                                                                           | 40 |
| 3.2.1. No fourth-instance court doctrine .....                                                      | 41 |
| 3.2.2. Margin of appreciation doctrine .....                                                        | 44 |
| 3.2.3. Procedural review .....                                                                      | 48 |
| 3.2.4. Other manifestations .....                                                                   | 52 |
| 4. Conclusion .....                                                                                 | 53 |

|                                                                         |    |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| PART II.                                                                |    |
| VERTICALISED CASES UNRAVELLED .....                                     | 73 |
| <b>Introduction.</b> .....                                              | 75 |
| <b>Chapter 5. Horizontal Positive Obligations</b> .....                 | 77 |
| 1. Introduction .....                                                   | 77 |
| 2. Concept of positive obligations .....                                | 78 |
| 2.1. Introduction to the concept of positive obligations.....           | 78 |
| 2.2. Defining positive obligations.....                                 | 79 |
| 2.2.1. Principle of effectiveness .....                                 | 80 |
| 2.2.2. Fair balance test .....                                          | 81 |
| 2.2.3. Reasonable knowledge and means test.....                         | 83 |
| 2.3. Limits to the scope of positive obligations .....                  | 84 |
| 3. Horizontal positive obligations: an overview .....                   | 85 |
| 3.1. Protection against violence by private individuals .....           | 85 |
| 3.2. Protection of Convention rights in family relations .....          | 86 |
| 3.3. Positive obligations in relation to defamatory publications.....   | 87 |
| 3.4. Protection of one's surroundings .....                             | 88 |
| 3.5. Protection of one's property .....                                 | 89 |
| 3.6. Protection of Convention rights in contractual relationships ..... | 90 |



|                                                                                          |            |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 3.7. Protection of Convention rights in employer-employee relations. . . . .             | 90         |
| 4. Conclusion . . . . .                                                                  | 91         |
| <b>Chapter 6. Detailed Analysis of Verticalised Cases before the ECtHR . . . . .</b>     | <b>93</b>  |
| 1. Introduction . . . . .                                                                | 93         |
| 2. Origins of verticalised cases: underlying conflicts and involved parties . . . . .    | 94         |
| 2.1. Cases related to one's surroundings . . . . .                                       | 95         |
| 2.2. Right to reputation and private life versus freedom of expression cases. . . . .    | 96         |
| 2.3. Family life cases. . . . .                                                          | 98         |
| 2.4. Employer-employee cases. . . . .                                                    | 99         |
| 2.5. Conclusion . . . . .                                                                | 100        |
| 3. The Court's examination of verticalised cases . . . . .                               | 100        |
| 3.1. Cases related to one's surroundings . . . . .                                       | 101        |
| 3.2. Right to reputation and private life versus freedom of expression cases . . .       | 104        |
| 3.3. Family life cases. . . . .                                                          | 110        |
| 3.4. Employer-employee cases. . . . .                                                    | 116        |
| 3.5. Conclusion . . . . .                                                                | 120        |
| <b>Conclusion . . . . .</b>                                                              | <b>123</b> |
| <br>PART III.                                                                            |            |
| <b>PROBLEMS IN VERTICALISED CASES . . . . .</b>                                          | <b>125</b> |
| <b>Introduction. . . . .</b>                                                             | <b>127</b> |
| <b>Chapter 7. Problems that may arise during the Court's Proceedings . . . . .</b>       | <b>129</b> |
| 1. Introduction . . . . .                                                                | 129        |
| 2. Private actors . . . . .                                                              | 129        |
| 2.1. Defending acts, interests and rights: an analysis of the four case studies. . .     | 130        |
| 2.1.1. Cases related to one's surroundings . . . . .                                     | 130        |
| 2.1.2. Right to reputation and private life versus freedom of expression cases . . . . . | 130        |
| 2.1.3. Family life cases. . . . .                                                        | 131        |
| 2.1.4. Employer-employee cases. . . . .                                                  | 132        |
| 2.1.5. Concluding observations: consequences for procedural rights . . .                 | 133        |
| 2.2. Possible problems further explored . . . . .                                        | 134        |
| 3. Convention States and the ECtHR . . . . .                                             | 137        |
| 3.1. Convention States . . . . .                                                         | 137        |
| 3.2. The ECtHR . . . . .                                                                 | 139        |
| 4. Conclusion . . . . .                                                                  | 142        |

|                                                                                |     |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Chapter 8. Problems that may arise after the Court's Proceedings.</b>       | 143 |
| 1. Introduction                                                                | 143 |
| 2. Effects of a judgment for the disappeared party                             | 143 |
| 2.1. Article 46 ECHR and the nature of the Court's judgments                   | 145 |
| 2.1.1. The indication of general or individual measures by the Court           | 145 |
| 2.1.2. Impact of the indication of specific measures on the disappeared party  | 150 |
| 2.2. Execution process: practice at the domestic level.                        | 151 |
| 2.2.1. Cases related to one's surroundings                                     | 153 |
| 2.2.2. Right to reputation and private life versus freedom of expression cases | 153 |
| 2.2.3. Family life cases                                                       | 154 |
| 2.2.4. Employer-employee cases                                                 | 156 |
| 2.3. Conclusion                                                                | 157 |
| 3. Implications of a judgment for Convention States and the Court itself       | 158 |
| 4. Conclusion                                                                  | 161 |
| <b>Conclusion</b>                                                              | 163 |
| <br><b>PART IV.</b>                                                            |     |
| <b>TOWARDS A NEW APPROACH TO VERTICALISED CASES.</b>                           | 165 |
| <b>Introduction.</b>                                                           | 167 |
| <b>Chapter 9. Current Third-party Intervention Procedure</b>                   | 169 |
| 1. Introduction                                                                | 169 |
| 2. Procedural requirements                                                     | 169 |
| 3. Different types of third-party intervention                                 | 173 |
| 3.1. Amicus curiae interventions                                               | 174 |
| 3.2. Actual third-party interventions                                          | 177 |
| 3.3. Conclusion                                                                | 180 |
| 4. Influence of third-party interventions on the Court's judgments             | 181 |
| 5. Conclusion                                                                  | 184 |
| <br><b>Chapter 10.</b>                                                         |     |
| <b>Proposal to Redesign the Third-party Intervention Procedure</b>             | 187 |
| 1. Introduction                                                                | 187 |
| 2. Scope of a right to third-party intervention for actual third parties.      | 188 |
| 2.1. Personal scope                                                            | 189 |
| 2.2. Procedural scope                                                          | 192 |

|      |                                                                                       |            |
|------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 3.   | Additional Procedural Issues in Relation to a Right to Third-party Intervention ..... | 194        |
| 3.1. | Becoming aware of the Court's proceedings and the possibility of intervening .....    | 195        |
| 3.2. | Third-party submissions and the Court's reasoning .....                               | 197        |
| 4.   | Redesigned third-party intervention procedure in practice .....                       | 199        |
| 4.1. | Right to reputation and private life versus freedom of expression cases ..            | 200        |
| 4.2. | Family life cases .....                                                               | 201        |
| 4.3. | Employer-employee cases .....                                                         | 202        |
|      | <b>Conclusion .....</b>                                                               | <b>205</b> |
|      | <b>CONCLUSION .....</b>                                                               | <b>207</b> |
|      | <b>Chapter 11. Conclusion .....</b>                                                   | <b>209</b> |
| 1.   | Introduction .....                                                                    | 209        |
| 2.   | Characteristics of verticalised cases and the Court's approach to them .....          | 211        |
| 3.   | Problems in verticalised cases .....                                                  | 216        |
| 4.   | Towards a new approach to verticalised cases .....                                    | 220        |
| 5.   | Final remarks .....                                                                   | 223        |
|      | <i>Summary in Dutch .....</i>                                                         | <i>225</i> |
| 1.   | Inleiding .....                                                                       | 225        |
| 2.   | De aard van geverticaliseerde zaken en de aanpak van het EHRM .....                   | 227        |
| 3.   | Problemen in geverticaliseerde zaken .....                                            | 233        |
| 4.   | Naar een nieuwe aanpak van geverticaliseerde zaken .....                              | 236        |
| 5.   | Afsluiting .....                                                                      | 239        |
|      | <i>Bibliography .....</i>                                                             | <i>241</i> |
|      | <i>Appendix I: Overview case law sample .....</i>                                     | <i>253</i> |
|      | <i>Curriculum Vitae .....</i>                                                         | <i>257</i> |

