

FROM FORMAL TO MATERIAL EQUALITY

EUCOLATH
EUROPEAN CONTRACT LAW AND THEORY SERIES

Editorial Board

Prof. Dr iur. Dr phil. Stefan Grundmann, LL.M (Berkeley)
Professor of Private, Commercial and International Law at Humboldt-University,
Berlin, and Professor of Transnational Law and Theory at the European University
Institute, Florence (part-time)

Prof. Hugh Collins
Cassel Professor of Commercial Law at the London School of Economics, London,
and Fellow of the British Academy

Prof. Dr Fernando Gómez Pomar
Professor of Civil Law and Law and Economics at Universitat Pompeu Fabra,
Barcelona

Prof. Jacobien Rutgers
Professor in Private Law and Private International Law at the Free University (VU)
Amsterdam

Prof. Dr Pietro Sirena
Professor of Private Law at Bocconi University, Milan

FROM FORMAL TO
MATERIAL EQUALITY

Comparative Perspectives from History,
Plurality of Disciplines and Theory

Edited by

Stefan GRUNDMANN

Jan THIESSEN



INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Mews
Wellington Street | Cambridge
CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1223 736 170
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and
Rest of the World (incl. Eastern Europe)*
NBN International
1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley
Milton Keynes MK13 8LD
United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe
Lefebvre Sarrut Belgium NV
Hoogstraat 139/6
1000 Brussels
Belgium
Tel: +32 (0)800 39 067
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada
Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

From Formal to Material Equality. Comparative Perspectives from History,
Plurality of Disciplines and Theory

© The editors and contributors severally 2023

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: Composition with figures (detail), Hendrik Nicolaas Werkman, 1944 - Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam

ISBN 978-1-83970-277-8
D/2023/7849/3
NUR 822

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

CONTENTS

List of Authorsvii

From Formal to Material Equality: Key Insights from History and in a Multidisciplinary Perspective

Stefan GRUNDMANN 1

1. Introduction to Equality, History and Social Theory..... 1
2. Historical Stages of Materialisation 6
3. Materialisation of Equality and Social Theory 12
4. Materialisation via Social Impact Analysis 22
5. Conclusions 27

The Same Human Nature: Some Approaches to Equality in Law

Tilman REPGEN 29

1. Different Approaches to Equality in Law 29
2. Equality as a Legal Argument in Late Scholasticism 35
3. Yields 57

Two Centuries of Private Law Theory on Formal and Material Equality

Marietta AUER 63

1. Conceptual Foundations: Formal and Material Freedom and Equality 64
2. Enlightenment Foundations of Private Law: Innate Equal Freedom and the Primacy of Private Autonomy..... 66
3. Formal Equality as the First Level of the Private Law Problem of Equality 70
4. Special Norms of Equality and Anti-Discrimination Law as the Second Level of the Private Law Equality Problem 72
5. From Specific Norms of Equality to General Claims for Equal Treatment under Private Law? 75

| | |
|--|-----|
| Equal Dignity of Human Beings: The Philosophical and Methodological Foundations of Private Law | |
| Muriel FABRE-MAGNAN | 81 |
| 1. A Requirement for the Meaning of Words | 83 |
| 2. A Logical Condition | 84 |
| 3. A Question of Knowledge | 86 |
| Equality between Efficiency and Distribution: A Law and Economics Reconceptualisation of a Principle of Justice | |
| Andreas ENGERT | 91 |
| 1. Introduction | 91 |
| 2. The Distinction between Distribution and Efficiency | 92 |
| 3. Equality as an Implication of Efficiency | 96 |
| 4. Equality as a Principle of Distributive Justice | 104 |
| 5. Conclusion | 108 |
| Dimensions of Equality in Private Law: Translating between Law, Society and Technology | |
| Dan WIELSCH | 111 |
| 1. Introduction | 111 |
| 2. Society and Law: From Structures to Functions | 113 |
| 3. Relational Reformulation of the Principle of Equality | 116 |
| 4. Equality Rights and the Change of Social Practice | 122 |
| 5. The Right of Equality and its Function in Private Regulation | 137 |
| <i>Index</i> | 141 |

LIST OF AUTHORS

Marietta Auer

Director at the Max Planck Institute of Legal History and Legal Theory in Frankfurt, Germany; Professor of Private Law and Interdisciplinary Foundations of Law at the University of Giessen, Germany.

Andreas Engert

Professor of Private Law, Commercial, Company and Capital Markets Law, and Foundations of Law at Freie Universität Berlin, Germany; research member of the European Corporate Governance Institute (ECGI).

Muriel Fabre-Magnan

Professor at the University of Paris 1 (Panthéon-Sorbonne).

Stefan Grundmann

Professor of Transnational Law & Theory at the European University Institute in Florence, Italy; Professor of Private and Business Law at Humboldt-University in Berlin, Germany.

Tilman Reppen

Professor of Civil Law, History of German Law, Private Law in Modernity; Dean of the Faculty of Law at Universität Hamburg, Germany.

Dan Wielsch

Professor of Private Law and Legal Theory, University of Cologne.

