



strada lex

Activering van het boek online Identificatiecode



Indien u abonnee bent van Strada lex **www.stradalex.com**, Strada lex Luxembourg **www.stradalex.lu** of Strada lex Europe **www.stradalex.eu** kunt u gratis, met behulp van bovenstaande identificatiecode, toegang krijgen tot de elektronische versie van voorliggend boek*.

Mocht u moeilijkheden ondervinden bij het activeren gelieve dan contact op te nemen met onze helpdesk: **tel. : +32(0)2 548 07 20 • fax : +32(0)2 548 07 22 • info@stradalex.com**. U dient een aankoopbewijs van het boek voor te kunnen leggen.

De identificatiecode kan slechts éénmaal door één enkele gebruiker, geïdentificeerd als abonnee van Strada lex, geactiveerd worden. Eenmaal geactiveerd, kan het boek geraadpleegd worden binnen de modaliteiten van uw abonnement op Strada lex.

U bent nog geen abonnee op één van onze databanken en u wenst hierover meer informatie te ontvangen of een presentatie van één van onze vertegenwoordigers? Neem dan snel contact op via het e-mailadres info@stradalex.com.

**Onder voorbehoud van beschikbaarheid in één van de vermelde databanken. Ga naar www.larcier.com om na te gaan in welke databank(en) deze monografie toegankelijk is.*

THE PATIENT, DATA PROTECTION AND CHANGING HEALTHCARE MODELS

THE PATIENT, DATA
PROTECTION AND CHANGING
HEALTHCARE MODELS

The Impact of e-Health on
Informed Consent, Anonymisation
and Purpose Limitation

Griet VERHENNEMAN

 INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Mews | Wellington Street
Cambridge | CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 736 170
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and the rest of the world (incl. Eastern Europe):

NBN International
1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley
Milton Keynes MK13 8LD
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe:

Lefebvre Sarrut Belgium NV
Hoogstraat 139/6
1000 Brussels
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL60610
USA
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

The Patient, Data Protection and Changing Healthcare Models. The impact of e-health on informed consent, anonymisation and purpose limitation

© Griet Verhenneman 2021

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover design by Danny Juchtmans / www.dsigngraphics.be

Cover image by Dave Vandeput / www.davevandeput.com

ISBN 978-1-83970-124-5 (paperback)

ISBN 978-1-83970-125-2 (PDF)

D/2021/7849/60

NUR 822



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

What separates privilege from entitlement is gratitude – Brené Brown

The predominant feeling with which I write this acknowledgement is gratitude. Being a researcher has been an honour. It is heart-warming to look back and find so many amazing people who crossed my path, inspired me, supported me and brought me to the point where I am today. To my mentors, peers, friends and family, I would like to say thank you.

This publication results from the PhD thesis respectfully presented to the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Faculty of Law, to my promotor Prof. Dr A. Vedder and my co-promotor Prof. Dr H. Nys.

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
Introduction	1
PART I.	
CHANGING HEALTHCARE SYSTEMS	7
Chapter I.	
Societal and Technological Changes	13
Section 1. Patient empowerment	14
1.1. Moving away from the doctor-knows-best-approach	15
1.2. A trend towards patient data as a commodity	19
Section 2. Socio-economic changes	23
2.1. Demographic changes	24
2.2. Healthcare consumerisation	25
Section 3. ICT for health	26
3.1. Computerisation of society	28
3.2. Electronic health records	32
3.3. ePrescription	34
3.4. Telemedicine	35
3.5. Consumer health informatics	36
Chapter II.	
Personalised Healthcare	39
Section 1. Systems biology	39
Section 2. Personalised medicine	40
Section 3. Disease management	42
Section 4. P4 Medicine	43

PART II.	
THE PATIENT'S RIGHT TO DATA PROTECTION. UNDERSTANDING	
THE LEGAL CONTEXT	45
Chapter I.	
Understanding the Legal Roots	49
Section 1. The right to be let alone	50
Section 2. First codifications towards a patients' right to data protection	52
2.1. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights	53
2.2. The European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights.	54
Section 3. The Personal Computer and the first regulatory instruments on data protection	56
3.1. Informational self-determination in case law.	57
3.2. First regulatory instruments on data protection	58
Section 4. A maturing legal framework for data protection and patients' rights	61
4.1. The right to the protection of health-related data	61
4.1.1. Protection of health-related data by the ECtHR	62
4.1.2. Health-related data and the 1995 EU Data Protection Directive ...	62
4.2. The patient's right to data protection	63
4.2.1. The emergence of individual patients' rights	64
4.2.2. The Declaration on the Promotion of Patients' Rights in Europe	66
4.2.3. The Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Biomedicine.	67
Section 5. The new millennium: post-privacy, but pro data protection?	69
5.1. Post-privacy movement	70
5.2. Data protection next to privacy.	74
5.2.1. Data protection in the ECtHR case law	74
5.2.2. The fundamental right to data protection	76
5.3. A European Charter for Patients' Rights?	78
Section 6. A round of modernisation	79
6.1. Modernisation of EU data protection law	80
6.1.1. Convention 108+	80
6.1.2. The General Data Protection Regulation	81
6.2. Modernisation of the EU framework for patients' rights	83
Chapter II.	
Understanding the Concepts	87
Section 1. The patient	87
Section 2. Data protection	89
2.1. Data protection versus privacy	89
2.2. Data protection versus confidentiality.	91

Chapter III.	
Understanding the Subject of Protection	97
Section 1. Personal data	97
1.1. Any information	97
1.2. Relating to a natural person	98
1.3. Identified or identifiable	100
Section 2. Health-related data	101
2.1. Data concerning health	101
2.1.1. Health-related data in the ECtHR case-law	102
2.1.2. Health-related data in European data protection law	103
1) Data processing in the medical professional context	104
2) Data concerning health outside of the medical professional context	107
A. Data directly concerning the health of the individual	107
B. Data allowing health-related conclusions after processing	110
C. Suggestion for a clarification to the limitations to ‘data concerning health’ as a category of personal data	111
a. Content – purpose – result in the qualification as personal data	112
b. Content – purpose – result in the qualification of health-related data	114
2.2. Genetic data	116
2.2.1. Data concerning hereditary characteristics	117
2.2.2. Raw versus interpreted data	119
Interim Conclusions	123
PART III.	
PROTECTIVE AND EMPOWERING MECHANISMS IN EUROPEAN DATA PROTECTION LAW. AN ASSESSMENT OF INFORMED CONSENT, ANONYMISATION AND PURPOSE LIMITATION	127
Chapter I.	
Informed Consent, a Means to Empower the Patient?	133
Section 1. The concept of informed consent	136
1.1. A fundamental principle of bioethics	137
1.1.1. Autonomy	139
1.1.2. Informed consent in the patient-doctor relationship	141
1.1.3. Informed consent in the participant-researcher relationship ..	143
1.2. A much-used element of data protection law	146

1.2.1.	Informed consent in the data subject-data controller relationship	147
1.2.2.	General safeguard versus legal basis	150
1.2.3.	Opportunity to discuss fundamental issues	154
Section 2.	Informed consent as a legal basis for the processing of personal (health-related) data	157
2.1.	The legal bases for the processing of health-related data	158
2.2.	No ranking	162
Section 3.	Conditions for valid consent	164
3.1.	Requirements for adequate and genuine consent.	165
3.2.	Threshold elements	168
3.2.1.	Competence, the first threshold element	168
1)	Legally capable of acting	169
2)	Competent to consent	171
3.2.2.	Voluntariness, the second threshold element	173
1)	Freedom of choice	176
2)	Imbalance of power	179
3.3.	Information elements	180
3.3.1.	Disclosure of the information	183
3.3.2.	Understanding the information	189
1)	Increased complexity	192
2)	The tendency towards broad consent.	194
3.4.	Consent elements.	198
Interim conclusions.	200
Chapter II.		
The Obligation for Data Minimisation through Anonymisation		207
Section 1.	The concept of anonymisation in European data protection law	210
1.1.	The identified or identifiable person	212
1.1.1.	A combination of elements	214
1.1.2.	Held by the data controller or any other party	215
1.1.3.	Means reasonably likely to be used	217
1.2.	Anonymisation versus pseudonymisation	217
1.2.1.	Reversible or non-reversible	218
1.2.2.	Pseudonymised data are personal data	220
1.3.	Relative versus absolute approach.	223
Section 2.	Anonymisation considered against the backdrop of technological advancements	227
2.1.	Failure of anonymisation techniques.	228
2.2.	The impact of Big data	231
2.3.	The impact of personalised care	232
Interim conclusions.	235

Chapter III.

Protecting the Patient through Purpose Limitation 241

Section 1. Purpose specification 244

 1.1. A prerequisite in European data protection law. 245

 1.1.1. Purpose specification and lawfulness 248

 1.1.2. Purpose specification and data minimisation 252

 1.1.3. Purpose specification and transparency. 253

 1.1.4. Purpose specification and accountability. 256

 1.2. A prerequisite here to stay? 257

 1.2.1. Common understanding 259

 1.2.2. Reasonable expectations 260

 Interim conclusions. 264

Section 2. Use limitation. 266

 2.1. Primary versus secondary processing 267

 2.2. Compatible use 273

 2.2.1. Compatibility in European instruments on data protection. 275

 2.2.2. The compatibility assessment in the GDPR 278

 1) The link between the purpose of the primary use and further use 281

 2) The context of the data collection and the further use 283

 3) The nature of the data. 286

 4) The consequences for data subjects 288

 5) Appropriate safeguards 290

 Interim conclusions 293

 2.2.3. Presumed compatibility 294

 1) Scientific research, what is in the name? 296

 2) The roots of presumed compatibility for scientific research 298

 3) Presumed compatibility in the GDPR. 302

 A. Further processing for research purposes 302

 B. Appropriate safeguards for researchers 304

 C. Suggestions for appropriate measures in a risk-based approach. 306

 a. Risk level zero: anonymisation and independent review 307

 b. Risk level two: pseudonymisation, encryption and information 310

 c. Risk level three: encryption, information, access limitation and logging. 319

 4) The impact of presumed compatibility on the lawfulness of data processing 320

 A. The legal basis in case of compatibility 321

 B. Once consent, always consent 325

C. Once public interest, always public interest?	327
Interstitial conclusions	327
Section 3. The timing of the specifications	328
Interim conclusions	335
PART IV.	
CONCLUDING REMARKS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE FUTURE . . .	339
Section 1. Understanding the modern healthcare system and its impact on the patient as a data subject	
1.1. The context	341
1.2. The patient's right to data protection	342
Section 2. Conclusions	344
2.1. Informed consent	346
2.2. Anonymisation	347
2.3. Purpose limitation	351
Section 3. Recommendations for the future	353
3.1. Recommendations on informed consent	358
3.2. Recommendations on anonymisation	358
3.3. Recommendations on purpose limitation	360
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	361
<i>Bibliography</i>	365