

POPULIST CONSTITUTIONALISM AND
ILLIBERAL DEMOCRACIES

POPULIST CONSTITUTIONALISM AND ILLIBERAL DEMOCRACIES

Between Constitutional Imagination,
Normative Entrenchment and
Political Reality

Edited by
Martin BELOV



INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Mews
Wellington Street | Cambridge
CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1223 736 170
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and
Rest of the World (incl. Eastern Europe)*
NBN International
1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley
Milton Keynes MK13 8LD
United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe
Lefebvre Sarrut Belgium NV
Hoogstraat 139/6
1000 Brussels
Belgium
Tel: +32 (0)800 39 067
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada
Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Populist Constitutionalism and Illiberal Democracies. Between
Constitutional Imagination, Normative Entrenchment and Political Reality
© The editor and contributors severally 2021

The editor and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: © EyeEm / Alamy Stock Photo

ISBN 978-1-83970-060-6
D/2021/7849/7
NUR 820

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

To My Wife Teodora with Love and Admiration

CONTENTS

<i>List of Contributors</i>	xiii
-----------------------------------	------

Introduction

Martin BELOV	1
--------------------	---

PART I. REPUBLICAN CONSTITUTIONALISM: THE ROLE OF PEOPLE IN RADICAL DEMOCRACY

The People and the Lawgiver in Political Foundings

Eoin DALY	13
1. Introduction	13
2. The Incapacity of the People as a Founding Agent	14
3. The Moral Perils of Political Founding	15
4. Political Action and Natural Harmony	19
5. A Contrast with Robespierre's Political 'Melodrama'	24
6. Conclusion	29

Radical Democracy and Revolutionary Reform: Looking for Solutions in Times of Democratic Disruption

Marcin KILANOWSKI	31
1. Introduction	31
2. The People	33
3. Towards Civil Society	35
4. Education	39
5. Institutions	42
6. Concluding Remarks	44

PART II. REASSESSING CONSTITUTIONAL PRINCIPLES
IN TIMES OF DEMOCRATIC RUPTURES

**The Invisible Separation of Powers and the Control of the
Central Political Power: Lessons from Hungary, Moldova
and Romania**

Zoltán POZSÁR-SZENTMIKLÓSY	49
1. Legal Institutions and Procedures Affecting the Separation of Powers	49
2. Theory and Practice	51
3. The Separation of Powers as a Complex System	52
4. Case Studies	59
5. Conclusions	75

**Rule of Law vs. Democracy: With Special Regard to the Case
of Hungary**

Zoltan J. TOTH	77
1. Introduction	77
2. Meanings of the ‘Rule of Law’	78
3. The Definition and the Content of Democracy	84
4. The Content Elements of Democracy	86
5. Democracy, the Rule of Law and the Constitutional Court’s Practice	90

PART III. POPULIST CONSTITUTIONALISM: DEMOCRACY
IN CRISIS

**The Degeneration of Contemporary Democracies as a
New Phenomenology of Constitutional Transition**

Angela DI GREGORIO	101
1. Definitions and Methodological Problems	101
2. The Doctrine on Illiberal Constitutionalism and Democracy	103
3. The Degeneration of Contemporary Democracies as a New Phenomenology of Constitutional Transition	108
4. ‘Degraded’ Democracies as an Intermediate Hypothesis between Democracy and Authoritarianism	110

5. Crisis of Liberal Democracy and Various Meanings
of ‘Democracy’ and ‘Constitutionalism’ 112

Between Law and Revolution: Is Populism Constitutional?

Gianmario DEMURO 117

1. Introduction. 117

2. Populism vs. Constitutionalism and Parliamentary
Democracy. 121

3. Populism as an Ideology Proliferates in Illiberal
Democracies 125

4. Conclusion: European Constitutional Identity has to Limit
Populism within the Internal State 127

**European Constitutional Order and Populist Legal Revolution:
A Challenge for Western Liberal Democracies**

Carlo Alberto CIARALLI. 129

1. The Rise of Populism in Europe 129

2. European Technocratic Democracy and Populist Direct
Democracy. 133

3. Populism as a ‘Stress Test’ for the European Legal Order 137

4. Italy as a Peculiar Case Study of Populism in Government 140

5. Concluding Remarks 143

**PART IV. POPULIST CONSTITUTIONALISM FROM THE
VIEWPOINT OF EMOTIONS AND CONSTITUTIONAL
IMAGINATION**

Populism, Constituent Power and Constitutional Imagination

Paul BLOKKER 149

1. Introduction. 149

2. Populist Constitutionalism 152

3. Constituent Power. 155

4. The Populist Imaginary 157

5. Popular Sovereignty versus Global Legalism 162

6. Legal Resentment or Populist Understandings of the Law 164

7. Concluding Remarks 169

Law and Emotions: Insights for the Study of Anti-Constitutional Populism

Julia WESOŁOWSKA 171

1. Introduction. 171
2. The Affective in the Legal. 173
3. The Myth of Irrationality 176
4. Are Constitutions Devoid of Emotions? 179
5. Too Much Emotion, or Not the Right Emotion? 181
6. Conclusion 183

PART V. CHALLENGES TO CONSTITUTIONAL DEMOCRACY IN TIMES OF COVID-19 CONSTITUTIONALISM AND BEYOND

The Role of Fear Politics in Global Constitutional ‘Ernstfall’:

Images of Fear under COVID-19 Health Paternalism

Martin BELOV 187

1. Introduction. 187
2. The Concept and Features of COVID-19 Constitutionalism 190
3. The Impact of COVID-19 on Constitutionalism, Constitutional Principles and Human Rights 203
4. Fear and Fear Politics in Constitutional Law and the Reformulation of Normalcy 206
5. Encoding Fear in Contemporary Constitutionalism Through Fear Politics 211
6. The New Paternalistic State: The Health Leviathan 218

Democracy and Human Rights in Illiberal Constitutionalism

Tímea DRINÓCZI and Agnieszka BIEN-KACAŁA 221

1. Introduction. 222
2. Illiberal Values and Collective Narcissism. 223
3. Illiberal Democracy 228
4. Relativisation of Human Rights 236
5. COVID-19 242
6. Conclusion 249

PART VI. THE SPREAD OF POPULISM AND ILLIBERAL
DEMOCRACY IN EUROPE

**Law, Revolution and Populism in Italy: The Path from Constitutional
Resentment to Constitutional Renaissance**

Monica BONINI 253

1. In Search of the Roots of Italian Populism 253
2. After World War II: The Sowing of a Dangerous Seed. 257
3. People and Democracy in the Italian Constitution 263
4. Italian Populism: A Threat to Constitutional Democracy?..... 268
5. Back to Piero Calamandrei: The Time has Come
for the ‘Promised Revolution’ 271

**Polish Constitutionalism under Populist Rule: A Revolution
without a Revolution**

Przemyslaw TACIK..... 275

1. Introduction. 275
2. What is a Revolution without a Revolution?..... 279
3. A Revolutionary Project before the Revolution: The 2010
Constitutional Draft 287
4. Effective Suspension of the Constitution. 291
5. A Revolution without a Revolution: Populist Disconnection. 296
6. Conclusions 299

**Representative Democracy in the Times of Populism: The Case
of the Polish Parliament as a Delegated Power**

Agnieszka BIEN-KACALA, Anna TARNOWSKA

and Wojciech WŁOCH 301

1. Introduction. 301
2. Constructing the ‘Chain of Delegation’ 302
3. From Representation to Discussion 307
4. From Discussion to Populism 310
5. Dysfunction of the ‘Chain of Delegation’ 314
6. Conclusion. 318

The Roots and Guises of Legal Populism in Russia: The *Narodniki*, Statism and Legalism of Soviet Law and the Political Theology of Ivan Ilyin

Wojciech ENGELKING 319

1. Introduction. 319

2. Russian Populism, the Guise of Ideology and the Anti-Gay Law 322

3. The Material Aspect: The Cult of the *Muzhik* 326

4. The Formal Aspect: Statism and Legalism of Soviet Law 330

5. The Material and Formal Aspect: The Political Theology of Ivan Ilyin 333

6. Conclusion 337

Bibliography 339

Index 377

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Martin Belov, Dr., is Professor in Constitutional and Comparative Constitutional Law at the University of Sofia ‘St. Kliment Ohridski’, Bulgaria. He is also Vice Dean of the Faculty of Law and is responsible for international relations and digitalisation of the education and scientific activities in the Faculty. He has been a visiting professor at many European universities, a project researcher at the Max-Planck Institute for European Legal History, Frankfurt am Main, Germany (2010–2012) and a visiting researcher at the Institute for Federalism, Fribourg, Switzerland (2014). He has published 18 books and more than 80 scientific papers.

Agnieszka Bień-Kacała is Professor in the Department of Constitutional Law, Faculty of Law and Administration at Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń, Poland. Her monograph on the sources of law was recognised as the best dissertation by the Chief of the Sejm Chancellery and the journal *Sejm Review* in 2014. Since 2015, she has been focusing on illiberal constitutionalism and has published, together with Professor Tímea Drinóczi, several works on this topic. Their newest co-edited book is *Rule of Law, Common Values, and Illiberal Constitutionalism* (Routledge, 2021).

Paul Blokker is Associate Professor at the University of Bologna, Italy, and a research coordinator at Charles University, Prague, Czech Republic. He is co-editor of the journals *Social Imaginaries* and *European Cultural and Political Sociology*. His most recent book (with Laura Guercio) is *Sociologia dei diritti umani* (Mondadori, 2020).

Monica Bonini is Associate Professor at the Università degli Studi di Milano-Bicocca, Italy. There, she is a member of several scientific committees, including the PhD committee, and teaches public law, communication law and policy and banking law. She is a visiting professor at the University of Konstanz, Germany, where she delivers courses on Italian constitutional law. Her research interests include public law,

comparative constitutional law and EU law. Professor Bonini has numerous publications in the above-mentioned scientific fields and is a member of many research groups in these fields.

Carlo Alberto Ciaralli is PhD in Constitutional Law and Post-Doctoral Research Fellow at the University 'G. d'Annunzio' of Chieti-Pescara, Italy. He obtained the international Master of Studies at the European Law and Governance School (ELGS) and is the author of several papers published in national and international scientific journals and reviews. His research topics concern the Italian and Spanish regional financial autonomy, the crisis of political parties and representative democracy in a time of globalisation and the rise of populism in Europe.

Eoin Daly is a lecturer in law at the National University of Ireland, Galway. His research focuses on the intersection between political theory and constitutional law, particularly republicanism, judicial review, Rousseau, secularism and France. He is the author of *Rousseau's Constitutionalism: Austerity and Republican Freedom* (2017) and *Religion, Law and the Irish State* (2012), as well as co-author of *The Political Theory of the Irish Constitution* (2015).

Gianmario Demuro (PhD in Public Law, Florence, Italy) is Full Professor of Constitutional Law in the Department of Law, University of Cagliari, Italy. He was Adjunct Professor at John Marshal Law School, Chicago, USA, where he taught EU regulation and governance (1999–2019). His research focuses on political systems, constitutional conventions, human rights and multilevel constitutionalism; in the field of human rights he co-edited W.B.T. Mock and G. Demuro (eds), *Human Rights in Europe. Commentary on the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union* (Carolina Academic Press, 2010).

Tímea Drinóczi is Professor in the Department of Constitutional Law at the Faculty of Law, University of Pécs, Hungary. She has been a visiting professor in several European universities, served as a professor at the Kenyatta University School of Law, Nairobi, Kenya (2018–2019) and regularly invited as an expert by OSCE ODIHR. Her research interests cover comparative constitutional change, illiberal constitutionalism, constitutional identity and the quality of legislation. Her newest co-edited book with Agnieszka Bień-Kacała is *Rule of Law, Common Values, and Illiberal Constitutionalism* (Routledge, 2021).

Wojciech Engelking is a PhD candidate at the University of Warsaw, Poland. His main areas of research are Carl Schmitt, Leo Strauss, states

of exception and the relationship between law and literature. He was a research fellow at Mainz University, Germany, Tel Aviv University, Israel, and Université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne, France. His works have been published in *History of European Ideas, Law, Culture and the Humanities* and *Państwo i Prawo*. He is also a novelist and columnist of the Polish edition of *Newsweek*.

Angela Di Gregorio is Full Professor of Public Comparative Law at the University of Milano, Italy. Her research interests include transition to democracy, democratic deterioration, constitutional justice, transitional justice and academic freedom. She is a member of many Italian and international lawyer's associations and is Editor-in-Chief of the journal *Nuovi Autoritarismi e Democrazie* (New Authoritarian Regimes and Democracies).

Marcin Kilanowski is Professor of Law at Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń, Poland. After completing his studies and research in philosophy and law at Nicolaus Copernicus University, Utrecht University, the Netherlands, Oxford University, UK, and Harvard University, USA, he was a visiting researcher and a visiting scholar at Freie Universität, Germany, The Institute for Social Research at Johann Wolfgang Goethe-Universität, Germany, Harvard University and Science-Po Ecole de Droit in Paris. Besides his previous work as a law tutor at Harvard College, teaching assistant at the Institute of Global Law and Policy at Harvard Law School and present work at Nicolaus Copernicus University, he worked as a member of the Prime Minister of Poland Working Group on Corporate Social Responsibility and in various ministries. His research focuses on the development of democracy, civil society, human rights and global governance.

Zoltán Pozsár-Szentmiklósy is Associate Professor of Constitutional Law at the ELTE Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest, Hungary. He is a member of the Advisory Board of the ICON-S CEE Chapter. He is a regular co-author of the Hungarian report of the annual Global Review of Constitutional Law, and author and co-author of chapters published in international volumes on the current challenges related to the separation of powers and constitutional adjudication. In his current research, he focuses on alternative interpretations of the separation of powers.

Przemysław Tacik is Assistant Professor at the Institute of European Studies of the Jagiellonian University of Kraków, Poland. A philosopher, lawyer and sociologist by education, he holds PhDs in philosophy (2014)

and international law (2016). In his academic work he combines both philosophical and legal perspectives, attempting to approach them from an interdisciplinary angle. His main fields of interest are international law, human rights law and EU law. He has authored three books: *Sociology of Zygmunt Bauman* (2012, in Polish), *The Freedom of Lights. Edmond Jabès and Jewish Philosophy of Modernity* (2019) and *The Accession of the European Union to the European Convention on Human Rights* (2017, in Polish), over 40 articles and one translation of a poetry volume (from French to Polish).

Anna Tarnowska, Dr. hab., is Assistant Professor in the Department of History of Legal and Political Thought and German Law at the Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń, Poland. Her main fields of interest are history of public law in Poland and in Germany, history of modern constitutionalism and history of administration and state structures. She was a member of an international group conducting research in the frames of the European Research Council Advanced Grant 'Reconsidering Constitutional Formation', headed by Professor Ulrike Müssig (University of Passau, Germany, 2014–2018). Since 2017, Dr Tarnowska has been involved as a head of project in the National Science Centre grant: Legislative delegation in a representative democracy (program OPUS 11).

Zoltan J. Toth, Dr., graduated in law from the University of Szeged, Hungary, in 2002. Since 2002, he has been working in the Faculty of Law at Károli Gáspár University, Budapest. He is also currently serving as a chief counsellor to the Constitutional Court of Hungary. Previously, his main research topic was the matter of capital punishment; now he studies the theoretical and practical aspects of constitutional adjudication and the issue of statutory interpretation. Altogether, he has published 14 books as author or co-author; the latest one is the monograph *Changing Attitudes Towards the Death Penalty: Hungary's Renewed Support for Capital Punishment* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2020).

Julia Wesółowska is a PhD candidate in the Department of Philosophy of Law and Legal Ethics of Jagiellonian University in Kraków, Poland. Her main research interests concern legal philosophy and legal realism: her work centres on the interactions between law and emotions (especially in tort law), as well as the relationships between law and religion. She is working on a dissertation concerning the legal and philosophical concept of harm and is conducting a research project funded by the National Science Centre of Poland concerning Polish courts' evaluation of emotional distress (2019).

Wojciech Włoch, PhD in philosophy (2012) and law (2017), is an assistant in the Department of Constitutional Law, Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń, Poland. His research interests focus on the philosophical and theoretical aspects of constitutional law. As part of his theoretical research, he studies I. Kant's thought and post-Kantian tradition, and investigates the concepts of democracy, constitution and the rule of law. In the field of legal research, he has used philosophical concepts to analyse legal phenomena. He is the Scientific Editor of the fifth volume of the Polish edition of collected works by I. Kant and author of the monograph on Kant's philosophy of law. His last book (2018) is devoted to the concept of constitution in the doctrines of H. Kelsen and J. Rawls and their importance for understanding the essence of the democratic system.

