

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF  
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

**VOLUME LXII**

**INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT**

**1 March 2014 – 22 May 2014**



**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF  
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

**VOLUME LXII**

**INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT**

**1 March 2014 – 22 May 2014**

**André KLIP/ Steven FREELAND (editors)**

**Victoria Häberle (assistant-editor)**

 **INTERSENTIA**

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd  
8 Wellington Mews | Wellington Street  
Cambridge | CB1 1HW | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 736 170  
Email: [mail@intersentia.co.uk](mailto:mail@intersentia.co.uk)  
[www.intersentia.com](http://www.intersentia.com) | [www.intersentia.co.uk](http://www.intersentia.co.uk)

*Distribution for the UK and Ireland:*

NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: [orders@nbninternational.com](mailto:orders@nbninternational.com)

*Distribution for Europe and all other countries:*

Intersentia Publishing NV  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21  
Email: [mail@intersentia.be](mailto:mail@intersentia.be)

*Distribution for the USA and Canada*

Independent Publishers Group  
Order Department  
814 North Franklin Street  
Chicago, IL 60610  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985  
Email: [orders@ipgbook.com](mailto:orders@ipgbook.com)

Please cite as: Judgment on the appeal of Mr Bosco Ntaganda against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber II of 18 November 2013 entitled “Decision on the Defence’s Application for Interim Release”, *Prosecutor v. Ntaganda*, Case No. ICC-01/04–02/06 OA, A. Ch., 5 March 2014 in Klip/Freeland ALC-LXII-9.

International Criminal Court

© The editors and contributors severally 2020

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover illustration: Elena Wijns

ISBN 978-1-83970-028-6  
D/2020/7849/126  
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

## CONTENTS

<b>Contents</b> .....	5
<b>Preface</b> .....	7
<b>Interim Release</b> .....	
Judgment on the appeal of Mr Bosco Ntaganda against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber II of 18 November 2013 entitled “Decision on the Defence’s Application for Interim Release”, <i>Prosecutor v. Ntaganda</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–02/06 OA, A. Ch., 5 March 2014. ....	9
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ušacka. ....	24
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Van den Wyngaert .....	33
Commentary <i>Kei Hannah Brodersen</i> .....	34
<b>Rights / Responsibilities of States</b>	
Decision on Prosecution’s Applications for a Finding of Non-Compliance pursuant to Article 87(7) and for an Adjournment of the Provisional Trial Date, <i>Prosecutor v. Kenyatta</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–02/11, T. Ch. V(B), 31 March 2014. ....	43
Decision on the Cooperation of the Democratic Republic of the Congo Regarding Omar Al Bashir’s Arrest and Surrender to the Court, <i>Prosecutor v. Al Bashir</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05–01/09, PT. Ch. II, 9 April 2014 .....	67
Commentary <i>Lachezar Yanev</i> .....	76
<b>Gaddafi Admissibility Judgment</b>	
Judgment on the Appeal of Libya against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I of 31 May 2013 entitled “Decision on the Admissibility of the Case against Saif Al-Islam Gaddafi”, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Senussi</i> , Case No. ICC-01/11–01/11 OA 4, A. Ch., 21 May 2014 .....	89
Separate Opinion of Judge Song .....	144
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ušacka. ....	152
Commentary <i>Steven Becker and Lucija Sokanović</i> .....	169
<b>Katanga Judgment</b>	
Judgment pursuant to article 74 of the Statute, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/07, T. Ch. II, 7 March 2014. ....	177
Minority Opinion of Judge Van den Wyngaert .....	499
Concurring Opinion of Judges Diarra and Cotte .....	569
Commentary <i>Miguel Manero de Lemos</i> .....	570
<b>Contributors and Editors</b> .....	611



## PREFACE

This is the sixty-second volume in the series ‘Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals’ (ALC) and contains the most important decisions of the International Criminal Court (ICC) handed down in the period 1 March 2014 – 22 May 2014. It is the ninth volume in the series containing decisions of the ICC. Given the increasing jurisprudential output of, and increasing number of cases before that court, a significant number of further volumes on ICC case law will be published in the series in the coming years.

This volume is in its approach and structure similar to the previous two volumes when we slightly changed our process. Thus, the book contains the full text of all the annotated decisions and judgements, including any separate, concurring and dissenting opinions, as well as annexes to the decisions. As with previous volumes, the Editors have ensured that the decisions are identical to the *written* original text, as issued by the ICC Press and Information Office, and which bears the signatures of the Judges, as only these can be considered as authoritative versions. In the course of our editorial work on this and previous volumes, we have occasionally discovered inconsistencies between the written original version of the decision and any available internet versions.

Although we are only able to include the full text of the decisions by reducing their original format, we wanted the reader to be able to identify the page number of the original text, which is placed in brackets [ ].

We are very pleased that a number of distinguished international law scholars were prepared to write interesting and stimulating commentaries regarding these decisions and believe that their contributions will add to the breadth of knowledge and understanding about the work of the ICC.

A few words regarding the selection of decisions in the ALC volumes are appropriate given the fact that we have decided to change the policy concerning the publication of judgements. In previous volumes, we selected all final judgements, rendered by both the Trial Chamber as well as by the Appeals Chamber in the same case. In view of the fact that more and more judgements deal with established case law, and in light of the space all the judgements cover in the series, we have decided no longer to select Trial Chamber judgements in cases in which there is already an existing Appeals Chamber judgement. The commentator to the latter judgement is invited to include a comparison of the Trial and Appeals Chamber judgements in his or her contribution. In doing so, we expect to be able to focus more on the key issues that are at stake in the case at hand. In addition, we expect to be able to publish the volumes sooner following the handing down of the relevant Appeals Chamber judgement.

With regard to other decisions, the existing policy will be maintained. This means that, additionally, we will continue to publish decisions taken at any stage of the proceedings that are important for other reasons: because they deal with a specific legal question, because they are representative of a specific type of decision, or because they enter new legal waters. As a result, we may not publish decisions in which issues have been decided in a way similar or identical to a decision that has already been selected.

Three decisions annotated in this volume deal with procedural matters – an Appeals Chamber decision on an application for interim release in the Ntaganda case and two decisions relating to the rights and responsibilities of States. The remainder of the volume address the two important judgements – the Appeals Chamber Judgement on Admissibility in the Gaddafi case and the Trial Chamber Judgement pursuant to Article 74 of the ICC Statute in the Katanga case.

Once again, we gratefully acknowledge the assistance of many people without whom we could not have completed this volume. These include the Press and Information Office of the ICC, which offered generous assistance in obtaining all the necessary copies of decisions, our publisher Intersentia, in particular Hans Kluwer, Tom Scheirs and Isabelle van Dongen, and also our excellent Assistant Editor, Victoria Haeberle.

Of course, we would again like to thank the distinguished authors for their commentaries on the decisions, and their cooperation throughout the process.

We hope that this volume will contribute to the further dissemination of the important work of the ICC, and that it will provide access to its decisions to practitioners, academics and students.

We continue to make every effort to maintain the high standard of previous volumes, and the Editors welcome feedback and suggestions as to how the ALC series can be continuously improved, so as to maximise its value to readers. The ALC is the largest case law series on international criminal jurisprudence in the world, and it is our on-going aim to make it as useful as possible to all persons interested in the work of the various institutions.

We therefore hope that you will find this volume to be a significant addition to your research resources in this ever more important area of international law.

André Klip and Steven Freeland

Maastricht / Sydney, July 2020

[andre.klip@maastrichtuniversity.nl](mailto:andre.klip@maastrichtuniversity.nl)

[s.freeland@westernsydney.edu.au](mailto:s.freeland@westernsydney.edu.au)