

PROTECTING TRANS RIGHTS IN THE AGE  
OF GENDER SELF-DETERMINATION



PROTECTING TRANS RIGHTS  
IN THE AGE OF GENDER  
SELF-DETERMINATION

*Edited by*  
Eva BREMS  
Pieter CANNOOT  
Toon MOONEN

 INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd  
8 Wellington Mews  
Wellington Street | Cambridge  
CB1 1HW | United Kingdom  
Tel: +44 1223 736 170  
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and  
Rest of the World (incl. Eastern Europe)*  
NBN International  
1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley  
Milton Keynes MK13 8LD  
United Kingdom  
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for Europe*  
Lefebvre Sarrut Belgium NV  
Hoogstraat 139/6  
1000 Brussels  
Belgium  
Tel: +32 (0)800 39 067  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

*Distribution for the USA and Canada*  
Independent Publishers Group  
Order Department  
814 North Franklin Street  
Chicago, IL 60610  
USA  
Tel: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985  
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Protecting Trans Rights in the Age of Gender Self-Determination  
© The editors and contributors severally 2020

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: Christina Rahm Art / Alamy Stock Photo

ISBN 978-1-83970-019-4  
D/2020/7849/64  
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

# CONTENTS

<i>List of Cases</i> .....	vii
<i>List of Authors</i> .....	xi

## **Introduction**

Eva BREMS, Pieter CANNOOT and Toon MOONEN .....	1
1. Gender Variation as a Human Rights Issue .....	1
2. Trans Rights in the Age of Gender Self-Determination .....	3
3. Book Overview .....	7

## **The Limits to Gender Self-Determination in a Stereotyped Legal System: Lessons from the Belgian Gender Recognition Act**

Pieter CANNOOT .....	11
1. The Legal Recognition of Gender Identity .....	13
2. Analysis of the Belgian Sex/Gender Registration Framework .....	22
3. Conclusion .....	52

## **From Assigning Sex to Affirming Gender: Remarks on an Ongoing Evolution Affecting Gender Identification**

Benjamin MORON-PUECH .....	55
1. Introduction .....	55
2. The Origin of Trans Difficulties Regarding Gender Identification .....	58
3. The Ongoing Shift from Sex Assignment to Gender Affirmation .....	64
4. Final Questions .....	68

## **The Insufficiency of Gender Recognition Acts: The Example of Schooldays in Norway**

Anniken SØRLIE .....	73
1. Introduction .....	73
2. Legal Gender Recognition for Children: The European Context .....	75
3. Being Transgender at School .....	80
4. A Look Forward .....	90

<b>Developments in German Civil Status Law on the Recognition of Intersex and Non-Binary Persons: Subversion Subverted</b>	
Jens T. THEILEN .....	95
1. Introduction .....	95
2. Developments in German Civil Status Law .....	97
3. Shifting Rationales for Legal Gender Recognition .....	108
4. Outlook .....	117
<b>Framing Equality: Debating Protected Grounds in the Field of Trans and Non-Binary Rights</b>	
Peter DUNNE .....	121
1. Introduction .....	121
2. Terminology .....	123
3. Background and Context .....	124
4. Disability .....	128
5. Sex .....	134
6. Trans-Specific Grounds .....	138
7. Conclusion .....	143
<b>‘True Sex’: The Law and Confirmation of One’s Sex</b>	
Petr AGHA .....	145
1. Introduction .....	145
2. Trans Identities in the Czech Context .....	147
3. Trans Identities from the Perspectives of Trans People .....	157
4. Identity Categories .....	162
5. Conclusion .....	166
<i>Index</i> .....	171

# LIST OF CASES

## INTERNATIONAL AND SUPRANATIONAL CASE LAW

### EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

ECtHR 22 October 1981, 7525/76, <i>Dudgeon v. the United Kingdom</i> , Series A no. 45 . . . .	27
ECtHR 17 October 1986, 9532/81, <i>Rees v. the United Kingdom</i> . . . . .	27, 64
ECtHR 27 September 1990, 10843/84, <i>Cossey v. the United Kingdom</i> . . . . .	27
EComm.HR, 9 September 1992, <i>Filip Reyntjens</i> , No. 16810/90 . . . . .	61
ECtHR 30 July 1998, 22985/93 and 23390/94, <i>Sheffield and Horsham</i> <i>v. the United Kingdom</i> . . . . .	27
ECtHR 11 July 2002, 28957/95, <i>Christine Goodwin</i> <i>v. the United Kingdom</i> . . . . .	5, 27, 64, 77, 111, 122, 125
ECtHR 12 June 2003, 35968/97, <i>Van Kück v. Germany</i> . . . . .	25, 27, 77, 111
ECtHR 23 May 2006, 32570/03, <i>Grant v. the United Kingdom</i> . . . . .	28
ECtHR 5 June 2009, 29002/06, <i>Schlumpf v. Switzerland</i> . . . . .	133
ECtHR 10 March 2015, 14793/08, <i>Y.Y. v. Turkey</i> . . . . .	27–28, 77, 111
ECtHR 12 May 2015, 73235/12 <i>Identoba and Others v. Georgia</i> . . . . .	126
ECtHR 6 April 2017, 79885/12, 52471/13, 52596/13, <i>A.P., Garçon</i> <i>and Nicot v. France</i> . . . . .	5, 27–28, 32–34, 41, 68, 77, 111, 133, 156
ECtHR 17 January 2019, 29663/16, <i>X v. the Former Yugoslav Republic</i> <i>of Macedonia</i> . . . . .	5, 27–28, 34–35
ECtHR 7 July 2020, 41701/16, <i>Y.T. v. Bulgaria</i> . . . . .	5

### COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION

<i>P v. S and Cornwall County Council</i> C-13/94 [1996] ECR I-2143 . . . . .	126, 135
Opinion of Advocate General Jacobs, C-423/04 [2005] . . . . .	136
<i>X, Y and Z v. Minister voor en Asiel</i> [2014] 2 C.M.L.R. 16 . . . . .	140

### EUROPEAN COMMITTEE OF SOCIAL RIGHTS

<i>Transgender Europe and ILGA-Europe v. the Czech Republic</i> , 15 May 2018. . . . .	33
--	----

## INTER-AMERICAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

IACtHR 24 November 2017, Advisory Opinion OC-24/17 . . . . . 6, 25, 125

## UN HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE

*G v. Australia* Communication No. 2172/2012 (CCPR/C/119/D/2172/2012)  
(UN HRC, 15 June 2017) . . . . . 126

## NATIONAL CASE LAW

### AUSTRIA

Verfassungsgerichtshof [Constitutional Court] (Austria) 15 June 2018, G 77/2018-9. . . . 49

### BELGIUM

Grondwettelijk Hof [Constitutional Court] (Belgium) 20 October 2004, 159/2004 . . . . 49  
Grondwettelijk Hof [Constitutional Court] (Belgium) 19 June 2019,  
99/2019 . . . . . 5, 12, 43, 68, 131  
Rechtbank Antwerpen [Tribunal Antwerp] (Belgium) 16 September 2019,  
19/1297/B . . . . . 42

### CANADA

*Commission des droits de la personne et droits de la jeunesse v. Maison des jeunes,  
CT and AT*, Québec Human Rights Tribunal (2 July 1998) . . . . . 134

### CZECH REPUBLIC

Judgment of the Municipal Court in Prague file No. 3 A 153/2017 of 14 May 2018 . . . . 152  
Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court No. 2 As 199/2018-37,  
dated 30 May 2019 . . . . . 152

### FRANCE

Cass. civ. (France), 4 May 2017, No. 16.17-189 . . . . . 62, 113



## GERMANY

Federal Constitutional Court of Germany, 1 BvR 3295/07 (11 January 2011) . . . . .	122
Federal Court of Justice, Decision of 22 June 2016, Appl. No. XII ZB 52/15. . . . .	99
Federal Constitutional Court of Germany, 2019/16 (10 October 2017) . . . . .	49, 131, 138

## HONG KONG

<i>W v. Registrar of Marriages</i> [2013] HKCFA 39. . . . .	122
---	-----

## INDIA

<i>National Legal Services Authority (NALSA) v. Union of India and others</i> Supreme Court of India, Writ Petition (Civil) No. 400 of 2012 (15 April 2014) . . . . .	122
--	-----

## IRELAND

<i>Hannon v. First Direct Logistics Ltd, Equality Tribunal of Ireland</i> (18 April 2011) . . . . .	128
<i>Foy v. Registrar General of Births, Deaths and Marriages (No 2)</i> [2007] IEHC 470. . . . .	122

## NEPAL

Supreme Court of Nepal, Writ No. 917 of the year 2064 BS (2007 AD) (21 December 2007) . . . . .	124
--	-----

## NETHERLANDS

Rechtbank Limburg [Tribunal Limburg] (the Netherlands) 28 May 2018, ECLI:NL:RBLIM:2018:4931 . . . . .	50
--	----

## PAKISTAN

Supreme Court of Pakistan, Constitution Petition No. 43 of 2009 (22 March 2011) . . . . .	124
---	-----

## SOUTH KOREA

Supreme Court of South Korea, En Banc Order 2004Seu42 (22 June 2006) . . . . .	122
--	-----

## UNITED KINGDOM

High Court of Justice (United Kingdom) 22 June 2018, CO/2704/2017 .....	50
Court of Appeal (civil division) 10 March 2020, <i>R on the application of Christie Elan-Cane v. Secretary of state for the Home Department</i> , EWCA Civ 363 .....	50

## UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

<i>MT v. JT</i> 355 A.2d 204 (N.J. Super. Ct. App. Div. 1976) .....	122
<i>Jean Doe v. Bell</i> 2003 WL 355603 (9 January 2003) .....	128
<i>Glenn v Brumby</i> : 'Extending Protection from Sex-Based Discrimination to Transsexuals in the Eleventh Circuit' (2012) 21 .....	136
<i>Macy v. Holder</i> No. 0120120821, 2012 WL 1435995 (E.E.O.C., 20 April 2012) .....	134
<i>Ashton Whitaker V. Kenosha Unified School District</i> (16-3522) [2017].....	90

## LIST OF AUTHORS

*Petr Agha*

Director of the Centre for Law and Public Affairs, Researcher at the Institute of State and Law, Czech Academy of Sciences, and Senior Lecturer at the Faculty of Law of Charles University in Prague, Czech Republic

*Eva Brems*

Senior Full Professor of human rights law at the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University, Belgium

*Pieter Cannoot*

Postdoctoral Researcher at ConstitUGent and the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University, and Visiting Professor at the University of Antwerp, Belgium

*Peter Dunne*

Senior Lecturer at the University of Bristol Law School, United Kingdom

*Toon Moonen*

Assistant Professor of constitutional law at ConstitUGent and the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University, Belgium

*Benjamin Moron-Puech*

Lecturer at the Laboratory of Legal Sociology, Panthéon-Assas University, Paris, France

*Anniken Sørli*

Associate Professor at Østfold University College, Faculty of Health and Welfare, Norway

*Jens T. Theilen*

Research Associate at Helmut Schmidt University, Hamburg, Germany

