

CULTURE IN THE STATE REPORTING PROCEDURE  
OF THE UN HUMAN RIGHTS TREATY BODIES

Human Rights Research Series, Volume 89.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

CULTURE IN THE STATE  
REPORTING PROCEDURE OF  
THE UN HUMAN RIGHTS  
TREATY BODIES

How the HRC, the CESCR and the  
CEDAWCee use human rights as a sword  
to protect and promote culture, and as a  
shield to protect against harmful culture

Vincent Willem VLEUGEL

 INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd  
8 Wellington Street  
Cambridge | CB1 1HW | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 736 170 | Fax: +44 1223 736 169  
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and Ireland:*

NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for Europe and all other countries:*

Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*

Independent Publishers Group  
Order Department  
814 North Franklin Street  
Chicago, IL60610  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1312 337 5985  
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Culture in the State Reporting Procedure of the UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies. How the HRC, the CESCR and the CEDAWCee use human rights as a sword to protect and promote culture, and as a shield to protect against harmful culture  
© Vincent Willem Vleugel 2020

Cover image: ImageZoo / Alamy Stock Photo

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

ISBN 978-1-83970-006-4 (paperback)  
ISBN 978-1-83970-009-5 (PDF)  
D/2020/7849/46  
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I can say with certainty that this research would never have started, and would certainly never have been finished, without the support and guidance that I received from many people.

First and foremost, I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisors, Yvonne Donders and Rosanne van Alebeek. Yvonne, you gave me the opportunity to do this research. I consider myself lucky for having you as my supervisor. If needed, you were always there for help and advice. But I am especially thankful for your optimism and motivational qualities. Somehow you always managed to give me the necessary confidence boosts, to find new energy to continue, and to keep going. Rosanne, without you I fear this book would have been a total mess. Numerous times I got lost in the overload of information I gathered, you helped me see the bigger picture.

I would like to warmly thank the members of the reading committee, Professor Ernst Hirsch Ballin, Professor Eva Brems, Professor Cees Flinterman, Professor Carla Zoethout, and Dr Maarten den Heijer, for taking the time to read my work, and for taking part in my defence. I want to say a special thank you to Professor Cees Flinterman, who – as a member of the Human Rights Committee – invited me to Geneva, and gave me the opportunity to see reality in all its complexity, also behind doors that would otherwise have been closed.

Thank you to my two roommates, Vladislav and Katrine. Your presence made PhD-life much more fun. Vlad, you became a good friend. I really enjoyed our café talks after yet another frustrating day at the office.

Thank you to all the colleagues that shared their PhD-journeys with me: Nienke, Isabelle, Natasa, Tim, Anne, Nik, Emma, Maarten, Chris, Heather, Vigjilenca, Enrico, Sanne, Berenice, Or, Stephan, Louwrens. Julie, sharing a supervisor creates a bond. Thanks for your help and support.

Thanks to my friends for always asking me about the (lack of) progress in my research, even when I did not want to talk about it. And thanks for subsequently distracting me from it. Thank you to my two paranymphs, Mien and Steve, for standing by my side on this special occasion.

I would like to thank my parents as well as my sister for always being there, no matter what. Maps, you gave me every opportunity to go where I want to go and to do what I want to do. Thanks for stimulating me to keep studying and discovering, and for keeping me grounded. Thanks for always pampering me when I come by.

Lastly, I want to say thanks to my two girls, who are everything to me. Marlies, thank you for believing in me, for being supportive, and for being you. Iris, I am so happy you are here.



# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	v
<i>Abbreviations</i> .....	xiii
Note on Citation Formats .....	xiv
Note on Grammar .....	xiv
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
1 Introduction .....	1
2 Purpose and Significance of the Study .....	5
3 Research Objective and Questions .....	9
4 Scope of the Research .....	10
5 Structure and Methodology of the Research .....	12
<b>Chapter 2</b>	
<b>Human Rights and Cultural Diversity. Between and Beyond Universalism and Cultural Relativism</b> .....	17
1 Introduction .....	17
2 Culture, Cultural Diversity, and Cultural Arguments .....	18
3 Cultural Values and Perspectives .....	22
3.1 'Western bias' .....	23
3.2 Arab/Islamic perspective .....	24
3.3 Asian perspective .....	26
3.4 African perspective .....	29
4 Universalism and Cultural Relativism: the Dichotomy and Beyond .....	31
5 Concluding Remarks .....	40
<b>Chapter 3</b>	
<b>UN Treaty Bodies. Treaties, Committees, Working Methods</b> .....	43
1 Introduction .....	43
2 The Treaties .....	43
2.1 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) .....	44
2.2 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) .....	45

2.3	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) . . . . .	46
2.4	Reservations . . . . .	47
3	The Committees . . . . .	53
3.1	Human Rights Committee (HRC) . . . . .	53
3.2	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR) . . . . .	54
3.3	Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAWCee) . . . . .	55
4	Working Methods . . . . .	56
4.1	State reporting procedure . . . . .	57
4.2	General comments and recommendations . . . . .	66
4.3	Strengthening and enhancing the effective functioning of the treaty body system . . . . .	68
5	Legal Status Treaty Body Output . . . . .	69
6	Legitimacy Challenges . . . . .	71
7	Treaty Bodies' Roles in Reconciling Universality and Diversity . . . . .	74
8	Concluding Remarks . . . . .	76

## Chapter 4

	<b>Human Rights as a Sword. To Protect and Promote Cultural Diversity . . . . .</b>	<b>79</b>
1	Introduction . . . . .	79
2	Cultural Exclusivity: Protecting and Promoting Cultural Distinctiveness and Exclusivity . . . . .	81
2.1	HRC . . . . .	82
2.1.1	Right to self-determination . . . . .	82
2.1.2	Right of members of minorities to enjoy their own culture . . . . .	84
2.1.3	Right to freedom of religion . . . . .	90
2.2	CESCR . . . . .	91
2.2.1	Right to self-determination . . . . .	91
2.2.2	Right to take part in cultural life . . . . .	95
2.3	CEDAWCee . . . . .	105
3	Cultural Inclusivity: Protecting Cultural Diversity through Non- Discrimination and Equality Provisions . . . . .	107
3.1	Non-discrimination and the enjoyment of equality: some preliminary notions . . . . .	107
3.2	Right to be different: permanent measures to ensure equality by accommodating differences in treatment . . . . .	112
3.2.1	HRC . . . . .	112
3.2.1.1	Freedom of religion . . . . .	113
3.2.1.2	Fair trial . . . . .	113
3.2.2	CESCR . . . . .	114
3.2.2.1	Education . . . . .	114



3.2.2.2	Health .....	118
3.2.2.3	Adequate standard of living .....	120
3.2.2.4	Social security .....	122
3.2.3	CEDAWCee.....	123
3.2.3.1	Education .....	123
3.2.3.2	Health .....	124
3.2.3.3	Access to justice.....	125
3.3	Right to be equal: temporary measures to ensure equality by eliminating differences in treatment .....	126
3.3.1	HRC .....	127
3.3.2	CESCR.....	134
3.3.3	CEDAWCee.....	140
4	Concluding Remarks.....	147

**Chapter 5**

**Human Rights as a Shield. To Protect against Harmful Aspects of Culture .....** 151

1	Introduction .....	151
2	State Party Obligations Linked to (Harmful) Culture.....	155
2.1	HRC.....	155
2.1.1	Discrimination on grounds of gender.....	155
2.1.2	Discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity .....	166
2.1.3	Discrimination against other vulnerable or disadvantaged groups.....	169
2.2	CESCR.....	171
2.2.1	Discrimination on grounds of gender.....	171
2.2.2	Discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity .....	186
2.2.3	Discrimination against other vulnerable or disadvantaged groups.....	188
2.3	CEDAWCee.....	190
2.3.1	Discrimination on grounds of gender.....	190
2.3.2	Discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity .....	224
2.3.3	Discrimination against other vulnerable or disadvantaged groups.....	225
3	Concluding Remarks.....	229

## Chapter 6

### Cultural Argumentation. The State Reporting Procedure as a Platform for

### Cross-Cultural Dialogue. . . . . 237

1	Introduction . . . . .	237
2	Cultural Arguments in the Discourse between States Parties and Committees	238
2.1	State party accepts need to change culture . . . . .	239
2.1.1	HRC . . . . .	241
2.1.1.1	Culture as ‘explanation’ for lack of progress . . . . .	241
2.1.1.2	Culture as ‘excuse’ for lack of compliance . . . . .	248
2.1.2	CESCR . . . . .	255
2.1.2.1	Culture as ‘explanation’ for lack of progress . . . . .	255
2.1.2.2	Culture as ‘excuse’ for lack of compliance . . . . .	259
2.1.3	CEDAWCee . . . . .	261
2.1.3.1	Culture as ‘explanation’ for lack of progress . . . . .	261
2.1.3.2	Culture as ‘excuse’ for lack of compliance . . . . .	267
2.1.4	Concluding Remarks . . . . .	271
2.2	State party defends the room for culture . . . . .	274
2.2.1	HRC . . . . .	275
2.2.2	CESCR . . . . .	282
2.2.3	CEDAWCee . . . . .	284
2.2.4	Concluding Remarks . . . . .	291
2.3	State party defends the culture . . . . .	292
2.3.1	HRC . . . . .	293
2.3.1.1	Culture is defended categorically . . . . .	293
2.3.1.2	Balancing of interests . . . . .	302
2.3.2	CESCR . . . . .	305
2.3.2.1	Culture is defended categorically . . . . .	305
2.3.2.2	Balancing of interests . . . . .	311
2.3.3	CEDAWCee . . . . .	312
2.3.3.1	Culture is defended categorically . . . . .	312
2.3.3.2	Balancing of interests . . . . .	322
2.3.4	Concluding Remarks . . . . .	325
3	‘Constructive Dialogue’ or ‘Destructive Contestation’? . . . . .	327
3.1	Illustrative cases . . . . .	328
3.1.1	Dowry . . . . .	328
3.1.2	FGM/C . . . . .	329
3.1.3	Polygamy . . . . .	331
3.2	Lack of explanation and due consideration . . . . .	333
4	Concluding Remarks . . . . .	334

<b>Chapter 7</b>	
<b>Conclusions. How the Treaty Bodies Universalise Human Rights</b> .....	337
1 Introduction .....	337
2 UN Treaty Bodies' Role in Protecting and Promoting Positive Aspects of Cultural Diversity .....	338
3 UN Treaty Bodies' Role in Changing, Challenging and Eradicating Negative Aspects of Cultural Diversity .....	340
4 Cultural Arguments in the Dialogue .....	341
5 UN Treaty Bodies' Role in Enhancing Universal Legitimacy of Human Rights.....	344
6. Overall Conclusions and Recommendations .....	346
<i>Bibliography</i> .....	349
<i>Summary</i> .....	361
<i>Samenvatting</i> .....	369



## ABBREVIATIONS

AAA	American Anthropological Association
AHRD	ASEAN Human Rights Declaration
AIV	Advisory Council on International Affairs of the Netherlands
CAT	Committee Against Torture
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CEDAWCee	Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women
CERD	Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CRTF	Country Report Task Forces
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
FGM	Female Genital Mutilation
HRC	Human Rights Committee
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ILC	International Law Commission
LGBT+	sexual and gender identities, such as lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons
LOIPR	List of Issues Prior to Reporting
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
OIC	Organisation of Islamic Cooperation
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

## NOTE ON CITATION FORMATS

The primary material on which the dissertation relies is the Committees' concluding observations on State party reviews. Due to the large number of citations referring to concluding observations, a short form of citation to the concluding observations is used in the present work, similar to that used by Freeman, Rudolf and Chinkin in *The UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women. A Commentary*, and approved by the Oxford University Press.

## NOTE ON GRAMMAR

Specific Concluding Observations are written with capitals; when referring to concluding observations in general, it is written without capitals. Same for general comments and recommendations, and for summary records.

On sexual orientation and gender identity, the LGBT+ is referred to, except where the Committees are quoted.