

TOWARDS A REGIME OF RESPONSIBILITY
OF ARMED GROUPS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

Human Rights Research Series, Volume 90.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

TOWARDS A REGIME OF
RESPONSIBILITY OF ARMED
GROUPS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

Laura ÍÑIGO ÁLVAREZ

 INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Street
Cambridge | CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 736 170 | Fax: +44 1223 736 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL60610
USA
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Towards a Regime of Responsibility of Armed Groups in International Law
© Laura Íñigo Álvarez 2020

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover image: © Clive Watts / Alamy Stock Photo

ISBN 978-1-83970-004-0 (paperback)
ISBN 978-1-83970-005-7 (PDF)
D/2020/7849/102
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Throughout the writing of this book I have received a great deal of support and assistance from a number of people and institutions. Firstly, I would like to thank my supervisors, Prof. Dr. Cedric Ryngaert, Prof. Dr. Carmen Márquez Carrasco and Dr. Katharine Fortin. I am indebted to Prof. Dr. Carmen Márquez Carrasco for her constant support, motivation and guidance, and for giving me the opportunity to engage in this PhD journey that began at the University of Seville. I am also grateful to Prof. Dr. Cedric Ryngaert and Dr. Katharine Fortin for their willingness to co-supervise my thesis. Their expertise was invaluable in formulating the research topic and methodology. Besides my supervisors, I would like to thank the members of my reading committee, Prof. Dr. Joaquín Alcaide Fernández, Prof. Dr. Terry Gill, Prof. Dr. Seline Trevisanut, Prof. Dr. Gerd Oberleitner and Dr. Brianne McGonigle Leyh for their insightful comments and suggestions for improving my manuscript. To my paranymphs, Yulia Levashova and Solène Guggisberg, I owe a huge debt of gratitude. Thank you for your friendship and for standing by my side at every moment I needed. My appreciation also goes to Anna Ledvinka for editing and proofreading this book.

This work would not have been possible without the financial support provided by the University of Seville Research Plan and the EU Project FRAME during the first years of research; and the Postgraduate Fellowship from La Caixa Banking Foundation during the last two years I spent in Utrecht. Likewise, I am grateful for the funds provided by the Stimulation Fund for Dissertations from Utrecht University that assisted in organising the PhD ceremony. My sincere thanks also go to the Ius Commune Research School and the Netherlands Network for Human Rights Research for the training and feedback provided from several prestigious professors in the Netherlands. I also appreciate the feedback offered by the IHCL Platform at the Asser Institute, especially by Dr. Christophe Paulussen. In addition, I received generous support from the PhD Programme at the University of Seville Law School and its coordinator Prof. Dr. Fernando H. Llano Alonso.

I would also like to acknowledge my colleagues at the IER Department of Utrecht University and the Utrecht Centre for Accountability and Liability Law (UCALL) who supported me and were always willing to help. Special thanks go to Wen Duan, Julie Fraser, Maddalena Visser, Friederycke Haijer, Kai Liu, Congrui Qiao, Machiko Kanetake, Diana Odier-Contreras, Tao Tang, Andrea Minto, Mita Mulia, Marloes van Rijsbergen, Elmar Schmidt, Vivian Aiyedogbon, Laurens van Kreij and Hye-Min Kim. Likewise, I want to thank my colleagues from the Ius Commune training programme,

Elif Durmus, Charlotte Mol, Tim Bleeker, Tom Vos, Tom Verdonk, Andrew Sweeney, Friso Bostoën, Erin Jackson, Luisa Cortat, Pieter Gillaerts, and Niels Graaf for their warm encouragement and all the good moments we spent during those lunches and dinners. My appreciation also goes to my colleagues at the Department of Public International Law of the University of Seville and the Research Group SEJ055, Laura García, Luis Rodríguez-Piñero, Rocío Alamillos, Elisa Medici, Nora Loozen, Francisco A. Domínguez, Libia Arenal, Pablo Gavira, Cristina Zamora, Marta Bordignon, Simona Fanni, Daniel Iglesias and Paula Schmid.

My friends and colleagues from the summer course at the Hague Academy of International Law have been another important source of inspiration and encouragement throughout this journey, including Jorge Crespo, Tetevi Davi, Jamilla Abdulle, Landry Fentchou, Luisa Scarpelli, Paola Reyes, Ezéchiél Amani, Wiliander F. Salomão, Walter Arévalo, Carolina Soler, Xuexia Liao and Kimberley Graham, as well as the coordinators of the programme, Monique Legerman and Anna Vasilyeva. Moreover, I also want to offer my thanks to my friends in Seville, Olga González, Ana Espinós, Cristina Valverde, Jose Ignacio López, and Jose Emilio Fernández; and my friends in the Netherlands, Barbra Bodnar, Olga Sorkin, Manuel Álvarez, Hrvoje Greguric, Attila Gulyas, Raquel León, Chelsea Woit, Patricio Rogat, Eva Hureau, Carlos Ronda, Arno Koehler, Pedro J. Montaña, Kristian Lenger, and Amal Nassar. Friends are the family one chooses, and I am truly grateful to have had them by my side all these years.

Finally, and most importantly, I owe my deepest gratitude to my parents Guillermina and José Ramón. Thank you for teaching me the value of hard work and always supporting me in pursuing my goals. My life would not have been the same without your knowledge and your love towards arts and culture. This look back to my origins makes me recall a verse by the Sevillian poet Antonio Machado that was found in his pocket when he passed away: “Estos días azules y este sol de la infancia”.

Seville – Utrecht

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xiii

Chapter I.

Introduction	1
1. Introduction	1
1.1. The quest for responsibility of armed groups in international law	2
1.2. Beyond the State-centric system of international law	6
2. Aim and objectives	8
3. Terminology and scope of the study	9
3.1. The notion of armed groups	9
3.2. Violations of international law	10
3.3. Notions of responsibility	11
4. Research questions and methodology	12
5. Structure of the study	16

Chapter II.

The Necessity of a Responsibility Regime for Armed Groups in International Law ..	17
1. Introduction	17
2. The concept of responsibility	18
2.1. The evolution of international responsibility	20
2.2. The codification process of international responsibility	23
2.3. Philosophical and political science approaches to collective responsibility	28
2.4. Concluding remarks on the concept and evolution of responsibility	33
3. Current legal framework applicable to armed groups	34
3.1. Mechanisms addressing violations committed by armed groups	35
3.1.1. International criminal law	36
3.1.2. Truth seeking mechanisms	39
3.1.3. Naming and shaming	50
3.1.4. Sanctions	51
3.2. Academic discussion on the disconnection between primary and secondary rules	52

3.3.	Concluding remarks on mechanisms addressing armed groups' violations	56
4.	A responsibility regime for armed groups under international law: an assessment	57
4.1.	The responsibility gap and the rule of law	58
4.2.	Prevention of impunity and the right to reparation of victims of armed conflict	59
4.3.	The insufficiency of individual criminal responsibility	61
4.4.	Complementarity between individual criminal responsibility and state/collective responsibility	63
4.5.	Challenges of a responsibility regime for armed groups	65
4.6.	Concluding remarks on the assessment of a responsibility regime for armed groups	69
5.	Conclusions	70

Chapter III.

Developing a Responsibility Regime for Armed Groups in International Law 73

1.	Introduction	73
2.	The methodology of the ILC on secondary norms of international responsibility	75
2.1.	Lessons learned from the work of the ILC on international responsibility	78
3.	Analogical legal reasoning in relation to secondary norms on international responsibility and armed groups	81
3.1.	Analogies in international law: conditions, advantages and limitations	81
3.2.	Applying analogical legal reasoning to the conduct of armed groups	83
3.2.1.	Similarities and differences between the proposed cases	84
3.2.2.	Assessment: the object and purpose of the rules of international responsibility	88
3.3.	Concluding remarks on the application of analogical legal reasoning to the conduct of armed groups	90
4.	From traditional to non-traditional sources of international law	91
4.1.	The legal significance of the practice of armed groups	93
4.1.1.	Uncertainty about the normative value of the practice of armed groups	93
4.1.2.	The contribution of the practice of armed groups to customary international law	95
4.1.3.	The role of the practice of armed groups as an interpretative tool	100
4.1.4.	The possible contribution of the practice of armed groups to secondary norms on international responsibility	101

4.2.	The legal significance of non-judicial monitoring mechanisms.	102
4.3.	The role of interpretation in shaping and developing international law. .	105
4.4.	Concluding remarks on the legal significance of non-traditional sources of international law	106
5.	Finding a suitable methodology regarding the international responsibility of armed groups: a proposal.	108
6.	Conclusions.	109
 Chapter IV.		
Attribution of Conduct to Armed Groups.		111
1.	Introduction	111
2.	Attribution as a key element of international responsibility	112
2.1.	Rules of attribution for states.	114
2.2.	Rules of attribution for international organisations	117
2.3.	Towards the identification of core principles of attribution for collective entities	120
3.	Adjusting the core principles of attribution to the conduct of armed groups . .	122
3.1.	The issue of structural disparity of armed groups	122
3.1.1.	Military and political wing.	123
3.1.2.	Centralised and decentralised groups.	124
3.1.3.	Changes of structure over the course of time	131
3.2.	Concluding remarks on the adjustment of principles of attribution to armed groups	132
4.	Application of rules of attribution to armed groups	133
4.1.	Conduct of organs and/or agents of the armed group	133
4.1.1.	Do armed groups have organs and/or agents?	134
4.1.2.	Is the notion of membership of armed groups relevant for the purpose of attribution?	139
4.1.3.	Concluding remarks: agency based on a functional approach .	141
4.2.	Conduct directed and controlled by an armed group	143
4.2.1.	Conduct of individuals	145
4.2.2.	Conduct of factions and other entities associated with armed groups	146
4.2.3.	Concluding remarks: agency based on direction and control. .	148
4.3.	Acknowledgement of the conduct by the armed group.	149
4.3.1.	Examples from the practice of armed groups	149
4.3.2.	Conditions for the validity of the acknowledgement	152
4.4.	Key implications for the process of attribution of conduct.	153
5.	Conclusions.	153

Chapter V.

The Obligation to Provide Reparations by Armed Groups	157
1. Introduction	157
2. The notion and function of reparations in international law	159
3. Current legal framework of reparations for violations committed in armed conflict	161
3.1. International humanitarian law	162
3.1.1. UN Basic Principles and Guidelines on the right to a remedy and reparation for victims of gross violations of International Human Rights Law and serious violations of International Humanitarian Law (UNBPG)	165
3.1.2. The ILA Committee on the issue of Reparations for Victims of Armed Conflict	168
3.1.3. The Nairobi declaration on Women’s and Girls’ Right to a Remedy and Reparation	169
3.1.4. UN Commissions of Inquiry and other monitoring mechanisms	170
3.1.5. 2018 Report on Armed Non-State Actors by the UN Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary killings ..	171
3.2. International human rights law	173
3.3. International criminal law	174
3.4. Reparations at the domestic level	178
3.5. Concluding remarks on the framework of reparations for violations committed in armed conflict	181
4. The practice of armed groups regarding reparations	182
4.1. Peace agreements between armed groups and states	183
Philippines	183
Darfur (Sudan)	184
Uganda	184
Colombia	185
Central African Republic	186
4.2. Unilateral declarations by armed groups and symbolic reparations.	187
4.3. Codes of conduct and internal rulings of armed groups	189
4.4. Assessing the practice of armed groups	191
4.5. Challenges and limiting factors relating to reparations provided by armed groups	192
4.6. Concluding remarks on the practice of armed groups regarding reparations	194
5. Proposals for the progressive development of international law regarding armed groups and reparations	195
5.1. The obligation to provide reparation by armed groups and its legal basis	196

5.2. Broad interpretation of the notion of reparation and possible forms of reparation	200
5.2.1. Cessation and non-repetition	200
5.2.2. Restoration: restitution, compensation and rehabilitation	201
5.2.3. Access to information	201
5.3 Possible implementation mechanisms	202
6. Conclusions.	203
Chapter VI.	
Conclusions	205
1. Introduction	205
2. Towards a less state-centric system of international law	206
3. The necessity of a responsibility framework for armed groups under international law	207
4. Identifying a suitable methodology to the study of the international responsibility of armed groups	209
5. The attribution of conduct to armed groups as an essential element of international responsibility	211
6. The legal consequences of responsibility: the obligation to provide reparations by armed groups	213
7. Progressive development of international law and armed groups	216
8. Proposed avenues for further research.	218
9. Final remarks	218
<i>Bibliography</i>	221
<i>Table of Instruments</i>	239
<i>Table of Cases</i>	241
<i>Annex I: Peace and Ceasefire Agreements</i>	245
<i>Curriculum Vitae</i>	247

ABBREVIATIONS

ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples Rights
ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
AFRC	Armed Forces Revolutionary Council (Sierra Leone)
ANSAs	Armed Non-State Actors
AOGs	Armed Opposition Groups
ARIO	Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations
ASR	Articles on State Responsibility
ATCA	Alien Tort Claim Act
CDF	Civil Defense Forces (Sierra Leone)
CMAs	Civil/Military Administrators
DDR	Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ELN	Ejército de Liberación Nacional (Colombia)
EMC	Estado Mayor Central
FARC-EP	Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia – Ejército del Pueblo
FIS	Front Islamique du Salut (Algeria)
FMLN	Frente Farabundo Martí para la Liberación Nacional (El Salvador)
FSA	Free Syrian Army
GAM	Free Aceh Movement (Indonesia)
GMC	General Military Council
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICL	International Criminal Law
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Court for the Former Yugoslavia
IHL	International Humanitarian Law
IHRL	International Human Rights Law
ILA	International Law Association
ILC	International Law Commission
IRA	Irish Republican Army
JCE	Joint Criminal Enterprise
KLA	Kosovan Liberation Army
LRA	Lord’s Resistance Army

LTTE	Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam (Sri Lanka)
MILF	Moro Islamic Liberation Front (Philippines)
MLC	Mouvement de Libération du Congo
NDFP	National Democratic Front of the Philippines
NIAC	Non-International Armed Conflict
NPA	New People's Army (Philippines)
OCHA	UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
OHCHR	United Nations Office of the High Commissioner of Human Rights
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
RUF	Revolutionary United Front (Sierra Leone)
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
SLA	Sudan Liberation Army
SPLM/A	Sudan People's Liberation Movement/Army
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
UNBPG	UN Basic Principles and Guidelines on the Right to a Remedy and Reparations
UPC	Union de Patriotes Congolais
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties