

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF  
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

**VOLUME LXI**

**INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT**

**2012-2014**



**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF  
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

**VOLUME LXI**

**INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT  
2012-2014**

**André KLIP/ Steven FREELAND (editors)  
Victoria Häberle (assistant-editor)**

 **INTERSENTIA**

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd  
8 Wellington Mews | Wellington Street  
Cambridge | CB1 1HW | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 736 170  
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and the rest of the world (incl. Eastern Europe):*

NBN International  
1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley  
Milton Keynes MK13 8LD  
United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for Europe:*

Lefebvre Sarrut Belgium NV  
Hoogstraat 139/6  
1000 Brussels  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

*Distribution for the USA and Canada*

Independent Publishers Group  
Order Department  
814 North Franklin Street  
Chicago, IL 60610  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985  
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Please cite as: Decision on an Application for Leave to Appeal Submitted by the Defence of Abdullah Al-Senussi, *Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Senussi*, Case No. ICC-01/11–01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 28 August 2013, Klip/Freeland, ALC-LXI-11.

International Criminal Court 2012–2014  
© The editors and contributors severally 2020

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover illustration: Helena Boudrez

ISBN 978-1-83970-000-2  
D/2020/7849/130  
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

## CONTENTS

<b>Contents</b> .....	5
<b>Preface</b> .....	9
<b>Admissibility</b>	
Decision Requesting Further Submissions on Issues Related to the Admissibility of the Case against Saif Al-Islam Gaddafi, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Senussi</i> , Case No. ICC-01/11–01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 7 December 2012 .....	11
Commentary <i>Claire Boost</i> .....	23
<b>Issues Relating to Appeal / Leave to Appeal</b>	
Decision on the “Defence Application for Leave to Appeal the ‘Decision on the Defence Request for a Temporary Stay of Proceedings’”, <i>Prosecutor v. Banda and Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05–03/09, T. Ch. IV, 13 December 2012 .....	29
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Eboe-Osuji .....	39
Decision on an Application for Leave to Appeal Submitted by the Defence of Abdullah Al-Senussi, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Senussi</i> , Case No. ICC-01/11–01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 28 August 2013 .....	51
Judgment on the Appeal of the Prosecutor against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I of 3 June 2013 entitled “Decision Adjourning the Hearing on the Confirmation of Charges pursuant to Article 61(7) (c)(i) of the Rome Statute”, <i>Prosecutor v. Gbagbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/11–01/11 OA 5, A. Ch., 16 December 2013 .....	65
Decision on the Admissibility of the Appeal against the “Decision on the Application for the Interim Release of Detained Witnesses DRC-D02-P-0236, DRC-D02-P-0228 and DRC-D02-P-0350”, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/07 OA 14, A. Ch., 20 January 2014. ....	83
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Song .....	93
Commentary <i>Rebecca Heemsker</i> .....	97
<b>Reparations</b>	
Decision on the Admissibility of the Appeals against Trial Chamber I’s “Decision Establishing the Principles and Procedures to be Applied to Reparations” and Directions on the Further Conduct of Proceedings, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/06 A A2 A3 OA 21, A. Ch., 14 December 2012 .....	107
Commentary <i>Manon Bax</i> .....	130
<b>Stay / Termination of Proceedings and Withdrawal of Charges</b>	
Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Laurent Koudou Gbagbo against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I on Jurisdiction and Stay of the Proceedings, <i>Prosecutor v. Gbagbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/11–01/11 OA 2, A. Ch., 12 December 2012 .....	135
Decision on the Withdrawal of Charges against Mr Muthaura, <i>Prosecutor v. Muthaura and Kenyatta</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–02/11, T. Ch. V, 18 March 2013 .....	159
Partial Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ozaki and Concurring Separate Opinion of Judge Eboe-Osuji .....	165

Decision on Defence Application pursuant to Article 64(4) and Related Requests, <i>Prosecutor v. Kenyatta</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–02/11, T. Ch. V, 26 April 2013 . . . . .	177
Separate Opinion of Judge Ozaki . . . . .	202
Concurring Opinion of Judge Christine Van den Wyngaert . . . . .	203
Corrigendum of Concurring Separate Opinion of Judge Eboe-Osuji . . . . .	205
Decision on Defence Application for a Permanent Stay of Proceedings due to Abuse of Process, <i>Prosecutor v. Kenyatta</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–02/11, T. Ch. V(B), 5 December 2013 . . . . .	227
Concurring Separate Opinion of Judge Eboe-Osuji . . . . .	247
Commentary <i>Luca Poltronieri Rossetti</i> . . . . .	250

### Disqualification of Judges

Decision of the Plenary of Judges on the Defence Application of 20 February 2013 for the Disqualification of Judge Sang-Hyun Song from the case of <i>The Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo</i> , 11 June 2013. . . . .	259
Commentary <i>Michele Caianiello</i> . . . . .	273

### Change of Location of Proceedings

Decision of the Plenary of Judges on the Joint Defence Application for a Change of Place where the Court Shall Sit for Trial in the case of <i>The Prosecutor v. William Samoei Ruto and Joshua Arap Sang</i> , 26 August 2013. . . . .	281
Decision on the Defence Application to Vacate the Decision of the Plenary of Judges on the “Joint Defence Application for a Change of Place where the Court Shall Sit for Trial” in the case of <i>The Prosecutor v. William Samoei Ruto and Joshua Arap Sang, Prosecutor v. Ruto and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09-01/11, The Presidency, 6 September 2013 . . . . .	291
Commentary <i>Irene Milazzo</i> . . . . .	296

### Other Procedural Issues

Decision on Witness Preparation, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–01/11, T. Ch. V, 2 January 2013 . . . . .	307
Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judge Eboe-Osuji . . . . .	318
Decision on the Joint Defence Request for Leave to Appeal the Decision on Witness Preparation, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–01/11, T. Ch. V, 11 February 2013 . . . . .	335
Concurring Separate Opinion of Judge Eboe-Osuji . . . . .	342
Decision on the Protocol on the Handling of Confidential Information and Contact of Between a Party and Witnesses of the Opposing Party, <i>Prosecutor v. Banda and Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05–03/09, T. Ch. IV, 18 February 2013 . . . . .	345
Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Abdallah Banda Abakaer Nourain and Mr Salah Mohammed Jerbo Jamus against the Decision of Trial Chamber IV of 23 January 2013 entitled “Decision on the Defence’s Request for Disclosure of Documents in the Possession of the Office of the Prosecutor”, <i>Prosecutor v. Banda and Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05–03/09 OA 4, A. Ch., 28 August 2013 . . . . .	361
Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Germain Katanga against the Decision of Trial Chamber II of 21 November 2012 entitled “Decision on the Implementation of Regulation 55 of the Regulations of the Court and Severing the Charges against the Accused Persons”, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/07 OA 13, A. Ch., 27 March 2013 . . . . .	375

Dissenting Opinion of Judge Cuno Tarfusser . . . . .	398
Decision Transmitting Additional Legal and Factual Material (Regulation 55(2) and 55(3) of the Regulations of the Court), <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/07, T. Ch. II, 15 May 2013. . . . .	405
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Christine Van den Wyngaert . . . . .	415
Commentary <i>Alexander Heinze</i> . . . . .	426

### Victims

Decision on the Participation of Victims in the Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Banda and Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05–03/09 OA 4, A. Ch., 6 May 2013 . . . . .	443
Separate Opinion of Judge Sang-Hyun Song . . . . .	449
Decision on the Application by Victims for Participation in the Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Gbagbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/11–01/11 OA 4, A. Ch., 27 August 2013 . . . . .	451
Separate Opinion of Judge Sang-Hyun Song . . . . .	457
Commentary <i>Suzan van der Aa</i> . . . . .	458

### Responsibilities/ Rights of States

Decision on the “Urgent Application on behalf of Abdullah Al-Senussi for Pre-Trial Chamber to Order the Libyan Authorities to Comply with their Obligations and the Orders of the ICC”, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Senussi</i> , Case No. ICC-01/11–01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 6 February 2013. . . . .	465
Decision on the “Government of Libya’s Application for Leave to Appeal the “Decision on the Urgent Application on behalf of Abdullah Al-Senussi for Pre-Trial Chamber to Order the Libyan Authorities to Comply with their Obligations and the Orders of the ICC””, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Senussi</i> , Case No. ICC-01/11–01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 25 February 2013 . . . . .	473
Decision on Libya’s Postponement of the Execution of the Request for Arrest and Surrender of Abdullah Al-Senussi pursuant to Article 95 of the Rome Statute and related Defence Request to Refer Libya to the UN Security Council, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Senussi</i> , Case No. ICC-01/11–01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 14 June 2013. . . . .	481
Decision on the Requests for Leave to submit Observations under Rule 103 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–01/11 OA 5, A. Ch., 13 September 2013. . . . .	491
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ušacka. . . . .	496
Commentary <i>Michael Kelly</i> . . . . .	498

### Interim Release of Detained Witnesses

Decision on the application for the interim release of detained Witnesses DRCD02-P-0236, DRC-D02-P-0228 and DRC-D02-P-0350, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/07, T. Ch. II, 1 October 2013 . . . . .	503
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Van den Wyngaert . . . . .	514
Commentary <i>André Klip</i> . . . . .	520

### Presence of Accused at Trial

Decision on Defence Request for Conditional Excusal from Continuous Presence at Trial, <i>Prosecutor v. Kenyatta</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–02/11, T. Ch. V(B), 18 October 2013 . . . . .	531
---	-----

Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ozaki .....	559
Separate Further Opinion of Judge Eboe-Osuji .....	563
Judgment on the Appeal of the Prosecutor against the Decision of Trial Chamber V(a) of 18 June 2013 entitled “Decision on Mr Ruto’s Request for Excusal from Continuous Presence at Trial”, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–01/11 OA 5, A. Ch., 25 October 2013 .....	573
Joint Separate Opinion of Judge Kourula and Judge Ušacka .....	590
Commentary <i>Diletta Marchesi</i> .....	595
 <b>Review of Detention</b>	
Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Laurent Gbagbo against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I of 11 July 2013 entitled “Third decision on the Review of Laurent Gbagbo’s Detention pursuant to Article 60(3) of the Rome Statute”, <i>Prosecutor v. Gbagbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/11–01/11 OA 4, A. Ch., 29 October 2013 .....	605
Separate Opinion of Judge Kourula .....	631
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ušacka .....	632
Commentary <i>Rebecca Heemskerk</i> .....	637
 <b>Article 74 Judgment</b>	
Judgment pursuant to Article 74 of the Statute, <i>Prosecutor v. Ngudjolo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–02/12, T. Ch. II, 18 December 2012 .....	645
Concurring Opinion of Judge Van den Wyngaert .....	741
Commentary <i>André Klip</i> .....	763
 <b>Contributors and Editors</b> .....	 775



## PREFACE

This is the sixty-first volume in the series ‘Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals’ (ALC) and contains the most important decisions of the International Criminal Court (ICC) handed down in the period 1 December 2012 – 28 February 2014. It is the eighth volume in the series containing decisions of the ICC. Given the increasing jurisprudential output of, and increasing number of cases before that court, a significant number of further volumes on ICC case law will be published in the series in the coming years.

This volume is in its approach and structure similar to previous volumes. Thus, the book contains the full text of all the annotated decisions and judgements, including any separate, concurring and dissenting opinions, as well as annexes to the decisions. As with previous volumes, the Editors have ensured that the decisions are identical to the *written* original text, as issued by the ICC Press and Information Office, and which bears the signatures of the Judges, as only these can be considered as authoritative versions. In the course of our editorial work on this and previous volumes, we have occasionally discovered inconsistencies between the written original version of the decision and any available internet versions.

Although we are only able to include the full text of the decisions by reducing their original format, we wanted the reader to be able to identify the page number of the original text, which is placed in brackets [ ].

We are very pleased that a number of distinguished international law scholars were prepared to write interesting and stimulating commentaries regarding these decisions, and believe that their contributions will add to the breadth of knowledge and understanding about the work of the ICC.

A few words regarding the selection of decisions in the ALC volumes are appropriate given the fact that we have decided to change the policy concerning the publication of judgements. In previous volumes, we selected all final judgements, rendered by both the Trial Chamber as well as by the Appeals Chamber in the same case. In view of the fact that more and more judgements deal with established case law, and in light of the space all the judgements cover in the series, we have decided no longer to select Trial Chamber judgements in cases in which there is already an existing Appeals Chamber judgement. The commentator to the latter judgement is invited to include a comparison of the Trial and Appeals Chamber judgements in his or her contribution. In doing so, we expect to be able to focus more on the key issues that are at stake in the case at hand. In addition, we expect to be able to publish the volumes sooner following the handing down of the relevant Appeals Chamber judgement.

With regard to other decisions, the existing policy will be maintained. This means that, additionally, we will continue to publish decisions taken at any stage of the proceedings that are important for other reasons: because they deal with a specific legal question, because they are representative of a specific type of decision, or because they enter new legal waters. As a result, we may not publish decisions in which issues have been decided in a way similar or identical to a decision that has already been selected.

The decisions annotated in this volume cover a broad spectrum of the proceedings before the ICC. A number of decisions address pre-trial issues and preliminary matters, including those relating to the stay or termination of proceedings, withdrawal of charges, review of detention, admissibility, and the rights and responsibilities of States Parties to the ICC Statute, amongst others.

This volume also deals with a range of issues relating to the conduct of trial proceedings. The decisions in this group address a range of procedural and evidence-related issues, as well as those relating to victims’ rights, the presence of the accused during proceedings, and the interim release of detained witnesses.

In addition, this volume includes a decision addressing the issue of reparations in the *Lubanga* case, as well as the Judgement in the *Ngudjolo* case.

Once again, we gratefully acknowledge the assistance of many people without whom we could not have completed this volume. These include the Press and Information Office of the ICC, which offered generous assistance in obtaining all the necessary copies of decisions, our publisher Intersentia, in particular Hans Kluwer, Tom Scheirs and Isabelle van Dongen, and also our excellent Assistant Editor, Victoria Haeberle.

Of course, we would again like to thank the distinguished authors for their commentaries on the decisions, and their cooperation throughout the process.

We hope that this volume will contribute to the further dissemination of the important work of the ICC, and that it will provide access to its decisions to practitioners, academics and students.

We continue to make every effort to maintain the high standard of previous volumes, and the Editors welcome feedback and suggestions as to how the ALC series can be continuously improved, so as to maximise its value to readers. The ALC is the largest case law series on international criminal jurisprudence in the world, and it is our on-going aim to make it as useful as possible to all persons interested in the work of the various institutions.

We therefore hope that you will find this volume to be a significant addition to your research resources in this ever more important area of international law.

André Klip and Steven Freeland

Maastricht/ Sydney, August 2020