

UNFAIR TRADING PRACTICES IN THE FOOD SUPPLY CHAIN

UNFAIR TRADING PRACTICES IN THE FOOD SUPPLY CHAIN

Implications of Directive (EU) 2019/633

Bert KEIRSBILCK
Evelyne TERRY
(eds.)

 INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Street
Cambridge | CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 736 170 | Fax: +44 1223 736 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL60610
USA
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Unfair trading practices in the food supply chain. Implications of Directive (EU) 2019/633

Bert Keirsbilck and Evelyne Terryn (eds.)

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

ISBN: 978-1-78068-980-7 (hardcover)

ISBN: 978-1-78068-999-9 (pdf)

D/2020/7849/39

NUR 822

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

CONTENTS

Chapter 1.

Run-Up, Legal Basis and Scope of Application

Elisa PAREDIS and Bert KEIRSBILCK	1
1. Introduction	1
2. The run-up to the UTPD	3
2.1. Informational asymmetries and imbalances in bargaining power – from protection offered in B2C relations to B2B relations? ..	3
2.2. Imbalances in bargaining power in B2B vertical supply chains.	7
2.3. Protection against abuse of imbalances in bargaining power to ensure a fair living standard for farmers?	12
3. Legal basis	16
3.1. Justification	16
3.2. A Common <i>Agricultural</i> Policy for <i>non-agricultural</i> products and producers?	17
3.3. The principle of proportionality and the principle of subsidiarity... ..	20
3.4. Exclusion of possible expansions of scope – other legal basis possible?	23
4. Choice of instrument and scope of application.	26
4.1. General overview	26
4.2. Scope <i>ratione materiae</i> : sales of agricultural and food products... ..	28
4.3. Scope <i>ratione personae</i> : protection for suppliers from buyers with a stronger bargaining position	30
4.3.1. Imbalance in bargaining position: relative turnover scales. .	30
4.3.2. One-way street: obligations for the buyer only	33
4.4. Application to buyer or supplier outside the Union	35
5. Conclusion	36

Chapter 2.

Prohibited and Conditionally Permitted Unfair Trading Practices

Sofie DE POURCQ and Evelyne TERRYN	37
1. Introduction	37
2. Existing EU legislative framework	38
2.1. Late payment directive	38
2.2. Supply Chain Initiative	39

3.	Directive 2019/633/EU: prohibited unfair practices.....	40
3.1.	Introduction	40
3.2.	Practices include terms – the absence of contractual remedies	41
3.3.	Prohibited practices.....	42
3.3.1.	Payment term exceeding 30 or 60 days.....	42
3.3.1.1.	Consequences of late payments and remedies	44
3.3.1.2.	Value sharing clause	44
3.3.1.3.	Exemptions from the payment provisions of Directive 2019/633/EU	45
3.3.2.	Short notice order cancellation	46
3.3.3.	Unilateral and retroactive change of the supply agreement .	47
3.3.4.	Payments not related to the contract.....	48
3.3.5.	Payment for deterioration or loss	50
3.3.6.	Refusal of confirmation in writing	51
3.3.7.	Unlawful acquirement, use or disclosure of trade secrets..	51
3.3.8.	Hampering the exercise of contractual or legal rights.....	52
3.3.9.	Payment for the examining of customer complaints	53
3.4.	Conditionally permitted practices	53
3.4.1.	Payment for unsold products.....	55
3.4.2.	Payment for stocking, displaying, listing or making available on the market.....	55
3.4.3.	Payment for discounts.....	56
3.4.4.	Payment for advertising & payment for marketing	57
3.4.5.	Payment for staff for fitting-out premises used for the sale of the supplier’s products.....	58
4.	Conclusion	58

Chapter 3.

Enforcement in the Directive (Articles 4 to 11)

	Muriel CHAGNY	61
1.	Effectiveness in tackling unfair trade practices	62
1.1.	The device designed to overcome the fear factor	63
1.1.1.	Expanding the categories of right of action holders beyond the direct victim.....	63
1.1.2.	Encouraging enforcement through confidentiality of the complaints.....	64
1.2.	Designation of enforcement authorities for each Member State ...	65
1.2.1.	The institutional design.....	65
1.2.2.	The competence of the designated authorities.....	67
2.	The efficiency of tackling unfair trade practices.....	68
2.1.	The measures ordered by the authorities in charge of tackling UTPs	68

2.1.1.	Preventing and deterring ex ante	69
2.1.2.	Addressing ex-post UTPs consequences	69
2.2.	The necessary link with decisions from civil and criminal courts	70
2.2.1.	Coordination between civil remedies	70
2.2.2.	Coordination with criminal sanctions	71
3.	Conclusion	71

Chapter 4.

The Common Agricultural Policy and the Directive on UTPS in the Agricultural and Food Supply Chain. Ensuring a Fair Standard of Living for the Agricultural Community?

	Tom VERDONK	73
1.	Introduction	73
2.	The development and objectives of the Common Agricultural Policy	75
2.1.	History of the CAP	75
2.2.	Relevant Treaty provisions	76
2.3.	The development of the Common Agricultural Policy	78
3.	Ensuring a fair standard of living for the agricultural community	80
4.	Evaluation of Commission’s proposal	83
5.	Final comments	85

Chapter 5.

The Directive on UTP in the Agricultural and Food Supply Chain – a German Perspective

	Jochen GLÖCKNER	87
1.	The Scene – Real World Problems and the Legal Framework of the Commission’s Proposal	87
1.1.	Real World Problems as Identified by the Commission	87
1.2.	Reactions of the Directive on Unfair Trading Practices in Business-to-Business Relationships in the Agricultural and Food Supply Chain	88
1.2.1.	Minimum harmonization, Arts. 1(1), 9(1) UTPD	89
1.2.2.	Limited scope of application	90
1.2.3.	Specific provisions instead of a general clause, Art. 1(1) UTPD	90
1.2.3.1.	Conduct under a contract, Art. 3(2) UTPD	91
1.2.3.2.	Conduct in breach of a contract, Art. 3(1) UTPD	91
1.2.4.	Battling the “fear factor”, Art. 4, 6 UTPD	92
1.2.5.	Homogeneity, Art. 8 UTPD	92
2.	Backdrop under Existing German Law	93
2.1.	Contract Law Remedies	93
2.1.1.	Conduct under the contract, Art. 3(2) UTPD	93

2.1.2.	Conduct in breach of the contract, Art. 3(1) UTPD	94
2.1.3.	Remedies	96
2.2.	Unfair Competition Law Remedies	96
2.2.1.	Conduct under the contract, Art. 3(2) UTPD	97
2.2.2.	Conduct in breach of the contract, Art. 3(1) UTPD	97
2.2.3.	Remedies	97
2.3.	Competition Law Remedies	98
2.3.1.	Conduct under the contract, Art. 3(2) UTPD	99
2.3.2.	Conduct in breach of a contract, Art. 3(1) UTPD	103
2.3.3.	Remedies	103
3.	Summary and Critique	104
3.1.	Conservative Approach of the UTP Directive	104
3.2.	Limited Need of Adaptation of German law	104
3.3.	Some Observations	106
3.3.1.	Does a prohibition of unfair trading practices really come as a “free lunch”?	106
3.3.2.	Horizontal or sectoral approach?	107
3.3.3.	Ratio: sufficient consideration of economic dependence by turnover relation requirement?	108
3.3.4.	Substantive gaps in the proposal	108
3.3.5.	Public enforcement of Contract law?	109

Chapter 6.

French Regulatory Experiences with the Control of UTPs

Denis VOINOT	111	
1.	Introduction	111
2.	Economic and legal context	112
3.	UTPs and trade negotiation	113
4.	Sanctions for UTPs in Title VI of the Commercial code	115
5.	Conclusion	117

Chapter 7.

The Regulation of UTPs in the Food Supply Chain in the United Kingdom

Mateja Durovic	119	
1.	Introduction	119
2.	Development of the food supply chain fairness rules	120
3.	The scope of application of the GSCOP	121
4.	Prohibited practices by the GSCOP	122
5.	Supplier as the only protected party	123
6.	The assessment of the existing framework	127
7.	The Groceries Code Adjudicator and enforcement of the Code	129

8.	The Tesco case as the first case of investigations carried out by the GCA	131
9.	The Co-op case as the second case of investigations carried out by the GCA.....	132
10.	Conclusions: The need for reform of the exiting legal framework in the UK?	133

Chapter 8.

The Supply Chain Initiative. Its Origins, Purpose and Activities

	Michael HUTCHINGS	135
1.	Introduction	135
1.1.	The independent Chair of the SCI.....	136
2.	The role of the SCI in promoting good trading practices in the food supply chain.....	137
2.1.	Principles of Good Practice	137
2.2.	Inclusive approach.....	139
2.3.	Commitment and measuring success.....	140
2.4.	Triggering change – the SCI dispute resolution mechanism	140
2.5.	Impact at the national level	142
3.	Future outlook	143

Chapter 9.

Tackling UTPs – Belgian Farmers Thoughts About the Belgian

Experience with Self-Regulation

	Pieter VERHELST and Bert MEULEMANS	145
1.	Farmers' thoughts about unfair trading practices	145
1.1.	Unfair trading practices' associations – price and quality	146
1.2.	Unfair trading practices are a farmers' reality	146
1.2.1.	Type and occurrence of listed unfair trading practices... ..	146
1.2.2.	Where do unfair trading practices occur?.....	148
1.3.	Imbalance in the food chain	150
1.4.	Defining unfair trading practices	151
2.	Tackling unfair trading practices	152
2.1.	The farmers expectation	152
2.2.	From market regulation 1.0.....	155
2.3.	Over market regulation 2.0.....	155
2.3.1.	Belgian Supply Chain Initiative.....	156
2.3.1.1.	Code of conduct.....	158
2.3.1.2.	Dispute settlement	160
2.3.1.3.	Guidelines for inter-professional agreements... ..	163
2.3.1.4.	Inter-professional market access.....	164

2.3.2. Farmers assessment of the Belgian Supply Chain Initiative.	165
2.4. To regulation on unfair trading practices	166
3. Conclusion	167

Chapter 10.

Unfair B2B Trading Practices: General Outlook and Preliminary

Conclusions

Jules STUYCK	169
1. Introduction	169
2. The Nature of UTP Regulations	170
2.1. Where do we come from?	170
2.1.1. Fairness in commercial behaviour	170
2.1.2. Fairness in contractual relations	172
2.1.3. Competition	173
2.2. The Place of UTPs in the Law	174
3. The Effects of UTP Law	176
3.1. What are the effects of such regulations on competition and market structures, on costs and prices?	176
3.2. What is left of the freedom to contract?	177
3.3. Can national rules be frustrated by the rules of private international law?	177
3.4. Will heavily protected and regulated business in Europe survive in the global economy?	179
3.5. Is this the end of the responsible entrepreneur?	179
4. General Conclusion	180