

JUST MEMORIES

SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

The Series on *Transitional Justice* offers a platform for high-quality research within the rapidly growing field of transitional justice. The research is, of necessity inter-disciplinary in nature, drawing from disciplines such as law, political science, history, sociology, criminology, anthropology and psychology, as well as from various specialised fields of study such as human rights, victimology and peace studies. Furthermore, the research is international in outlook, drawing on the knowledge and experience of academics and other specialists in many different regions of the world.

The series is aimed at a variety of audiences who are either working or interested in fields such as crime and justice; human rights; humanitarian law and human security; conflict resolution and peace building. These audiences include academics, researchers, students, policy makers, practitioners, non-governmental organisations and the media.

All books published within the series are subject to a double-blind peer review by recognised authorities in the field.

The General Editors of the Series are:

- Prof. Stephan Parmentier (Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium)
- Prof. Jeremy Sarkin (NOVA University of Lisbon, Portugal)
- Prof. Elmar Weitekamp (University of Tübingen, Germany)
- Mina Rauschenbach (Université de Lausanne and University of Leuven) (Associate Editor)

The general editors receive the support from an Editorial Committee and an Advisory Board, consisting of internationally renowned academics and practitioners.

Published titles within this Series:

10. Bas van Stokkom, Neelke Doorn and Paul van Tongeren (eds.), *Public Forgiveness in Post-Conflict Contexts* (2012), 978-1-78068-044-6
11. Ilse Derluyn, Cindy Mels, Stephan Parmentier and Wouter Vandenhole (eds.), *Re-Member. Rehabilitation, Reintegration and Reconciliation of War-Affected Children* (2012), 97894-000-0027-4
12. Anne-Marie de Brouwer, Charlotte Ku, Renée Römkens and Larissa van den Herik (eds.), *Sexual Violence as an International Crime: Interdisciplinary Approaches* (2012), 978-1-78068-002-6
13. Estelle Zinsstag and Martha Albertson Fineman (eds.), *Feminist Perspectives on Transitional Justice: From International and Criminal to Alternative Forms of Justice* (2013), 978-1-78068-142-9
14. Josep M. Tamarit Sumalla, *Historical Memory and Criminal Justice in Spain. A Case of Late Transitional Justice* (2013), 978-1-78068-143-6
15. Catherine Jenkins (ed.), Max du Plessis (ed.), *Law, Nation building and Transformation The South African experience in perspective* (2014), 978-1-78068-184-9
16. Susanne Buckley-Zistel and Stefanie Schäfer (eds.), *Memorials in Times of Transition* (2014), 978-1-78068-211-2
17. Nico Wouters (ed.), *Transitional Justice and Memory in Europe (1945–2013)*, 978-1-78068-214-3
18. Agata Fijalkowski and Raluca Groseanu (eds.), *Transitional Criminal Justice in Post-Dictatorial and Post-Conflict Societies*, 978-1-78068-260-0
19. S. Elizabeth Bird and Fraser M. Ottanelli (eds.), *The Performance of Memory as Transitional Justice* 978-1-78068-262-4
20. Bo Viktor Nylund, *Child Soldiers and Transitional Justice*, 978-1-78068-394-2
21. Peter Malcontent (ed.), *Facing the Past: Amending Historical Injustices through Instruments of Transitional Justice*, 978-1-78068-403-1
22. Francesca Capone, *Reparations for Child Victims of Armed Conflict: State of the Field and Current Challenges*, 978-1-78068-438-3
23. Cheryl S. White, *Bridging Divides in Transitional Justice: The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia*, 978-1-78068-440-6
24. Jeremy Sarkin (ed.), *The Global Impact and Legacy of Truth Commissions*, 978-1-78068-794-0

For previous volumes in the series, please visit <http://tj.intersentia.com>

JUST MEMORIES

Remembrance and Restoration
in the Aftermath of Political Violence

Edited by

Camila DE GAMBOA TAPIAS

Bert VAN ROERMUND



INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Mews
Wellington Street | Cambridge
CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1223 736 170
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and
Rest of the World (incl. Eastern Europe)*
NBN International
1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley
Milton Keynes MK13 8LD
United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada
Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Just Memories. Remembrance and Restoration in the Aftermath of Political Violence
© The editors and contributors severally 2020

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: Author Jan Jordaan, title 'Hurt', medium Linocut, 1999. From the Universal Declaration of Human Rights – International Print Portfolio, Article 5, published by Art for Humanity, South Africa, 1999.

ISBN 978-1-78068-908-1
D/2020/7849/59
NUR 828



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This volume originates from a seminar of the same name convened by the editors at Tilburg University Law School in March 2014. The financial and organizational support, in particular from the Department of European and International Public Law and its staff, is gratefully acknowledged. Special thanks go to Michael C. Leach for copy-editing the various chapters of the present volume.

The editors would also like to thank SAGE Publications for their permission to republish Stewart Motha's text with minor changes, and Taylor & Francis Group for their permission to publish a rewritten text by Eldad Ben Aharon.

Camila de Gamboa Tapias and
Bert van Roermund
June 2020

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xi

Chapter 1. Introduction

Camila DE GAMBOA TAPIAS and Bert VAN ROERMUND.	1
1. Transitional Justice, Restorative Justice and Memory: A Conceptual Framework	4
2. Justice, Remembrance and a Politics of Closure.	9
3. Just Memories and a Politics of Disclosure	10

PART I. RESTORING TRUST

Chapter 2. The Duty to Remember a Violent Past: A Restorative (Re)Construction of Our Identity

Camila DE GAMBOA TAPIAS and Wilson HERRERA ROMERO.	21
1. Introduction	21
2. The Construction of Identity and Tradition	22
3. Agency, Identity, and the Duty to Remember.	25
4. The Perils of the Duty to Remember a Troublesome Past.	30
5. Transforming Negative Identities	39
6. Conclusion	41

Chapter 3. Forgiveness, Reconciliation and Justice

Carlos THIEBAUT.	45
1. Introduction	45
2. The Role of Forgiveness, Justice and Reconciliation in Harm Experiences	46
3. The Demand for a New Beginning: Forgiveness and Justice	52
4. The Voices of Forgiveness	57
5. The Forms and Processes of Forgiving.	60
6. Conclusion	65

**Chapter 4. Resentment and the Limits of a Politics of Memory:
Justice vs. Time**

Antonio GÓMEZ RAMOS	69
1. Introduction	69
2. Time and the Duty of Memory.....	70
3. Justice in Time: A Model for a Politics of Memory	71
4. Justice vs. Time: Resentment	76
5. Natural Time, Reflective Time and Forgiveness.....	82
6. Conclusion.....	85

PART II. RESTORING TRUTH

Chapter 5. Anamnesis – Or Reparation as Responsive Remembrance

Bert VAN ROERMUND	91
1. Introduction	92
2. “Never Again”: Three Overly Simple Strategies	92
3. Remembrance, History and Time	96
4. Anamnesis	102
5. Conclusion: Re-Reading “Never Again”	106

**Chapter 6. Reflections on the Work of the Truth and Reconciliation
Commission in South Africa: Memory, Counter-Memory
and Restorative Justice**

Anél MARAIS	113
1. Introduction	113
2. From Political Iniquity to Truth and Reconciliation	115
3. Truth and Truths.....	119
4. Untimely Meditations, Counter-Truth(s) and the Archive.....	123
5. Conclusion.....	132

**Chapter 7. “Begging to be Black”: Liminality and Critique
in Post-Apartheid South Africa**

Stewart MOTHÁ	135
1. Introduction: From Anti-Colonial Longing to Postcolonial Becoming.....	137
2. Becoming Minor.....	139
3. Becoming Sovereign.....	146
4. Liminality and Interconnectedness	149
5. Conclusion: Restoring Being-Becoming.....	155

PART III. RESTORING LAND

Chapter 8. Limitations to the Principle of *Restitutio in Integrum* and Full Reparations in Transitional Justice Contexts: What Reparation does not Repair

Beira AGUILAR RUBIANO	159
1. Introduction	160
2. The Development of the Field of Transitional Justice and the Model of Reparation	164
3. The Focus on Reparation with an Emphasis on the Restitution of Rights	169
4. Problems Regarding Land Restitution and Reparation	175
5. Conclusions	186

Chapter 9. Problems and Inconsistencies in the Protection of Women in the Colombian Land Restitution Process

Lina M. CÉSPEDES BÁEZ	191
1. Introduction	191
2. Women in Conflict: A Normative Category	194
3. The Colombian Land Restitution Process, a Case of Hybridization	197
4. The Gap between Sexual Violence and the Land Restitution Process	202
5. The Impact of an Imprecise Diagnosis: A Flattened Notion of Women in Conflict	206
6. Conclusion: Returning to Private Law?	214

Chapter 10. Letting Go and Creating New Opportunities in Palestinian Women's Words: "They' Entered and Took 'us'"

Fatma KASSEM	221
1. Introduction	221
2. A Meta-National Narrative	222
3. Contested Cities	226
4. Words as Expression of Power Relations	227
5. Micro–Macro Forms of Patriarchal Violence	230
6. Healing Wounds by Women's Agency	233
7. Familial National Formation	233
8. Conclusion	238

PART IV. RESTORING LAW

**Chapter 11. Legal Argumentation in Transitional Justice Adjudication:
A Land of New Arguments, a Land of New Law**

Juan Francisco SOTO HOYOS	243
1. Introduction	245
2. Transitional Justice Adjudication: A Theoretical Inquiry	247
3. Paving the Way for a Transitional Justice Adjudication Model	254
4. Testing the Model in Practice: “Colombia’s Land Restitution Process”	261
5. Conclusion	275

**Chapter 12. The Interplay between History, Tradition and Local
Agency in Shaping Rwanda’s Future: Beyond Gacaca**

Felix Mukwiza NDAHINDA	281
1. Introduction	281
2. Identity, Agency and Legitimacy in Post-Colonial Governance	283
3. <i>U Rwanda Rushya</i> : The Politics of Post-Genocide Reconstruction in Rwanda	285
4. <i>Ubutabera</i> or Justice in the Post-Genocide Landscape	289
5. <i>Kwibuka</i> or Memorialisation of Genocide Victims	293
6. Plurality of Transitional Processes in Shaping a “New Rwanda”	295
7. Managing the Past, Shaping the Future: An Appraisal	305

**Chapter 13. Unconventional Restorative Justice and the Diplomacy
of Closure: The Israeli Policy on the Armenian Genocide and the
Geopolitics of Memory**

Eldad BEN AHARON	313
1. Introduction	314
2. Conceptual Framework and Methodology	314
3. The Diplomacy of Closure	316
4. Early Years of Israel’s Armenian Genocide Policy (1983–1988)	321
5. Post-Cold War: Interim Period (1989–2000)	325
6. From the Millennium Onwards: Third Period (2001–2016)	329
7. Conclusion: The Two-Level Game and the Diplomacy of Closure	336

<i>Index</i>	341
--------------------	-----

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Beira Aguilar Rubiano is an assistant professor at the Escuela de Ciencias Humanas, Universidad del Rosario, Bogotá, Colombia.

Eldad Ben Aharon is a university lecturer at the Leiden University Institute for Area Studies; the Netherlands; he obtained his PhD at the Holocaust Research Institute, Department of History, Royal Holloway, University of London, United Kingdom.

Lina M. Céspedes Báez is a titular professor at the Facultad de Jurisprudencia, Universidad del Rosario, Bogotá, Colombia.

Camila de Gamboa Tapias is an associate professor at the Centro de Estudios sobre Paz y Conflictos, Universidad del Rosario, Bogotá, Colombia.

Antonio Gómez Ramos is an associate professor of philosophy at the University Carlos III, Madrid, Spain.

Wilson Herrera Romero is an associate professor at the Escuela Ciencias Humanas and director of the Center for Teaching Ethics and Citizenship – Phronimos, Universidad del Rosario, Bogotá, Colombia.

Fatma Kassem holds a PhD from the Department of Behavioral Sciences at Ben-Gurion University of the Negev in Beer Sheva, Israel.

Anél Marais is a lecturer at the School of Law and Criminology of Aberystwyth University, Wales, United Kingdom.

Stewart Motha is professor of law at Birkbeck School of Law, University of London, United Kingdom.

Felix Mukwiza Ndahinda is the director of Research, Policy and Higher Education (RPHE) at the Aegis Trust; an honorary associate professor at the University of Rwanda Law School; and a research fellow at Tilburg University, the Netherlands.

Juan Francisco Soto Hoyos is a professor at the Facultad de Jurisprudencia, Universidad del Rosario, Bogotá, Colombia, and a consultant at the Comisión Colombiana de Juristas.

Carlos Thiebaut is a professor of philosophy, focusing on contemporary moral and political philosophy in particular, at Universidad Carlos III, Madrid, Spain.

Bert van Roermund is professor of philosophy (em) in the Department of Public Law and Governance at Tilburg Law School, the Netherlands.