# EUROPEAN YEARBOOK ON HUMAN RIGHTS 2019

# This publication is supported by



## AUSTRIAN HUMAN RIGHTS INSTITUTE







United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization





UNESCO Chair in Human Rights and Human Security University of Graz, Austria



# EUROPEAN YEARBOOK ON HUMAN RIGHTS 2019

Edited by
Philip Czech
Lisa Heschl
Karin Lukas
Manfred Nowak
Gerd Oberleitner





Intersentia Ltd 8 Wellington Mews Wellington Street | Cambridge CB1 1HW | United Kingdom Tel.: +44 1223 736 170

Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International

Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road

Plymouth, PL6 7PP United Kingdom

Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331

Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv

Groenstraat 31 2640 Mortsel Belgium

Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21

Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada: Independent Publishers Group Order Department 814 North Franklin Street Chicago, IL 60610

Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985

Email: orders@ipgbook.com

# European Yearbook on Human Rights 2019

© The editors and contributors severally 2019

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: © Vectorstock - Danny Juchtmans

ISBN (NWV) 978-3-7083-1288-0 ISBN (Intersentia) 978-1-78068-854-1 D/2019/7849/131 NUR 828



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

NWV Verlag GmbH Seidengasse 9/OG 2/TOP 2.4

A-1070 Vienna

Tel.: +43 1 796 35 62-24 | Fax: +43 1 796 35 62-25

Email: office@nwv.at

www.nwv.at

## Scientific Advisory Board

Kalliope Agapiou-Josephides (Nicosia), Veronique Arnault (Brussels), Heiner Bielefeldt (Erlangen), Bojko Bučar (Ljubljana), Emmanuel Decaux (Paris), Koen De Feyter (Antwerp), Olivier De Schutter (Leuven), Andrew Drzemczewski (Strasbourg), Horst Fischer (Brussels), Jenny Goldschmidt (Utrecht), Felipe Gomez (Bilbao), Jonas Grimheden (FRA, Vienna), Gábor Halmai (Florence), Thomas Hammarberg (former CoE Commissioner for Human Rights), Enver Hasani (Pristina), Kirsten Hastrup (Copenhagen), Walter Kälin (Bern), Dzidek Kedzia (President, EIUC Board), Matthias C. Kettemann (Frankfurt), Renate Kicker (Graz), Morten Kjærum (Lund), Rumyana Kolarova (Sofia), Josip Kregar (Zagreb), Eva Maria Lassen (Copenhagen), Jean-Paul Lehners (Luxembourg), Paul Lemmens (Judge, ECtHR, Leuven), Peter Leuprecht (Montréal), Lauri Mälksoo (Tartu), Carmen Marquez-Carrasco (Sevilla), Fabrizio Marrella (Venice), Iulia Moțoc (Judge, ECtHR, Bucarest), Michael O'Flaherty (Director FRA, Vienna), Margot O'Salomon (LSE, London), Maria Teresa Pizzaro Beleza (Lisbon), Allan Rosas (Judge, ECJ), William Schabas (Middlesex), Alexander Sicilianos (Judge, ECtHR), Markku Suksi (Abo Akademi University), Engelbert Theuermann (Vienna), George Ulrich (Secretary General, EIUC), Mark Villiger (Judge, ECtHR), Knut Vollebæk (Oslo), Ineta Ziemele (Riga).

Intersentia V

# **EDITORS' PREFACE**

Dear readers.

The year 2018 has seen several human rights milestone events worldwide: at the international level the 70th anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights was widely celebrated, as was the 25th birthday of the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action, the result of the World Conference on Human Rights in Vienna 1993. But also at the national, the Austrian level (the European Yearbook on Human Rights (EYHR) is edited by the three major human rights institutes in Austria) several human rights jubilees have shaped the academic human rights discourse in 2018: Austria ratified the European Convention on Human Rights in 1958 (60 years); the two Covenants on Civil and Political and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in 1978 (40 years); and the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in 2008 (10 years). But despite all these long-standing human rights commitments which the international community and states have celebrated in 2018, human rights are still a topic of concern and their violation remains widespread despite the effusive affirmations by world leaders to respect, protect and promote human rights. The EYHR 2019 thus aims to continue to contribute to the academic debate on human rights and to raise awareness for topical human rights issues in Europe and beyond.

The editorial team – composed of representatives of the European Training and Research Centre on Human Rights and Democracy of the University of Graz (UNI-ETC), the Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights Vienna (BIM), the Austrian Human Rights Institute of the University of Salzburg and the Global Campus of Human Rights Venice - when selecting the contributions paid particular attention to the highest academic standard, gender balance and a concerted mix of contributions by well-established academics and 'newcomers' in the field of human rights research. As in the last years the EYHR 2019 remains structured around current human rights challenges the European institutions – i.e. the European Union (EU), the Council of Europe (CoE), and the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) – are currently facing. This year we introduced a new part dedicated to reports by special procedures of international organisations, reflecting the important work which is done in the field of monitoring human rights violations worldwide. Topical human rights issues beyond European borders are further addressed in the part 'Others'. Finally, the EYHR 2019 concludes with seven book reviews of recent publications in fields relevant for human rights developments in Europe 2018.

Intersentia Vii

With this edition we are again able to provide the reader with interesting, diverse and highly relevant contributions of highest academic quality and important first-hand information from inside the aforementioned institutions in the field of human rights 2018. Topics include all-time classics such as the right to freedom of expression or fair trial and tensions between security and the protection of human rights; attention is, however, also drawn to 'new' topics such as the rights of persons with disabilities or the rights of children to be heard in political processes, which are of increasing importance for all three organisations.

As mentioned, the EYHR 2019 takes off with the 'Topic of the Year', a contribution by Nils Muižnieks, the former Council of Europe High Commissioner for Human Rights who provides a very detailed, critical and personal account of the reactions of the CoE to the democratic backsliding in two CoE Member States, namely Poland and Hungary.

The subsequent part on human and fundamental rights issues in the EU is introduced by a contribution directly addressing one of the most decisive and policy-shaping developments at the EU level in the last two years, namely the Brexit. While whole books can be and are written on different issues related to the complicated separation of the UK from the EU, Colin Murray and Ben Warwick dedicate their contribution 'The Strange Case of Northern Ireland's Disappearing Rights in the EU-UK Withdrawal Negotiations', to the specific implications of the Brexit negotiations on the Northern Ireland question which not only has a huge impact on the political stability of the UK but also on the protection of fundamental and human rights in Northern Ireland.

While the UK struggles to end its relationship with the EU, the next contribution addresses how employers use the disabilities of employees to end working contracts quite quickly, often violating the principle of non-discrimination of persons with disabilities. David Gutiérrez Colominas in his contribution, 'Can Reasonable Accommodation Safeguard the Employment of People with Disabilities?', assesses how the duty to provide reasonable accommodation for people with disabilities which is enshrined in the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and the relevant EU non-discrimination framework provides an additional layer of protection of persons with disabilities at the workplace.

National security and the prevention of terrorism have been on top of the agenda for several years. Human and fundamental rights were and are often undermined and annihilated in the attempts of states to protect national security. Questions related to the oft-perceived as necessary trade-off between human rights and state security are addressed in the subsequent two contributions. First, Vigjilenca Abazi addresses in her contribution, 'Whistleblowing in Europe: A New Era of Legal Protections' the tension between the calls to protect the rights of whistleblowers and the interest of states to keep certain information internal and secret, and the progress which has been made at the level of the EU legal

viii Intersentia

framework to reconcile these two diverging interests. Second, Elspeth Guild and Elif Mendos Kuskonmaz in 'A Critical Take on Opinion 1/15: Is the Glass Half Full or Half Empty?' subsequently turns to human rights questions related to the retention and use of a vast amount of personal data and information about individuals in order to prevent terrorism by using the example of Passenger Name Records (PNR) and Opinion 1/15 by the Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU), striking down a draft international agreement between the EU and Canada on the transfer of the PNR data due to its shortcomings in complying with the human right to privacy afforded under EU law.

The remaining two contributions in the EU part, turn beyond EU borders and address human rights violations that occur extraterritorially but find their roots in the legal or political position of the EU or its Member States. Most topically, Adel-Naim Reyhani exemplifies in his contribution 'Absolute Rightlessness Sur Place through Excessive Externalisation' how the famous notion of Hannah Arendt 'the right to have rights' is eroded in the cooperation by the EU with Libya on migration resulting in an absolute rightlessness of refugees sur place through obstructing any attempt to access legal status in the EU. Extraterritorial human rights violations and how they can be addressed within the EU also play the main role in the contribution by Axel Marx, Claire Bright, Nina Pineau and Jan Wouters on 'Corporate Accountability Mechanisms in EU Member States for Human Rights Abuses in Third Countries'. By mapping all the relevant judicial proceedings that have already been brought before the courts of EU Member States, the contribution provides a crucial overview on how national judicial mechanisms may contribute to address claims involving human rights violations in third countries and thereby increase chances in holding EU based companies accountable.

From the EU level, the EYHR, in its second part, turns to relevant human rights developments at the CoE level. As in previous years, this part begins with a review of the jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) 2018 by Stefan Kieber.

The wide range of topics that have been addressed by the Court in 2018 is further reflected on by the contributions in the CoE part. It begins with Jeroen Temperman analysing and criticising in his contribution, 'Blasphemy and the European Court of Human Rights: A Small Step Forward, a Giant Leap Back' the developments the jurisprudence of the ECtHR in blasphemy and freedom of expression/religion cases has undergone in the course of the years starting from the *Handyside* case to most recent judgements such as *E.S. v Austria* and *Mariya Alekhina and Others v Russia* [*Pussy Riot*].

While the ECtHR has already struggled in finding a coherent line of argumentation in the field of blasphemy, it struggled even more in the field of same-sex marriage due to the sensitivity of the topic in certain CoE Member States. Accordingly, Masuma Shahid in 'How Do European Courts Deal with the Sensitive Topic of Same-Sex Marriage? An Analysis of the Case Law of

Intersentia iX

the ECtHR and the CJEU in the "Catch 22"-Field of Equal Marriage Rights' analyses and compares the approaches by the ECtHR and the CJEU and how their credibility, authority and legitimacy suffers while trying to reconcile the divergent views of Member States on equal marriage rights and in providing protection to LGBTIQ-persons suffering from human and fundamental rights violations.

The protection of the rights of persons with disabilities is also a topic in the CoE part and Delia Ferri and Andrea Broderick in 'The European Court of Human Rights and the Human Rights Model of Disability: Convergence, Fragmentation and Future Perspectives' analyse the most recent and contentious case law of the ECtHR on disability, and discuss the emerging and future perspectives regarding the influence of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities on the Strasbourg Court's jurisprudence.

While the rights of persons with disabilities are a fairly new topic to be found in the jurisprudence of the ECtHR, the right to a fair trial is an all-time classic and Article 6 ECHR the most heavily litigated provision of the Convention. Still, the case law of the Court and its recent jurisprudence in the field of fair criminal proceedings continue to provide food for thought and criticism as is shown by Ryan Goss in his contribution, 'The Undermining of Article 6 ECHR'.

The right to a nationality has become an increasingly debated topic considering that the number of stateless persons has seen a constant growth in the last years. Agnieszka Szklanna dedicates her contribution, 'The Right to a Nationality in Recent Case Law of the European Court of Human Rights and Council of Europe Bodies' Work' to the recent and growing case law of the ECtHR in this field and also sheds light on the approaches adopted by other CoE's bodies increasingly engaging in the field of statelessness and the right to a nationality.

In the last edition of the EYHR the relevance of the OSCE in the field of human rights was questioned due to its struggles in the human dimension area. However, this year's contributions to the OSCE part prove that the OSCE still plays a crucial and important role in this field, especially in some core areas such as the protection of journalists and the observation of democratic elections.

Accordingly, the OSCE part starts with a very detailed and insightful account of events within the OSCE leading to the adoption of the OSCE Ministerial Council Decision on Safety of Journalists in December 2018. Andrei Richter and Deniz Yazici in their contribution on the 'Pioneer Decision on Safety of Journalists in the Preceding Context' allow the reader to participate in the difficult process of finding consensus among OSCE states on the protection of journalists and provide them with valuable insights in this regard.

Subsequently, Svetlana Chetaikina and Vasil Vashchanka in their contribution 'If I Could I Would? International Electoral Standards and the Recommendations of Election Observers' turn to one of the core areas of competences of the OSCE in the field of the human dimension. While the role of the OSCE in the field

X Intersentia

of election monitoring is unchallenged, the standards used when drafting recommendations require, according to the authors, some further adaptations in order to ensure the credibility of the OSCE in the field of election monitoring.

As has been mentioned above, the rights of persons with disabilities became a major concern for all three human rights organisations in Europe in recent years. In line with the contributions in the EU and CoE parts, Anete Erdmane in her contribution on 'The Right to Political Participation of Persons with Disabilities' analyses how the right of persons with disabilities to political participation became increasingly strengthened recently and how organisations like the OSCE contributed to this process.

The last contribution in the OSCE part is the contribution by Anita Danka on the 'The Right of Children to Be Heard through Peaceful Protests'. In light of the recent 'Fridays for Future' mostly driven by young people and the controversies about it, Danka's contribution is highly relevant in placing the peaceful protest by children in the context of children's rights to freedom of assembly and freedom of expression.

As has already been pointed out, following the part on human rights developments within the three major human rights institutions a new part on 'Reports from the Field' has been introduced. It specifically aims to raise the awareness for reports by special procedures of international organisations and make their work in the field of monitoring human rights known to a wider public.

The Moscow Mechanism by the OSCE has been used only eight times since its introduction in 1992 and aims to seek clarification on situations of alleged human rights violations in an OSCE state through fact-finding missions by experts. Wolfgang Benedek was appointed as rapporteur for the situation of LGTBI persons in Chechnya. In his contribution he explains how the Moscow mechanism works, what difficulties he faced when drafting the report on the rights and protection of LGTBI persons in Chechnya and what conclusion he has drawn from the information he gathered in this regard.

The second report included in the EYHR 2019, is the report by the current UN Independent Expert on Foreign Debt and Human Rights, Juan Pablo Bohoslavsky on his mission to Ukraine. In his contribution he asks, 'A Human Rights Approach to Deal with Economic and Corruption Issues in Ukraine' and presents the major findings of his report which has been presented to the UN Human Rights Council in December 2018.

Next, the Yearbook turns to current human rights issues beyond European borders. As has been already mentioned, the year 2018 saw the 70th anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Due to its importance and the role the UDHR still plays in the field of human rights, we, the editors, decided to include a contribution exclusively dedicated to it. Julia Kapelańska-Pręgowska analyses in her contribution on 'The Legal Authority and Recognition of the

Intersentia Xi

Universal Declaration of Human Rights: Conceptions, Developments and Practice' the practical importance of the UDHR and its current legal weight in the field of human rights.

The effective protection of human rights requires as a precondition that people actually are aware of and know about the human rights they actually have. Thus, Barbara Santibanez in her contribution 'Teaching Human Rights at School: A Survey of Persisting Challenges to the Practice' underlines the importance of human rights education in schools, especially in times of increasing radicalisation of young people and assesses critically how well-established concepts of human rights education are reflected in human rights education policies and practices.

Even though the so called 'migration crisis' that kept European politics hostage in the last four years has been mitigated in terms of numbers of newly arriving people, migration remains one of the decisive topics at the national and also the European level. While the security paradigm still dominates the political discourse about migration, the human rights implications European and national policies have on migration remain severe. Francesca Cimino's contribution 'Human Rights Implications for Vulnerable Migrants in Light of the EU and Italian Migration Policies' addresses these human rights implications of European policies on particularly vulnerable persons such as victims of human trafficking in Italy.

From Italy, Mikhail Antonov in his contribution turns to Russia and asks: 'The Russian Constitutional Court as a Mediating Link Between Russian and European Law?' He describes how the role of the Russian Constitutional Court has changed over the years due to a changing self-perception of the Court which has also been influenced by wider political developments in Russia and beyond.

The editorial team would like to acknowledge the crucial financial support of the Global Campus on Human Rights to this publication. Furthermore, many thanks go to Reinmar Nindler, who was in charge of the book reviews and to Manuela Rusz, who took care of the formatting and harmonisation of the contributions. Without their precious help, the EYHR 2019 would not have been possible in the same form. Finally, particular thanks go to Tom Scheirs and Rebecca Moffat from Intersentia for the excellent cooperation on publishing this volume.

We hope that reading this Yearbook, which is unique in its focus and vocation, will not only help to better understand the rich landscape of the European regional human rights system but will also stimulate discussions and critical thinking about human rights developments.

Graz, Salzburg, Venice, Vienna – June 2019 Philip Czech, Lisa Heschl, Karin Lukas, Manfred Nowak, Gerd Oberleitner

XII Intersentia

# **CONTENTS**

Intersentia Xiii

Blasphemy and the European Court of Human Rights: A Small Step Forward, a Giant Leap Back
Jeroen Temperman
How Do European Courts Approach the Sensitive Topic of Same-Sex Marriage? An Analysis of the Case Law of the ECtHR and the CJEU in the 'Catch 22'-Field of Equal Marriage Rights  Masuma Shahid
The European Court of Human Rights and the Human Rights Model of Disability: Convergence, Fragmentation and Future Perspectives  Delia Ferri and Andrea Broderick
The Undermining of Article 6 ECHR  Ryan Goss
The Right to a Nationality in Recent Case Law of the European Court of Human Rights and Council of Europe Bodies' Work  Agnieszka Szklanna
PART IV. OSCE
Pioneer Decision on Safety of Journalists in the Preceding Context  Andrei RICHTER and Deniz YAZICI
If I Could I Would? International Electoral Standards and the Recommendations of Election Observers Svetlana Chetaikina and Vasil Vashchanka
The Right to Political Participation of Persons with Disabilities  Anete Erdmane
The Right of Children to be Heard through Peaceful Protests  Anita Danka
PART V. REPORTS FROM THE FIELD
OSCE Moscow Mechanism: Situation of Human Rights in Chechnya Wolfgang Benedek
A Human Rights Approach to Deal with Economic and Corruption Issues in Ukraine
Juan Pablo Bohoslavsky

XİV Intersentia

# PART VI. OTHERS

The Legal Authority and Recognition of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights: Conceptions, Developments and Practice  Julia Kapelańska-Pręgowska
Teaching Human Rights at School: A Survey of Persisting Challenges to the Practice  Barbara Santibanez
Human Rights Implications for Vulnerable Migrants in Light of the EU and Italian Migration Policies  Francesca Cimino
The Russian Constitutional Court as a Mediating Link between Russian and European Law?  Mikhail Antonov
PART VII. BOOK REVIEWS
Lisa Heschl: Protecting the Rights of Refugees Beyond European Borders – Establishing Extraterritorial Legal Responsibilities Maghy SAAD
Lorenza Violini and Antonia Baraggia (eds.): The Fragmented Landscape of Fundamental Rights Protection in Europe  Christian Breitler
Panos Kapotas and Vassilis P. Tzevelekos (eds.): Building Consensus on European Consensus – Judicial Interpretation of Human Rights in Europe and Beyond Nikolina KULUNDŽIJA
Pieter van Dijk, Fried van Hoof, Arjen van Rijn and Leo Zwaak (eds.):  Theory and Practice of the European Convention on Human Rights  Markus Pötz
Adrienne Yong: The Rise and Decline of Fundamental Rights in EU Citizenship  Cristina PUCNALE  57
Unishina Phignal F

Intersentia

#### Contents

Jeroe	n Temperman, T. Jeremy Gunn and Malcolm Evans (eds.):
	The European Court of Human Rights and the Freedom
	of Religion or Belief - The 25 years since Kokkinakis
	Christina Seewald
Jann	eke Gerards: General Principles of the European Convention on Human Rights
	Charles SLIDDERS
Inde:	x58

XVi Intersentia

# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACtHPR African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights

AFPS Association France Palestine Solidarité

API Advanced Passenger Information

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations

ATS Alien Tort Statute

CAS Court of Arbitration for Sport
CAT UN Committee against Torture
CBSA Canada Border Service Agency
CCPR Human Rights Committee

CDCJ European Committee on Legal Co-operation

CEAS Common European Asylum System

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of

Discrimination against Women

CEEP European Centre of Employers and Enterprises providing

**Public Services** 

CEPEJ European Commission for the Efficiency of Justice
CERD Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial

Discrimination

CESCR Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

CEU Central European University

CFR/CFREU Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union

CJEU Court of Justice of the European Union
CJ-S-NA Group of Specialists on Nationality

CM Committee of Ministers

CNDT-CI National Coordination of Toxic Waste Victims of Côte

d'Ivoire

CoE Council of Europe

CPD Continuing Professional Development

CPSU (formerly) Communist Party of the Soviet Union
CPT European Committee for the Prevention of Torture

CRC Convention on the Rights of the Child

Intersentia XVII

CRD Citizenship Rights Directive

CRPD Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
CSCE Conference on Security and Co-operation in Europe

CSDP Common Security and Defence Policy

CTA Common Travel Area

DPOs disabled people's organizations
DTM Displacement Tracking Matrix
DUP Democratic Unionist Party

EASO European Asylum Support Office

EAW European Arrest Warrant EC European Community

ECCHR European Center for Constitutional and Human Rights

ECHR European Convention on Human Rights

ECJ European Court of Justice

ECN European Convention on Nationality
EComHR European Commission of Human Rights

ECRIS-TCN European Criminal Record Information System

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

EEAS External Action Service

EEC European Economic Community

EES Entry/Exit System

EHRC European Human Rights Cases

EIIL European Journal of International Law

EP European Parliament

ETIAS European Travel Information and Authorisation System

ETUC European Trade Union Confederation

EU European Union

EU MS European Union Member States

EUBAM EU Border Assistance Mission in Libya

EUD European Union of the Deaf

FIDH International Federation on Human Rights

FNASS National Federation of Sportspersons' Associations

and Unions

FRA European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights

GA General Assembly

GDP Global Detention Project

xviii Intersentia

GDP gross domestic product

GFA Good Friday/Belfast Agreement

GIHRL general international human rights law

GNA Government of National Accord
GSP Generalised Scheme of Preferences

HCJ High Council of the Judiciary

HCNM High Commissioner on National Minorities

HDC Human Dimension Committee
HDP Halkların Demokratik Partisi
HIV Human Immunodeficiency Virus

HR human rights

HRC UN Human Rights Council
HRE Human Rights Education
HRW Human Rights Watch

IACtHR Inter-American Court of Human Rights

IAI Istituto Affari Internazionali

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and

**Cultural Rights** 

ICI International Court of Justice

ICMPD International Centre for Migration Policy Development

ICT Information and Communication Technology

IDP Internally Displaced Person

IFJ International Federation of Journalists
IJRL International Journal of Refugee Law

IMF International Monetary Fund

IOM International Organisation for Migration
IPSN Identification of Persons with Special Needs

ITE Initial Teacher Education

ITU International Telecommunication Union LGBT Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender

LGBTI Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Intersex

LJIL Leiden Journal of International Law

LNA Libyan National Army
M5S Movimento 5 Stelle
MC Ministerial Council

Intersentia xix

MCEL Maastricht Centre for European Law

MNEs many multinational enterprises
MoU Memorandum of Understanding

MPs members of parliament

MPEPIL Max Planck Encyclopedia of Public International Law

MSM men that had sexual relations with other men

NCN Polish National Science Center NGO Non-Governmental Organisation

NJO National Judicial Office

NSA US National Security Agency
OAS Organization of American States

ODIHR OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human

Rights

OHCHR Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for

Human Rights

OSCE Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe

OSI Other Supplementary Information

PACE Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe

PC Permanent Council

PCII Permanent Court of International Justice

PNR Passenger Name Records

RF Russian Federation

RF CC Russian Federation Constitutional Court

RF SC Russian Federation Supreme Court

RFOM Representative on the Freedom of the Media RSFSR Russian Soviet Federal Socialist Republic SANA Security Assessment in North Africa

SAR Search and Rescue SC Security Council

SDG Sustainable Development Goals

SFRY Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia

SG Secretary General

SSI Special Service Information

T&L Tate & Lyle

TEU Treaty on European Union

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

XX Intersentia

TVPA Torture Victim Protection Act of 1991
UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UK United Kingdom
UN United Nations

UN HR United Nations Human Rights

UNCRC United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child UNCRPD United Nations Committee on the Rights of Persons with

Disabilities

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

UNDHRET United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education

and Training

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural

Organization

UNGA United Nations General Assembly

UNGPs United Nations Guiding Principles on Business and

Human Rights

UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund UNODC UN Office on Drugs and Crime

UNSMIL United Nations Support Mission in Libya

UPIAS Union of Physically Impaired People Against Segregation

US(A) United States (of America)

VC Venice Commission
VIS Visa Information System
WHO World Health Organization

WIPO World Intellectual Property Organization

WOMEN UN Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment

of Women

WTO World Trade Organization

Intersentia XXI

# LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

### Vigjilenca ABAZI

Vigjilenca Abazi is Assistant Professor of European Law at Maastricht University. She was Resident Fellow at Yale Law School, Emile Nöel Fellow at NYU School of Law, and Fulbright Scholar at Columbia Law School. Her most recent book is *Secrecy and Oversight in the European Union* (Oxford University Press 2019). On whistleblowing protection, Abazi provided legal advice to the European Parliament and the Council of Europe. She co-drafted the model EU Directive for protection of whistleblowers in 2016 and the Council of Europe Resolution for local and regional protections in 2019.

#### Mikhail ANTONOV

Mikhail Antonov is Associate Professor at the Law Faculty (Department of Theory and History of Law and State) of the National Research University Higher School of Economics (Saint Petersburg, Russia).

### **Wolfgang BENEDEK**

Wolfgang Benedek is Professor Emeritus at the Institute of International Law and International Relations and former Director of the European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy of the University of Graz (UNI-ETC). He is a regular lecturer at the Vienna Diplomatic Academy and the European Master Programmes on Human Rights and Democratisation in Venice and Sarajevo. His main research interests include human rights, human development and human security, on which he has published substantially. He was the managing co-editor of this Yearbook until 2018.

### Juan Pablo BOHOSLAVSKY

Juan Pablo Bohoslavsky is the current United Nations Independent Expert on Foreign Debt and Human Rights. He previously worked at the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) and as a consultant for the United Nations Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC). A doctor of law with wide experience in international relations and litigation, he is the author of numerous books and articles on finance and human rights.

#### Claire BRIGHT

Claire Bright is a Max Weber Fellow at the European University Institute in Florence and a Research Fellow in Business and Human Rights at the British Institute of International and Comparative Law. She holds a PhD in International

Intersentia xxiii

Law from the European University Institute, an LLM in Private International Law and International Commercial Law from La Sorbonne Law School and a Dual Bachelor in French and English Laws from the University Paris-Est. In the past, Claire has worked as a Lecturer at the London School of Business and Management and Programme Associate on the Research Programme on Civil Justice Systems at the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies of the University of Oxford.

#### Andrea BRODERICK

Andrea Broderick is Assistant Professor at the Department of International and European Law, Maastricht University, having previously been a Marie Curie Early Stage Researcher in the DREAM network. Dr. Broderick holds a PhD in international/comparative disability equality law from Maastricht University. Her PhD thesis was nominated for the Max van der Stoel Human Rights Award 2016. She received the Edmond Hustinx Prize for Science 2018 for her work on equality and accessibility law. She has published widely in the fields of international, European and comparative law, and has taken part in funded research projects for, among others, the European Commission and the Council of Europe. In addition, she is a qualified lawyer, and previously worked in legal practice.

#### Svetlana CHETAIKINA

Svetlana Chetaikina is a PhD candidate at the Human Rights Centre, University of Padova. She holds an LLM degree in Comparative Constitutional Law from Central European University (Budapest). She has considerable experience in the field of electoral observation and practice. She has participated as legal and election analyst in election observation missions deployed by the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights and has authored articles on election observation and suffrage rights. Her current research is related to constitutionalisation of international electoral standards.

### Francesca CIMINO

Francesca Cimino is a PhD student of the international joint PhD programme 'Human rights, Society and Multi-Level Governance' held at the University of Padua, Sydney, Nicosia, Zagreb and Athens. Her field research includes: mixed migration flows, female migrations, trafficking in human beings, migration management policies.

#### Philip CZECH

Philip Czech holds a Dr iur and a Dr phil degree. Since 2002 he has been a researcher at the Austrian Institute for Human Rights, which has become a department of the University of Salzburg in 2014. He is editor of the *Newsletter Menschenrechte*, a periodical reporting in German on the current case law of the European Court of Human Rights. He is mainly engaged with publishing and teaching in the field of fundamental rights, especially with the case law of

XXİV Intersentia

the ECtHR and its transposition in Austria. Further main fields of interest are asylum and migration law, the freedom of reproductive choice and family law as well as human rights in the penitentiary system.

#### Anita DANKA

Anita Danka is a former Human Rights Adviser at the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) of the OSCE. She has monitored assemblies in 17 countries and trained police on how to facilitate assemblies in a human rights compliant way in five countries of the OSCE region. She is a Hungarian certified attorney and also holds an MA degree in Human Rights from the Central European University and an MA in English from the University of Debrecen, Hungary. Besides human rights monitoring and capacity building she had been engaged in strategic litigation to further the enjoyment of human rights of Roma and Sinti communities in Europe. She has published on the role of communication in the human rights-based facilitation of peaceful protests, using digital technologies for human rights monitoring, combating hate crimes and intolerance, school segregation, police abuse, discrimination in access to employment, and reproductive rights.

#### **Anete ERDMANE**

Anete Erdmane is the Associate Democratic Governance Officer at the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR). Her work focuses on promoting the political participation of persons with disabilities. Anete has been working with the OSCE since 2013, including on various human rights and democratic governance issues in Kosovo and Kyrgyzstan. From 2012 until 2017 she served as a Management and Executive Board member of the EU Agency of Fundamental Rights. She holds a law degree from the University of Latvia and a master's degree in Human Rights and Democratisation (EMA) from the European Inter-University Centre for Human Rights and Democratisation and University of Leuven.

### Delia FERRI

Delia Ferri is a Lecturer in Law at Maynooth University Department of Law. She is an affiliated researcher at the Dirpolis Institute of Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna (Italy) and a fellow at the Burton Blatt Institute of Syracuse University (USA). Since 2018, she has been a member of the Royal Irish Academy Standing Committee in International Affairs. Dr. Ferri has taken part in several research projects and EU-funded studies in the field of disability law and has published extensively in the fields of European and comparative law, with a focus on the rights of people with disabilities, participatory processes and cultural diversity.

#### **Ryan GOSS**

Ryan Goss is Associate Professor at the Australian National University Law School, where he works on human rights law and constitutional law. He was previously Junior Research Fellow in Law at Lincoln College, University of

Intersentia XXV

Oxford. Relevant publications include his book, *Criminal Fair Trial Rights: Article 6 of the European Convention on Human Rights* (Hart 2014), which was longlisted for the Inner Temple Book Prize 2015, shortlisted for the Birks Prize 2015, and cited by Sajó & Laffranque JJ in Ibrahim v UK (2016). See also https://lawschool.anu.edu.au/people/ryan-goss.

### **Elspeth GUILD**

Elspeth Guild is Jean Monnet Professor ad personam at Queen Mary, University of London and Emeritus Professor at the Radboud University Nijmegen, Netherlands. She is a partner at the London law firm, Kingsley Napley. She is also a visiting Professor at the College of Europe, Bruges. She was special advisor to the House of Lords European Union Committee's Inquiry into Economic Migration in 2005. Her interests and expertise lies primarily in the area of EU law, in particular EU Justice and Home Affairs (including immigration, asylum, border controls, criminal law and police and judicial cooperation in criminal matters). She researches EU privacy and data protection law and the nexus with human rights. She is co-editor of the European Journal of Migration and Law and of the book series Immigration and Asylum Law and Policy in Europe published by Martinus Nijhoff. Professor Guild provides regular advice to the European Parliament, the European Commission, the Council of Europe and other European and international organisations (such as the UNHCR) on free movement of persons, migration and asylum. Professor Guild is co-chair of the European Sub Committee, Immigration Law Practitioners Association, the UK legal profession's voice on immigration and asylum matters.

#### David GUTIÉRREZ COLOMINAS

David Gutiérrez Colominas is a post-doctoral researcher (accredited Associate Professor in 2019) from the Autonomous University of Barcelona, and completed his PhD in 2018 (International mention), with a grant from the Ministry of Education of Spain (FPU), that has allowed him to teach Employment Law at Autonomous University of Barcelona. He gives lectures in labour law for undergraduates in the law degree and labour relations degree. In labour law, he has a particular interest in equality and non-discrimination of people with disabilities. His PhD dissertation, published in 2019 by Editorial Bomarzo, analysed the duty to provide reasonable accommodation in the workplace from an international and comparative legal perspective (USA, Canada, United Kingdom, France and Spain). Dr. Gutiérrez Colominas is a member of Berkeley Comparative Equality & Anti-Discrimination Law Study Group, and a member of different UAB research institutions related to equality and non-discrimination (CERSIN, DRELATES and Dones i Drets).

#### Lisa HESCHL

Lisa Heschl is a post-doctoral research and teaching fellow at the European Training and Research Centre on Human Rights and Democracy at the University

XXVİ Intersentia

of Graz (UNI-ETC). She received her PhD in law from the University of Graz and holds a European master's degree in Human Rights and Democratisation (EMA). She has been a Marie Curie visiting research fellow at the University of Deusto, Bilbao and is a visiting lecturer at the University Oldenburg and the University of Padua. Her research focuses on the European migration and asylum policy and legislation, the extraterritorial application of international and European refugee and human rights law and its relation to European border policies. Her most recent publication is *Protecting the Rights of Refugees beyond European Borders. Establishing Extraterritorial Responsibilities* (Cambridge, Intersentia 2018).

## Julia KAPELAŃSKA-PRĘGOWSKA

Julia Kapelańska-Pręgowska, PhD in international law (Nicolaus Copernicus University), is Assistant Professor at the Chair of Human Rights, Faculty of Law and Administration, Nicolaus Copernicus University in Torun, Poland. Her areas of expertise cover international human rights law and legal aspects of biomedicine (international and comparative perspective). Her PhD (2010) was awarded the 1st prize in an all-Poland competition for doctoral and post-doctoral theses. She received the scholarship START from the Foundation for Polish Science (2014) and the Bohdan Winiarski Scholarship in International Law 2017 at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge.

#### Stefan KIEBER

Stefan Kieber is Senior Scientist at the Austria Institute for Human Rights (University of Salzburg). His main research fields are: human rights in general, the case law and procedure of the ECtHR, the implementation of international (human rights) obligations in national law and preventive detention. In addition, he carries out human rights and law trainings for different professional groups such as prison guards. He is also Chief Editor of the academic journal *Newsletter Menschenrechte*.

#### Elif Mendos KUSKONMAZ

Elif Mendos Kuskonmaz is Lecturer at University of Portsmouth and PhD candidate at Queen Mary University of London. She researches on Passenger Name Record Agreements, privacy and data protection in the context of national security.

#### **Karin LUKAS**

Karin Lukas is Senior Researcher and Head of Department at the Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights. In January 2011 she joined the European Committee of Social Rights (ECSR) of the Council of Europe and has been Vice-President since 2017. She has been a consultant for various national and international organisations, such as the UN Development Programme and the Austrian Ministry for Foreign Affairs. She has done research as well as project-related activities in the field of human rights, in particular women's rights,

Intersentia XXVII

development cooperation and business. Dr. Lukas holds an LLM in Gender and the Law (American University), an EMA in Human Rights and Democratisation (University of Padova) and a PhD in Legal Studies (University of Vienna). She currently works on the issue of labour rights in global production networks, and international as well as company-based grievance mechanisms.

#### Axel MARX

Axel Marx is Deputy Director of the Leuven Centre for Global Governance Studies, KU Leuven. He has managed over 50 funded research projects and acted as a consultant to several national and international organisations including the European Parliament, the European Commission, the Committee of the Regions, International Labour Organization, United Nations Industrial Development Organization, the OECD, IDEA, Worldbank, the Belgian, Dutch and German Governments. His academic publications (100+) have appeared in four dozen leading international peer reviewed journals and six languages (English, French, Spanish, German, Dutch and Chinese). His research interests include voluntary sustainability standards, human rights, global governance, governance through trade, EU trade policy and comparative case methods.

### Nils MUIŽNIEKS

Nils Muižnieks was the Council of Europe's Commissioner for Human Rights from 2012 to 2018. He was a Fernand Braudel Fellow at the Department of Law at the European University Institute in Florence in autumn 2018. Previously, he served as Chairman of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance from 2010 to 2012, Director of the Advanced Social and Political Research Institute at the University of Latvia from 2005 to 2012, Minister of Social Integration in the Latvian government from 2002 to 2004, and Head of the NGO Latvian Centre for Human Rights and Ethnic Studies from 1994 to 2002. He is a Riga-based political scientist and consultant.

#### Colin MURRAY

Colin Murray is a Reader in Public Law at Newcastle University. He joined Newcastle Law School in 2006, having previously taught at Durham University. His research has been cited in the UK Supreme Court, and has also informed UK Government consultations and Select Committee reports across a range of public law issues. These include prisoner voting, the office of Lord Chancellor and the nature of the UK's devolution arrangements. He is the Principal Investigator for Performing Identities, an ESRC-funded project on the impact of Brexit upon governance and identity in Northern Ireland.

#### Manfred NOWAK

Manfred Nowak is Professor of International Human Rights at the University of Vienna, where he is the Scientific Director of the Vienna Master of Arts in

XXVIII Intersentia

Human Rights. Since 2016, he has also served as Secretary General of the Global Campus of Human Rights in Venice. In October 2016, he was appointed as an independent expert leading the UN Global Study on Children Deprived of Liberty. He formerly taught at various prestigious universities, such as Utrecht, Lund, Stanford and the Graduate Institute in Geneva, co-founded the Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights in Vienna and has published more than 600 books and articles in this field. He has carried out various expert functions for the UN, the Council of Europe, the EU and other intergovernmental organisations. Most importantly, he served for many years in various functions as UN Expert on Enforced Disappearances (1993–2006), as one of eight international judges in the Human Rights Chamber for Bosnia and Herzegovina in Sarajevo (1996–2003), and as UN Special Rapporteur on Torture (2004–2010).

#### Gerd OBERLEITNER

Gerd Oberleitner is UNESCO Chair in Human Rights and Human Security at the Faculty of Law, University of Graz, Austria, Head of the Institute of International Law and International Relations of the University of Graz, and Director of the European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy at the University of Graz. He has been a lecturer at the Centre for the Study of Human Rights of the London School of Economics and Political Science and Visiting Professor at the European Inter-University Centre Venice, the Université du Quebéc à Montréal, the University of Ljubljana and Rutgers University. He teaches in the Global Campus of Regional Human Rights Master Programmes. His latest publication is *Human Rights Institutions, Tribunals and Courts* (Springer 2018).

#### Nina PINEAU

Nina Pineau is a PhD researcher at the Leuven Centre for Global Governance Studies (GGS) in Leuven. Her research focuses on the law of international organisations. She holds an LLM in International Law from the Université Libre de Bruxelles (ULB), as well as a master's degree in International Relations from ULB, a bachelor's degree in Political Science from the Freie Universität Berlin, and a bachelor's degree in Philosophy from Université de Reims Champagne-Ardenne.

#### Adel-Naim REYHANI

Adel-Naim Reyhani graduated in law from the Karl Franzens University Graz (Austria). He is currently a researcher at the Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights in Vienna, focusing on questions related to access to asylum in the European Union from the perspective of human rights, as well as legal philosophy. Prior to that, he worked in the field of asylum and migration law for the Austrian Asylum Court, the International Organization for Migration, as well as the Diakonie Refugee Service.

Intersentia XXİX

#### Andrei RICHTER

Andrei Richter (Andrey Rikhter) is Senior Adviser at the OSCE Office of the Representative on Freedom of the Media. Richter holds university degrees in law, journalism and foreign languages, a doctorate in Russia and a professorship in media studies from Slovakia. He has authored more than 200 publications on media law and policy, including the only standard media law textbook for journalism students in the Russian Federation (2002, 2009, 2016), a textbook on international standards of media regulation (2011), a textbook on online media law (2014), and a book on censorship and freedom of the media in post-Soviet countries, published by UNESCO (2007). Dr. Richter sits on the editorial boards of a number of international journals on communications and the media. He also served as a commissioner at the International Commission of Jurists and the Chair of the Law Section of the International Association for Media and Communication Research.

#### Barbara SANTIBANEZ

Barbara Santibanez is a PhD fellow at the Human Rights Centre, University of Padova, and a Peace Fellow Alumna (2015-2017) from the Duke-UNC Rotary Peace Centre. Her research interests are human rights policy, citizenship and human rights education, and education policy in post-conflict and transitional contexts. She has over ten years of professional experience in the fields of human rights, education, and international development working with organisations such as UNESCO – IIEP, the Council of Europe and Amnesty International, among others. Her current research focuses on the role of teachers in implementing human rights education at school, using France as a case study.

#### Masuma SHAHID

Masuma Shahid is a lecturer in the field of European Union Law at the Erasmus School of Law (Erasmus University Rotterdam). She holds master's degrees in International and European Union Law and Dutch Constitutional and Administrative Law. Her master thesis was awarded the Max van der Stoel Human Rights Award. Prior to her current position, she worked at a legal clinic in The Hague for four years, was a lecturer at the Delft University of Technology (TU Delft) and interned at the department of International, Legal and Administrative Affairs of the municipality of Rotterdam. Her PhD research focuses on how international courts approach the topic of equal marriage rights, specifically same-sex marriage.

#### Agnieszka SZKLANNA

Agnieszka Szklanna, adwokat, MA (College of Europe-Natolin) is Secretary to the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights, Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe. Agnieszka studied law and applied linguistics at the Warsaw University. Since 2003, she has been a staff member of the Council of Europe (previously as a legal officer in the Registry of the European Court

XXX Intersentia

of Human Rights and then in the Department for the Execution of ECtHR Judgments). She lectured at Warsaw University, Faculty of Law (1999-2003), and at the Strasbourg University, Political Studies Institute (2012-2015), and regularly publishes on issues of the ECtHR system, legal protection of aliens, relations between the European Union and the Council of Europe.

#### Jeroen TEMPERMAN

Jeroen Temperman is Professor of International Law and Religion at Erasmus School of Law, Erasmus University Rotterdam, the Netherlands. He is also the Editor-in-Chief of *Religion & Human Rights* and a member of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe's Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief. He has authored, among other books, *Religious Hatred and International Law* (Cambridge University Press 2016) and *State-Religion Relationships and Human Rights Law* (Martinus Nijhoff 2010) and edited *Blasphemy and Freedom of Expression* (Cambridge University Press 2017) and *The Lautsi Papers* (Martinus Nijhoff 2012).

#### Vasil VASHCHANKA

Vasil Vashchanka holds an LLM degree from Central European University (Budapest). He worked as an officer and Deputy Chief of Rule of Law at the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) between 2002 and 2012. He also worked at the International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance (Sweden) between 2012 and 2014, where his research focused on election administration and dispute resolution. Currently, he is a consultant for international organisations on rule of law and electoral issues. His research interests include election administration, dispute resolution and campaign financing.

#### Ben WARWICK

Ben Warwick is a Lecturer in Law at the University of Birmingham. His research explores how economic considerations affect the implementation of human rights (and especially socio-economic rights). He has written on how rights are impacted by crises, neoliberalism, time, and Brexit. He is on the European Parliament's list of legal experts and is an Associate of the Oxford Human Rights Hub. His research is frequently used by governmental and non-governmental bodies nationally and internationally, and has been prominently reported in national print and news media.

#### Jan WOUTERS

Jan Wouters is Full Professor of International Law and International Organizations, Jean Monnet Chair ad personam European Union and Global Governance, Director of the Institute for International Law and of the Leuven Centre for Global Governance Studies (both a Jean Monnet Centre of Excellence and a University Centre of Excellence) at KU Leuven, and President of the University's Board for International Policy. He is Adjunct Professor at Columbia University

Intersentia XXXi

(New York) and Visiting Professor at Sciences Po (Paris), LUISS (Rome) and the College of Europe (Bruges). A Member of the Belgian Royal Academy and Of Counsel at Linklaters, he has published widely on international and EU law, international organisations and global governance. He is Coordinator of a large Horizon 2020 Project, RECONNECT (Reconnecting Europe with its Citizens through Democracy and Rule of Law).

#### Deniz YAZICI

Deniz Yazici is Adviser to the OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media (RFOM). Her specialisation is in the areas of access to information, internet governance, cybersecurity, and strategic communications. Previously, Yazici worked as Senior Adviser for human rights at the Austrian Ministry for Europe, Integration and Foreign Affairs where she also led the OSCE 2017 Chairmanship portfolio on media freedom, and as an Officer at the OSCE where she steered media freedom projects in various countries across the OSCE, to establish independent media regulators, build up expert networks, support policy reform initiatives, and enhance media pluralism. She holds a university degree in management, and a master's from Warwick University (UK) in globalisation and development.

XXXII Intersentia