

TRAPPED IN A RELIGIOUS MARRIAGE

Human Rights Research Series, Volume 86.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

# TRAPPED IN A RELIGIOUS MARRIAGE

A human rights perspective  
on the phenomenon of marital captivity

Benedicta DEOGRATIAS

 INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd  
8 Wellington Street  
Cambridge | CB1 1HW | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 736 170 | Fax: +44 1223 736 169  
Email: [mail@intersentia.co.uk](mailto:mail@intersentia.co.uk)  
[www.intersentia.com](http://www.intersentia.com) | [www.intersentia.co.uk](http://www.intersentia.co.uk)

*Distribution for the UK and Ireland:*

NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: [orders@nbninternational.com](mailto:orders@nbninternational.com)

*Distribution for Europe and all other countries:*

Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21  
Email: [mail@intersentia.be](mailto:mail@intersentia.be)

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*

Independent Publishers Group  
Order Department  
814 North Franklin Street  
Chicago, IL60610  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1312 337 5985  
Email: [orders@ipgbook.com](mailto:orders@ipgbook.com)

Trapped in a Religious Marriage. A human rights perspective on the phenomenon of marital captivity

© Benedicta Deogratias 2020

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover image: © David Clarke – Unsplash

ISBN 978-1-78068-842-8 (paperback)

ISBN 978-1-78068-843-5 (PDF)

D/2020/7849/107

NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

# CONTENTS

|  |    |
|--|----|
| <i>List of Frequently Used Abbreviations</i> ..... | xi |
|--|----|

## Chapter 1

|   |    |
|---|----|
| <b>Introduction to Marital Captivity</b> .....                      | 1  |
| 1.1. A human rights approach to marital captivity.....              | 1  |
| 1.2. Terminological clarification.....                              | 6  |
| 1.3. The causes and consequences of marital captivity.....          | 9  |
| 1.3.1. Marital captivity as a women's issue.....                    | 10 |
| 1.3.2. The consequences of a situation of marital captivity.....    | 12 |
| 1.3.2.1. Restrictions in establishing new relationships.....        | 12 |
| 1.3.2.2. Difficulties in leaving a violent environment.....         | 13 |
| 1.3.2.3. Exploitation of the weak position of the trapped wife..... | 15 |
| 1.3.2.4. Cross-border complications.....                            | 16 |
| 1.4. Marital captivity in human rights discourse.....               | 17 |
| 1.5. Adopting a human rights approach to marital captivity.....     | 21 |
| 1.5.1. The selected human rights.....                               | 22 |
| 1.5.2. Over-arching principles of human rights law.....             | 25 |
| 1.6. Methodology.....   | 26 |
| 1.6.1. Methods of interpreting human rights instruments.....        | 26 |
| 1.6.2. Scope and limitations.....                                   | 31 |
| 1.7. Outline.....   | 33 |

## Chapter 2

|  |    |
|--|----|
| <b>Religious Barriers to Divorce</b> .....   | 37 |
| 2.1. Christianity, divorce and marital captivity.....  | 38 |
| 2.1.1. Marriage dissolution in the Catholic faith.....   | 39 |
| 2.1.2. Marriage dissolution and marital captivity in the Protestant faith.....                                   | 41 |
| 2.1.3. Marital captivity and multiple normative systems.....   | 42 |
| 2.2. Hinduism, divorce and marital captivity.....  | 44 |
| 2.2.1. Non-existent or impossible?.....  | 45 |
| 2.2.2. Marital captivity and competing normative systems.....  | 47 |
| 2.3. Islam, divorce and marital captivity.....   | 48 |
| 2.3.1. Repudiation, divorce by mutual consent and divorce with the<br>intervention of religious authorities..... | 49 |
| 2.3.2. Marital captivity and competing normative systems.....  | 52 |

|        |   |    |
|--------|---|----|
| 2.4.   | Judaism, divorce and marital captivity            | 54 |
| 2.4.1. | Divorce in Judaism                                | 55 |
| 2.4.2. | Marital captivity and competing normative systems | 58 |
| 2.5.   | Marital captivity to a religious marriage         | 59 |

### Chapter 3

|   |  |    |
|---|--|----|
| <b>Marital Captivity in the Netherlands</b> | <b>61</b>  |    |
| 3.1.  | State-Church relations                                     | 62 |
| 3.1.1.                                      | The historical context                                     | 63 |
| 3.1.2.                                      | Secularism and State neutrality in the Dutch context.      | 65 |
| 3.1.3.                                      | Growing religious suspicion                                | 67 |
| 3.2.  | Religiosity and the organisation of religious communities. | 69 |
| 3.2.1.                                      | Christian communities.                                     | 69 |
| 3.2.2.                                      | Jewish communities   | 71 |
| 3.2.3.                                      | Muslim communities   | 72 |
| 3.2.4.                                      | Hindu communities  | 73 |
| 3.2.5.                                      | The status of religious communities.                       | 75 |
| 3.3.  | Marriage, divorce and marital captivity                    | 77 |
| 3.3.1.                                      | Public discourse on marital captivity.                     | 79 |
| 3.3.2.                                      | The role of the State in religious divorces                | 81 |
| 3.4.  | Measures for addressing marital captivity.                 | 82 |
| 3.4.1.                                      | Civil law  | 86 |
| 3.4.2.                                      | Criminal law.  | 90 |
| 3.4.3.                                      | Alternative measures                                       | 91 |
| 3.5.  | Concluding remarks   | 92 |

### Chapter 4

|  |  |     |
|--|--|-----|
| <b>Marital Captivity and the Freedom of Religion</b> | <b>97</b>  |     |
| 4.1.   | Reasons and motives to oppose the dissolution of a religious marriage.                               | 99  |
| 4.2.   | The legal framework  | 100 |
| 4.3.   | Religious rules and practices that enable marital captivity  | 101 |
| 4.3.1.   | Religious rules that limit both spouses' or women's possibilities to dissolve the religious marriage | 102 |
| 4.3.2.   | Application and enforcement of restrictive and discriminatory rules within the religious community   | 104 |
| 4.3.2.1.   | The regulation of religious divorces as internal affairs.  | 107 |
| 4.3.2.2.   | State interference in religious affairs related to divorce.  | 109 |
| 4.4.   | Individuals' right to freedom of religion  | 112 |
| 4.4.1.   | Religious manifestations   | 114 |
| 4.4.1.1.   | Manifestation in worship, teaching, observance and practice  | 116 |
| 4.4.1.2.   | Conscientious objection  | 117 |

|                                  |  |     |
|----------------------------------|--|-----|
| 4.4.1.2.1.                       | ICCPR .....  | 118 |
| 4.4.1.2.2.                       | ECHR.....  | 121 |
| 4.4.2.                           | Opposition and non-cooperation to divorce as a religious<br>manifestation .....      | 123 |
| 4.4.2.1.                         | International and regional case law.....   | 123 |
| 4.4.2.2.                         | National case law .....  | 125 |
| 4.4.2.2.1.                       | The Netherlands.....   | 125 |
| 4.4.2.2.2.                       | France .....   | 128 |
| 4.4.2.2.3.                       | The United Kingdom.....  | 131 |
| 4.4.2.3.                         | A right to oppose or withhold cooperation in a religious<br>divorce? .....           | 134 |
| 4.4.2.4.                         | The implications of recognising divorce denial as a<br>religious manifestation ..... | 136 |
| 4.4.3.                           | Conscientious objection to divorce .....   | 138 |
| 4.5.                             | State's obligations and limitations to the freedom of religion and belief .....      | 139 |
| 4.5.1.                           | State's obligations.....   | 140 |
| 4.5.2.                           | Interference with the religious freedom .....  | 141 |
| 4.5.2.1.                         | The limitation clauses .....   | 142 |
| 4.5.2.1.1.                       | Prescribed by law .....  | 143 |
| 4.5.2.1.2.                       | Pursuing a legitimate aim .....  | 144 |
| 4.5.2.1.3.                       | Necessary (in a democratic society) .....  | 145 |
| 4.5.2.1.4.                       | Margin of appreciation .....   | 146 |
| 4.5.2.2.                         | State interference in situations of marital captivity .....                          | 146 |
| 4.6.                             | Concluding remarks .....   | 148 |
| <br>                             |  |     |
| <b>Chapter 5</b>                 |  |     |
| <b>The Right to Divorce.....</b> |  |     |
|                                  |  | 151 |
| 5.1.                             | The legal framework on marriage and divorce .....                                    | 155 |
| 5.2.                             | A right to divorce.....  | 157 |
| 5.2.1.                           | Divorce in human rights law .....  | 158 |
| 5.2.1.1.                         | General comments .....   | 158 |
| 5.2.1.2.                         | Case law .....   | 159 |
| 5.2.1.3.                         | Concluding observations.....   | 164 |
| 5.2.1.4.                         | Preparatory works .....  | 165 |
| 5.2.2.                           | Equality at the dissolution of marriage .....  | 170 |
| 5.2.3.                           | No implied right to divorce .....  | 174 |
| 5.3.                             | A right to divorce or not to divorce?.....   | 175 |
| 5.3.1.                           | Acknowledging a right to divorce.....  | 176 |
| 5.3.2.                           | Moral barriers and competing interests .....   | 179 |
| 5.3.3.                           | Divorce and the right to marry.....  | 181 |
| 5.3.3.1.                         | The ECtHR position on divorce and the right to remarry.....                          | 182 |
| 5.3.3.2.                         | Effective protection of the right to remarry.....                                    | 184 |
| 5.4.                             | Concluding remarks: The right to dissolve a religious marriage? .....                | 186 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>Chapter 6</b>   |     |
| <b>The Trapped Spouse's Rights</b>   | 191 |
| 6.1. Personal autonomy   | 192 |
| 6.1.1. The notion of personal autonomy in human rights law                 | 194 |
| 6.1.2. The trapped spouse's personal autonomy                              | 197 |
| 6.2. The trapped spouse's human rights                                     | 197 |
| 6.2.1. The right to remarry  | 198 |
| 6.2.1.1. The right to remarry subsequent to a divorce                      | 199 |
| 6.2.1.2. Religious, formal and informal marriages                          | 201 |
| 6.2.1.3. The right to remarry for trapped spouses                          | 205 |
| 6.2.2. The right to private life   | 206 |
| 6.2.2.1. The legal framework   | 206 |
| 6.2.2.1.1. 'Privacy' and 'private life'                                    | 207 |
| 6.2.2.1.2. The physical and social dimensions                              | 208 |
| 6.2.2.1.3. Limitation grounds  | 209 |
| 6.2.2.2. Interpersonal relationships, social life and personal development | 210 |
| 6.2.2.2.1. The right to establish relationships with others                | 210 |
| 6.2.2.2.2. Personal development  | 214 |
| 6.2.2.2.3. Concluding remarks  | 215 |
| 6.2.2.3. The trapped spouse's private life                                 | 216 |
| 6.2.3. The freedom of movement   | 217 |
| 6.2.3.1. Terminological clarifications                                     | 217 |
| 6.2.3.2. Transnational aspects of marital captivity                        | 217 |
| 6.2.3.3. The legal framework   | 220 |
| 6.2.3.4. Three freedoms  | 221 |
| 6.2.3.4.1. Movement within the territory of a country                      | 222 |
| 6.2.3.4.2. The right to leave  | 223 |
| 6.2.3.4.3. The right to enter  | 224 |
| 6.2.3.5. The freedom of movement in situations of marital captivity        | 227 |
| 6.2.4. Right to the highest attainable standard of health                  | 227 |
| 6.2.4.1. The legal framework   | 228 |
| 6.2.4.1.1. Defining 'health'   | 229 |
| 6.2.4.1.2. Limitations to the right to health                              | 230 |
| 6.2.4.2. The right to attain the highest standard of health                | 230 |
| 6.2.4.3. Health and marital captivity                                      | 232 |
| 6.3. States' obligations to protect the trapped spouse's right             | 232 |
| 6.3.1. Types of obligations  | 234 |
| 6.3.1.1. Negative obligations  | 235 |
| 6.3.1.2. Positive obligations  | 237 |
| 6.3.2. Marital captivity and States' obligations                           | 243 |
| 6.3.2.1. Protection from violations of the State and private actors        | 244 |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 6.3.2.2. Addressing the causes of marital captivity. ....                                  | 246        |
| 6.3.2.3. Ensuring the freedom of movement .....  | 247        |
| 6.3.2.4. Guaranteeing the trapped spouse’s health .....                                    | 248        |
| 6.4. Concluding remarks .....  | 249        |
| <br>   |            |
| <b>Chapter 7</b>   |            |
| <b>Violence Against Women .....</b>  | <b>251</b> |
| 7.1. The legal framework .....   | 253        |
| 7.2. Conceptual clarifications .....   | 261        |
| 7.2.1. Violence against women as gender-based violence .....                               | 261        |
| 7.2.2. ‘Violence’ in violence against women .....  | 262        |
| 7.3. The characteristics of VAW .....  | 267        |
| 7.3.1. The root cause of VAW .....   | 267        |
| 7.3.1.1. Patriarchy. ....  | 269        |
| 7.3.1.2. Gender inequality. ....   | 271        |
| 7.3.1.3. Practices that are harmful to women .....   | 273        |
| 7.3.1.4. Concluding remarks. ....  | 273        |
| 7.3.2. Violence as a means and consequence .....   | 274        |
| 7.3.3. Settings and agents .....   | 276        |
| 7.3.3.1. Family, community and State level .....   | 276        |
| 7.3.3.2. Agents of VAW: Perpetrators, victims, bystanders and the<br>State. ....           | 278        |
| 7.3.4. The nature of VAW .....   | 280        |
| 7.4. Marital captivity as a form of violence against women .....                           | 281        |
| 7.5. Marital captivity, intimate partner violence and forced marriage. ....                | 285        |
| 7.5.1. Intimate partner violence. ....   | 286        |
| 7.5.2. Forced marriage. ....   | 287        |
| 7.5.3. Similarities and differences .....  | 289        |
| 7.6. States’ obligations in relation to VAW .....  | 292        |
| 7.6.1. The principle of due diligence in the context of VAW. ....                          | 297        |
| 7.6.1.1. The duty to prevent. ....   | 301        |
| 7.6.1.1.1. The commitment of the State. ....   | 302        |
| 7.6.1.1.2. Involvement of all stakeholders and sectors .....                               | 304        |
| 7.6.1.1.3. Addressing the structural factors and<br>eliminating the causes of VAW .....    | 306        |
| 7.6.1.2. The duty to protect .....   | 308        |
| 7.6.1.3. The duty to investigate alleged violence and to punish those<br>responsible. .... | 311        |
| 7.6.1.4. Providing reparations .....   | 313        |
| 7.6.1.5. Monitoring, data collection and international cooperation? ..                     | 313        |
| 7.6.2. States’ obligations in the context of marital captivity .....                       | 315        |
| 7.6.2.1. Measures on the individual level .....  | 316        |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 7.6.2.2. Measures for the religious communities. . . . .  | 317 |
| 7.6.2.3. Measures for State agents and professionals . . . . .  | 320 |
| 7.6.2.4. Cooperation on national and international level . . . . .                                    | 322 |
| 7.7. Concluding remarks . . . . .   | 323 |
| <b>Chapter 8</b>  |     |
| <b>Conclusions</b> . . . . .  | 325 |
| 8.1. Human rights that are affected in a situation of marital captivity . . . . .                     | 327 |
| 8.2. State's human rights obligations . . . . .   | 331 |
| 8.3. Striking a balance between competing rights and interests . . . . .                              | 335 |
| 8.3.1. Religious manifestations that undermine women's rights and<br>gender equality. . . . .         | 336 |
| 8.3.2. Respecting religious groups that engage in discriminatory practices<br>against women . . . . . | 337 |
| 8.3.3. Gender equality vs. the freedom of religion and the rights of others . . .                     | 339 |
| 8.3.4. Secularism as a barrier for State intervention? . . . . .                                      | 340 |
| 8.4. The advantages of a human rights approach to marital captivity . . . . .                         | 341 |
| 8.5. Measures to protect from and prevent marital captivity. . . . .                                  | 346 |
| 8.5.1. General measures . . . . .   | 346 |
| 8.5.2. Preventive measures . . . . .  | 348 |
| 8.5.3. Protective measures . . . . .  | 350 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> . . . . .   | 353 |
| <i>Curriculum Vitae</i> . . . . .   | 393 |

## LIST OF FREQUENTLY USED ABBREVIATIONS

|                 |   |
|-----------------|---|
| ACHR            | American Convention on Human Rights   |
| ACHPR           | African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights                                  |
| CEDAW           | Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination<br>Against Women |
| CEDAW Committee | Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against<br>Women               |
| CESCR           | Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights                             |
| CRC Committee   | Committee on the Rights of the Child  |
| CSW             | Commission on the Status of Women   |
| DEVAW           | Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against women                      |
| DCC             | Dutch Civil Code  |
| ECHR            | European Convention on Human Rights   |
| ECmHR           | European Commission of Human Rights   |
| ECtHR           | European Court of Human Rights  |
| HRC             | Human Rights Committee  |
| ICCPR           | International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights                          |
| ICESCR          | International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural<br>Rights             |
| IPV             | Intimate partner violence   |
| NGO             | Non-Governmental Organisation   |
| SGP             | Staatkundig Gereformeerde Partij  |
| VAW             | Violence Against Women  |
| VCLT            | Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties                                      |
| UDHR            | Universal Declaration of Human Rights   |

