

JUSTINIAN'S DIGEST 9.2.51 IN THE WESTERN LEGAL CANON

JUSTINIAN'S DIGEST 9.2.51
IN THE WESTERN
LEGAL CANON

Roman Legal Thought and Modern
Causality Concepts

Wolfgang ERNST



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Justinian's Digest 9.2.51 in the Western Legal Canon. Roman Legal Thought
and Modern Causality Concepts

© Wolfgang Ernst 2019

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988,
to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any
form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly
permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights
organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above
should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: Shutterstock.com ©

ISBN 978-1-78068-832-9

D/2019/7849/75

NUR 820

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library.

*Ille se profecisse sciat,
cui Iulianus valde placebit.*

To be able to delight in Julian,
mind, this is progress indeed!

cf Quint 10.1.112

TABULA GRATIARUM

John Adams
John Cairns
Andrew Dickinson
Shane Finn
Tomasz Giaro
Benjamin Goodyear
Richard Hyland
David Ibbetson
Horst Heinrich Jakobs
Jonathan Katz
Francesca Lamberti
Ian Maclean
Francesco Milazzo
Thomas Rűfner
Martin Schermaier
Daniel Schwennicke
Jakob Fortunat Stagl
Andreas Thier
Thamar Xandry

CONTENTS

<i>Tabula gratiarum</i>	vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xi
Chapter 1. The Quaestio	1
Chapter 2. The Evidence	11
I. Setting the Stage	11
1. Accursius's Ordinary Gloss	11
2. The Byzantine Perspective	13
3. Canonists Take Note	15
4. The Lethal Wound: Criminal Law and the Medico-Legal Aspect	18
II. The Late Middle Ages	22
III. Renaissance Men	24
IV. Early Modern Jurists	28
V. 19th-Century Pandectists from Glück to Windscheid	34
VI. Modern Roman Law Scholarship Since the Late 19th Century	39
1. Pioneers of Critical Historicism	39
2. Heydays of Interpolationism	44
3. The Pendulum Swings Back	54
4. Division of Labour in Roman Law Research	61
a) Ascertaining the Sources	61
b) Ideas of Causation in Antiquity	62
c) Enter Nörr	64
d) Modern Causation Theorists Chip In	68
e) The Measure of Damages Aspect	73
f) Julian's and Celsus's Legal Methodologies	76
g) Punishing <i>maleficia</i> : Deterrence as a Public Policy Argument?	84
h) <i>Absurdus est</i>	90
i) All Text, No Context?	91
j) <i>Lex Aquilia</i> for Student Readers	91
VII. More Contemporaries	93

Chapter 3. The Summing Up	103
I. The Changing Sociology of Roman Law Scholarship	103
II. A Spectrum of Solutions	105
III. ‘Lawyers are Bad Historians’ – Was Edmund Burke Right?	108
Chapter 4. Verdict on Julian	111
I. The Legal Background	111
II. Ulp 18 ad ed D.9.2.15.1 and Ulp 18 ad ed D.9.2.11.1–3	116
1. Ulp 18 ad ed D.9.2.15.1	116
2. Ulp 18 ad ed D.9.2.11.1–3	119
a) <i>Si alius tenuit – cum sit poena</i> (§§1 and 2)	119
b) <i>Celsus scribit – et est probabilius</i> (§3)	123
III. Iul 86 dig D.9.2.51 Revisited	125
1. The Provenance of the Text	125
2. <i>Ita vulneratus – lege aquilia teneri (Principium)</i>	126
3. <i>Idque – iudicaverunt</i> (§1)	128
4. <i>Aestimatio autem – eam sustulisse</i> (§2)	130
IV. Roman Jurisprudence: A Product of Group Intelligence	133
1. Jurists’ Opinions: Complementarity and Disagreement	133
2. The Reckoning of the One-Year Period	134
3. <i>L.51</i> and <i>l.15.1</i>	135
4. <i>L.11.3</i> and <i>l.51</i>	136
5. Celsus versus Julian?	138
V. Justinian’s Use of Julian: A Model Essay of Statutory Interpretation	141
VI. <i>Omnia praeclara tam difficilia quam rara</i>	146
<i>Gerhard von Beseler’s Conjectures</i>	149
<i>Charts</i>	153
<i>Bibliography</i>	161
<i>Index of Sources</i>	173
<i>Index of Persons</i>	175

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Abt	Abt(h)eilung
AC	Appeal Cases
Anm	Anmerkung
AnnPal	Annali del Seminario Giuridico della Università di Palermo
ANRW	Aufstieg und Niedergang der Römischen Welt
ArchGiur	Archivio Giuridico
Art	article
Bas	Basilika
BIDR	Bulletino dell'Istituto di Diritto Romano
C	Codex Iustiniani
<i>ca</i>	circa
CCC	Constitutio Criminalis Carolina
CE	Christian era
cf	confer/conferatur
cap	caput
caut	cautela/ae
c Iul Imp	contra Iulianum opus imperfectum
col	columna, -ae
comp	compilatio
const	constitutio
CRRS	Corpus der römischen Rechtsquellen zur antiken Sklaverei
D	Digesta Iustiniani
<i>d</i>	died
dig	digesta
disp	disputatio
diss	dissertatio
DNB	Dictionary of National Biography

ed(s)	editor(s); edictum
edn	edition
e.g.	exempli gratia
et al	et alii
ER	English Reports
f/ff	(and) following (pages/columns)
<i>ff.</i>	Digesta
fin	finis
frag	fragment
h.t.	hoc titulo
I	Institutiones Iustiniani
ibid	ibidem
IECL	International Encyclopedia of Comparative Law
i.f.	in fine
HLL	Handbuch der lateinischen Literatur der Antike
Iul	Iulianus
KanAbt	Kanonistische Abteilung
l	lex
lib	liber, -ri
LQR	Law Quarterly Review
MS(S)	manuscript(s)
n	nota, notae, footnote
n p	no place
Po	Pothast
OCD5	(New) Oxford Classical Dictionary
OIR	Orbis Iuris Romani – Journal of Ancient Law Studies
qu, quaest	quaestio(nes)
RomAbt	Romanistische Abteilung
sec	sectio
tit	titulus, -i
tom	tomus, -i
tr	translated, translator
TR	Tijdschrift voor Rechtsgeschiedenis
p	pagina, page

pr	principium
Quint	Quintilian
RIDA	Revue internationale des droits de l'Antiquité
Sab	Sabinus
schol	scholion
SDHI	Studia et documenta historiae iuris
s v	sub voce/verbo
UKHL	House of Lords, United Kingdom
Ulp	Ulpianus
v	versus
vol	volume(n)
X	Liber Extra
ZRG	Zeitschrift für Rechtsgeschichte

