

Collective Reparations

Tensions and Dilemmas Between Collective Reparations and the
Individual Right to Receive Reparations

HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 84.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Collective Reparations

Tensions and Dilemmas Between Collective Reparations and the
Individual Right to Receive Reparations

Diana Itza Odier-Contreras Garduño



Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Collective Reparations: Tensions and Dilemmas Between Collective Reparations and the Individual Right to Receive Reparations

© Diana Itza Odier-Contreras Garduño 2018

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover artwork: Pablo Palazuelo, *Monroy II (Yantra)* © Fundación Pablo Palazuelo.

Typesetting: Editing Department, School of Law, Utrecht University

ISBN 978-1-78068-705-6 (paperback)
ISBN 978-1-78068-746-9 (PDF)
D/2018/7849/86
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

*“The good life is one inspired by love and guided by knowledge”
Bertrand Russel*

I would like to express my gratitude to CONACyT whose financial support helped me to conduct this doctoral research. Likewise, my gratitude to my supervisors: Prof. Dr. Jenny Goldschmidt and Prof. Dr. Rianne Letschert for their valuable support and understanding, especially when my other commitments kept me away from my research. Jenny, thanks for your guidance throughout this journey. Rianne, thank you for staying on board despite your busy schedule.

I would also like to acknowledge my reading committee – Prof. Dr. Antoine Buyse, Dr. Mcgonigle, Prof. Dr. John Vervaele, Prof. Dr. Titia Loenen and Prof. Dr. Stephan Parmentier. I would also like to convey my gratitude to Judge Cançado Trindade whose work and commitment to human rights has been a constant source of inspiration. I am truly grateful for our discussions. I would also like to thank Rodrigo Uprimny whose idea on transformative reparations soon spiked my interest about the complexities of collective awards. In addition, I would like to thank Prof. Dr. Héctor Olásolo – thanks for your encouragement to do a PhD (and for your countless invitations to join several projects), and to Enrique Carnero for our discussions on victims’ rights.

I would also like to thank and acknowledge several people and institutions where I had the privilege to work throughout my PhD. I would like to thank Dr. Pablo Saavedra and my colleagues at the IACtHR for making my time as a Visiting Professional an inspiring experience. This work has also benefited from my time at INTERVICT as a Visiting Researcher and at International Institute of Social Studies where I worked as a Teaching Assistant. I would like to thank Alphonse, Lorena, Prof. Dr. Karin Arts, and Dr. Jeff Handmaker. Thank you also Peter, Klaartje and Titia for your great editorial work.

I would also like to express my gratitude to my colleagues at SIM where I found a stimulating academic environment. Thanks for your collegiality: Alice, Alexandra, Anja, Hye-Min, Ingrid, Judith, Julie, Machiko, Marie Elske, Marjolein, Paulien, Penny and Tom. And a special thank you to Antoine Buyse. I would also like to express my deepest gratitude to my colleagues of UCU where I have been lucky to find an amazing group of scholars and teachers. Thanks to Agnes, Annemieke,

Acknowledgments

Anton, Bald, Bas, Bettina, Carla, Christel, Elsa, Filippe, Floris, Gaetano, Gerda, James, Jocelyn, Kim, Mark, Lilian, Patrick, Tijana and Sabine: your passion and collegiality has enriched me greatly not only as a scholar but more importantly as a human being. I wish to specially thanks Dr. Patricia Post and Prof. Dr. Wil Pansters for their constant support.

This journey has been a remarkable period of my life in many ways. I will treasure good memories and great friendships. I realize how lucky I am to be surrounded with invaluable people. Special thanks goes to Angelica, Andreeanne, Annick Audrey, Benedetta, Bettina, Boudewijn, Carlos, Caroline, Diana, Eugene, Filippo, Gwen, Irina, Isabelle, James, Jurian, Laura, Marguerita, Mariana, Michael, Nancy, Nora, Terry, Tutty, Sanne, Yadhira, Yayoi, Yenuen Wing and for bearing and beering with me ☺ Alastair, Karina, Nacho and Lalo – thanks for all our precious and crazy memories. Melanie – thanks for your invaluable friendship and constant optimism even during your last days. A heartfelt thank you to my *paranymphs*: Leo and Lidija. Thank you for standing beside me throughout all these years. Your friendship, unwavering support and fun memories have made you one of the best parts of my family. If I ever decide to conquer the moon, I will invite you all to come with me!

It is virtually impossible to give justice to all the people who have contributed in one form or another to make this book come true. My apologies to everyone who I may have forgotten to mention in the rush of finalizing the book.

I would also like to thank my family who has always encouraged me to aim higher while keeping my feet on earth. Ambre, Claire, Colette, Jean Francois, Luc and Peggy – merci d'avoir ouvert la porte de votre famille et de vos cœurs. To Anna, Irma, July, Michel, Trini, and especially to my mum – les agradezco infinitamente su amor y apoyo. A pesar de la distancia, siempre los llevo en mi corazón! Finally, I would like to thank my husband, who is the most important person in my life. David – tu es le plus beau cadeau que la vie ne m'a jamais offert. Thanks for always being there, for making my life a constant and intense adventure, for being the most caring husband, and above all, for sharing your parenting journey with me.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	v
Abbreviations	xiii

CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Reparations Commonly Awarded for Gross Violations of Human Rights	6
2	The Problem in a Nutshell	9
2.1	Complex Reparations for Complex Harm	9
2.2	Legal Foundations of Collective Reparations under Human Rights Law	10
2.3	Legal Issues Arising from Awarding Only Collective Reparations	12
2.4	Central Research Question	15
2.5	Aims and Structure	18
3	Key Concepts	19
3.1	Victim	19
3.2	Gross Violations of Human Rights	20
3.3	Collective Reparations	23
3.4	Transitional Justice	24
4	Research Methodology and Limitations	24
4.1	Defining the Methodology	25
4.2	Delimiting the Scope of the Research	26

CHAPTER II DEVELOPMENTS CONCERNING THE RIGHT TO REPARATION

1	Introduction	33
1.1	Right to a Remedy	35
1.1.1	Procedural Aspect: Access to Justice	37
1.1.2	Substantive Aspect: Reparations	39
2	Reparations: A State Obligation	41
2.1	Concept of Reparation	41

2.2	Types of Reparations	43
2.2.1	Restitution	43
2.2.2	Compensation	45
2.2.3	Satisfaction	47
2.2.4	Cessation and Guarantees of Non-Repetition	49
2.3	Main Characteristics of Reparations	52
2.3.1	<i>Restitutio in Integrum</i>	53
2.3.2	Full Reparations	53
2.3.3	Adequacy and Appropriateness	55
2.3.4	Proportionality	56
2.4	Other Substantive and Procedural Aspects of Reparations	57
2.4.1	Liability to Repair	57
2.4.2	Beneficiaries	58
2.4.3	Assessment of Harm	60
2.4.4	Standard of Proof	62
2.4.5	Causality	64
2.5	Compliance with Judgments on Reparations	68
3	Reparations: A Human Right for Victims	70
3.1	Concept of Reparation	73
3.2	Types of Reparations	75
3.2.1	Restitution	76
3.2.2	Compensation	81
3.2.3	Rehabilitation	87
3.2.4	Satisfaction	89
3.2.5	Guarantees of Non-Repetition	92
3.3	Main Characteristics of Reparations	95
3.3.1	<i>Restitutio in Integrum</i>	97
3.3.2	Full Reparation	97
3.3.3	Adequacy and Appropriateness	98
3.3.4	Proportionality	100
3.4	Other Substantive and Procedural Aspects of Reparations	101
3.4.1	Liability to Repair	101
3.4.2	Beneficiaries	101
3.4.3	Assessment of the Harm	103
3.4.4	Standard of Proof	106
3.4.5	Causality	111
3.5	Compliance with Judgments on Reparations	113
4	Conclusions	117

CHAPTER III

COLLECTIVE REPARATIONS AT THE INTER-AMERICAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

1	Introduction	121
1.1	Selection of Cases	123
1.2	Table of the 40 Cases Selected from the IACtHR's Jurisprudence	125
2	The IACtHR's Legal Framework for Reparations	127
3	Principles on Reparations	129
4	Types of Reparations	130
4.1	Individual Measures	131
4.1.1	Restitution	131
4.1.2	Compensation	132
4.1.3	Rehabilitation	133
4.1.4	Satisfaction and GNR	134
4.2	Collective Measures	136
4.2.1	Symbolic (Satisfaction & GNR)	136
4.2.2	Material	138
4.2.2.1	Restitution	138
4.2.2.2	Compensation	139
4.2.2.3	Rehabilitation	140
4.2.3	Collective Reparations	141
4.2.3.1	Definition	142
5	Substantive and Procedural Aspects of Collective Measures and Reparations	143
5.1	Adequacy	143
5.1.1	Victims' Participation	145
5.1.2	Agreement	147
5.2	Liability to Repair	147
5.3	Beneficiaries	148
5.3.1	Collectivities as Beneficiaries	150
5.3.2	Society as a Beneficiary	151
5.4	Assessment of Harm	151
5.4.1	Moral Harm	153
5.4.2	Material Harm	154
5.4.3	Collective Harm	156
5.5	Standard of Proof	157
5.6	Causality	163
5.7	Implementation of Collective Reparations	166
5.8	Main challenges of Implementation	169
5.8.1	Other Challenges & Dilemmas	170
6	Conclusions	172

CHAPTER IV
COLLECTIVE REPARATIONS IN INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW

1	Introduction	175
2	Legal Framework of Reparations	177
2.1	The ICC's Legal Framework	178
2.1.1	The Trust Fund for Victims	179
2.2	The ECCC's Legal Framework	183
2.2.1	Victims Support Section	184
2.3	Overview of the Cases	185
3	Principles on Reparations	189
3.1	ICC's General Principles	189
3.2	ECCC's General Principles	192
4	Types of Reparations	193
4.1	Individual Reparations	193
4.2	Moral Reparations	195
4.2.1	Acknowledgment of Responsibility	196
4.2.2	Truth-Seeking	198
4.2.3	Dissemination of a Judgment	198
4.2.4	Memory-related Measures	199
4.2.5	Preventive Measures	200
4.2.6	Other Measures of Satisfaction	201
4.3	Collective Reparations	201
4.3.1	Definition	201
4.3.2	Scope	203
4.3.2.1	Scope of the ICC's Collective Reparations	203
4.3.2.2	Scope of the ECCC's Collective Reparations	206
4.3.2.3	Scope of Collective Reparations in General	208
5	Substantive and Procedural Aspects of Collective Reparations	208
5.1	Adequacy	209
5.1.1	Victims' Participation	211
5.2	Liability to Repair	213
5.2.1	Liability and Indigence	214
5.2.2	Liability and Proportionality to the Crime's Contribution	216
5.3	Beneficiaries	220
5.3.1	Who Can Become a Beneficiary?	220
5.3.2	Identification of Beneficiaries	222
5.4	Assessment of Harm	227
5.5	Standard of Proof	229
5.6	Causality	233

5.7 Implementation of Collective Reparations	235
5.7.1 ICC's Implementation of Collective Reparations	236
5.7.2 ECCC's Implementation of Collective Reparations	241
5.8 Main Challenges for Implementation	241
6 Conclusions	244

CHAPTER V

COLLECTIVE REPARATIONS & NON-JUDICIAL BODIES

1 Introduction	249
1.1 Definition of Transitional Justice	251
1.2 Truth and Reconciliation Commissions	252
1.3 National Reparations Programmes	254
1.4 Mass Claims Reparations	255
2 Overview of the Case Studies	256
2.1 Peruvian TRC	256
2.2 Moroccan TRC	259
2.3 The United Nations Compensation Commission	261
2.4 The Eritrea-Ethiopia Claims Commission	263
3 Principles on Reparations in TJMs	264
3.1 National Programmes	265
3.2 Mass Claims Reparations	267
4 Types of Reparations	268
4.1 Individual Reparations	269
4.2 Collective Reparations	270
4.2.1 Concept	270
4.2.2 Scope	271
5 Substantive and Procedural Aspects of Collective Reparations	273
5.1 Adequacy	273
5.1.1 National Reparation Programmes	274
5.1.2 Mass Claims Reparations	277
5.2 Liability	278
5.2.1 National Reparation Programmes	278
5.2.2 Mass Claims Reparations	279
5.3 Beneficiaries	280
5.3.1 National Reparations Programmes	281
5.3.2 Mass Claims Reparations	283
5.4 Assessment of Harm	285
5.4.1 National Reparations Programmes	285
5.4.2 Mass Claims Reparations	288

5.5 Standard of Proof	291
5.5.1 National Reparations Programmes	291
5.5.2 Mass Claims Reparations	292
5.6 Causality	294
5.6.1 National Reparations Programmes	295
5.6.2 Mass Claims Reparations	295
5.7 Implementation of Collective Reparations	297
5.7.1 National Reparations Programmes	297
5.7.2 Mass Claims Reparations	303
5.8 Main Challenges of Implementation	307
6 Conclusions	308

CHAPTER VI

CONCLUSIONS

1 Introduction	313
2 The Main Findings of This Research	314
2.1 Developments Concerning the Right to Reparations	314
2.2 Collective Reparations at the Inter-American Court of Human Rights	315
2.3 Collective Reparations in International Criminal Law	317
2.4 Collective Reparations and Non-Judicial Bodies	318
2.5 Conclusions	320
3 Collective Reparations: A Bitter but Better Approach?	321
3.1 Towards a Concept	322
3.2 Purposes and Aims	324
4 Collective Reparations: Tensions and Dilemmas	326
4.1 Main Tensions	327
4.2 Dilemmas: Beneficiaries and Groups	327
4.3 Dilemmas: Adequacy and its Content	328
4.4 Dilemmas: Standard of Proof and the Causality Requirement	329
4.5 Dilemmas: Assessment of Harm	330
4.6 Extraordinary Justice: A Justification	331
Samenvatting	335
Resumen	349
Résumé	363
Bibliography	375
Table of Instruments	403
Table of Cases, Decisions and Filings	407
Curriculum Vitae	423

ABBREVIATIONS

AC	Appeals Chamber
ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
ACmHPR	African Commission on Human and People's Rights
ACtHPR	African Court on Human and People's Rights
ACHPR	African Charter on Human and People's Rights
Algiers Agreement	2000 Agreement between the Government of the State of Eritrea and the Government of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
ANR	Assurances of Non-Repetition
APRODEH	Asociación Pro Derechos Humanos (Association for Human Rights in Peru)
ASP	Assembly of States Parties
CAR	Central African Republic
CCDH	Conseil Consultatif des Droits de l'Homme (National Human Rights Council)
CHRAC	Cambodian Human Rights Action Committee
CMAN	Comisión Multisectorial de Alto Nivel (High Level Multisectoral Commission)
CNDH	Conseil National des Droits de l'Homme (National Council on Human Rights)
CoE	Council of Europe
CR	Collective Reparations
CVR	Comisión de la Verdad y Reconciliación (Truth and Reconciliation Commission)
DIP	Draft Implementation Plan
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo

Abbreviations

ECCC	Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia
EECC	Eritrea-Ethiopia Claims Commission
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ESCR	Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
FEDADOI	Fondo Especial de Administración de Dineros Obtenidos Ilícitamente (Special Fund for the Administration of Money Illicitly Obtained in Prejudice to the State)
FCDG	Fondation Caisse de Dépôt et de Gestion (Foundation of the Deposit and Management Fund)
GA	General Assembly
GNR	Guarantees of Non-Repitition
GVHR	Gross Violations of Human Rights
HRC	Human Rights Council
HRL	Human Rights Law
IAC	Independent Arbitration Commission
IACCommHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
IASHR	Inter-American System of Human Rights
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICC's RoPE	ICC's Rules of Procedure and Evidence
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICL	International Criminal Law
ICTJ	International Center for Transitional Justice
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IER	Instance Equité et Réconciliation (Equity and Reconciliation Commission)

ILA Declaration	2010 ILA Draft Declaration on Reparations for Victims of Armed Conflict
ILC	International Law Commission
Articles on State Responsibility	ILC Draft Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts
IP	Indigenous Peoples
I&TP	Indigenous and Tribal Peoples
JCE	Joint Criminal Enterprise
LRV	Legal Representatives of the Victims
MCR	Mass Claims Reparations programmes
MoA	Margin of Appreciation
NCR	Consejo Nacional de Reparaciones (National Reparations Council)
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
OAS	Organization of American States
OHCHR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PIR	Plan Integral de Reparaciones (Comprehensive Reparations Plan)
PIR's Law	Ley No. 28592
Principles against Impunity	Set of Principles for the Protection and Promotion of Human Rights through Action to Combat Impunity
Principles on Reparations	UN Basic Principles and Guidelines on the Right to a Remedy and Reparation for Victims of Gross Violations of International Human Rights Law and Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law
Regulations of PIR's Law	Supreme Decree Ds 015-2006-Jus: Reglamento de la Ley No. 28592
RoPE	Rules of Procedure and Evidence
RUV	Registro Único de Víctimas (National Victims Registry)
SC	Security Council

Abbreviations

SCC	Supreme Court Chamber
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
SCU	Special Crimes Unit of the SPSC
SGBV	Sexual Gender-Based Violence
SPSC	Special Panel for Serious Crimes in East Timor
TC	Trial Chamber
TFV	Trust Fund for Victims
TJ	Transitional Justice
TJM	Transitional Justice Mechanisms
TJP	Transitional Justice Processes
TRCs	Truth and Reconciliation Commissions
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNCC	United Nations Compensation Commission
UNCC Rules	UNCC Provisional Rules for Claims Procedure
UNCHR	United Nations Commission on Human Rights
UNPO	Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization
UNMIK	United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo
UNSC	UN Security Council
VCCR	Vienna Convention on Consular Relations
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of the Treaties
Victims' Declaration	1985 Declaration of Basic Principles of Justice for Victims of Crime and Abuse of Power
VSS	Victims Support Section
WWII	World War II