

Advancing the Right to Health Care in China:
Towards Accountability

HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 83.
The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Advancing the Right to Health Care in China:
Towards Accountability

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169 Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Advancing the Right to Health Care in China: Towards Accountability

© Yi Zhang 2019

Cover photograph © alexmlx - Adobe Stock

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

ISBN 978-1-78068-677-6 (paperback)
ISBN 978-1-78068-678-3 (PDF)
D/2019/7849/10
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To my family

I sometimes hear that doing a PhD can be as tough as training for a marathon. I abandoned jogging many years ago and I would not have finished this lonely and tough PhD journey if I did not meet and work with these amazing people, to whom I am deeply grateful for their trust, encouragement, support, friendship and love.

First and foremost, I would like to extend my heartfelt gratitude to my supervisors Prof. Brigit Toebes and Prof. Marcel Brus for their excellent guidance throughout the entire process of my PhD. Being given the opportunity to do a PhD at the University of Groningen was definitely one of the best opportunities of my academic career.

My sincere appreciation also goes to the members of my reading committee, Prof. Aart Hendriks, Prof. Chenguang Wang and Prof. Hans Hogezeil for their thoughtful review and their approval of this thesis.

A special thank you to my colleagues at the International Law Department. It has been a great pleasure and privilege to be part of the team over the years.

I am endlessly grateful to my officemate, my language editor, my paranymph and most importantly, my best friend, Lottie Lane. I cannot imagine that I could have completed this project without her. My deep gratitude goes to Erna, Ira, Katrina, Lucia, Marlies, Marie Elske and Veronika, not only for the interesting academic discussions, but also for their company. I am also grateful for the time spent with my Chinese friends, especially Huanlin Lang, Bin Jiang, Yu Sun and Hao Cui. I will cherish all the fun and adventures we have had in Groningen.

I gratefully acknowledge the Chinese Scholarship Council for funding me to do this PhD project.

Last but certainly not least, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my family for their unconditional support. I dedicate this book to them.

Yi Zhang
April 2018
Groningen

CONTENTS

| | | |
|-----------------------|---|-----------|
| Acknowledgements | v | |
| List of Abbreviations | xv | |
| Chapter 1 | General Introduction | 1 |
| 1.1 | Background and problem | 1 |
| 1.2 | Research questions and structure | 9 |
| 1.2.1 | Research questions | 9 |
| 1.2.2 | Research structure | 10 |
| 1.3 | Methodology | 13 |
| 1.4 | Terminology | 16 |
| 1.5 | Concluding summary | 18 |
| PART 1 | THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE RIGHT TO HEALTH (CARE) – AN ANALYSIS OF CHINA’S PRACTICE | |
| Chapter 2 | The Right to Health Care as a Human Right | 21 |
| 2.1 | Introduction | 21 |
| 2.2 | Defining the right to health care | 23 |
| 2.2.1 | The meaning of the terms ‘health’ and ‘health care’ | 23 |
| 2.2.1.1 | Definition of ‘health’ | 23 |
| 2.2.1.2 | Definition of ‘health care’ | 25 |
| 2.2.2 | The emergence of health as a human right | 26 |
| 2.2.2.1 | The right to health in international human rights law | 27 |
| 2.2.2.2 | The right to health in regional human rights law | 32 |
| 2.2.2.3 | The right to health in national constitutions | 32 |
| 2.2.3 | The meaning of the right to health care | 35 |
| 2.3 | Normative content of the right to health care | 37 |
| 2.3.1 | The scope of the right to health care | 38 |

| | | |
|------------------|--|-----------|
| 2.3.2 | The core content of the right to health care | 41 |
| 2.3.2.1 | The evolution of the ‘core’ concept | 43 |
| 2.3.2.2 | Limitations of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights’ interpretation of ‘core obligations’ | 48 |
| 2.3.2.3 | Scholarly debate over the core concept | 52 |
| 2.3.2.4 | Summary | 56 |
| 2.3.3 | Essential elements of the right to health care: AAAQ-AP | 57 |
| 2.3.3.1 | Availability | 57 |
| 2.3.3.2 | Accessibility | 58 |
| 2.3.3.3 | Acceptability | 62 |
| 2.3.3.4 | (Good) quality | 62 |
| 2.3.3.5 | Accountability | 63 |
| 2.3.3.6 | Participation | 64 |
| 2.4 | States’ obligations arising from the right to health care | 64 |
| 2.4.1 | Progressive realisation | 64 |
| 2.4.2 | Obligations of immediate effect | 66 |
| 2.4.3 | Core obligations to respect, protect and fulfil and violations of such obligations | 68 |
| 2.4.3.1 | Core obligation to respect the right to health care | 69 |
| 2.4.3.2 | Core obligation to protect the right to health care | 70 |
| 2.4.3.3 | Core obligation to fulfil the right to health care | 71 |
| 2.4.4 | General obligations under the right to health care | 72 |
| 2.5 | Concluding summary | 72 |
| Chapter 3 | China’s Legislative Commitments towards the Right to Health Care | 75 |
| 3.1 | Introduction | 75 |
| 3.2 | The background of China’s human rights protection and health care system | 76 |
| 3.2.1 | China’s political and legal system | 76 |
| 3.2.1.1 | China’s political power structure | 76 |
| 3.2.1.2 | China’s health administration and health service delivery system | 79 |
| 3.2.1.3 | China’s legal system | 82 |
| 3.2.1.4 | China’s judicial system | 83 |

| | | |
|------------------|--|------------|
| 3.2.2 | China's ideology of human rights | 84 |
| 3.2.2.1 | The conception of human rights | 84 |
| 3.2.2.2 | Legal protection of human rights | 87 |
| 3.3 | The domestic application of international (human rights) treaties | 88 |
| 3.3.1 | General legal doctrines of domestic application of international (human rights) treaties | 89 |
| 3.3.1.1 | Internal effect | 89 |
| 3.3.1.2 | Direct effect | 91 |
| 3.3.1.3 | Precedence | 92 |
| 3.3.1.4 | General observations | 93 |
| 3.3.2 | Application of international (human rights) treaties in China | 94 |
| 3.3.2.1 | Application of international treaties: general practice | 95 |
| 3.3.2.2 | Application of international human rights treaties | 98 |
| 3.4 | The legislative implementation of the right to health care in China | 99 |
| 3.4.1 | General introduction and methodology | 99 |
| 3.4.2 | The Chinese Constitution and the right to health care | 101 |
| 3.4.2.1 | 'The State respects and preserves human rights' | 101 |
| 3.4.2.2 | Constitutional provisions concerning non-discrimination and equality | 103 |
| 3.4.2.3 | Constitutional provisions concerning health and health care | 104 |
| 3.4.2.4 | Non-direct applicability of constitutional provisions | 106 |
| 3.4.3 | The Chinese health legislation | 108 |
| 3.4.3.1 | An overview of China's health law system | 108 |
| 3.4.3.2 | Provisions concerning non-discrimination and equality | 112 |
| 3.4.3.3 | Provisions concerning elements of other non-derogable core obligations | 114 |
| 3.4 | Concluding summary | 118 |
| Chapter 4 | China's Policy Commitments towards the Right to Health Care | 131 |
| 4.1 | Introduction | 131 |
| 4.2 | An appraisal of China's policy commitments to the right to health care | 134 |
| 4.2.1 | The scope of health policy in the Chinese context | 135 |
| 4.2.2 | Human rights-related documents | 137 |

| | | |
|---------|--|-----|
| 4.2.2.1 | Human Rights White Papers | 137 |
| 4.2.2.2 | National Human Rights Action Plans | 139 |
| 4.2.3 | Health-related documents | 143 |
| 4.2.4 | A comparative normative analysis of Universal Health Coverage and the right to health care | 146 |
| 4.2.4.1 | The changing definitions of Universal Health Coverage | 146 |
| 4.2.4.2 | Evaluating progress towards Universal Health Coverage | 153 |
| 4.2.4.3 | Universal Health Coverage anchored in the right to health care | 154 |
| 4.2.4.4 | Reconciling core obligations under the right to health care with Universal Health Coverage | 160 |
| 4.3 | The evaluation of progress towards the realisation of the right to health care in China | 162 |
| 4.3.1 | Major health care reforms | 162 |
| 4.3.1.1 | Phase one: Before China's reform and opening-up in 1979 | 163 |
| 4.3.1.2 | Phase two: 1980s to 2006 | 164 |
| 4.3.1.3 | Phase three: 2006 to the present | 165 |
| 4.3.2 | Basic medical insurance system | 166 |
| 4.3.2.1 | The Urban Employees' Basic Medical Insurance | 167 |
| 4.3.2.2 | The Urban Residents' Basic Medical Insurance | 168 |
| 4.3.2.3 | The New Rural Cooperative Medical Scheme | 168 |
| 4.3.2.4 | The issue of health equity | 169 |
| 4.3.3 | The provision of essential medicines | 171 |
| 4.3.3.1 | Current reform of China's National Essential Medicines System | 172 |
| 4.3.3.2 | The impact of China's Essential Medicines Policy | 173 |
| 4.4 | Concluding summary | 175 |

PART 2

AN ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK FOR RIGHT TO HEALTH-BASED ACCOUNTABILITY

Chapter 5 An Overview of Right to Health-based Accountability 189

| | | |
|-----|--------------------------------|-----|
| 5.1 | Introduction | 189 |
| 5.2 | Conceptualising accountability | 191 |

| | | |
|------------------|---|------------|
| 5.2.1 | Accountability in different discourses | 192 |
| 5.2.2 | The principal-agent theory | 196 |
| 5.2.3 | Answerability and enforcement: two sides of the same coin | 198 |
| 5.2.3.1 | Answerability | 199 |
| 5.2.3.2 | Enforcement | 201 |
| 5.2.3.3 | <i>Ex ante</i> and <i>ex post</i> accountability | 202 |
| 5.2.4 | Summary | 203 |
| 5.3 | Types of accountability | 203 |
| 5.3.1 | The prevailing view of vertical, horizontal and diagonal accountability | 204 |
| 5.3.2 | Another school of thought on vertical, horizontal and diagonal accountability | 206 |
| 5.4 | Right to health-based accountability: a conceptual framework | 208 |
| 5.4.1 | Defining right to health-based accountability | 208 |
| 5.4.2 | Constituent elements of right to health-based accountability | 211 |
| 5.4.2.1 | Responsibility | 212 |
| 5.4.2.2 | Answerability | 212 |
| 5.4.2.3 | Enforcement | 213 |
| 5.5 | A constructive accountability process | 214 |
| 5.5.1 | Monitoring | 216 |
| 5.5.2 | Judgement | 217 |
| 5.5.3 | Consequences | 218 |
| 5.5.4 | Remedies | 218 |
| 5.6 | Concluding summary | 218 |
| Chapter 6 | Accountability Mechanisms for the Realisation of the Right to Health | 221 |
| 6.1 | Introduction | 221 |
| 6.2 | An overview of accountability mechanisms | 222 |
| 6.2.1 | Accountability and accountability mechanisms: a conceptual clarification | 222 |
| 6.2.2 | Analytical framework for right to health-based accountability | 228 |
| 6.2.2.1 | Components of the analytical framework | 228 |
| 6.2.2.2 | An overview of findings | 232 |
| 6.3 | Domestic accountability mechanisms | 234 |

| | | |
|---------|---|-----|
| 6.3.1 | Judicial accountability mechanisms | 234 |
| 6.3.2 | Quasi-judicial accountability mechanisms | 238 |
| 6.3.3 | Political accountability mechanisms | 239 |
| 6.3.4 | Administrative accountability mechanisms | 242 |
| 6.3.5 | Social accountability mechanisms | 243 |
| 6.4 | The media's role in exerting accountability | 247 |
| 6.5 | International mechanisms for monitoring the implementation of the right to health | 250 |
| 6.5.1 | UN Charter-based accountability mechanisms | 250 |
| 6.5.2 | UN treaty-based accountability mechanisms | 251 |
| 6.5.2.1 | State reporting | 252 |
| 6.5.2.2 | Inter-State communications | 253 |
| 6.5.2.3 | Individual communications | 254 |
| 6.5.2.4 | Inquiries | 255 |
| 6.6 | Concluding summary | 256 |

PART 3

ADVANCING THE RIGHT TO HEALTH CARE IN CHINA - TOWARDS ACCOUNTABILITY

| | | |
|------------------|---|------------|
| Chapter 7 | Accountability Mechanisms for the Realisation of the Right to Health Care in China | 261 |
| 7.1 | Introduction | 261 |
| 7.2 | Overseeing and accountable actors in China's health sector | 262 |
| 7.2.1 | Overseeing actors | 263 |
| 7.2.2 | Accountable actors | 263 |
| 7.3 | Judicial accountability | 265 |
| 7.3.1 | Constitutional accountability mechanisms | 266 |
| 7.3.1.1 | Constitutional review of legislation | 266 |
| 7.3.1.2 | Constitutional litigation – the ' <i>judicialisation</i> ' of the Constitution | 268 |
| 7.3.2 | General judicial accountability mechanisms | 271 |
| 7.3.2.1 | Civil proceedings | 271 |
| 7.3.2.2 | Administrative proceedings | 273 |
| 7.4 | Quasi-judicial accountability | 275 |
| 7.4.1 | 'Letters and visits' | 275 |
| 7.4.2 | Mediation | 276 |

| | | |
|------------------|--|------------|
| 7.5 | Political accountability | 279 |
| 7.6 | Administrative accountability | 281 |
| | 7.6.1 The cadre responsibility system | 283 |
| | 7.6.2 General oversight mechanisms | 286 |
| 7.7 | Social accountability | 288 |
| | 7.7.1 Society-led social accountability | 289 |
| | 7.7.1.1 The role of the media | 290 |
| | 7.7.1.2 The role of CSOs | 297 |
| | 7.7.2 State-led social accountability | 298 |
| | 7.7.3 Implications and limitations | 300 |
| 7.8 | Concluding summary | 302 |
| Chapter 8 | Conclusions | 307 |
| 8.1 | Introduction | 307 |
| 8.2 | Conclusions | 308 |
| 8.3 | Recommendations | 315 |
| ANNEXES | | |
| Annex 1 | The OPERA Framework | 321 |
| Annex 2 | The Evolving Conceptions of ‘ <i>Weisheng</i> ’, ‘ <i>Yiliao</i> ’ and ‘ <i>Jiankang</i> ’ | 323 |
| 1 | Weisheng | 323 |
| 2 | Yiliao | 330 |
| 3 | Jiankang | 332 |
| Annex 3 | Comparison of Chinese basic medical insurance schemes | 335 |
| | List of Instruments | 337 |
| | United Nations Documents | 341 |
| | List of Tables and Figures | 343 |
| | Samenvatting | 345 |
| | Selected Bibliography | 355 |
| | Curriculum Vitae | 367 |
| | Human Rights Research Series | 369 |

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

| | |
|----------|---|
| AAAQ-AP | Availability Accessibility Acceptability Quality Accountability Participation |
| AIDS | Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome |
| APL | Administrative Procedure Law of the People's Republic of China |
| Art | Article |
| BMI | Basic Medical Insurance |
| CDC | Centre for Disease Control and Prevention |
| CEDAW | Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women |
| CERD | International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination |
| CFDA | Chinese Food and Drug Administration |
| CPC | Communist Party of China |
| CRC | Convention on the Rights of the Child |
| CRMW | International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families |
| CRPD | Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities |
| CSOs | Civil Society Organisations |
| CteeEDAW | United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women |
| CteeESCR | United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights |
| CteeRC | United Nations Committee on the Rights of the Child |
| ECHR | Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms |
| ECOSOC | Economic and Social Council |
| ECtHR | European Court of Human Rights |
| Eg | Exempli gratia (for example) |
| ESCR | Economic, Social and Cultural Rights |
| EU | European Union |
| GP | General Practitioner |
| GPCL | General Principles of Civil Law of the People's Republic of China |
| HIV | Human Immunodeficiency Virus |
| ICCPR | International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights |
| ICESCR | International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights |
| IPCD | Insurance Programme for Catastrophic Diseases |

List of Abbreviations

| | |
|--------|---|
| MFA | Medical Financial Assistance |
| MOCA | Ministry of Civil Affairs |
| MOF | Ministry of Finance |
| MOH | Ministry of Health |
| MOHRSS | Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security |
| NDRC | National Development and Reform Commission |
| NHFPC | National Health and Family Planning Commission |
| NHR | New Round of Health Care Reform |
| NHRI | National Human Rights Institution |
| NGOs | Non-governmental Organisations |
| NPC | National People's Congress |
| NPCSC | Standing Committee of the National People's Congress |
| NRCMS | New Rural Cooperative Medical Scheme |
| OECD | Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development |
| OHCHR | Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights |
| OOP | Out-of-pocket |
| OP | Optional Protocol |
| PHC | Primary Health Care |
| SARS | Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome |
| SDGs | Sustainable Development Goals |
| TCM | Traditional Chinese Medicine |
| UDHR | Universal Declaration of Human Rights |
| UEBMI | Urban Employees' Basic Medical Insurance |
| UHC | Universal Health Coverage |
| UK | United Kingdom |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNAIDs | United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS |
| UNDP | United Nations Development Programme |
| UNGA | United Nations General Assembly |
| UNICEF | United Nations Children's Fund |
| URBMI | Urban Residents' Basic Medical Insurance |
| USA | United States of America |
| VCLT | Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties |
| WHA | World Health Assembly |
| WHO | World Health Organisation |