



Revisiting Procedural Human Rights

Fundamentals of Civil Procedure and
the Changing Face of Civil Justice

Editors:
A. Uzelac
C.H. van Rhee

Revisiting Procedural Human Rights

Fundamentals of Civil Procedure and
the Changing Face of Civil Justice



Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: 32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

Revisiting Procedural Human Rights
Fundamentals of Civil Procedure and the Changing Face of Civil Justice
© A. Uzelac and C.H. van Rhee (eds.) 2017

The authors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover photograph © Studio Porto Sabbia - Shutterstock

ISBN 978-1-78068-533-5
D/2017/7849/76
NUR 822

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF AUTHORS	XIII
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XV
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	XVII

INTRODUCTION

A. Uzelac & C.H. van Rhee

REVISITING PROCEDURAL HUMAN RIGHTS. FUNDAMENTALS OF CIVIL PROCEDURE AND THE CHANGING FACE OF CIVIL JUSTICE.....	3
1. Introduction.....	3
2. The Human Right to Accessible and Foreseeable Justice	5
3. Fundamental Procedural Rights from a National Angle.....	7
4. Wheels of History: Fair Trial Rights in Historical Perspective	10
5. Equal Justice for All: Empirical and Normative Approaches to Legal Aid and Assistance in Civil and Administrative Cases.....	11
Bibliography	13

THE HUMAN RIGHT TO ACCESSIBLE AND FORESEEABLE JUSTICE

A. Galič

THE INCONSISTENCY OF CASE LAW AND THE RIGHT TO A FAIR TRIAL.....	17
1. Introduction.....	17
2. The Prohibition of Arbitrary Departure from Settled Case Law in the Case Law of the Slovenian Constitutional Court	19
2.1. General Principles.....	19
2.2. When is the Departure from Settled Case Law ‘Arbitrary’?	21
2.3. There is No Guarantee of Unchangeable Case Law	23

2.4.	When is Case Law Settled?.....	24
2.5.	The Constitutional Court Cannot Intervene when there is no Uniform Case Law	26
3.	Conflicting Court Decisions and the Right to a Fair Trial in the Case Law of the European Court of Human Rights.....	27
3.1.	General Principles.....	27
3.2.	Conflicting Judgments, Legal Certainty and Public Confidence in the Judicial System.....	28
3.3.	The Duty to Give Substantial Reasons for Departing from Earlier Case Law	30
4.	Comments and Recommendations.....	32
4.1.	Departure from Settled Case Law	32
4.2.	Dealing with Matters in which Case Law is not yet Settled.....	35
4.3.	Remedies Available in the Event of Unsettled Case Law.....	38
4.4.	The Oxymoron of ‘Judicial Law-making in Abstracto’: Binding Interpretational Statements	40
4.5.	The Uniformity of Case Law and the Public Role of the Supreme Court.....	42
4.6.	The Importance of Precedent and the Convergence of Civil Law and Common Law Civil Procedure	44
5.	Concluding Remarks: The ‘Constitutionalisation of Precedent’	45
	Bibliography	47

R.L. Marcus

	MISGIVINGS ABOUT AMERICAN EXCEPTIONALISM: COURT ACCESS AS A ZERO-SUM GAME.....	53
1.	Introduction.....	53
2.	The Received Procedural Traditions	55
3.	The US Brand of Broad Access.....	56
4.	50 Years of Convergence?	58
5.	Resistance to Change in the US - Access Defeated?	59
6.	The Competing Narrative - ‘Access Prevented’	63
7.	The Comparative Procedure Argument	66
8.	Toward More Harmonization to Further Access to Justice?.....	67
9.	Conclusion	70
	Bibliography	72

L. Ervo

SHOULD FAIR TRIAL RIGHTS BE REDEFINED? CIVIL LITIGATION AS A SOCIETAL DISCUSSION.....	77
1. New Type of Court Scenes	77
2. People's Trust in the Courts	80
3. Meeting with People.....	81
4. Openness.....	84
5. The New List of Procedural Human Rights.....	88
Bibliography	90

FUNDAMENTAL PROCEDURAL RIGHTS FROM A NATIONAL ANGLE**H.-P. Chen**

DOING JUSTICE: CHINESE CIVIL PROCEDURE AND ITS REFORM	95
1. Introduction.....	95
2. Chinese Civil Procedural Law and Its Institutional Background.....	97
3. Chinese Civil Procedure in Practice	100
3.1. Filing and Docketing	100
3.2. Pretrial Preparation	102
3.3. Trial.....	103
3.4. Post-trial	104
4. Proposals for Reform of Chinese Civil Procedure.....	105
5. Conclusion	110
Bibliography	111

M. Strandberg

THE PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE IN CIVIL CASES	115
1. Introduction.....	115
2. Judgments by the Norwegian Supreme Court	116
3. The Wording of Article 6(2) and Comparative Aspects	118
4. Strasbourg Cases Dealing with the General Meaning of Article 6(2) ..	121
5. The Burden of Proof and the Use of Legal Presumptions	122
6. The Standard of Evidence.....	126
Bibliography	132

Z. Jelinic

FIGHTING RECESSION AT THE EXPENSE OF ACCESS TO JUSTICE. THE CASE OF THE CROATIAN FINANCIAL OPERATIONS AND PRE-BANKRUPTCY SETTLEMENT ACT 135

1.	Introduction.....	135
2.	About the Croatian Two-stage Model of Pre-bankruptcy Proceedings.....	139
3.	Understanding PBS Proceedings from a Practical Point of View.....	141
4.	FINA's Settlement Committees – Independent and Impartial Tribunals or just the Long Arm of the State?	142
5.	Commercial Courts – Only Rubber Stamps or Judicial Bodies with Full Jurisdiction?	146
6.	Approval of the Pre-bankruptcy Settlement and Legal Remedies against the Decision of the Court on Approval of the Pre-bankruptcy Settlement	148
7.	A Few Words about the Role of FINA's Settlement Committees in the New Bankruptcy Code	151
8.	Concluding Remarks	152

Bibliography	155
--------------------	-----

S. Spinei

THE RIGHT PRINCIPLES – WHAT OUTCOME? FUNDAMENTAL PROCEDURAL RIGHTS AND THEIR IMPLEMENTATION IN ROMANIAN CIVIL PROCEDURE AND OTHER LEGAL SYSTEMS..... 157

1.	Foreword.....	157
2.	Convention Violations.....	158
3.	Early Years. The Principle of Legal Certainty: The Right not to Have a Final Judicial Decision Called into Question.....	158
4.	The 2013 New Code of Civil Procedure (NCPC).....	160
4.1.	Justification.....	160
4.2.	Principles of Civil Process.....	160
4.2.1.	Preliminary Remarks. Inconsistency as Principle?	160
4.2.2.	Addressing Major Deficiencies	162
4.2.2.1.	Length of Proceedings.....	162
4.2.2.1.1.	The Principle (Optimal and Predictable Time)	162
4.2.2.1.2.	Implementation.....	162
4.2.2.1.2.1	The 'Optimal Time' Standard.....	162
4.2.2.1.2.2	The 'Predictable/Foreseeable' Time Standard.....	164
4.2.2.1.2.3	The Existence of Effective Remedies for Breaching the Principle	165
4.2.2.2.	Legal Certainty: Consistency of Case Law/Predictability	165
5.	ECtHR: <i>Vlad and Others v. Romania</i> , 26 November 2013	169
6.	Compensatory Remedies in European Legislation	171

Bibliography	175
--------------------	-----

D. van Loggerenberg

WHAT IS HAPPENING TO FUNDAMENTAL PROCEDURAL GUARANTEES IN THE AREA OF CIVIL JUSTICE? A VIEW FROM SOUTH AFRICA 179

1.	Introduction.....	179
2.	What is Happening to Fundamental Procedural Guarantees in South Africa in the Area of Civil Justice?	180
2.1.	The Limitation of the Right to Access to Courts.....	181
2.2.	Arrest of Persons to Found or Confirm Jurisdiction	182
2.3.	Arrests tanquam suspectus de fuga	185
3.	Class Actions	187
3.1.	Certification	189
3.2.	Class Definition	189
3.3.	A Cause of Action that Raises a Triable Issue.....	189
3.4.	The Procedure to be Adopted in an Application for Certification.....	190
3.5.	Common Issues of Fact or Law	190
3.6.	The Representative Plaintiff and his Lawyers	190
4.	Conclusion	192

Bibliography	193
--------------------	-----

N. Baradanchenkova and K. Sergeeva

JUDICIAL REFORM IN RUSSIA AND ITS IMPACT ON PROCEDURAL HUMAN RIGHTS AND ACCESS TO JUSTICE 195

1.	Introduction.....	195
2.	The Court System Issue.....	196
3.	Appointment of Judges.....	197
4.	The Competence Issue.....	199
5.	Means of Recourse against Judgments	201
6.	The Future of the Commercial Procedural Law Innovations	203
7.	Conclusion	204

Bibliography	206
--------------------	-----

J. Sladič

CONDITIONS OF ADMISSIBILITY AND ACCESS TO JUSTICE – A SLOVENIAN PERSPECTIVE. 209

1.	Introduction.....	209
2.	The Slovenian Constitution, Article 6 of the (European) Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, and Conditions of Admissibility.....	210
3.	The Position of Conditions of Admissibility in Civil Procedure: The Modern <i>sequitur, ut de exceptionibus dispicamus</i>	212

4.	The Division of Conditions of Admissibility	219
4.1.	Absolute and Relative Conditions of Admissibility.....	219
4.2.	Positive and Negative Conditions of Admissibility	220
4.3.	General and Special Conditions of Admissibility	220
4.4.	Conditions of Admissibility Pertaining to the Court	221
4.5.	Conditions of Admissibility Pertaining to the Parties	221
4.6.	Conditions of Admissibility Pertaining to the Subject Matter of the Case.....	222
5.	Conditions of Admissibility and other Procedural Bars Originating in International Law in Slovenian Case Law	224
5.1.	State Immunity	224
5.1.1.	Position of Slovenian Courts	225
5.1.2.	Position of the Court of Justice of the European Union.....	228
5.1.3.	Position of the European Court of Human Rights	228
5.1.4.	Position of the International Court of Justice	230
5.1.4.1.	The Territorial Tort Exception.....	230
5.1.4.2.	The Difference between Immunity from Jurisdiction and Immunity from Enforcement	231
5.1.4.3.	Exequatur and State Immunity from Jurisdiction	232
5.2.	Dismemberment of a State – Existing Clauses of prorogatio fori expressa	233
5.3.	Is there still a <i>cautio iudicatum solvi</i> in Slovenian Law?	233
6.	Conclusion	235
	Bibliography	236

WHEELS OF HISTORY: FAIR TRIAL RIGHTS IN HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE

I. Milotić

	ACCESS TO JUSTICE BY MEANS OF ARBITRATION IN ROMAN LAW	243
1.	Introduction	243
2.	Ability to be a Party in Dispute Resolution as a Means of Access to Justice.....	245
3.	Eliminating Constraints of Ordinary Jurisdiction as a Mechanism to Facilitate Access to Justice	248
4.	Excessive (<i>plus petitio</i>) and Non-pecuniary Claims from the Perspective of Access to Justice.....	250
5.	Importance of the Method of Operation in Dispute Resolution from the Perspective of Access to Justice	252
6.	An Overview of Access to Justice through Arbitration in Different Periods of the Roman State.....	254
7.	Conclusion	256
	Bibliography	258

T. Karlović**CIVIL PROCEDURAL ASPECTS OF RETROACTIVITY – HISTORICAL AND COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES..... 263**

1.	Introduction.....	263
2.	<i>Tempus regit actum</i> and Forms of Retroactivity	265
3.	Procedural Aspects of Retroactivity in Roman Law	267
4.	From the Medieval Distinction between <i>decisoria</i> and <i>ordinaria litis</i> to Contemporary Codes of Civil Procedure	270
5.	Retroactive Legislation and Procedural Human Rights	272
6.	Conclusion	277

Bibliography	279
--------------------	-----

EQUAL JUSTICE FOR ALL: EMPIRICAL AND NORMATIVE APPROACHES TO LEGAL AID AND ASSISTANCE IN CIVIL AND ADMINISTRATIVE CASES**S. Nieuwenhuis, B. Laarhoven, J. van Nuland and F. Fernhout****THE PARADOX OF ACCESS TO JUSTICE – EMPIRICAL RESEARCH INTO THE ATTITUDE OF THE CANTONAL JUDGE TOWARDS UNREPRESENTED PARTIES IN DUTCH CIVIL PROCEDURE..... 287**

1.	Introduction.....	287
2.	Dutch Civil Procedure and the Position of the Court	288
2.1.	Civil Procedure in Cantonal Cases	288
2.2.	Position of the Civil Judge towards the Parties	289
2.3.	Post-Defence Hearing.....	290
2.4.	The Problematic Position of the Unrepresented Party.....	291
3.	The Solutions of Other Jurisdictions	292
3.1.	Austria	292
3.2.	Denmark.....	293
3.3.	Germany.....	294
3.4.	Interim Conclusion	295
4.	Research Design.....	295
4.1.	Operationalization of Communication in Court ‘Pointing towards an Intention to Help’ and Registration of Events	295
4.2.	Observation Forms	296
4.3.	Visiting Court Hearings.....	297
5.	Results	297
5.1.	Relevant Events.....	297
5.2.	Irrelevant Events	300
5.3.	Including Time	300
5.4.	Clear Discrimination of Unrepresented Parties.....	302
6.	To Conclude.....	303

Bibliography	305
--------------------	-----

M. Held

ACCESS TO JUSTICE IN ADMINISTRATIVE CASES. AN ANALYSIS OF CASES OF THE ZAGREB LEGAL CLINIC..... 307

1. Introduction..... 307

2. Legal Basis for Access to Justice in Administrative Matters in Croatia 308

3. Access to Justice in Administrative Proceedings: Examples from the Zagreb Legal Clinic..... 309

3.1. Right to a Trial within a Reasonable Time, Administrative Silence, Constitutional Complaint and Appeal to the ECtHR 310

3.1.1. Reasonable Time 310

3.1.2. Administrative Inactivity..... 311

3.1.3. Constitutional Complaint 311

3.1.4. Application to the ECtHR..... 311

3.2. Procedural Rights, Appeal in Administrative Procedure and Administrative Complaint..... 312

3.2.1. Procedural Rights and Appeal..... 312

3.2.2. Administrative Complaint..... 312

3.3. Social Rights, Free Legal Aid, Work of Administrative Bodies and Civil Servants..... 312

3.3.1. Social Rights in General and Free Legal Aid..... 313

3.3.2. Violation of Social Rights by Administrative Bodies and Civil Servants 313

3.4. Other Categories 314

4. Conclusion 314

Bibliography 316

S. Aras Kramar

ARE FINANCIAL BURDENS PREVENTING ACCESS TO JUSTICE IN SOUTHEAST EUROPEAN JUDICIAL SYSTEMS?..... 317

1. Introduction..... 317

2. Litigation Costs: General Remarks 318

3. Attorneys' Fees..... 320

4. Legal Aid Systems and *Pro Bono* Representation..... 322

4.1. General Remarks..... 322

4.2. Legal Aid..... 324

5. Concluding Remarks..... 331

Bibliography 334



LIST OF AUTHORS

Slađana Aras Kramar, Assistant Professor, Department of Civil Procedure, Faculty of Law, Zagreb University, Zagreb, Croatia

Natalia Baradanchenkova, PhD candidate and Senior lecturer, Department of Civil Procedure, Ural State Law University, Yekaterinburg, Russia

Hang-Ping Chen, Associate Professor, School of Law, Tsinghua University, Beijing, China

Laura Ervo, Professor of Procedural Law, University of Örebro, Örebro, Sweden, Associate Professor at the Finnish Universities of Turku, Helsinki and Eastern Finland, Finland

Fokke Fernhout, Associate Professor of Civil Procedure, Faculty of Law, Maastricht University, Maastricht, the Netherlands

Aleš Galič, Professor of Civil Procedure, Faculty of Law, University of Ljubljana, Ljubljana, Slovenia

Mateja Held, Associate Professor of Administrative Law, Faculty of Law, University of Zagreb, Zagreb, Croatia

Zvonimir Jelinić, Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, J.J. Strossmayer University of Osijek, Osijek, Croatia

Tomislav Karlović, Assistant Professor of Roman Law, Faculty of Law, Zagreb University, Zagreb, Croatia

Bianca Laarhoven, former student at Faculty of Law, Maastricht University, Maastricht, the Netherlands

Richard L. Marcus, Coil Chair in Litigation, Hastings College of the Law, University of California; Associate Reporter, Advisory Committee on Civil Rules, Judicial Conference of the US

Ivan Milotić, Assistant Professor of Roman Law, Zagreb University, Zagreb, Croatia

Stefan Nieuwendijk, former student at Faculty of Law, Maastricht University, Maastricht, the Netherlands

Ksenia Sergeeva, Ural State Law University, Yekaterinburg, Russia; Chief Legal Counsel (RusHydro)

Jorg Sladič, Sladič Law Firm, Ljubljana, Slovenia; Associate Professor of International and European Law, University of Maribor, Maribor, Slovenia

Sebastian Spinei, Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, 'Lucian Blaga' University of Sibiu, Sibiu, Romania

Magne Strandberg, Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Bergen, Bergen, Norway

Alan Uzelac, Professor of Civil Procedure, Faculty of Law, Zagreb University, Zagreb, Croatia

Danie van Loggerenberg, Member of the Pretoria Bar; formerly Professor of Law, University of Port Elizabeth, Port Elizabeth; Extraordinary Professor of Law, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa

Jeffrey van Nuland, former student at Faculty of Law, Maastricht University, Maastricht, the Netherlands

Remco (C.H.) van Rhee, Professor of European Legal History and Comparative Civil Procedure, Faculty of Law, Maastricht University, Maastricht, the Netherlands

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AACLAA	Amendments to the Croatian Legal Aid Act
AD	Anno Domini
ADA	Administrative Disputes Act
ADR	Alternative Dispute Resolution
AFOPS	Act on Financial Operations and Pre-Bankruptcy Settlement
AGAP	Act on General Administrative Procedure
Art.	Article
BC	Before Christ
CALP	Act on the Legal Profession
CBA	Croatian Bar Association
CCJE	Consultative Council of European Judges
CCPA	Croatian Civil Procedure Act
CEPEJ	European Commission for the Efficiency of Justice
CLAA	Croatian Legal Aid Act
CPA	Civil Procedure Act
CPL	Civil Procedure Law
CPR	Civil Procedure Rules
CQES	Case Quality Evaluation System
DCCP	Dutch Code of Civil Procedure
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EU	European Union
FINA	Financial Agency
GVG	<i>Gerichtsverfassungsgesetz</i> (Court Act)
ICJ	International Court of Justice
JPE	Judicial Performance Evaluation
MNLAA	Montenegro Legal Aid Act
NCPC	New Code of Civil Procedure
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
No.	Number
OIB	Personal Identification Number
ÖZPO	Österreichische Zivilprozessordnung (Austrian Code of Civil Procedure)

List of Abbreviations

PBS	Pre-Bankruptcy Settlement
PRC	People's Republic of China
RC	Republic of Croatia
RPL	<i>Retsplejelov</i> (Danish Code of Procedure)
RS	Republic of Slovenia
SEC	Securities & Exchange Commission
SLAA	Slovenian Legal Aid Act
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
US	United States (of America)
WWII	World War II
ZPO	<i>Zivilprozessordnung</i> (Code of Civil Procedure)
ZPP	Slovenian law on civil procedure

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The editors would like to thank Mrs. Marina Jodogne from the Maastricht European Institute for Transnational Legal Research (Maastrichts Europees Instituut voor Transnationaal Rechtswetenschappelijk Onderzoek or METRO) for her help and advice in editing the present volume. They are also grateful to Mr. Randolph Davidson (Pavia) for revising the English of the contributions of the non-native speakers; his language revision often went beyond what may be expected from a language revisor.

Most of the contributions to this book were initially presented as a paper and discussed at a postgraduate course and conference which took place at the Inter-University Centre Dubrovnik, as a part of the Public and Private Justice (PPJ) series. The editors would like to thank the Inter-University Centre, led by Secretary General Ms. Nada Bruer, for their continuing kind assistance in providing an inspiring forum for high-quality professional and academic debates. The comprehensive PPJ discussions would not have been possible without the help of the Maastricht and Zagreb Universities. In particular, helpful aid in all organisational matters on-site was provided by the team of the Faculty of Law in Zagreb and its Legal Clinic led by Marko Bratković (who also assisted in the editing of this book). Some financial support for participation of individual participants was provided by two Croatian ministries (Ministry of Justice and Ministry of Science, Education and Sports) and the HESP Programme of the Soros Foundation. Many contributions to this book are the result of research within the ambit of the project *Transformation of Civil Justice under the Influence of Global and Regional Integration Processes. Unity and Diversity* (TCJust-UD, IP-11-2013) approved and financed by the Croatian Science Foundation (HRZZ).

A. Uzelac and C.H. van Rhee
May 2017

