

THE FUTURE OF BUSINESS AND HUMAN RIGHTS

THE FUTURE OF BUSINESS
AND HUMAN RIGHTS

Theoretical and Practical Considerations
for a UN Treaty

Edited by
Jernej LETNAR ČERNIČ
Nicolás CARRILLO-SANTARELLI



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

The Future of Business and Human Rights. Theoretical and Practical Considerations
for a UN Treaty

© The editors and contributors severally 2018

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents
Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or
by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or
under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning
reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the
address above.

Image on cover © Jernej Letnar Čerņič, Sangat Ampil, Cambodia, January 2017

ISBN 978-1-78068-491-8

D/2018/7849/7

NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from
the British Library.

To Miren, my *bihotz*.

JLĈ

To Carol, Mateo and Valeria, my joy and my Triforce of Wisdom

NCS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to thank the contributors to this volume for their debates, original arguments, hard work and patience. We would also like to thank the Autónoma de Madrid University for providing the venue for the workshop on which this volume is based. We would like to give special thanks to Professor Carlos Esposito Massicci for his support and to Ann-Christin Maak-Scherpe of Intersentia for her invaluable help, comments and assistance.

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>About the Contributors</i>	xiii

Introduction

Jernej LETNAR ČERNIČ and Nicolás CARRILLO-SANTARELLI	1
------------------------------------------------------------	---

PART I. THE CONVENIENCE AND POSSIBILITY OF ADOPTING A TREATY ON BUSINESS AND HUMAN RIGHTS

Alternative Paths to a Business and Human Rights Treaty

Surya DEVA	13
1. Introduction	13
2. State of the Art: Binding Corporate Obligations and the “Three High Tides’	17
3. Exploring Alternative Paths	23
4. Conclusion	30

A Defence of Direct International Human Rights Obligations of (All) Corporations

Nicolás CARRILLO-SANTARELLI	33
1. Introduction	33
2. The Centrality of Victims and the Existence of Corporate <i>Violations</i> : Key Issues Frequently Ignored	34
3. Rebutting the Objections to Direct International Human Rights Obligations of <i>All</i> Corporations, and Affirming the Benefits of those Duties	44
4. The Existence of Implied General Duties and the Relevance of Complementary Express Obligations	54
5. Conclusions	59

A Treaty on Business and Human Rights: Problems and Prospects

Chiara MACCHI	63
1. Introduction: Moving the Business and Human Rights Agenda Forward	63

2.	The <i>Ratione Personae</i> Scope of the Proposed Treaty.	68
3.	The Nature of the Proposed Treaty and its <i>Ratione Materiae</i> Scope.	71
4.	The Long and Winding Road Towards an International Treaty	76
5.	Monitoring the Treaty: What Role for a Business and Human Rights Treaty Body?	81
6.	Conclusion: The Added Value of a Treaty on Business and Human Rights.	82

PART II. CRITICAL ANALYSES OF A TREATY ON BUSINESS
AND HUMAN RIGHTS

Considering a Treaty on Corporations and Human Rights:

Mostly Failures but with a Glimmer of Success

	Larry Catá BACKER	89
1.	Introduction	89
2.	The Failures that the Treaty Process Reveals	93
3.	From Out of Failure ... Small Success: Why the Treaty Process Ought to Embrace its Destiny	105
4.	Conclusion	109

**‘Band-Aids Don’t Fix Bullet Holes’: In Defence of a Traditional
State-Centric Approach**

	Tara L VAN HO	111
1.	Introduction	111
2.	The Guiding Principles and the Need for a Treaty	115
3.	Horizontal Human Rights in a State-Centric Approach	122
4.	Assessing and Modifying the Current Tools	130
5.	Conclusions	136

Voluntary vs. Binding: Civil Society’s Claim for a Binding Instrument

	Ana María SUÁREZ FRANCO and Daniel FYFE	139
1.	Introduction	139
2.	The Reasons behind the Demand for a Binding Instrument to Regulate TNCs	140
3.	The Response from the Treaty Alliance	146
4.	Resolution 26/9	150
5.	The Pre-Sessional Period	151
6.	First Session of the Open-Ended Intergovernmental Working Group.	152
7.	Second Session of the Oeigwg, 24–28 October 2016	155
8.	Conclusions: The Added Values of the Process and the Way Ahead	157

PART III. REGIONAL APPROACHES

Business and Human Rights in the Americas: Defining a Latin American Route to Corporate Responsibility

Humberto CANTÚ RIVERA	163
1. Introduction	163
2. The Treaty Resolution and the Position of Latin American States During the First and Second Sessions of the Treaty Process	165
3. First Steps Towards the Implementation of the UN Guiding Principles in the Americas	170
4. A Changing Role for the Inter-American Human Rights System: Human Rights Due Diligence	180
5. Concluding Thoughts	184

**The Applicability of Human Rights Treaties to Business Enterprises:
A Case Study of India**

Manoj Kumar SINHA	185
1. Introduction	185
2. Business and Human Rights.	186
3. Enforcement of Human Rights	187
4. Human Rights and the Indian Constitution	188
5. Right to Work	191
6. Right to Social Security	198
7. UN Treaty on Business and Human Rights: Indian Experience	205
8. Conclusion	207

Reckless Business: Corporate Accountability for Atrocities

Dan KUWALI	209
1. Introduction	209
2. Mapping Out the Business and Human Rights Agenda in Africa	212
3. Why a Treaty? Closing the Corporate Accountability Gap	216
4. From Corporate Impunity to Corporate Accountability: Towards Responsible Business Conduct	220
5. Conclusion	226

European Perspectives on the Business and Human Rights Treaty Initiative

Jernej LETNAR ČERNIČ	229
1. Introduction	229
2. The UN Guiding Principles and the European States.	230
3. Workings within the Council of Europe.	233

4.	The European Union and Business and Human Rights	236
5.	How to Move Forward?	243
6.	Conclusion	248

PART IV. LESSONS FROM OTHER REGIMES OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

A Convention or a Recommendation? The Experience of International Labour Legislation

	Ago SHIN-ICHI	253
1.	Introduction	253
2.	Legal Nature of International Labour Instruments	254
3.	A ‘Soft Drive’ Towards Ratification of an ILO Convention	256
4.	Conventions and Recommendations as a Set	259
5.	Lessons Learnt from the ILO’s Choice of Legal Instruments	262
6.	Lesson from the ILO’s Tripartite Declaration on Multinational Enterprises	263
7.	Treaty or Guidelines: Concluding Remarks	270

Lessons for the Treaty Process from the International Law Commission and International Environmental Law

	Sara L SECK	273
1.	Introduction	273
2.	The Amnesty Case Studies	275
3.	Contributions of the International Law Commission	285
4.	Conclusions: Lessons for the Treaty Process	294

Conclusion

	Jernej LETNAR ČERNIČ and Nicolás CARRILLO-SANTARELLI	299
1.	Actor-Related Scope	301
2.	Subject-Related Scope	302
3.	Final Remarks	306

	<i>Index</i>	307
--	------------------------	-----

ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTORS

Jernej Letnar Čerňič is Associate Professor of Human Rights Law at the Graduate School of Government and European Studies in Kranj (Slovenia) and Senior Research Fellow at the University Institute of European Studies – IUSE (Turin, Italy). He also holds a Diploma in Human Rights Law from the European University Institute and Diplome de droit international et de droit comparé des droits de l'homme (merit) from René Cassin Institut International des droits de l'homme. He completed his PhD in Human Rights Law in 2009 at the University of Aberdeen. He has published articles in Slovenian, English, Spanish, Italian, Romanian and Swedish, and his works have been cited in reports by the United Nations, European Union institutions and the Council of Europe and in academic studies from around the world.

Nicolás Carrillo-Santarelli is Associate Professor of International Law at the La Sabana University in Chía (Colombia) and a member of the International Law Association and its Study Group on Business and Human Rights. He holds a European PhD degree in International Law and International Relations from the Autónoma de Madrid University, and an LLM. in the protection of human rights from Alcalá University. He has published books and articles on the international legal responsibility of non-state actors and other international legal issues in English and Spanish.

Humberto Cantú Rivera is Professor in the School of Law of the University of Monterrey (Mexico). He is a member of the Research Centre on Human Rights and Humanitarian Law (CRDH) of Panthéon-Assas Paris II University (France), an expert advisor to the government of Mexico, before the Open-Ended Intergovernmental Working Group on human rights and transnational corporations and other business enterprises, and in the development of Mexico's National Action Plan on business and human rights, and is a member of the International Law Association's Study Group on Business and Human Rights. He is on the editorial board of the *Business and Human Rights Journal* and is editor of *Derechos humanos y empresas: reflexiones desde América Latina* (Inter-American Institute of Human Rights, 2017), the first book in Spanish on this topic with a regional perspective.

Larry Catá Backer is the W Richard and Mary Eshelman Faculty Scholar and Professor of Law & International Affairs at Pennsylvania State University. His research focuses on governance-related issues of globalisation and the

constitutional theories of public and private governance, with a focus on institutional frameworks for public-private law governance systems. Current research includes corporate social responsibility, business and human rights, and the regulation of global production chains. His publications include *Lawyers Making Meaning* (2013) and *Signs in Law* (2014) (both with Jan Broekman), casebooks, *Elements of Law and the US Legal System* (2017), *Comparative Corporate Law* (2002), *Harmonizing Law in an Era of Globalization* (editor, 2007), and a number of articles and contributions to published collections of essays. Shorter essays on various aspects of globalisation and governance appear on his essay site, 'Law at the End of the Day', <http://lcbackerblog.blogspot.com>. He sits on the editorial/advisory boards of the *Business and Human Rights Journal* (CUP), International Private Law Book Series (Eurilink University Press), and *Iuris Dictio* (Universidad de San Francisco de Quito, Ecuador).

Surya Deva is an Associate Professor at the School of Law of City University of Hong Kong and a Member of the UN Working Group on Business and Human Rights. His primary research interests lie in business and human rights, India-China constitutional law, and sustainable development. He has published extensively in these areas, and has advised UN bodies, states, multinational corporations and civil society organisations on issues concerning business and human rights. His books include *Socio-Economic Rights in Emerging Free Markets: Comparative Insights from India and China* (editor) (2015); *Human Rights Obligations of Business: Beyond the Corporate Responsibility to Respect?* (co-editor with David Bilchitz) (2013); and *Regulating Corporate Human Rights Violations: Humanizing Business* (2012). He is one of the founding editors-in-chief of the *Business and Human Rights Journal* (CUP) and sits on the editorial/advisory board of the *Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights*, and the *Vienna Journal on International Constitutional Law*. In 2014 Deva was elected a member of the Executive Committee of the International Association of Constitutional Law.

Daniel Fyfe has been working as Research and Advocacy Officer for FIAN International at their Geneva office before the UN Human Rights system since 2015. He holds a BSc in Political Science from the University of Geneva and a MSc in Human Rights from the London School of Economics and Political Science. He has been participating in the negotiations at the UN Human Rights Council on an international legally binding instrument on human rights and transnational corporations and other business enterprises, and supporting the activities of the Treaty Alliance. He additionally works towards mainstreaming States' extraterritorial obligations within UN Human Rights bodies and supports civil society advocacy work with the UN Treaty Bodies and Human Rights Council. He has undertaken research analysing the discourse within the United Nations on business and human rights issues, on the human rights impact of land grabbing by European corporate and financial entities

in third countries and is currently researching the causes and human rights impacts of the transformation of peasant seed systems in West Africa. He has previously worked for human rights and trade union organisations.

Dan Kuwali is an Extraordinary Professor of International Law at the Centre for Human Rights, Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria; a Fellow of the Carr Center for Human Rights Policy, Harvard Kennedy School of Government; and a Distinguished Professor of Law and International Affairs, University of Lilongwe. He serves in the Malawi Defence Force where he heads the Directorate of Legal Services with the rank of Brigadier General. He is a Senior Fellow, R2P Scholars Network at the Canadian Centre for the Responsibility to Protect (Canada); correspondent, since 2007, of the *Year Book of International Humanitarian Law*; an editor of the *African Yearbook of International Humanitarian Law*; and an Associate Member of the Institute of International Humanitarian Law (IIHL), Sanremo (Italy). He is a former Research Fellow at the Danish Institute of International Legal Studies in Copenhagen; Marie Curie Researcher at the Grotius Centre, Leiden University (The Hague); Guest Researcher at the Nordic African Institute, Upscale (Sweden); and until recently, Senior Researcher at the Centre for Conflict Resolution, University of Cape Town. He worked as a Division Legal Advisor at the then United Nations (UN) Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo (MONUC). He is also the author of *Responsibility to Protect: Implementation of Article 4(h) Intervention* (2011); *Africa and the Responsibility to Protect* (2014), and *By All Means Necessary: Protecting Civilians and Preventing Mass Atrocities in Africa* (2017).

Chiara Macchi is a Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the Sant'Anna School of Advanced Studies (Pisa, Italy). She completed her PhD in 2015 with a thesis on corporate accountability for human rights abuses occurring in transnational supply chains. She teaches courses in business and human rights, and international human rights law. As an associate member of the Essex Business and Human Rights Project, she takes part in consultancy projects for governmental and non-governmental organisations on the human rights impacts of extractive and garment industries. In 2013 she was a consultant for the Italian Ministry for Economic Development and the Italian OECD National Contact Point producing a report on the business and human rights legal and policy framework in Italy. Her current research focuses on the right to water, corporate accountability for human rights violations, and conflict minerals policies.

Sara L Seck (LLB, Toronto; PhD, Osgoode Hall) is an Associate Professor with tenure in the Schulich School of Law at Dalhousie University (Nova Scotia, Canada), where she is a member of the Marine and Environmental Law Institute. Previously, she was a member of the Faculty of Law, Western University in Ontario (Canada). In September 2015 she received the Emerging Scholarship Award from the Academy of Environmental Law of the IUCN

(World Conservation Union) in recognition of her research contributions on sustainable mining and international environmental law. She is a Senior Fellow with CIGI's International Law Research Program, where her research examines business responsibilities for human rights affected by climate change. Seck is a member of the editorial board of the new *Business and Human Rights Journal* (CUP), a member of the International Law Association's Business and Human Rights study group, and a member of the governance committee of Columbia University's Teaching Business and Human Rights Forum.

Ago Shin-Ichi is a Professor of Law at Ritsumeikan University in Kyoto (Japan). Before joining Ritsumeikan University, he was Professor of Law at Kyushu and legal officer at the International Labour Organization (ILO). He received both his LLB. and LL.M. from Tokyo University and obtained his Doctorat en Sciences Politiques from the University of Geneva. He worked with the ILO from 1980 to 1993 in its International Labour Standards Department before returning to academia. He has been a judge at the Asian Development Bank Administrative Tribunal since 2013 and a member of the ILO's Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations since 2015. His latest publication (in English) is *Non-Economic Criteria in the Formulation of the World Trade Regime: From Social Clause to CSR*, (2012).

Manoj Kumar Sinha is Director of the Indian Law Institute. He obtained his doctorate in International Law from Jawaharlal Nehru University, and LL.M. from the University of Nottingham and LL.B. from the University of Delhi. In 1998 he attended the 29th session of the International Institute of Human Rights in Strasbourg (France). His areas of specialisation are human rights, constitutional law, international humanitarian and refugee law, international criminal law, international law and international institutions. He has published extensively in national and international law journals in the field of international law, international relations, constitutional law, international human rights, humanitarian and refugee laws. He is a member of the editorial boards of various well-known national and international journals.

Ana María Suárez Franco is currently the Permanent Representative of FIAN International before the UN Human Rights system in Geneva, as well as coordinator of the accountability work of the organisation. She holds degrees in law from the Universidad Javeriana (Bogotá), as well as in public policies from the Universidad de los Andes (Bogotá). She has received the titles LL.M. from the University of Heidelberg and Doctor Juris from the University of Mannheim. Her main topics of research have been the Justiciability of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the monitoring of public policies related to the Human Right to Food. In this practice she has committed her work mainly to case advocacy, public policy monitoring, the gender dimension of the right to food and nutrition and extraterritorial obligations of human

rights. She has participated in the process towards the adoption of the Maastricht Principles on the Extraterritorial Obligations of States, the process towards the adoption of an International Declaration on the Rights of Peasants, the discussions on human rights and transnational companies and has been supporting civil society work with the CESCR and CEDAW. She has been working closely with diverse communities affected by right to food and nutrition violations in diverse regions supporting them with case advocacy and co-construction of knowledge.

Tara L Van Ho is an Assistant Professor of Law at Aarhus University (Denmark). In addition to her BA in English, she holds a JD (Cincinnati, USA) and an LLM in international human rights law and a PhD in law (both from Essex, UK). She has advised governments, intergovernmental organisations, and non-governmental organisations through her work with the Essex Business and Human Rights Project. She researches, writes and teaches on the intersection of human rights, humanitarian law, transitional justice, investment law, and business and human rights. Funding for her research came from the INTRALaw Centre in the Department of Law, Aarhus University.

