

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

VOLUME LIII

INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR RWANDA

2010-2012

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

VOLUME LIII

INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR RWANDA

2010-2012

André KLIP/ Steven FREELAND (editors)

Victoria Häberle (assistant-editor)



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Please cite as: ICTR, Judgement, *Renzaho v. Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-97-31-A, A. Ch., 1 April 2011, Klip/
Freeland ALC-LIII-213

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals
© André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.); Victoria Häberle (assistant editor) 2019

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover illustration: Martha Koocheki

ISBN 978-1-78068-490-1 (paperback)
ISBN 978-1-78068-814-5 (PDF)
D/2019/7849/17
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

CONTENTS

Contents	5
Preface	7
Part I Preliminary Issues	
Decision on Prosecutor’s Request for Clarification of Trial Chamber’s “ <i>Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Admission into Evidence of Post-Arrest Interviews with Joseph Nzirorera and Mat[ithieu Ngirumpatse</i> ” Rule 89(C) and 95 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera and Ngirumpatse</i> , Case No. ICTR-98–44-T, T.Ch. III, 6 December 2010	9
Decision on the Prosecutor’s Request for Preservation of Evidence by Special Deposition for a Future Trial (Pursuant to Rule 71bis), <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-98–44F-R71bis, T. Ch. III, 5 May 2011	13
Decision on Callixte Nzabonimana’s Interlocutory Appeal of the Trial Chamber’s Decision, Dated 10 February 2011, <i>Nzabonimana v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98–44D-AR77, A. Ch., 11 May 2011	19
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Liu Daqun	23
Commentary <i>Ana María Torres Chedraui</i>	24
Part II Referral To Rwanda	
Decision on Prosecutor’s Request for Referral to the Republic of Rwanda, <i>Rule 11 bis of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence</i> , <i>Prosecutor v. Uwinkindi</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001–75-R11bis, R. Ch., 28 June 2011	35
Decision on Uwinkindi’s Appeal against the Referral of His Case to Rwanda and Related Motions, <i>Prosecutor v. Uwinkindi</i> , Case No. ICTR-01–75-AR11bis, A. Ch., 16 December 2011	81
Decision on the Monitoring Arrangements for the Trial of Jean Uwinkindi in the Republic of Rwanda, <i>Prosecutor v. Uwinkindi</i> , Case No. ICTR-01–75-R11bis, Office of the President, 5 April 2012	101
Decision on the Prosecutor’s Request for Referral of the Case to the Republic of Rwanda, <i>Prosecutor v. Munyagishari</i> , Case No. ICTR-2005–89-R11bis, R.Ch., 6 June 2012	109
Decision on Appeal against the Referral of Phénéas Munyarugarama’s Case to Rwanda and Prosecution Motion to Strike, <i>Prosecutor v. Munyarugarama</i> , Case No. MICT-12–09-AR14, A. Ch., 5 October 2012	155
Commentary <i>Mark Mackareel</i>	162
Part III Post-Trial Issues	
Decision on Request for Review, <i>Prosecutor v. Kamuhanda</i> , Case No. ICTR-99–54A-R, A. Ch., 25 August 2011	169
Decision on the Early Release of Michel Bagaragaza, Article 27 of the Statute, Rules 125 and 126 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, and the Practice Direction on the Procedure for the Determination of Application for Pardon, Commutation of Sentence and Early Release of Persons Convicted by the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagaragaza</i> , Case No. ICTR-05–86-S, Office of the President, 24 October 2011	185
Decision on Protais Zigiranyirazo’s Motion for Damages, <i>Zigiranyirazo v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001–01–073, T. Ch. III, 18 June 2012	189

Partially Dissenting Opinion Judge Park	201
Commentary <i>Thom Dieben</i>	203
Part IV Judgments	
Judgement, <i>Renzaho v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-31-A, A. Ch., 1 April 2011	211
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Güney	325
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pocar	327
Commentary by <i>Julia Kretzenbacher</i>	340
Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Munyakazi</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-36A-A, A. Ch., 28 September 2011	349
Separate Opinion of Judge Güney	391
Separate Opinion of Judge Liu	392
Separate Opinion of Judge Vaz	394
Commentary by <i>Raimo Lahti</i>	401
Judgement, <i>Setako v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-04-81-A, A. Ch., 28 September 2011	407
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pocar	464
Commentary by <i>Susan Forder</i>	474
Judgement, <i>Ntawukuliyayo v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-05-82-A, A. Ch., 14 December 2011	481
Commentary by <i>Caroline Fournet</i>	543
Judgement, <i>Bagosora and Nsengiyumva v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-A, A. Ch., 14 December 2011	549
Joint Dissenting Opinion of Judges Meron and Robinson	717
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Güney	719
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pocar	720
Joint Dissenting Opinion of Judges Pocar and Liu	722
Commentary by <i>Miguel Lemos</i>	735
Judgement, <i>Kanyarukiga v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-2002-78-A, A. Ch., 8 May 2012	747
Separate Opinion of Judge Pocar	802
Commentary by <i>Sunethra Gunasekara</i>	812
Judgement, <i>Hategekimana v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-55B-A, A. Ch., 8 May 2012	817
Commentary by <i>Jane Munro</i>	886
Judgement, <i>Gatete v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-2000-61-A, A. Ch., 9 October 2012	891
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pocar	951
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Agius	953
Commentary by <i>Hilde Farthofer</i>	965
Contributors and Editors	971