

## THE LEGAL STATUS OF INTERSEX PERSONS

The publication of this book was supported by



THE LEGAL STATUS  
OF INTERSEX PERSONS

*Edited by*

Jens M. SCHERPE

Anatol DUTTA

Tobias HELMS



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd  
Sheraton House | Castle Park  
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169  
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and Ireland:*

NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for Europe and all other countries:*

Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*

Independent Publishers Group  
Order Department  
814 North Franklin Street  
Chicago, IL 60610  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985  
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

## The Legal Status of Intersex Persons

© The editors and contributors severally 2018

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: M.C. Escher's 'Eight Heads' © 2018 The M.C. Escher Company B.V. – Baarn – Holland. All rights reserved. www.mcescher.com

ISBN 978-1-78068-475-8

D/2018/7849/68

NUR 822

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

## PREFACE

The idea for this book began as a workshop supported by the DAAD Cambridge Research Hub with funds from the German Federal Foreign Office (FFO), the University of Regensburg and Cambridge Family Law.

The workshop was held at the University of Cambridge/Gonville and Caius College on 21–22 July 2016, jointly organised by the editors of this book. The workshop was attended not only by academics from Australia, Germany, the UK, Ireland, New Zealand, Spain and Italy, but also by representatives of the Law Commission of England and Wales, the German Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection (Berlin), the German Institute for Human Rights (Berlin) and the Ministry for Social Dialogue, Consumer Affairs and Civil Liberties (Malta). While the focus was on legal developments and regulation, there also were contributions from theology, medicine and psychology. There was an intense and productive interdisciplinary and interjurisdictional debate over the two days, and much of this is now reflected in this book. After the workshop, and indeed as a result of it, the research project leading to this book was started, and many additional chapters were commissioned in order to present an even broader discussion of the issues.

However, all major research projects face difficulties of varying kinds, and this one certainly was no exception. Several people who had promised to participate dropped out or failed to deliver. Houses were flooded, illnesses overcome, jobs changed, and children born during the period it took to put this book together. But in the end things came together, and we are pleased with the outcome and the broad range of contributions. We truly hope that this book will contribute to the national and international debates and lead to a focus on the autonomy of the people concerned.

We also are very grateful to many institutions and persons supporting the research project and publication of the book: the Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich for supporting the significant editorial work that needed to be undertaken, and which was handled expertly by Intersentia Publishing; Dafni Lima for her help with the initial editorial work; the Gonville and Caius Conference Office, and particularly Laura Webb, for ensuring that the workshop could take place in such a pleasant and well-organised environment; Ingrid Hobbis of the Cambridge Research Hub for her administrative support; Prof. Chris Young, the Co-Director of the Cambridge Research Hub, for his continuous support of this project; and Intersentia Publishing and particularly Rebecca Moffat, for their work to get this book published. Finally, we would like to thank the contributors to the workshop and particularly the contributors of this volume for their patience and understanding. It has been a long road ...

The editors  
Cambridge/Munich/Marburg, March 2018



# CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i> .....	v
<i>List of Contributors</i> .....	.xi
<b>The Legal Status of Intersex Persons: An Introduction</b>	
Jens M. SCHERPE .....	1
<b>Malta Declaration</b> .....	7
<b>Darlington Statement</b> .....	11
<b>Vienna Statement</b> .....	19
<b>PART I. MEDICINE AND PSYCHOLOGY</b>	
<b>Biology of Fetal Sex Development</b>	
Ieuan HUGHES .....	25
<b>Intersex in the Brain: What Neuroscience can Tell the Law about Gender Identity</b>	
Joe HERBERT .....	45
<b>Gender Identity and Intersex Conditions</b>	
Vickie PASTERSKI .....	65
<b>Evidence-Based Reviews of Medical Interventions Relative to the Gender Status of Children with Intersex Conditions and Differences of Sex Development</b>	
Jameson GARLAND and Milton DIAMOND .....	81
<b>PART II. THEOLOGY AND LEGAL HISTORY</b>	
<b>Intersex in the Christian Tradition: Personhood and Embodiment</b>	
Duncan DORMOR .....	105

<b>Four Sexes, Two Genders: The Rabbinic Move from Legal to Essentialist Polarisation of Identities</b>	
Moshe LAVEE and Tali ARTMAN PARTOCK.....	165
<b>Intersex: Some (Legal-)Historical Background</b>	
Alain WIJFFELS.....	181
<b>PART III. TRANSGENDER, TRANSSEXUALITY AND INTERSEX</b>	
<b>Lessons from the Legal Development of the Legal Status of Transsexual and Transgender Persons</b>	
Jens M. SCHERPE .....	203
<b>Towards Trans and Intersex Equality: Conflict or Complementarity?</b>	
Peter DUNNE.....	217
<b>PART IV. NATIONAL LEGAL DEVELOPMENTS</b>	
<b>Australia</b>	
Claire FENTON-GLYNN .....	243
<b>Sweden</b>	
Jameson GARLAND.....	255
<b>India</b>	
Smita SHAH.....	281
<b>The Netherlands</b>	
Marjolein VAN DEN BRINK .....	293
<b>France</b>	
Benjamin MORON-PUECH .....	305
<b>Colombia (The Colombian Constitutional Court)</b>	
Ruth RUBIO-MARÍN and Stefano OSELLA .....	319
<b>United States</b>	
Julie A. GREENBERG.....	339
<b>Malta</b>	
Tanya Ní MHUIRTHILE .....	357

<b>Germany (The 2013 German Law)</b>	
Tobias HELMS .....	369
<b>Germany (German Inter-Ministerial Working Group)</b>	
Thomas MEYER .....	383
<b>Germany (Gender Diversity in Law)</b>	
Nina ALTHOFF .....	393
<b>PART V. PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW ASPECTS OF INTERSEX</b>	
<b>Private International Law Aspects of Intersex</b>	
Anatol DUTTA and Walter PINTENS .....	415
<b>PART VI. INTERSEX AND HUMAN RIGHTS</b>	
<b>Standing Up for the Human Rights of Intersex People</b>	
Dan Christian GHATTAS .....	429
<b>The ‘Normalisation’ of Intersex Bodies and ‘Othering’ of Intersex Identities</b>	
Morgan CARPENTER .....	445
<b>Intersex Children and the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child</b>	
Kirsten SANDBERG .....	515



## LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

*Nina Althoff*

German Institute for Human Rights, Berlin, Germany

*Marjolein van den Brink*

School of Law, University of Utrecht, The Netherlands

*Morgan Carpenter*

Sydney Health Ethics, University of Sydney, Australia; Co-executive Director of Intersex Human Rights Australia (IHRA); GATE, New York, USA

*Milton Diamond*

John A. Burns School of Medicine, University of Hawai'i, United States of America

*Duncan Dormor*

United Society Partners in the Gospel, London, England, United Kingdom

*Peter Dunne*

Faculty of Law, University of Bristol, England, United Kingdom

*Anatol Dutta*

Faculty of Law, Ludwig Maximilians University of Munich, Germany

*Claire Fenton-Glynn*

Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom

*Jameson Garland*

Faculty of Law, Uppsala University, Sweden

*Dan Christian Ghattas*

Executive Director of Organisation Intersex International Europe (OII Europe), Berlin, Germany

*Julie Greenberg*

Emeritus Faculty, Thomas Jefferson School of Law, San Diego, California, United States of America

*Tobias Helms*

Faculty of Law, Philipps University Marburg, Germany

*Joe Herbert*

John van Geest Centre for Brain Repair, Department of Clinical Neurosciences,  
University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom

*Ieuan Hughes*

Department of Paediatrics, University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom

*Moshe Lavee*

Department of Jewish History and Thought, University of Haifa, Israel

*Thomas Meyer*

Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection, Berlin, Germany

*Tanya Ní Mhuirthile*

School of Law and Government, Dublin City University, Ireland

*Benjamin Moron-Puech*

Faculty of Law, Pantheon-Assas University Paris (Paris II), France

*Stefano Osella*

Department of Law, European University Institute, Florence, Italy

*Ruth Rubio-Marín*

Faculty of Law, University of Sevilla, Spain; School of Transnational Governance,  
European University Institute, Florence, Italy

*Tali Artman Partock*

Faculty of Divinity, University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom

*Vickie Pasterski*

Department of Psychology, University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom

*Walter Pintens*

Faculty of Law, Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium; Faculty of Law, Saarland  
University, Germany

*Kirsten Sandberg*

Faculty of Law, University of Oslo, Norway

*Jens M. Scherpe*

Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom; University  
of Hong Kong; Aalborg University, Denmark

*Smita Shah*

Department of Law, European University Institute, Florence, Italy

*Alain Wijffels*

Faculty of Law, Catholic University of Leuven and Catholic University of  
Louvain, Belgium; Faculty of Law, University of Leiden, The Netherlands; Centre  
d'Histoire Judiciaire (CNRS), France