

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

**VOLUME LII:
THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT
16 July 2010 – 1 August 2011**

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

**VOLUME LII:
THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT**

16 July 2010 – 1 August 2011

André Klip and Steven Freeland (editors)

Anzinga Low (assistant-editor)



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

Please cite as: ICC, Judgment on the appeal of Mr Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo against the decision of Trial Chamber III of 24 June 2010 entitled “Decision on the Admissibility and Abuse of Process Challenges”, Situation in the Central African Republic, *Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo*, Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08 OA 3, A. Ch., 19 October 2010, Klip/ Freeland, ALC-LII-13.

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

© André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.); Anzinga Low (assistant editor) 2018

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover illustration: Jelle Boudrez

ISBN 978-1-78068-470-3
D/2018/7849/32
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface	11
 Part 1/ Preliminary Matters	
1. Complementarity / Admissibility / Jurisdiction	
Judgment on the appeal of Mr Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo against the decision of Trial Chamber III of 24 June 2010 entitled “Decision on the Admissibility and Abuse of Process Challenges”, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08 OA 3, A. Ch., 19 October 2010	13
Decision on the Application by the Government of Kenya Challenging Admissibility of the Case Pursuant to Article 19(2)(b) of the Statute, Situation in the Republic of Kenya, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto, Kosgey and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09-01/11, P.T. Ch. II, 30 May 2011	41
Decision on “Prosecutor’s Application Pursuant to Article 58 as to Muammar Mohammad Abu Minya Gadaffi, Saif Al-Islam Gadaffi and Abdullah Al-Senussi, Situation in the Libyan Arab Jamahiriya, Case No. ICC-01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 27 June 2011	57
<i>Commentary</i> Kevin Crow	80
2. Confirmation of Charges	
Corrigendum of the “Decision on the Confirmation of Charges”, Situation in Darfur, <i>Prosecutor v. Abdallah Banda and Saleh Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-03/09, P.T. Ch. I, 7 March 2011	91
<i>Commentary</i> Thomas McDonnell	130
3. Amendment of Charge Document / Issue of Arrest Warrant	
Decision on the defence application for corrections to the Document Containing the Charges and for the prosecution to file a Second Amended Document Containing the Charges, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 20 July 2010	141
<i>Commentary</i> Anna Griffin	191
Decision on the Prosecutor’s Application for a Warrant of Arrest Mbarushimana, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Mbarushimana</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/10, P.T. Ch. I, 28 September 2010	197
<i>Commentary</i> Anna Griffin	214
4. Summons and Modalities Applying Thereto	
Decision on the Prosecutor’s Application for Summons to Appear for William Samoei Ruto, Henry Kiprono Kosgey and Joshua Arap Sang, Situation in the Republic of Kenya, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto, Kosgey and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09-01/11, P.T. Ch. II, 8 March 2011	219
Dissenting Opinion by Judge Hans-Peter Kaul to Pre-Trial Chamber II’s “Decision on the Prosecutor’s Application for Summons to Appear for William Samoei Ruto, Henry Kiprono Kosgey and Joshua Arap Sang”, Situation in the Republic of Kenya, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto, Kosgey and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09-01/11, P.T. Ch. II, 15 March 2011	233

Decision Establishing Modalities to be Observed When Complying with Summons Conditions, Situation in the Republic of Kenya, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto, Kosgey and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09-01/11, P.T. Ch. II, 5 April 2011	249
<i>Commentary</i> Anna Benedetti	254

Part 2/ Procedural Matters

5. Victims Issues

Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Katanga Against the Decision of Trial Chamber II of 22 January 2010 Entitled “Decision on the Modalities of Victim Participation at Trial”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07 OA 11, A. Ch., 16 July 2010	265
Decision on the Participation of Victims in the Appeal against Trial Chamber I’s Oral Decision of 15 July 2010 to Release Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06 OA 17, A. Ch., 17 August 2010.	287
Separate Opinion of Judge Sang-Hyun Song	294
Decision on Victims’ Participation at the Hearing on the Confirmation of the Charges, Situation In Darfur, <i>Prosecutor v. Abdallah Banda and Saleh Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-03/09, P.T. Ch. I, 29 October 2010	295
Decision on common legal representation of victims for the purpose of trial, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 10 November 2010.	307
Decision on the Participation of Victims in the Appeal against the “Decision on Applications for Provisional Release” of Trial Chamber III, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08 OA 7, A. Ch., 14 July 2011	317
Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judge Song on Decision on the Participation of Victims in the Appeal against the “Decision on Applications for Provisional Release” of Trial Chamber III, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08 OA 7, A. Ch., 1 August 2011	323
<i>Commentary</i> Yvonne McDermott	326

6. Disclosure Issues and Obligations

First Decision on the Prosecutor’s Requests for Redactions, Situation in Darfur, <i>Prosecutor v. Abdallah Banda and Saleh Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-03/09, P.T. Ch. I, 29 July 2010	333
Decision on the “Prosecution’s Application Concerning Disclosure Pursuant to Rules 78 and 79(4)”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 14 September 2010	339
Decision on the Prosecution Motion for leave to disclose and add the investigator’s report concerning Witness P-268 to the List of Incriminating Evidence, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 27 September 2010	351
Redacted Decision on the “Prosecution’s request for non-disclosure of information in transcripts of the Lubanga case to defence in the <i>Katanga and Ngudjolo</i> case” and the “Joint Application for maintaining discrete redactions to transcripts of witness DRC-OTP-WWWW-0007”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 11 November 2010	359

Decision on the scope of the prosecution's disclosure obligations as regards defence witnesses, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 12 November 2010.	369
Public Redacted Decision on the Prosecution's Requests for Non-Disclosure of Information in Witness-Related Documents, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 3 December 2010.	377
<i>Commentary</i> Sally Longworth.	396

7. Admission of Evidence

Decision on Prosecutor's request to allow the introduction into evidence of the prior recorded testimony of P-166 and P-219, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 3 September 2010.	405
Corrigendum of Decision on the "Prosecution's Second Application for Admission of Documents from the Bar Table Pursuant to Article 64(9)", Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 25 October 2010.	415
Decision on the admission into evidence of materials contained in the Prosecution's list of evidence, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 19 November 2010.	427
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Kuniko Ozaki on the Decision on the admission into evidence of materials contained in the prosecution's list of evidence, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 23 November 2010.	437
Decision on the Prosecutor's Bar Table Motions, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 17 December 2010.	447
Redacted Decision on the Prosecution's Application to Admit Rebuttal Evidence from Witness DRC-OTP-WWWW-0005, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 28 April 2011.	467
Judgment on the appeals of Mr Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo and the Prosecutor against the decision of Trial Chamber III entitled "Decision on the admission into evidence of materials contained in the prosecution's list of evidence" Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08 OA 5 OA6, A. Ch., 3 May 2011.	487
<i>Commentary</i> Emma Irving.	505

8. Review of Detention and Interim Release

Judgment on the appeal of Mr Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo against the decision of Trial Chamber III of 28 July 2010 entitled "Decision on the review of the detention of Mr Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo pursuant to Rule 118(2) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence", Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08 OA 4, A. Ch., 19 October 2010.	511
Decision on the review of detention of Mr Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo pursuant to the Appeals Judgment of 19 November 2010, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 17 December 2010.	531
Decision on the "Defence Request for Interim Release", Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Mbarushimana</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/10, P.T. Ch. I, 19 May 2011.	545
<i>Commentary</i> Bridget Kennedy.	561

9. General Procedural Matters

Decision on the Prosecutor's request to give suspensive effect to the appeal against Trial Chamber I's oral decision to release Mr Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06 OA 17, A. Ch., 23 July 2010.	567
Decision on the "Defence Application to Obtain the French Version of Certain Filings and Statements", Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 8 September 2010.	573
Decision on the "Prosecution's application to take testimony while proceedings are stayed pending decision of the Appeals Chamber", Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 24 September 2010.	583
Decision on Directions for the Conduct of the Proceedings, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 19 November 2010.	591
Decision on the Prosecution's Request for Leave to Appeal the Trial Chamber's Decision on Directions for the Conduct of the Proceedings, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 15 December 2010.	599
Decision on the arrangements for contact between represented victims and the parties, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 23 November 2010.	605
Redacted version of Decision on the defence request for adjustment of fees advanced by the Registry pursuant to Trial Chamber III's Decision on legal assistance for the accused of 20 October 2009 (ICC-01/05-01/08-897-Conf), Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 7 December 2010.	613
Decision on the Prosecution's Renunciation of the testimony of witness P-159, <i>Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 24 February 2011.	623
Decision on the defence request to reconsider the "Order on numbering of evidence" of 12 May 2010, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 30 March 2011.	629
Judgment on the appeal of Mr Callixte Mbarushimana against the decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I of 19 May 2011 entitled "Decision on the 'Defence Request for Interim Release'", Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Mbarushimana</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/10 OA, A. Ch., 14 July 2011.	639
Redacted Version of Decision on the "Defence Motion for Disclosure Pursuant to Rule 77", Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 29 July 2011.	655
<i>Commentary</i> Tomas Hamilton and Dounia Hattabi.	663

10. Appointment and Conduct of Counsel

Decision on Prosecution's Request to Invalidate the Appointment of Counsel to the Defence, Situation in Darfur, <i>Prosecutor v. Abdallah Banda and Saleh Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-03/09, T. Ch. IV, 30 June 2011.	677
Decision on the Prosecution's Application for Leave to Appeal the "Decision on the Prosecution's Request to Invalidate the Appointment of Counsel to the Defence", Situation in Darfur, <i>Prosecutor v. Abdallah Banda and Saleh Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-03/09, T. Ch. IV, 13 July 2011.	685

Decision with Respect to the Question of Invalidating the Appointment of Counsel to the Defence, Situation in the Republic of Kenya, <i>Prosecutor v. Muthaura, Kenyatta and Ali</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09-02/11, P.T. Ch. II, 20 July 2011	695
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

<i>Commentary</i> Maria Laura Ferioli	702
-------------------------------------------------	-----

11. Stay of Proceedings

Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Katanga Against the Decision of Trial Chamber II of 20 November 2009 Entitled “Decision on the Motion of the Defence for Germain Katanga for a Declaration on Unlawful Detention and Stay of Proceedings”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07 OA 10, A. Ch., 12 July 2010	711
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

Dissenting Opinion of Judge Erkki Kourula and Judge Ekaterina Trendafilova – Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Katanga Against the Decision of Trial Chamber II of 20 November 2009 Entitled “Decision on the Motion of the Defence for Germain Katanga for a Declaration on Unlawful Detention and Stay of Proceedings”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07 OA 10, A. Ch., 28 July 2010.	731
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

Judgment on the appeal of the Prosecutor against the decision of Trial Chamber I of 8 July 2010 entitled “Decision on the Prosecution’s Urgent Request for Variation of the Time-Limit to Disclose the Identity of Intermediary 143 or Alternatively to Stay Proceedings Pending Further Consultations with the VWU”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06 OA 18, A. Ch., 8 October 2010.	761
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

Judgment on the appeal of Prosecutor against the oral decision of Trial Chamber I of 15 July 2010 to release Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06 OA 17, A. Ch., 8 October 2010	777
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

Redacted Decision on the “Defence Application Seeking a Permanent Stay of the Proceedings”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 7 March 2011	785
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

<i>Commentary</i> Magda Karagiannakis	829
-------------------------------------------------	-----

12. Issues Relating to Witnesses

Decision on the Unified Protocol on the practices used to prepare familiarise witnesses for giving testimony at trial, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 18 November 2010	839
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judge Kuniko Ozaki on the Decision on the Unified Protocol on the practices used to prepare familiarise witnesses for giving testimony at trial, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 24 November 2010.	849
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

Decision on an Amicus Curiae Application and on the “Requete tendant à obtenir présentations des témoins DRC-D02-P-0350, DRC-D02-P0236, DRC-D02-P-0228 aux autorités néerlandaises aux fins d’asile” (articles 68 and 93(7) of the Statute), Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 9 June 2011	859
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

<i>Commentary</i> Steven Becker and Lucija Sokanović	878
----------------------------------------------------------------	-----

13. Relationship with States Parties

Decision informing the United Nations Security Council and the Assembly of the States Parties to the Rome Statute about Omar Al-Bashir’s presence in the territory of the Republic of Kenya, Situation in Darfur, <i>Prosecutor v. Al Bashir</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-01/09, P.T. Ch. I, 27 August 2010	889
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

Decision requesting observations from the Republic of Kenya, Situation in Darfur, <i>Prosecutor v. Al Bashir</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-01/09, P.T. Ch. I, 25 October 2010.	893
Decision on Request for Assistance submitted by the Government of the Republic of Kenya Pursuant to Article 93(10) of the Statute and Rule 194 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, Situation in the Republic of Kenya, Case No. ICC-01/09, P.T. Ch. II, 29 June 2011	897
Decision on “Defence Application pursuant to articles 57(3)(b) & 64(6)(a) of the Statute for an order for the preparation and transmission of a cooperation request to the Government of the Republic of the Sudan”, Situation in Darfur, <i>Prosecutor v. Abdallah Banda and Saleh Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-03/09, T. Ch. IV, 1 July 2011	905
<i>Commentary</i> Menno Dolman	915
Contributors and Editors	929