

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

**VOLUME L:
THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT
1 November 2009 – 12 July 2010**



**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

**VOLUME L:
THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT
1 November 2009 – 12 July 2010**

**André Klip and Steven Freeland (editors)
Anzinga Low (assistant-editor)**

 intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:
NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

Please cite as: ICC, Decision on the Confirmation of Charges, Situation in Darfur, Sudan, *Prosecutor v. Abu Garda*, Case No. ICC-02/05-02/09, P.T. Ch. I, 8 February 2010, Klip/Freeland, ALC-L-795.

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals
© André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.); Anzinga Low (assistant editor) 2017

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover illustration: Louis and Emilia Schelkens

ISBN 978-1-78068-450-5
D/2017/7849/55
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface	11
1. Issues Relating to Victims	
Decision on the Applications a/0011/06 to a/0013/06, a/0015/06 and a/0443/09 to a/0450/09 for Participation in the Proceedings at the Pre-Trial Stage of the Case, Situation in Darfur, Sudan, <i>Prosecutor v. Al Bashir</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-01/09, P.T. Ch. I, 10 December 2009	13
Decision on the Modalities of Victim Participation at Trial, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 22 January 2010	27
Decision on the Second Application by Victims a/0443/09 to a/0450/09 to Participate in the Appeal against the “Decision on the Prosecution’s Application for a Warrant of Arrest against Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir”, Situation in Darfur, Sudan, <i>Prosecutor v. Al Bashir</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-01/09 OA, A. Ch., 28 January 2010	51
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Sang-Hyun Song	56
Decision on the Defence Observations Regarding the Right of the Legal Representatives of Victims to Question Defence Witnesses and on the Notion of Personal Interest -and- Decision on the Defence Application to Exclude Certain Representatives of Victims from the Chamber During the Non-Public Evidence of Various Defence Witnesses, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 11 March 2010	57
Decision on Applications a/0655/09, a/0656/09, a/0736/09 to a/0747/09, and a/0750/09 to a/0755/09 for Participation in the Proceedings at the Pre-Trial Stage of the Case, <i>Situation in Darfur, Sudan, Prosecutor v. Abu Garda</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-02/09, P.T. Ch. I, 19 March 2010	67
Decision on the “Defence Application for Leave to Appeal the Trial Chamber’s <i>Décision relative aux modalités de participation des victimes au stade des débats sur le fond</i> ”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 19 April 2010	77
Decision on the Participation of Victims in the Appeal of Mr Katanga against the “Decision on the Modalities of Victim Participation at Trial”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, A. Ch., 24 May 2010	87
Separate Opinion of Judge Sang-Hyun Song	92
Decision on the Participation of Victims in the Trial and on 86 Applications by Victims to Participate in the Proceedings, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 30 June 2010	93
Decision on 8 Applications for Victims’ Participation in the Proceedings, Situation in Darfur, Sudan, <i>Prosecutor v. Al Bashir</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-01/09, P.T. Ch. I, 9 July 2010	121
Commentary <i>Sara Wharton</i>	130
2. Appeals	
Decision on the “Prosecution’s Request for Leave to Appeal the Trial Chamber’s Oral Ruling Denying Authorisation to Add and Disclose Additional Evidence after 30 November 2009”, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 28 January 2010	141

Decision on the “Defence Application for Leave to Appeal the Trial Chamber’s <i>Décision relative à la requête de la Défense de Germain Katanga en illégalité de la détention et en suspension de la procédure</i> ”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 11 February 2010	153
Decision on the “Prosecution’s Application for Leave to Appeal Oral Rulings on Clarifying Inconsistencies in Prior Statements and Partial Hostility”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 11 March 2010	159
Decision on the Request of Mr Bemba to Give Suspensive Effect to the Appeal against the “Decision on the Admissibility and Abuse of Process Challenges”, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08 OA 3, A. Ch., 9 July 2010	165
Commentary <i>Alexandra Harrington</i>	171
3. Reclassification of Facts	
Judgment on the appeals of Mr Lubanga Dyilo and the Prosecutor against the Decision of Trial Chamber I of 14 July 2009 entitled “Decision Giving Notice to the Parties and Participants that the Legal Characterisation of the Facts May Be Subject to Change in Accordance with Regulation 55(2) of the Regulations of the Court”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/OA 15 OA 16, A. Ch., 8 December 2009	181
Separate Opinion of Judge Sang-Hyun Song and Judge Christine van den Wyngaert	206
Decision on the Legal Representatives’ Joint Submissions concerning the Appeals Chamber’s Decision on 8 December 2009 on Regulation 55 of the Regulations of the Court, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 8 January 2010	207
Commentary <i>Miriam Cullen</i>	216
4. Right of Accused to Legal Assistance	
Redacted version of “Decision on Legal Assistance for the Accused”, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 26 November 2009	225
Commentary <i>Tomas Hamilton</i>	244
5. Disclosure Obligations / Issues	
Redacted Decision on the “Prosecution’s Application for Non-Disclosure of Sources Contained in the Meta-Data in Compliance with the Consolidated E-Court Protocol” of 16 April 2009, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 11 November 2009	253
Redacted Second Decision on Disclosure by the Defence and Decision on Whether the Prosecution May Contact Defence Witnesses, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 20 January 2010	263
Decision on the “Prosecution’s Submissions on the Trial Chamber’s 8 December 2009 Oral Order Requesting Updating of the In-Depth-Analysis Chart”, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 29 January 2010	281
Redacted Decision on the Prosecution’s Request for Non-Disclosure of Information in the Statements of Three Individuals Providing Rule 77 Information, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 24 February 2010	289
Redacted version of “Decision on the ‘Observations of the Victims and Witnesses Unit on the Re-Classification of ICC-01/05-01/08-72-Conf with Two Confidential Annexes and ICC-01/05-01/08-95-Conf’ (ICC-01/05-01/08-676-Conf), Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case. No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 3 March 2010	297

Public Redacted Version of “Decision on the Defence Request for Disclosure of Pre-Interview Assessments and the Consequences of Non-Disclosure” (ICC-01/05-01/08-750-Conf), Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 9 April 2010	307
Redacted Decision on the “Prosecution’s Request for Non-Disclosure of Information in Transcripts of Re-Interviews with Prosecution Witnesses”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 7 June 2010	317
Decision on the Request from the Defence in the <i>Katanga and Ngudjolo</i> Case for Disclosure of Transcripts in the <i>Lubanga</i> case, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 11 June 2010	325
Decision on the “Prosecution’s Request to Apply Redactions to Audio-Video Recordings of Statements Already Disclosed to Defence” (ICC-01/05-01/08-724), Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 29 June 2010	339
Decision on the Prosecution’s Request to Apply Redactions to Screening Notes (ICC-01/05-01/08-689-Conf-Exp), Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 9 July 2010	345
Commentary <i>Iryna Marchuk</i>	351
6. Protective Measures	
Redacted Decision on the Application to Disclose the Identity of Intermediary 143, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 10 December 2009	363
Redacted Decision on the Defence Request for a Witness to Give Evidence via Video-Link, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 9 February 2010	373
Decision Defining the Status of 54 Victims Who Participated at the Pre-Trial Stage, and Inviting the Parties’ Observations on Applications for Participation by 86 Applicants, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 22 February 2010	379
Redacted Decision on the Prosecution’s Applications to Vary Protective Measures under Regulation 42 of 14 July and 17 August 2009, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 22 February 2010	393
Redacted Decision on the Variation of Protective Measures under Regulation 42 on Referral from Trial Chamber II on 22 July 2009, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 16 March 2010	421
Decision on the Protection of the Neutral and Impartial Status of Information Providers, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 5 May 2010	435
Redacted Decision on the Prosecution’s Urgent Request for Variation of the Time-Limit to Disclose the Identity of Intermediary 143 or Alternatively to Stay Proceedings Pending Further Consultations with the VWU, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 8 July 2010	443
Commentary <i>Simon Meisenberg</i>	457
7. Conduct of Proceedings / Protocols for Procedures	
Directions for the Conduct of the Proceedings and Testimony in Accordance with Rule 140 (including corrigendum), Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 1 December 2009	463

Public Redacted Version of the “Decision on the Motion of the Defence for Germain Katanga for a Declaration on Unlawful Detention and Stay of Proceedings” of 20 November 2009 (ICC-01/04-01/07-1666-Conf-Exp), Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 3 December 2009	483
Decision on Judicial Questioning, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 18 March 2010	487
Decision on the “Protocol on Investigations in Relation to Witnesses Benefiting from Protective Measures”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 26 April 2010	511
Decision on Issues Relating to Disclosure, Situation in Darfur, Sudan, <i>Prosecutor v. Banda Abakaer Nourain and Jerbo Jamus</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-03/09, P.T Ch. I, 29 June 2010	517
Commentary <i>Nicola Palmer</i>	540
8. Conduct of Prosecution / Defence Counsel	
Decision on the Prosecution’s “Request on the Manner of Questioning of Witness DRC-OPT-WWWW-0015” and Contact by the Prosecution with Court Witnesses, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 1 February 2010.	547
Decision on the “Prosecution’s Request to Invalidate the Appointment of Legal Consultant to the Defence Team”, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case. No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 7 May 2010.	555
Decision on the Press Interview with Ms Le Fraper du Hellen, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 12 May 2010	565
Commentary <i>Marina Aksenova</i>	576
9. Admissibility and Other Issues Relating to Evidence	
Decision on the Prosecution’s Application to Add P-317 to the Prosecution Witness List (ICC-01/04-01/07-1537), Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 3 November 2009	581
Decision on the “Prosecution’s Application for Leave to Appeal the “Decision on the Confirmation of Charges””, Situation in Darfur, Sudan, <i>Prosecutor v. Abu Garda</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-02/09, P.T. Ch. I, 23 April 2010.	589
Decision on the “Requête de la Défense sollicitant l’autorisation d’interjeter appel de la décision orale du 4 mars 2010 autorisant l’utilisation et le dépôt en preuve de trois photographies”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 29 April 2010	597
Decision on Request to Admit Prior Recorded Testimony of P-30 as well as Related Video Excerpts, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 30 June 2010	607
Commentary <i>Kirsten Bowman</i>	613
10. Abuse of Process	
Decision on the Admissibility and Abuse of Process Challenges, Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case. No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 24 June 2010	623
Commentary <i>Mark Mackareel</i>	673

11. Use of Intermediaries

Redacted Decision on Intermediaries, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, *Prosecutor v. Lubanga*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 31 May 2010 679

Decision on the Prosecution Request for Leave to Appeal the “Decision on Intermediaries”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, *Prosecutor v. Lubanga*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 2 June 2010 711

Commentary *Artur Appazov* 719

12. Arrest Warrant

Judgment on the Appeal of the Prosecutor against the “Decision on the Prosecution’s Application for a Warrant of Arrest against Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir”, Situation in Darfur, Sudan, *Prosecutor v. Al Bashir*, Case No. ICC-02/05-01/09-OA, A. Ch., 3 February 2010 725

Second Decision on the Prosecution’s Application for a Warrant of Arrest, Situation in Darfur, Sudan, *Prosecutor v. Al Bashir*, Case No. ICC-02/05-01/09, P.T. Ch. I, 12 July 2010 737

Commentary *Anzinga Low* 751

13. Interim Release

Judgment on the Appeal of the Prosecutor against Pre-Trial Chamber II’s “Decision on the Interim Release of Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo and Convening Hearings with the Kingdom of Belgium, the Republic of Portugal, the Republic of France, the Federal Republic of Germany, the Italian Republic, and the Republic of South Africa”, Situation in the Central African Republic, *Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo*, Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08-OA 2, A. Ch., 2 December 2009 755

Decision on the Review of the Detention of Mr Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo Pursuant to Rule 118(2) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, Situation in the Central African Republic, *Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo*, Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, T. Ch. III, 1 April 2010 775

Commentary *Steven Freeland* 786

14. Confirmation of Charges

Decision on the Confirmation of Charges, Situation in Darfur, Sudan, *Prosecutor v. Abu Garda*, Case No. ICC-02/05-02/09, P.T. Ch. I, 8 February 2010 795

Separate Opinion of Judge Cuno Tarfusser 837

Commentary *Rosalyn Roberts* 839

15. Unlawful Arrest

Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Katanga Against the Decision of Trial Chamber II of 20 November 2009 Entitled “Decision on the Motion of the Defence for Germain Katanga for a Declaration on Unlawful Detention and Stay of Proceedings”, Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, *Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07 OA 10, A. Ch., 12 July 2010 845

Dissenting Opinion of Judge Erkki Kourula and Judge Ekaterina Trendafilova 865

Commentary *Martine Durocher* 894

Contributors and Editors 899

