

LEGAL ASPECTS OF LAND RIGHTS AND THE USE OF LAND  
IN ASIA, AFRICA, AND EUROPE

LEGAL ASPECTS OF LAND  
RIGHTS AND THE USE OF LAND  
IN ASIA, AFRICA, AND EUROPE

Ingrid WESTENDORP (editor)



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd  
Sheraton House | Castle Park  
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169  
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and Ireland:*  
NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for Europe and all other countries:*  
Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*  
International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58<sup>th</sup> Ave Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832  
Email: info@isbs.com

Legal aspects of land rights and the use of land in Asia, Africa, and Europe  
© 2016 The editor and contributors severally  
Cover photograph © Ko Backpacko - Shutterstock.com

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

ISBN 978-1-78068-441-3  
D/2016/7849/160  
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This publication is based on the presentations on a land rights conference that was held between 19 and 21 October 2014 in Maastricht. The editor wishes to express her gratitude to the contributors who spent a great deal of time and effort in preparing the presentations and in adapting and updating the contributions for publication.

This conference was the first official starting point of the Land Rights Consortium; a cooperation between the Maastricht Centre for Human Rights and the Maastricht European Institute for Transnational Legal Research (METRO) of Maastricht University on the one hand, and the faculties of law of the Gadjah Mada University (Yogyakarta), Padjadjaran University (Bandung), Udayana University (Denpasar), University of North Sumatra (Medan), and University of Indonesia (Jakarta) on the other hand. Thanks to the financial contributions of the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the SWOL, the Research Fund Faculty of Law of Maastricht University, and the Maastricht Centre for Human Rights it was possible to organize this meeting and to invite participants from the Netherlands and abroad, especially from Indonesia.

A word of thanks should also be addressed to Chantal Kuypers and Yleen Simonis, who took care of the organizational and logistical aspects of the conference.

# CONTENTS

*Acknowledgements* ..... v

## **Introduction**

Ingrid WESTENDORP ..... 1

## **A Human Rights-Based Approach to Food and Land Issues – A Normative Analysis**

Fons COOMANS ..... 5

1. Introduction ..... 5
2. The legal basis for food and land as human rights ..... 6
3. Understanding food and land issues: the capabilities and human rights approach ..... 9
4. A framework for analysing food and land issues through a human rights lens ..... 10
5. Security of land tenure through human rights ..... 15
6. A framework law on the right to food ..... 17
  - 6.1. Introduction ..... 17
  - 6.2. The aims of a framework law ..... 17
  - 6.3. The content of a framework law ..... 19
7. Towards a national food strategy ..... 21
8. Extraterritorial human rights obligations ..... 22
9. Concluding remarks ..... 25

## **Pollution, Takings and Access to Justice in East and West**

Michael FAURE and Andri WIBISANA ..... 27

1. Introduction ..... 27
2. Pollution as an externality ..... 29
  - 2.1. External effects for companies and States ..... 29
  - 2.2. Internalizing the externality as goal of environmental law ..... 30
  - 2.3. Possible role of non-legal instruments ..... 31
3. The Coase theorem ..... 32
  - 3.1. Reciprocal nature of harm ..... 32
  - 3.2. Conflicting property rights: an example ..... 32

3.3.	The Coase theorem: a few constraints.....	34
3.4.	Practical value of the Coase theorem .....	35
3.5.	Nuisance .....	37
4.	First use doctrine.....	37
4.1.	Economic principles.....	37
4.2.	Examples.....	40
4.2.1.	American cases .....	40
4.2.2.	European examples.....	42
4.3.	Economic analysis .....	44
5.	Indonesia.....	46
5.1.	First use in Indonesia.....	47
5.2.	Takings in Indonesia .....	51
6.	Concluding remarks.....	58

### **Land Grabbing, Land Struggles and the Human Right to Food**

	Roman HERRE .....	61
1.	A historic starting point .....	61
1.1.	Ongoing social struggles.....	64
2.	Contextualizing land grabbing .....	65
2.1.	... A convergence of multiple crises.....	66
2.2.	... Of cases and structures .....	67
3.	Land struggles: the case of Cambodia's 'blood sugar'.....	68
3.1.	The Kampong Speu sugar cane concessions .....	69
3.2.	The role of the European Union .....	72
3.3.	Rightful resistance .....	73
4.	Land struggles: underlying power imbalances .....	74
5.	Contemporary land struggles: complex and multi-layered .....	75
6.	Land grabbing and the human right to adequate food .....	77
6.1.	Access to land and the right to food .....	78
6.2.	Land rights and human rights – a differentiation .....	78
6.3.	Global governance instruments and the issue of democratic legitimacy .....	80
6.4.	A human right to land.....	83

### **Women's Right to Land: A Comparison between International Legal Obligations and Customary Laws in Bali (Indonesia) and in Acholi (Uganda)**

	Ingrid WESTENDORP and Elin HILWIG .....	85
1.	Introduction .....	85
2.	The international human rights framework relevant to women's land rights.....	88
3.	Indonesia – international and national legal framework.....	91

3.1.	Introduction.....	91
3.2.	International legal framework.....	92
3.3.	National legal framework.....	93
3.3.1.	Constitution.....	93
3.3.2.	Human Rights Act.....	93
3.3.3.	Basic Agrarian Law.....	94
3.3.4.	Marriage Act.....	94
3.4.	Decentralization.....	95
4.	Situation in Bali.....	95
4.1.	Background.....	95
4.2.	Balinese Adat law and tradition on land.....	96
4.3.	Hindu women's land rights; new developments.....	99
4.4.	Remedies.....	101
5.	Uganda – international and national legal framework.....	102
5.1.	Introduction.....	102
5.2.	International legal framework.....	103
5.3.	National legal framework.....	104
5.3.1.	The Constitution.....	104
5.3.2.	The 1998 Land Act.....	105
5.3.2.	National Land Policy.....	106
5.3.4.	Other relevant legal instruments and organs.....	106
6.	Situation in Acholi.....	108
6.1.	Background.....	108
6.2.	Acholi customary law.....	109
6.3.	Acholi women's land rights in practice.....	111
6.3.1.	The current situation.....	111
6.3.2.	Concerns for the future.....	113
6.4.	Remedies.....	114
7.	Analysis and possible solutions.....	117
7.1.	Differences.....	117
7.2.	Similarities.....	118
7.3.	Possible solutions.....	120
8.	Concluding remarks.....	122
<b>Agrarian Reform and Smallholder Rights in Indonesia: Alternatives to Corporate, Customary and Private Ownership</b>		
	Ben WHITE.....	125
1.	Indonesian land rights: vision and reality.....	125
2.	Land problems in Indonesia: legacies of the colonial and recent past ..	128
3.	Why prioritize smallholder farming?.....	131
4.	Problems of 'customary' and private ownership.....	133
4.1.	Problems of 'customary rights' in land.....	134

4.2.	Problems of private individual titling: the De Soto fallacy . . . . .	135
5.	Criteria for alternative land tenure regimes . . . . .	137
5.1.	The general principle: collective ownership, individual use rights	140
5.2.	Using community-owned land to provide use-rights to the poor, near-landless, young farmers, etc. . . . .	141
5.3.	Where private property in land exists, putting a cap on accumulation and speculation . . . . .	142
5.3.1.	Promoting collectively-owned commercial farming, for export and domestic markets . . . . .	143
5.3.2.	Providing and protecting equal land rights for women . . .	144
5.3.3.	Promoting access to land for young farmers . . . . .	144
	<i>Note on Contributors</i> . . . . .	147