
The French Contract Law Reform

A Source of Inspiration?

Editors:
S. Stijns & S. Jansen

The French Contract Law Reform

A Source of Inspiration?

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

The French Contract Law Reform: A Source of Inspiration?

© S. Stijns and S. Jansen (eds.) 2016

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover image: Gautherot Pierre (1765/1769-1825), Jean Etienne Marie, comte Portalis, ministre des Cultes de 1804 à 1807 (1746-1807) © RMN-Grand Palais (Château de Versailles) / Gérard Blot.

ISBN 978-1-78068-419-2
D/2016/7849/106
NUR 822

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

CONTENTS

Introduction

Sophie Stijns and Sanne Jansen	1
--	---

The Reform of the French Law of Obligations: How Long will the Belgians Remain Napoleon's Most Loyal Subjects?

Sander Van Loock	7
----------------------------	---

1. Introduction	7
2. Historical antecedents	8
3. Incentives for the reform and the first reform projects	10
3.1. Incentives	10
3.2. Initial reform projects	12
4. Chronicle of a Reform Foretold	14
4.1. Reform by ordinance	14
4.2. Criticism	16
5. Overview	17
5.1. Incentives and aims of the reform	17
5.2. General overview	18
5.3. Appreciation	23
6. Belgium	24
7. Conclusion: Brief lessons from the French reform	26

Pre-Contractual Phase: Reflections on the Attractiveness of the New French Rules for the Parties to International Commercial Transactions

Ekaterina Pannebakker	29
---------------------------------	----

1. Introduction	29
2. Pre-contractual phase in the <i>ordonnance</i>	31
2.1. The new rules	31
2.2. The background of the new rules	34
2.2.1. Evolution of case law	34
2.2.2. International influence	37

3.	Assessing the attractiveness of the new provisions	40
3.1.	Legal certainty.	40
3.1.1.	Express limit of liability	40
3.1.2.	Inspiration from the international soft law	42
3.1.3.	Definitions of preliminary agreements.	43
3.2.	(In)flexibility	44
3.2.1.	Effects of preliminary agreements.	44
3.2.2.	Characterisation of liability	45
4.	Conclusion	46

Nullity in the *Ordonnance*

	Frederik Peeraer	49
1.	Introduction	49
2.	Overview of the <i>ordonnance</i> 's approach	50
3.	The concept of nullity	51
3.1.	Essential aspects and distinction with other remedies.	51
3.2.	The <i>summa divisio</i> between absolute and relative nullity	53
3.3.	The recognition of partial nullity.	57
3.3.1.	Requirements	57
3.3.2.	Scope	58
4.	The use of nullity	59
4.1.	Too much nullity.	60
4.2.	Not enough nullity.	61
5.	The enforcement of nullity	61
5.1.	Judicial enforcement.	62
5.1.1.	Principle.	62
5.1.2.	Criticism	62
5.2.	Obstacles to the enforcement of nullity	65
5.2.1.	Prescription.	65
5.2.2.	Confirmation	65
5.2.3.	Regularisation?	66
6.	General appreciation.	67
6.1.	A textbook example of <i>Begriffsjurisprudenz</i>	67
6.2.	Are there any lessons for Belgium and the Netherlands?	68
7.	Conclusion	70

A Tale of Novelty and Continuity: Exploring the Future Judicial Control of Employment Contracts in the French Contract Law Reform

	Candida Leone.	73
1.	Introduction	73
2.	What's new? The new Civil code provisions and the existing rules	75
2.1.	Clauses creating "a significant imbalance"	75
2.2.	The penumbra of unfair terms control	80

3.	Possible headings of unfair terms control in French labour law	82
3.1.	The general provision of Article L. 1121-1 Code du Travail	82
3.2.	The regime of clauses de variation	83
3.3.	The judge-made regime of certain clauses	85
4.	Conclusion	87

Introducing *Imprévision* into French Contract Law – A Paradigm Shift in Comparative Perspective

	Tobias Lutzi	89
1.	Introduction	89
2.	<i>Imprévision</i> as an exception to <i>pacta sunt servanda</i>	90
2.1.	The principle of <i>pacta sunt servanda</i> and its exceptions	90
2.2.	The exception for <i>imprévision</i>	93
3.	Current approaches to <i>imprévision</i>	94
3.1.	The French approach: no exception for <i>imprévision</i>	94
3.2.	The English approach: extension of the impossibility exception	98
3.3.	The German approach: development of a separate exception	99
3.3.1.	The doctrine of the basis of the transaction.	100
3.3.2.	Reception in other legal systems and instruments.	102
3.3.3.	The codification of 2002	103
4.	The French reform	105
4.1.	The doctrinal importance of the French reform	107
4.2.	The practical shortcomings of the reform proposal	109
4.3.	The provision finally adopted	111
5.	Conclusion	112

Commercial Impracticability and the Missed Opportunity of the French Contract Law Reform: Doctrinal, Historical and Law and Economics Arguments – Comment on Lutzi’s Introducing *Imprévision* into French Contract Law

	Janwillem (Pim) Oosterhuis	113
1.	Introduction	113
2.	The German commercial impracticability excuse and legal doctrine.	115
3.	Long use and wide spread reception: lessons from legal history	118
4.	Practical implications: which remedy is more efficient?	120
4.1.	Efficient contracting: reduction of transaction costs <i>ex ante</i>	121
4.2.	Contractual fairness, efficiency and financial loss	122
4.3.	Reduction of transaction costs <i>ex post</i> : discharge or adjustment?	124
5.	Conclusion	128

Price Reduction under the French Contract Law Reform	
Sanne Jansen	131
1. Introduction	131
2. Road-map to price reduction: projet Catala, projet de la Chancellerie and projet Terré	133
2.1. No price reduction under the Catala project, but a partial termination	133
2.2. No price reduction under the project of the Chancellerie (2008)	134
2.3. Price reduction and partial termination under the Terré project	135
2.3.1. Price reduction	135
2.3.2. Partial termination	137
3. Price reduction under the <i>ordonnance</i>	138
3.1. General	138
3.2. Conditions of application	140
3.2.1. Contracts and the meaning of ‘price’	140
3.2.2. Partial non-performance and seriousness of the non-performance	142
3.2.3. Excused and (un)excused non-performance?	143
3.2.4. Relation between price reduction and other remedies	145
3.3. Role of the judge and of the parties	147
3.3.1. Role of the parties	147
3.3.2. Role of the judge	148
3.4. Calculation method	150
3.5. Other characteristics	153
3.5.1. Price reduction before and after the payment of the price	153
3.5.2. Price reduction as a defence and as a claim of the creditor	154
3.5.3. Combination with damages	154
3.5.4. No restitution	154
3.6. Material partial termination	155
4. Conclusion	156
The Measure of Damages in the French Contract Law Reform – Lessons from far more Inspiring Systems	
Brecht Verkempinck	157
1. Belgian Civil Code	157
1.1. Need for innovation	157
1.2. New French legal framework as a godsend?	158
2. French contract law reform	158
2.1. A lost chance	158
2.2. Lack of innovation	159
2.3. Non-inclusion of several basic compensation principles	160
3. Drafting prerequisites	162
3.1. Necessity	162
3.2. Clear, simple and precise rules	163

3.3.	Legal-linguistic consistency	164
3.4.	References	165
4.	Belgium 2020: new provisions on contractual damages	166
4.1.	Basic structure of legal framework	166
4.2.	Introductory provision on the location of contractual damages	167
4.3.	Basic measure of contractual damages	168
4.3.1.	Principle of full compensation	168
4.3.2.	Date of assessment	170
4.3.3.	Expectation interest	171
4.3.4.	Non-pecuniary loss	174
4.3.5.	Lost chances	177
4.3.6.	Reliance interest	178
4.3.7.	Equitable assessment of damages	181
4.3.8.	Gain-based measure of damages	182
4.4.	Limits on principle of full compensation	184
4.4.1.	Foreseeability	184
4.4.2.	Avoidability	189
4.4.3.	Indirectness	195
5.	Conclusion	196

Set-off in the French Reform of the Law of Obligations: a Tale of Missed Opportunities?

	Matthias E. Storme	201
1.	The role and definition of set-off	201
2.	The requirements for set-off: failure to distinguish the requirements for the active and the passive claim	202
3.	Automatic set-off?	202
4.	Obligational aspects and requirements	203
4.1.	Requirements for the active claim	204
4.2.	Requirements for the passive claim	204
5.	Property law aspects	205
5.1.	Requirements for the active claim	205
5.2.	Requirements for the passive claim	205

Fundamental Rights in the French Contract Law Reform

	Chantal Mahé	209
	Abbreviations	209
1.	Introduction	209
2.	The non-codification of a general clause on contractual infringements of any FR	212
2.1.	The abandonment of a general clause common to all types of contracts	212
2.2.	The abandonment of a general clause common to all fundamental rights	214

2.3.	Upholding <i>direct</i> horizontal effects of FR in the contractual context . . .	217
2.3.1.	The implicit rejection of FR <i>indirect</i> interpersonal effects.	218
2.3.2.	The upholding of the <i>direct</i> interpersonal effects of FR.	219
3.	Legal consequences of contractual infringements of FR.	221
3.1.	The <i>Cour de cassation</i> long-standing case law on proportionality.	222
3.2.	The deadlock of the unqualified invalidity.	224
4.	A missed opportunity to codify	227
5.	Lessons to be learned from the French experience.	228