

A HUMAN RIGHTS-BASED
APPROACH TO CONSERVING
PROTECTED AREAS IN CHINA

Lessons from Europe

Miao HE



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:
NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

A Human Rights-Based Approach to Conserving Protected Areas in China
Lessons from Europe
© Miao He 2016

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: The Kangxi Emperor's Southern Inspection Tour, Wang Hui (1632-1717) and assistants © RMN-Grand Palais (musée Guimet, Paris) / Michel Urtado

ISBN 978-1-78068-388-1
D/2016/7849/33
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations xv

PART I.
INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

Chapter 1.

Introduction 3

1.1. Research Background 3

 1.1.1. Relationship Between Human Rights Protection and
 Environmental Protection at the International Level 4

 1.1.1.1. Linkages Between Human Rights Protection
 and Environmental Protection in International
 Instruments 4

 1.1.1.2. Relationship Between Human Rights Protection
 and Environmental Protection in Practice 8

 1.1.2. Human Rights Approaches to Environmental Protection 10

 1.1.2.1. Mobilising the Existing Rights 11

 1.1.2.2. Reinterpreting the Existing Rights 11

 1.1.2.3. A New Human Right: A Human Right to
 an Environment of a Certain Quality 12

 1.1.2.4. A Human Rights-Based Approach 14

 1.1.3. The Value of Protected Areas 15

 1.1.4. Relationship Between Human Rights Protection
 and Protected Areas Conservation 20

 1.1.4.1. Relationship Between Human Rights Protection
 and Protected Areas Conservation in General 20

 1.1.4.2. Relationship Between Human Rights Protection
 and Protected Areas Conservation in China 24

 1.1.4.2.1. Problems in Protected Areas
 Conservation in China 25

 1.1.4.2.2. Examples of Conflicts in Practice in China . 27

 1.1.4.3. Relationship Between Human Rights Protection
 and Protected Areas Conservation in Europe 32

 1.1.5. Existing Approaches to Conserve Protected Areas 36

1.2.	Problem Statement	39
1.3.	Research Questions	42
1.4.	Academic and Societal Contribution of the Book.....	44
1.5.	Research Methodology and Sources	45
1.6.	Scope and Objectives	46

Chapter 2.

	Theory of a Human Rights-Based Approach to Conservation	53
2.1.	A Human Rights-Based Approach and its Key Features	53
2.1.1.	Features of a Human Rights-Based Approach	56
2.1.2.	A Human Rights-Based Approach to Conservation.....	61
2.2.	Advantages and Challenges of a Human Rights-Based Approach to Conservation.....	63
2.2.1.	Added Values of a Human Rights-Based Approach	63
2.2.2.	Challenges	69
2.2.2.1.	External Challenges	69
2.2.2.2.	Challenges Inherent to the Human Rights-Based Approach Itself	71
2.3.	Rights and Duties.....	73
2.3.1.	Rights	73
2.3.2.	Duties	74
2.3.3.	Actors	75
2.3.3.1.	Rights-Holders	76
2.3.3.2.	Duty-Bearers	76
2.4.	Substantive and Procedural Rights	78
2.5.	Implementing the Human Rights-Based Approach to Conservation ...	79
2.6.	Interim Conclusion	87

PART II.

ANALYSIS OF THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN HUMAN RIGHTS
AND PROTECTED AREAS CONSERVATION IN CHINA
AND IN EUROPE

Chapter 3.

	Protected Areas Conservation in China and in Europe	91
3.1.	Protected Areas Conservation in China.....	93
3.1.1.	General Introduction	93
3.1.2.	History of the Legal and Policy Framework for Protected Areas in China.....	97
3.1.3.	Administrative and Legal System for Protected Areas Conservation in China.....	102

3.1.3.1.	Administrative System for Protected Areas Conservation in China.	102
3.1.3.2.	Legal and Policy Framework for Protected Areas Conservation in China.	104
3.2.	Protected Areas Conservation in Europe.	112
3.2.1.	The European Context.	113
3.2.2.	The Context of the European Union.	114
Chapter 4.		
Substantive Right (Right to Property) and Protected Areas Conservation		
4.1.	Relationship between the Right to Property and Protected Areas.	118
4.1.1.	General Right to Property in International and Regional Human Rights Instruments.	118
4.1.2.	Role of the Right to Property in Environmental Protection.	119
4.1.3.	Relationship Between the Right to Property of Indigenous Peoples and Protected Areas Conservation.	121
4.1.3.1.	General Right to Property of Indigenous Peoples.	121
4.1.3.2.	Right to Property of Indigenous Peoples and Protected Areas Conservation.	123
4.1.4.	Different Forms of Property Rights.	124
4.1.5.	Discussion.	126
4.2.	Right to Property and Protected Areas Conservation in China.	128
4.2.1.	Right to Property and Protected Areas Conservation in General.	128
4.2.2.	Legal and Policy Framework Concerning Property Rights in China.	131
4.2.3.	Conflicts Regarding Property Rights and Protected Areas Conservation in Practice.	138
4.2.4.	Underlying Causes for the Conflicts.	140
4.3.	Right to Property in Environmental Protection in Europe.	142
4.3.1.	Right to Property Under the European Convention on Human Rights.	142
4.3.1.1.	Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 to the Convention.	142
4.3.1.2.	Three “Rules” for the Right to Property under the European Convention on Human Rights.	144
4.3.1.3.	Three Criteria for Restricting the Right to Property under the European Convention on Human Rights.	146
4.3.2.	Case Law in the European Court of Human Rights.	150
4.3.2.1.	The Bottom Line: Whether the Livelihood is Really Affected or Not.	151

4.3.2.2.	The Legitimate Aim: The General Interest	153
4.3.2.3.	A Better Solution for a Fair Balance: Reasonable Compensation	156
4.3.3.	Right to Property Under European Union Law	159
4.3.4.	Right to Property in Protected Areas Conservation Law in Europe	159
4.3.4.1.	The Bern Convention	159
4.3.4.2.	The Birds Directive and the Habitats Directive	160
4.3.4.3.	Case Law in the Court of Justice of the European Union According to Protected Areas Conservation Law	161
4.4.	Analysis and Interim Conclusion	162
4.4.1.	General Analysis	162
4.4.2.	From Conflicts to Cooperation	165
4.4.3.	From Principles to Practice	167
 Chapter 5.		
	Procedural Rights and Protected Areas Conservation	169
5.1.	Right to Information and Protected Areas Conservation	172
5.1.1.	Relationship between the Right to Information and Protected Areas	172
5.1.1.1.	Right to Information in International Human Rights Instruments	172
5.1.1.1.1.	General Right to Information in International Human Rights Instruments	172
5.1.1.1.2.	Right to Information of Indigenous Peoples in International Human Rights Instruments	173
5.1.1.1.3.	Discussion	175
5.1.1.2.	Right to Information in International Environmental Instruments	175
5.1.1.2.1.	General Right to Information in International Environmental Instruments	175
5.1.1.2.2.	Right to Information of Indigenous Peoples in International Environmental Instruments	179
5.1.1.3.	Right to Information in Protected Areas Conservation Law	179
5.1.2.	Right to Information and Protected Areas Conservation in China	181
5.1.2.1.	Legal and Policy Framework Concerning the Right to Information	182

5.1.2.1.1.	Legal and Policy Framework Concerning the Right to Information in General	182
5.1.2.1.2.	Legal and Policy Framework Concerning Environmental Information . . .	190
5.1.2.1.3.	Right to Information in Protected Areas Conservation in China	193
5.1.2.2.	Analysis on the Right to Information in China.	195
5.1.3.	Right to Information in Environmental Protection in Europe.	196
5.1.3.1.	Right to Information under the European Convention on Human Rights	196
5.1.3.2.	Case Law in the European Court of Human Rights	197
5.1.3.2.1.	Public Access to Clear and Full Information is a Basic Human Right	197
5.1.3.2.2.	Restrictions on the Right to Information Must “Be Prescribed by Law”, “Be Necessary in a Democratic Society” and “Follow a Legitimate Aim”	202
5.1.3.3.	Right to Environmental Information in the Aarhus Convention	204
5.1.3.4.	Case Law of the Aarhus Convention Compliance Committee	208
5.1.3.4.1.	Providing Environmental Information upon a Request is an Obligation of a Relevant Authority	209
5.1.3.4.2.	Access to Environmental Information Shall Be Readily Available to Support Public Participation in Environmental Matters	210
5.1.3.4.3.	Restrictions for a Request for Environmental Information	211
5.1.3.5.	Influence of the Aarhus Convention on EU Law on Access to Environmental Information	212
5.1.3.6.	Right to Information in Protected Areas Conservation Law in Europe	214
5.1.3.6.1.	The Bern Convention	214
5.1.3.6.2.	The Birds Directive and the Habitats Directive	214
5.1.3.6.3.	Case Law in the Court of Justice of the European Union According to Protected Areas Conservation Law	216

5.1.4.	Analysis and Interim Conclusion.	216
5.1.4.1.	Differences in the Right to Environmental Information in China and in Europe	217
5.1.4.1.1.	Different Historical Stages of the Right to Environmental Information	217
5.1.4.1.2.	Different Levels of the Right to Environmental Information	218
5.1.4.1.3.	Different “Supporters” of the Right to Environmental Information	218
5.1.4.2.	Similarities in the Right to Environmental Information Between China and Europe	219
5.1.4.3.	Some Lessons for China.	220
5.2.	Right to Participation and Protected Areas Conservation	223
5.2.1.	Relationship Between the Right to Participation and Protected Areas	223
5.2.1.1.	Right to Participation in International Human Rights Instruments.	223
5.2.1.1.1.	General Right to Participation in International Human Rights Instruments	223
5.2.1.1.2.	Right to Participation of Indigenous Peoples in International Human Rights Instruments	224
5.2.1.2.	Right to Participation in International Environmental Instruments	225
5.2.1.2.1.	General Right to Participation in International Environmental Instruments	225
5.2.1.2.2.	Right to Participation of Indigenous Peoples in International Environmental Instruments	228
5.2.1.3.	The Value of the Right to Participation.	229
5.2.1.4.	Right to Participation in Protected Areas Conservation	232
5.2.2.	Right to Participation and Protected Areas Conservation in China	236
5.2.2.1.	The Development of “Public Participation” in China from a Historical Perspective.	236
5.2.2.2.	Legal and Policy Framework Concerning the Right to Participation.	238
5.2.2.3.	The Right to Participation in Protected Areas Conservation	245
5.2.2.4.	Public Participation in Practice	249
5.2.2.5.	Some Limitations for Public Participation in China.	250
5.2.2.6.	Analysis on the Right to Participation in China	254

5.2.3.	Right to Participation in Environmental Protection in Europe	254
5.2.3.1.	Right to Participation under the European Convention on Human Rights	254
5.2.3.2.	Case Law in the European Court of Human Rights	255
5.2.3.2.1.	The Public Authorities Need to Take into Account the Interests of Individuals or Groups who May be Affected	255
5.2.3.2.2.	The Decision-Making Process Must Involve Appropriate Investigations and Studies	256
5.2.3.2.3.	The Affected Groups Have a Right to Participate in the Decision-Making	257
5.2.3.3.	Public Participation in Environmental Decision-Making in the Aarhus Convention	258
5.2.3.4.	Case Law of the Aarhus Convention Compliance Committee	262
5.2.3.4.1.	Meaningful Public Participation Shall be at an Early Stage	262
5.2.3.4.2.	Public Participation Procedures Shall Include Reasonable Time-Frames for Different Phases	264
5.2.3.4.3.	NGOs' Roles in Public Participation	265
5.2.3.4.4.	Each Party Shall Ensure that the Decision-Maker Takes Due Account of the Outcome of the Public Participation	266
5.2.3.5.	The Influence of the Aarhus Convention on EU Law on the Right to Participation	268
5.2.3.6.	Right to Participation in Protected Areas Conservation Law in Europe	271
5.2.3.6.1.	The Bern Convention	271
5.2.3.6.2.	The Birds Directive and the Habitats Directive	271
5.2.3.6.3.	Case Law in the Court of Justice of the European Union According to Protected Areas Conservation Law	272
5.2.4.	Analysis and Interim Conclusion	273
5.2.4.1.	Differences in Public Participation in China and in Europe	274
5.2.4.1.1.	Different Theories of Public Participation	274
5.2.4.1.2.	Different Historical Stages of Public Participation	275
5.2.4.1.3.	Different Scopes of Public Participation	276

	5.2.4.1.4. Different Levels of Public Participation. . . .	278
	5.2.4.1.5. Different “Supporters” of Public Participation.	279
	5.2.4.2. Similarities in Public Participation Between China and Europe.	279
	5.2.4.3. Some Lessons for China.	280
5.3.	Right to Access to Justice in Environmental Matters.	281
	5.3.1. Access to Justice in China	284
	5.3.1.1. Legal and Policy Framework Concerning the Right to Access to Justice in Environmental Matters in China.	285
	5.3.1.2. Right to Access to Justice in Environmental Matters in Practice in China.	294
	5.3.1.3. Right to Access to Justice Concerning Protected Areas Conservation in China.	300
	5.3.2. Access to Justice in Environmental Protection in Europe. . . .	301
	5.3.2.1. Access to Justice under the European Convention on Human Rights.	301
	5.3.2.2. Case Law in the European Court of Human Rights. . . .	302
	5.3.2.2.1. Whether Individuals Have an Opportunity to Appeal to the Courts against Any Decision	303
	5.3.2.2.2. Whether NGOs Have an Opportunity to Appeal to the Courts against Any Decision	305
	5.3.2.3. Access to Justice in Environmental Matters in the Aarhus Convention.	306
	5.3.2.4. Case Law of the Aarhus Convention Compliance Committee.	310
	5.3.2.4.1. The EU Law Shall Follow the Aarhus Convention on Access to Justice.	310
	5.3.2.4.2. National Limited Legal Standing for NGOs Shall Meet the Minimum Standards of the Aarhus Convention.	312
	5.3.2.4.3. Access to Justice is Affordable for the Public.	314
	5.3.2.5. Influence of the Aarhus Convention on EU Law on Access to Justice.	316
	5.3.2.6. Right to Access to Justice in Protected Areas Conservation Law in Europe	320
	5.3.2.6.1. The Bern Convention	320

5.3.2.6.2. The Birds Directive and the Habitats Directive	321
5.3.2.6.3. Case Law of the Court of Justice of the European Union	321
5.3.3. Analysis and Interim Conclusion.	321
5.3.3.1. Differences in Access to Justice in China and in Europe	321
5.3.3.1.1. Different Cultural Background for Access to Justice.	322
5.3.3.1.2. Different Historical Stages of Access to Justice	322
5.3.3.1.3. Different “Supporters” of Access to Justice	322
5.3.3.2. Similarities in Access to Justice Between China and Europe.	323
5.3.3.3. Some Lessons for China.	324
Chapter 6.	
Conclusions for Part II	327
PART III.	
IMPLEMENTATION AND GENERAL CONCLUSION	
Chapter 7.	
Implementing a Human Rights-Based Approach in Protected Areas Conservation in China	333
7.1. Empowering Rights in Legislation on Protected Areas	333
7.1.1. A Stakeholder Analysis	333
7.1.2. Empowering Rights from a Substantial Perspective	335
7.1.3. Empowering Rights from a Procedural Perspective	336
7.1.3.1. Empowering the Right to Information	338
7.1.3.2. Empowering the Right to Participation	339
7.1.3.3. Empowering the Right to Access to Justice	341
7.2. Safeguarding Rights in the Enforcement of Legislation on Protected Areas	341
7.2.1. Safeguarding Rights in the Enforcement from a Substantial Perspective	342
7.2.2. Safeguarding Rights in the Enforcement from a Procedural Perspective	342
7.2.2.1. To Provide Information	342
7.2.2.2. To Ensure Participation	343

Contents

7.2.2.3.	To Explore the Corresponding Environmental Education.....	345	
7.2.2.4.	To Stimulate the Enthusiasm of the Relevant Parties.....	345	
7.3.	Monitoring and Evaluating Application of the Human Rights-Based Approach.....	346	
7.4.	Providing a Legal Remedy.....	349	
Chapter 8.			
General Conclusion and Outlook.....			353
7.1.	General Conclusion.....	353	
7.2.	A Way Forward (Limitations of the Research).....	356	
<i>References</i>		359	

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Aarhus Convention	Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters
ACCC	Aarhus Convention Compliance Committee
ACEF	All-China Environment Federation
ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
AMCE	African Ministerial Conference on Environment
Bern Convention	Convention on the Conservation of European Wildlife and Natural Habitats
Birds Directive	Directive 79/409/EEC on the Conservation of Wild Birds
Bonn Convention	Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals
CAFF	Conservation of Arctic Flora and Fauna
CBD	Convention on Biological Diversity
CEACR	Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women
CERD	Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
CHRD	Center for Human Rights and Development
CLAPV	Centre for Legal Assistance to Pollution Victims
CI	Conservation International
CIFOR	Center for International Forestry Research
CIEL	Center for International Environmental Law
CoE	Council of Europe
CPC	Communist Party of China
CRC	Committee on the Rights of the Child
CRIN	Child Rights International Network
CUMPM	Communauté Urbaine Marseille Provence Métropole
Directive 96/61/EC	Council Directive 96/61/EC of 24 September 1996 Concerning Integrated Pollution Prevention and Control

List of Abbreviations

Directive 2003/4/EC	Directive 2003/4/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 28 January 2003 on Public Access to Environmental Information and Repealing Council Directive 90/313/EEC
Directive 2003/35/EC	Directive 2003/35/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 26 May 2003 Providing for Public Participation in Respect of the Drawing up of Certain Plans and Programs Relating to the Environment and Amending with regards to Public Participation and Access to Justice Council Directive 85/337/EEC and 96/61/EC
Directive 2010/75/EU	Directive 2010/75/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 24 November 2010 on Industrial Emissions (Integrated Pollution Prevention and Control)
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECE	Economic Commission for Europe
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EEA	European Environment Agency
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EIA Directive	Council Directive 85/337/EEC of 27 June 1985 on the Assessment of Certain Public and Private Projects on the Environment
EPB	Environmental Protection Bureau
ESRC	Economic & Social Research Council
Espoo Convention	Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Trans-boundary Context
EU	European Union
EUR	Euro
FPIC	Free, Prior Informed Consent
FPP	Forest Peoples Programme
FIELD	Foundation for International Environmental Law and Development
FTE	Full Time Employment
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GEF	Global Environment Facility
GONGO	Government Organized Non-Governmental Organization
GPRG	Global Poverty Research Group
Habitats Directive	Directive 92/43/EEC on the Conservation of Natural Habitats and of Wild Fauna and Flora

Helsinki Convention	Convention on the Protection of the Marine Environment of the Baltic Sea Area
HRBA	Human Rights-Based Approach
HRS	Household Responsibility System
IAEA	International Atomic Energy Agency
IAITPTF	International Alliance of the Indigenous and Tribal Peoples of the Tropical Forests
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICRAF	International Center for Research in AgroForestry
ICRW	International Center for Research on Women
IDS	Institute of Development Studies
IIED	International Institute for Environment and Development
ILO	International Labour Organization
INTRAC	International NGO Training and Resource Center
IPE	Institute of Public and Environmental Affairs
IPPC	Integrated Pollution Prevention and Control
IUCN	International Union for Conservation of Nature
MAB	Man and the Biosphere Programme
MEA	Millennium Ecosystem Assessment
MEP	Ministry of Environmental Protection
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NPC	National People's Congress
NRDC	Natural Resources Defense Council
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OGI	Open Governance Information
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner on Human Rights
OSPAR Convention	Convention for the Protection of the Marine Environment of the North-East Atlantic
PAs	Protected Areas
PATF	Protected Area Task Force
PEEN	Pan-European Ecological Network
PEM	Participatory Environmental Management
PoWPA	Programme of Work on Protected Areas
PRC	People's Republic of China
Ramsar Convention	Convention on Wetlands of International Importance
Rio Declaration	Rio Declaration on Environment and Development

List of Abbreviations

SACs	Special Areas of Conservation
SCI	Sites of Community Importance
SEA Directive	Directive 2001/42/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 27 June 2001 on the Assessment of the Effects of Certain Plans and Programs on the Environment
SEPA	State Environmental Protection Administration
“Seveso” Directive	Council Directive of 24 June 1982 on the Major-Accident Hazards of Certain Industrial Activities (82/501/EEC), issued on 24 June 1982 and replaced by 87/216/EEC
SFA	State Forestry Administration
SGLA	Sino-Global Legal Alliance
SPAs	Special Protection Areas
SPC	Supreme People’s Court
Stockholm Declaration	Declaration of the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment
TNC	The Nature Conservancy
TRI	Toxic Release Inventory
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNCF	United Nations Children’s Fund
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on Law of the Sea
UNCSD	United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development
UNDRIP	United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UN/ECE	United Nations Economic Commission for Europe
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund Agency
USD	United States Dollar
Water Framework Directive	Directive 2000/60/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 October 2000 Establishing a Framework for Community Action in the Field of Water Policy

WCC	World Conservation Congress
WCED	World Commission on Environment and Development
WCPA	World Commission on Protected Areas
WDPA	World Database on Protected Areas
WFFPDSEFA	Wild Fauna and Flora Protection Division of the State Forestry Administration
WHC	World Heritage Convention
WHO	World Health Organization
WPC	World Park Congress
WWF	World Wide Fund for Nature