

DUTIES ACROSS BORDERS

Advancing Human Rights
in Transnational Business

Edited by
Bård A. Andreassen
Võ Khánh Vinh



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7PP
United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

Duties Across Borders

© The editors and contributors severally 2016

The authors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover image: © Kari Johanne Nordheim, Verdighet

ISBN 978-1-78068-376-8

D/2016/7849/16

NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

PREFACE

Human rights performance is, in many ways, intertwined with large processes of globalisation. One feature of these processes, which has come to the attention of the human rights community over the last two decades, is the impact that multinational business enterprises may have on human rights around the globe. This volume argues that international businesses and the legislation that govern their behaviour represent a new frontier on the struggle for human rights. This frontier has borne witness to many victims, but there are also glimpses of hope and opportunities for expanding the respect and protection of human rights in the corporate sector at local, national, and global levels.

The volume aims to analyse key legal and social issues surrounding the advancement of human rights. The chapters evolve from an international conference organised on 27–28 June 2013 in Hanoi, hosted by the Vietnam Academy of Social Sciences (VASS) with its co-organising partner the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights (NCHR) at the University of Oslo. The conference gathered scholars and practitioners from different regions of the world and from different academic disciplines.

We are very grateful for the support of the Vietnam Program at the NCHR and the generous financial support of the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs. VASS has provided the project with strong support throughout, and we have benefitted greatly from fruitful research collaborations between our two institutions over the last seven years. At VASS, we are particularly indebted to the Vice Director of the International Cooperation Department, Tuyet Ahn Luu, for her logistical and overall support. At the NCHR we have indeed benefitted from the editorial assistance of Natasha Telson, and appreciate the keen support of Gisle Kvanvig and Mau Don Thi Nguyen of the Vietnam Programme. Finally, we would like to thank Tom Scheirs at Intersentia for his avid interest in driving the project forward.

Bård A. Andreassen and Võ Khánh Vinh
Oslo/Hanoi, October 2015

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	v
<i>List of Authors</i>	xv
<i>List of Figures and Tables</i>	xxi

Introduction. Business' Duties Across Borders: The New Human Rights Frontier

Bård A. ANDREASSEN and Võ Khánh Vinh	1
1. Introduction	1
2. Human Rights and Regulation Theory	5
3. Human Rights Law and Business: Concepts, Principles and Challenges ..	8
4. Conclusion	19

PART I. CONCEPTUAL DEVELOPMENTS

Chapter 1.

Business and Human Rights, or the Business of Human Rights. Critical Reflections on Emerging Themes

Surya DEVA	23
1. The Business Case for Human Rights	24
2. Hazards in the SRSG's Work	27
3. Spineless States	32
4. Kiobel's Encounter with an Inconvenient Truth	35
5. Conclusion	38

Chapter 2.

Corporate Liability for Human Rights. Effective Remedies or Ineffective Placebos?

Itai APTER	39
1. Introduction	39
2. Litigation and Guidelines – a Critical Analysis	41
2.1. US Litigation against Corporations	42
2.1.1. Victims	44
2.1.2. Global Corporations	46

2.1.3. Forum Government	46
2.1.4. Corporations' Home States	48
2.2. Litigation against Corporations in Non-US Courts	50
2.3. OECD Guidelines for Multinational Corporations	51
3. United Nations Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights	56
4. Political Inter-State Solutions – Looking into the Past to Suggest a Way Forward	59
5. Concluding Remarks	65

Chapter 3.

**Ensuring the Protection of the Environment from Serious Damage.
Towards a Model of Shared Responsibility between International
Corporations and the States Concerned?**

Gentian ZYBERI	67
1. Introduction	67
2. Addressing Environmental Damage from Nuclear Accidents	71
3. Addressing Environmental Damage from Oil Pollution	72
4. Ensuring Responsibility for Serious Environmental Damage	73
4.1. The Responsibility of Transnational Corporations	73
4.2. Host State Responsibility	78
4.3. Home State Responsibility	83
4.4. Environmental Protection as a Matter of Shared Responsibility among the Corporation, the Host State and the Home State	84
5. The Complexity of Attribution of Responsibility and Adjudication of Cases of Serious Environmental Damage	86
6. Concluding Remarks	89

Chapter 4.

The Business Case for Taking Human Rights Obligations Seriously

Güler ARAS	91
1. Introduction	91
2. The Business Drivers for CSR	93
2.1. Investor Relations and Access to Capital	94
2.2. Consumers	100
2.3. Employee Recruitment, Retention and Productivity	103
2.4. The Minimisation of Legal Risk	104
2.5. The 'Licence to Operate'	105
3. Conclusions	106

Chapter 5.

Corporate Accountability in the Field of Human Rights. On Soft Law Standards and the Use of Extraterritorial Measures

Humberto CANTÚ RIVERA	109
1. Introduction	109
2. Thinking Outside the Boundaries: Talking about Extraterritoriality... ..	111
2.1. Some Comments regarding the US Supreme Court’s <i>Kiobel</i> Opinion	112
2.2. Extraterritoriality in the Dutch Judicial System	121
3. Enhancing the Role of Soft Law: From Guidelines to Obligations?	125
3.1. The Classic Sources of International Law According to the ICJ Statute	125
3.2. A Permanent Call for ‘Rethinking’ the Sources of International Law: the Role of Soft Law	129
4. General Conclusions	133

Chapter 6.

The Viability of the Maastricht Principles in Advancing Socio-Economic Rights in Developing Countries

Ebenezer DUROJAYE	135
1. Introduction	135
2. Are MNCs Subject to International Human Rights Law?	136
3. Attempts at the National Level to Make MNCs Responsible for Human Rights Violations.....	142
4. How Relevant are the Maastricht Principles in Advancing Socio-Economic Rights?	146
5. Limitations of the Principles	151
6. Conclusion	152

PART II. CONTEXTUAL ISSUES

Chapter 7.

The Next Generation of ‘Fair Trade’. A Human Rights Framework for Combating Corporate Corruption in Global Supply Chains

Hana IVANHOE	157
1. Introduction	157
2. The Relationship between Corruption and Human Rights Violations..	159
2.1. Overview of the Problem: What is the Impact of Corruption in Global Supply Chains?	159

2.2.	Corruption in Supply Chains: Snapshots of Emerging Developments	160
2.3.	Academic and Empirical Support for the Concept of Corruption as a Human Rights Violation	162
3.	Duty of Multinational Corporations to Respect Human Rights in their Supply Chains	165
3.1.	Overview of the Protect, Respect and Remedy Framework and its Application	166
3.2.	Role of CSR and Voluntary Standards in Advancing Respect for Human Rights.....	168
4.	Corporate Duty to Prevent Corruption in their Supply Chains as a Matter of their Duty to Respect Human Rights	172
5.	Non-Judicial Enforcement of this Duty under a CSR Approach	173
5.1.	Efficacy of a CSR Approach in Combating Corruption in Global Corporate Supply Chains.....	174
5.2.	Why is a CSR Approach Beneficial?.....	176
5.3.	Why is a CSR Approach to Combating Corruption Needed Given the Domestic Anti-Corruption Laws Already in Place? ...	178
6.	Conclusions.....	181

Chapter 8.

A Critical Analysis of Human Rights Due Diligence Frameworks for Conflict Minerals. Challenges for the Electronics Industries

	Miho TAKA	183
1.	Introduction	183
2.	The Concept of Human Rights Due Diligence	186
3.	Initiatives to Implement Human Rights Due Diligence in Mineral Supply Chains.....	188
3.1.	ICGLR Regional Initiative against the Illegal Exploitation of Natural Resources	190
3.2.	Conflict-Free Smelter.....	190
3.3.	ITRI Tin Supply Chain Initiative	191
3.4.	Certified Trading Chains and Analytical Fingerprint	192
4.	Challenges of Applying Human Rights Due Diligence in Mineral Supply Chains.....	195
5.	Implications of the Human Rights Due Diligence Initiatives.....	204
6.	Conclusions.....	207

Chapter 9.

The Pursuit of Substantive Corporate Human Rights Policies

Matthew MULLEN	209
1. Introduction	209
2. Principle 16 in Context	210
3. Ensuring Substance	213
4. Assessing the Substance of CHRPs through HRBA Indicators	216
5. Conclusion: Stepping Strategically, but Assertively	223

PART III. SITES OF REGULATION

Chapter 10.

Human Rights and Business. An Assessment of the Responsibility of the State in Vietnam

NGUYỄN Thị Thanh Hải	227
1. Introduction	227
2. CSR and Human Rights in Vietnam: the Role of Relevant Public Institutions	228
3. The Gap in the Legal Framework for Corporate Human Rights Responsibility	234
3.1. Constitutions	235
3.2. National Laws on Corporate Human Rights Responsibility	236
3.3. Corporate Civil, Administrative and Criminal Liability	240
3.3.1. Civil Liability	240
3.3.2. Administrative Liability	241
3.3.3. Corporate Criminal Liability	242
4. The Governance System and its Influence on Corporate Human Rights Responsibility	243
4.1. The Legislature: the National Assembly	243
4.2. The Executive	245
4.3. The Judiciary	247
5. Gaps in the Political, Legislative, Executive and Judicial Institutions in Implementing Corporate Human Rights Responsibility	248
6. Conclusion	251

Chapter 11.

Investment Treaties and Human Rights. Reflections from Mining in Latin America

Stéphanie GERVAIS	253
1. Introduction	253
2. Method	255
3. Regulatory Chill Theory	256
4. Case Studies	260
4.1. <i>Pacific Rim Cayman LLC v. El Salvador</i>	262
4.1.1. Basis for Case Selection	262
4.1.2. Human Rights Context	262
4.1.3. Domestic Policy	264
4.1.4. Arbitration Proceedings	265
4.1.5. Variance of the Dependent Variable	266
4.2. <i>Infinito Gold Ltd v. Costa Rica</i>	267
4.2.1. Basis for Case Selection	267
4.2.2. Human Rights Context	267
4.2.3. Domestic Policy	268
4.2.4. Arbitration Proceedings	271
4.2.5. Variance of the Dependent Variable	272
5. Analysis	273
6. Conclusion	277

Chapter 12.

Beyond State Duty and Corporate Responsibility. Human Rights in Industrial Zones in Vietnam

NGUYỄN Hong Nga	279
1. Introduction	279
2. Challenges of Human Rights Engagement in Industrial Zones in Vietnam	281
2.1. Failure of State Duties: Limitations of the Legal System	281
2.2. Reluctance to Implement CSR	284
2.3. Legal, Political, and Social Constraints	286
3. The Emergence of CSOs in ‘Humanising’ Business in Vietnam	289
3.1. An Overview of CSOs Development in Vietnam	289
3.2. Experiences of CSOs in the Promotion of Human Rights in Industrial Zones in Vietnam	291
3.2.1. Centre of Development and Integration (CDI)	291
3.2.2. Fair Labour Association (FLA)	293
3.2.3. Domestic CSOs and the Vedan Case	295
4. Conclusion	297

Chapter 13.

The Application of the UN ‘Protect, Respect and Remedy’ Framework to State-Owned Enterprises. The Case of the State Oil Company SOCAR in Azerbaijan

Ramute REMEZAITE	301
1. Human Rights Due Diligence in Extractive Industries in Azerbaijan ..	302
2. The Legal and Political Context of Extractive Industries in Azerbaijan	305
3. SOCAR’s Adverse Impact on Property Rights	309
3.1. House Demolitions, Illegal Expropriations, and Forced Evictions as a Price for Urbanisation and Further Development of Oil Industry.....	309
3.2. Case Study: Forced Evictions and House Demolitions in the Sulutepe Area.....	310
3.3. Assessment of SOCAR’s Social Corporate Responsibility over the Violations and Absence of Effective Legal Remedies.....	311
4. Azerbaijan’s Obligation to Secure Access to Effective Remedy for Property Rights Violations.....	315
4.1. The Need for Increased Protection of Human Rights Defenders Working on Corporate Responsibility	317
5. The Corporate Social Responsibility that Foreign Oil Companies Bear for SOCAR’s Business-Related Human Rights Abuses in Azerbaijan	318
6. Conclusion	320

Chapter 14.

The Invisible Minority. Status of the ‘Differently Able’ People in the Export Industries in India

Rituparna MAJUMDAR	323
1. Introduction	323
2. Indian Export Industry and Corporate Social Responsibility	324
3. Disability and International Human Rights	325
4. Methodology	329
5. Main Findings	330
6. Profile of the Respondents	330
7. Recruitment Policies of Companies.....	331
8. Status of Employment of PWD Employees	331
9. Accessibility to Work	332
10. Termination of PWD Employees	333
11. Impact of Corporate Social Responsibility and Labour Rights	333
12. Training and Development.....	334
13. Health and Safety	334

14.	Case Studies	335
14.1.	Worker A, Female, Age 30 Years: Checking Department, Garment Manufacturing Unit.....	335
14.2.	Worker B, Transsexual, Age 32 Years: Machining Department, Shoe Manufacturing Unit.....	336
14.3.	Company Owner A, Male, Age 55 Years, Owns Garment Manufacturing Company in Delhi	336
14.4.	Company Owner B, Male, Age 40 Years, Heads Automobile Company in Gurgaon	337
14.5.	Company Owner B, Female, Age 73 Years, Heads Garment Manufacturing Unit in Noida.....	338
15.	Discussion	339
16.	Recommendations	340

LIST OF AUTHORS

Bård A. Andreassen is Professor at the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights, Law Faculty, University of Oslo. He received his Dr. Polit. degree (political science) at the University of Oslo, and a Diploma of International and Comparative Law of Human Rights from the International Institute of Human Rights, Strasbourg. Andreassen has published on human rights analysis of poverty, power, human rights based approaches to development, business responsibilities, social and economic rights, as well as on governance, democratic change and ethno-politics in African contexts. His most recent books are *Development as a Human Right. Legal, Political and Economic Dimensions*, 2nd revised edition (Intersentia, 2010) edited with Stephen P. Marks, and *Human Rights, Power and Civic Action. Comparative analyses of struggles for rights in developing societies* (Routledge, 2013) edited with Gordon Grawford. He is Editor-in-Chief of the *Nordic Journal of Human Rights* (Routledge).

Võ Khánh Vinh is Vice President of the Vietnam Academy of Social Sciences (VASS), and Chancellor and Professor at the Academy of Social Sciences (GASS). He got his PhD in Law in 1993 at the Institute of State and Law, Vietnam Academy of Social Sciences. His research and teaching areas focus on theories of state and law, criminal justice, human rights and civil society. He is the author, editor and chief-editor of many publications, among them the most recent are, all in Vietnamese: *Sociology of Law: Fundamental Issues* (People's Police Publishing House, 2011); *Mechanism for human rights protection* (Social Sciences Publishing House, 2011); *Conflict and social consensus* (Social Sciences Publishing House 2013); *Overview of 1992 Constitution implementation: Theoretical and urgent practical issues* (Social Sciences Publishing House, 2013).

AUTHORS

Itai Apter is a PhD student at the Law Faculty, Haifa University (Israel). His publications include 'The New International Frontier – the Legal Profession and the Challenges of New 'International Law' in the New Member State', *Croatian Yearbook of European Law and Policy* (2014), and 'International Rights of Older Persons: What Differences Would a New Convention Make to the Lives of Older People', co-authored with Isreal Doron in the *Marquette Elder's Advisor Journal* (2010).

Güler Aras is a Professor of Finance and Accounting at Yildiz Technical University in Istanbul, Turkey, and Founding Director of Finance, Corporate Governance and Sustainability. She is also a Visiting Professor at Georgetown University McDonough School of Business. Professor Aras is the editor of Gower Book Series, *Finance, Governance and Sustainability: Challenges to Theory and Practice* and the editor of Gower book series *Corporate Social Responsibility*; she has also served as an editor of *Social Responsibility Journal*. She has published more than 20 books and has contributed over 250 articles in academic, business and professional journals. Her most recent co-authored books are *The Durable Corporation: Strategies for Sustainable Development* (Gower, 2010) *Governance and Social Responsibility: International Perspectives* (Palgrave MacMillan, 2012). Professor Aras's latest book *Sustainable Markets for Sustainable Business: A Global Perspective for Business and Financial Markets* was published by Gower at 2015.

Surya Deva is an Associate Professor at the School of Law of City University of Hong Kong. His primary research interests lie in Business and Human Rights, Corporate Social Responsibility, Indo-Chinese Constitutional Law, International Human Rights, and Sustainable Development. He has published extensively in these areas. Surya's books include *Socio-Economic Rights in Emerging Free Markets: Comparative Insights from India and China* (editor) (Routledge, forthcoming in 2015); *Human Rights Obligations of Business: Beyond the Corporate Responsibility to Respect?* (co-edited with David Bilchitz) (Cambridge University Press, 2013); *Confronting Capital Punishment in Asia: Human Rights, Politics, Public Opinion and Practices* (co-edited with Roger Hood) (Oxford University Press, 2013); and *Regulating Corporate Human Rights Violations: Humanizing Business* (Routledge, 2012). Surya has also prepared two major reports on *Access to Justice: Human Rights Abuses Involving Corporations* (concerning India and China) for the International Commission of Jurists (ICJ), Geneva. He is one of the founding Editors-in-Chief of the *Business and Human Rights Journal* (CUP), and sits on the Editorial Board of the *Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights* and the *Vienna Journal on International Constitutional Law*.

Ebenezer Durojaye is an Associate Professor of Law and Head of the Socioeconomic Rights Project at the Community Law Centre, University of the Western Cape in South Africa. His research interests include focusing on human rights issues raised by the access to HIV/AIDS treatment, intersection between gender inequality and HIV/AIDS response in Africa, as well as women's health and adolescents' sexual and reproductive rights in Africa. Among his latest publications is the book titled 'Strengthening the protection of sexual and reproductive health through human rights in the African region' (Pretoria University Law Press, 2014) edited together with Charles Ngwena.

Nukila Evanty earned her Master's of Law degree from the University of Groningen in the Netherlands. She serves as a visiting lecturer at faculty of law University of Mahendradatta Bali. She is a research associate at the Center for Strategic and International Studies and a senior researcher for the National Coalition for the Elimination of Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children. Ms. Evanty's research interest focuses on human rights and social justice. She has published two international books; 'Indonesia Human Rights and the International Human Rights Regime' in 2010 and 'the Application of the Doctrine of Command Responsibility in International Law, Prosecuting the Leaders' in 2011.

Stéphanie Gervais holds an MA in international affairs from Carleton University, Canada, and is a PhD candidate in Anthropology with a specialisation in Political Economy. Her early research focused on international investment agreements and human rights, with a special attention on the intersection of both legal systems in the mining sector of Latin America. Her latest areas of interest have concentrated on the organisation strategies of indigenous communities resisting extractive operations on their land.

Hana Ivanhoe has a Juris Doctor degree from Berkeley Law, University of California, where she has been a lecturer in the Advanced Degree Program. She is currently the North American Advocacy Manager for Fairfood International. She is also the Policy and Engagement Manager at the Aquaya Institute, a global non-profit organisation which works to achieve universal access to safe water in the developing world. Having worked on human rights issues and matters of trade and development from both the public and private sector perspectives, her key areas of research interest include transparency, business and human rights and corporate social responsibility.

Matthew Mullen, PhD, is a lecturer at the Institute of Human Rights and Peace Studies, Mahidol University, Thailand. He has published on oppression and resistance, transitional justice, structural and cultural violence, international human rights law, corporate accountability, the human right to play and Burma/ Myanmar.

Nguyễn Hong Nga holds a Master's degree in human rights from the University of Oslo, Norway. She is currently working as a researcher for the Institute of World Economics and Politics, a member of Vietnam Academy of Social Sciences. Her major is human rights, human security and related issues including climate change, food, energy and water security, especially human rights in business. She both authored and edited her most recent publication, titled 'Regional and Social Impacts of Industrial Zones in Vietnam'.

Nguyễn Thị Thanh Hải holds an LLM in Human Rights Law from the University of Hong Kong and a PhD in Law from Sydney University, Australia. She is currently a lecturer at the Vietnamese Institute for Human Rights of the Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics. Her areas of interest include international human rights law, human rights and globalisation, human rights and corporate responsibility, human rights and gender equality including issues on violence against women, as well as human rights and HIV/AIDS.

Ramute Remezaite is currently is a PhD candidate at the School of Law at Middlesex University and a Legal Consultant at the European Human Rights Advocacy Centre in UK. She litigates cases before the European Court of Human Rights and other international tribunals and advises human rights lawyers in the former Soviet Union states. Her key areas of research include implementation and compliance with judgments of the European Court of Human Rights, civil and political rights, extractive industries and their compliance with human rights law.

Humberto Cantú Rivera is an Associate Researcher and PhD Candidate at the Research Centre on Human Rights and Humanitarian Law (CRDH) of Université Panthéon-Assas Paris II, in France. He has been a Visiting Professional at the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, and a Scholar of The Hague Academy of International Law. He published the first edited book in Spanish with contributions from acting UN human rights mandate holders and the High Commissioner for Human Rights: 'El futuro es hoy: Construyendo una agenda de derechos humanos' (Monterrey, CEDHNL/UANL, 2014).

Miho Taka received her PhD degree in international relations and sociology from Coventry University in, England, where she's currently a senior lecturer at the Centre for Trust, Peace and Social Relations (CTPSR). Dr Miho has various living and working experiences from Japan, England, Sweden and Rwanda. After working as the Country Director of an NGO in Rwanda for four years, she became interested in the relationship between natural resources and violent conflict in sub-Saharan Africa. Her research interests also include natural resource management, global governance, business and human rights, corporate social responsibility and peace-building. She has published several papers, and is a reviewer for several international academic journals in the area of corporate governance.

Gentian Zyberi is Associate Professor at the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights, University of Oslo, Norway. Over the last eleven years he has worked in the field of international law for different universities in the Netherlands, the US, China and Albania. His international legal practice includes working for the defence before the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY) and coordinating the work of the Albanian legal team in the *Kosovo* case before the

International Court of Justice (ICJ). His current research focuses on issues related to transitional justice, responsibility to protect, and the protection of community interests under international law.

LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

Figure 4.1. CSR requirements for listed companies	99
Figure 4.2. How companies influence society.....	101
Figure 4.3. Company CSR interest.....	102
Table 4.1. Stock exchanges' involvement in CSR.....	99
Table 7.1. The business rationale for fighting corruption	177
Table 14.1. India's exports by major regions (in per cent)	325
Table 14.2. Distribution of the all-India working age population (15 to 64 years old) by usual activity status in 1999–2000	327
Table 14.3. Types of export factories selected	331
Table 14.4. Recruitment policies concerning PWDs in companies	331
Table 14.5. Prevalence of PWD employees in companies	332
Table 14.6. Provisions for accessing work	332
Table 14.7. Termination clause for PWDs	333
Table 14.8. Impact of CSR in changing employer attitude towards PWDs...	334
Table 14.9. Training and development imparted	334
Table 14.10. Health and safety training imparted to PWDs	335